CONSTRUCTING HERITAGE IN THE GLOBAL AGE:
THE CONVERGENCE OF PATRIMONY AND MEDIA IN CULTURAL TOURISM

A Thesis
submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
of Georgetown University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of
Master of Arts
in Communication, Culture and Technology

By

Anna Victoria Palladino, B.A.

Washington, DC
April 22, 2010
CONSTRUCTING HERITAGE IN THE GLOBAL AGE: THE CONVERGENCE OF PATRIMONY AND MEDIA IN CULTURAL TOURISM

Anna Victoria Palladino, B.A.

Thesis Advisor: J.P. Singh, Ph.D.

Reader: Michael Coventry, Ph.D.

ABSTRACT

The creation of cultural messages previously was relegated to the sphere of national patrimonial producers. However, this thesis departs from prior scholarship by focusing on the integral role of non-government mediated environments in cultural construction. These mediated environments have significant implications for the tourist’s perceptions of the perceived authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the tourism product.

Cultural construction marks most aspects of modern life. It requires a selective narrative formation that results in a simplified, easily consumable message. This practice is especially pronounced in the field of cultural tourism. As elements are included and excluded, how much of what is referred to as “culture” is inherent to or representative of places? Further examination reveals that the construction of heritage, culture, and place are influenced both by government institutions and user-generated participatory models.

In particular, this thesis will study the combined effects of government institutional intervention and mediated environments on four case studies: Istanbul, Turkey- European Capital of Culture Program; Spain- El Camino de Santiago de Compostela; Thailand- Culinary Tourism; and British Columbia, Canada- Indigenous Tourism. In each of these cases, the effects on the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the final tourism product will be examined.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. J.P. Singh, whose Geneva study abroad program marked the beginning of this thesis. His encouragement, criticism, and approach to scholarship have broadened my horizons both personally and academically. I cannot thank him enough for his guidance during this process.

In addition, I would like to thank my second reader, Dr. Michael Coventry, for the energy that he dedicated to the review of my work. He supported me from the beginning of my time at CCT and his belief in me has made all the difference in my two years here.

Special thanks to Brannon Cullum for her friendship, time, humor, and keen analytical eye during the writing process. Also thank you to Rebecca Jakob for her thoughtful commentary which added to the progression of my research.

A very special thank you to Anna Britz, Vauldi Carelse, Francisco Felitti, Ekaterina Gabalova, Ryan Jackson, Yixian Li, and Onur Uygun, each of whom provided his or her regional expertise and advice. My thesis research and, more importantly, my life are richer for having known them.

A much needed thank you to my friends for their support and understanding during this process. I can think of more than 302 reasons why I love them each.

Finally, thank you to my parents and Patrick without whose unconditional love, inexhaustible patience, and unquestioning belief in me, I would be lost.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1. Constructing Heritage in the Global Age, Introduction

1.1. Research Problem ................................................................. 4
1.2. Argument .............................................................................. 4
1.3 Tourism Contextualization ......................................................... 5
1.4 Conceptual Definitions ........................................................................ 11
1.5 Methodology ........................................................................... 13
1.6 Case Study Notes .................................................................... 16
1.7 Research Organization ............................................................... 18

CHAPTER 2. Culture Under Construction, Literature Review

2.1. Taking Account of Culture .......................................................... 20
2.2. Explanatory Factors .................................................................... 22
2.3. Constructing Patrimony ................................................................. 22
2.4. Mediated Environments ................................................................. 43
2.5. The Tourist-Explorer .................................................................... 44
2.6. Inspiring Tourism and Modern Exploration ....................................... 46
2.7. Networking Potential and Structural Possibilities ................................. 54
2.8. Dependent Outcomes .................................................................. 58

CHAPTER 3. Case Studies

3.1. Extra-National Case Studies: Turkey and Spain............................... 70
3.2. Istanbul, Turkey: European Capital of Culture 2010 ......................... 71
3.3. Istanbul and the Capital of Culture Program ..................................... 73
3.4. Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders ....... 75
3.5. Locating the Tourist ..................................................................... 78
3.6. Summary of Explanatory Factors .................................................. 82
3.7. Dependent Outcomes ................................................................. 83
3.5. Locating the Tourist ..................................................................... 78
3.8. El Camino de Compostela, Spain: Religious Tourism ..................... 87
3.9. Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders ....... 93
3.10. Locating the Tourist ................................................................... 99
3.11. Summary of Explanatory Factors .................................................. 102
3.12. Dependent Outcomes ................................................................. 102
3.13. Conclusion .............................................................................. 108

CHAPTER 4. Case Studies

4.1. Sub-National Case Studies: Thailand & Canada ............................. 110
4.2. Thailand: Culinary Tourism ......................................................... 110
4.3. Culinary Tourism in and from Thailand .......................................... 113
4.4. Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders ....... 115
4.5. Locating the Tourist ................................................................... 118
4.6. Summary of Explanatory Factors .................................................. 121
4.7. Dependent Outcomes ................................................................. 122
4.8. British Columbia, Canada: Indigenous Tourism ............................ 124
4.9. Indigenous Tourism in Canada ..................................................... 126
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.10. Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11. Locating the Tourist</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13. Dependent Outcomes</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14. Conclusion</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER 5. Conclusion ................................................................. 142
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Theoretical Contributions</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Empirical Contributions</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Methodological Contributions</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4. Limitations and Future Research</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5. Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. TravelBlog.org and TripAdvisor Suggestions ......................... 154
Figure 2. Conocer El Camino ............................................................. 155
Appendix A. Africa Regional Case Study ............................................... 156
Appendix B. Colonialism and Tourism ................................................... 162
Bibliography ................................................................................. 165
TABLES

Table 1. Conceptual Definitions ................................................................. 11
Table 2. Case Study Matrix ................................................................. 15, 70
Table 3. Cross-Cultural Tourist-Host Content ........................................... 56
Table 4. Istanbul’s Minorities .............................................................. 85
Table 5. El Camino and Tourism Motivations ............................................ 97
Table 6. Summary Chart ................................................................. 141
Table 7. Summary of Findings ............................................................. 148
CHAPTER 1. Constructing Heritage in the Global Age

INTRODUCTION

“Youro travel life has the essence of a dream. It is something outside the normal, yet you are in it. It is peopled with characters you have never seen before and in all probability will never see again. It brings occasional homesickness, and loneliness, and pangs of longing... But you are like the Vikings or the master mariners of the Elizabethan age, who have gone into a world of adventure, and home is not home until you return.” ~Agatha Christie, *English mystery author (1890 - 1976)*

The construction of a tourism market depends upon narrative creation; and as in other fields, construction requires choices concerning the inclusion and exclusion of content. While romanticized views of tourism pervade, this process establishes culture as a product capable of impacting the ways in which individuals and nations conceive of their heritage. The struggle to control the narrative takes place in many arenas, often including interaction between governmental patrimonial powers and non-governmental entities. The outcome of this tension has a significant impact on the perceived authenticity of the product. Along with authenticity, commodification and homogenization also become issue areas because of their ability to alter the cultural product as it becomes part of the market. Cultural tourism is a prime example of these tensions. As a tourism subset, it is a resourceful way to integrate heritage and traditional themes into a modern format. The convergence and conflict inherent to this narrative formation illustrate the fluidity of several key concepts and results in variations in the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the cultural product.

This thesis will examine cultural tourism industries in order to ascertain how new challenges from globalization have impacted the ways in which culture is constructed and the business of tourism is conducted. Local and national government institutions have an

---

1 University of Idaho, 2007
interest in presenting a cohesive national message for tourists and residents, often excluding or reinterpreting parts of history. Once the message is formulated and presented to visitors, their views of the subject matter become influential in popularizing or exposing certain cultural attractions. The roles of popular media and internet technologies, referred to as mediated environments, have played a crucial role in the evolution of user-based content influencing tourist motivations and travel decisions. As governmental interventions converge with mediated environments, the resulting tourism products differ in terms of the quality of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization.

Cultural tourism is a term without a static definition, more often molded to fit the situation than to define a clear precept (McKercher & du Cros, 2002). The Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD) (2008) defines all aspects of tourism as part of the “Experience Economy,” which, while broad, does encompass the concept. Many adjectives can be placed in front of tourism, such as “environmental” or “electronic,” but “cultural” has qualities that lend it to be defined in numerous ways and by multiple practices. As Robinson (1999) suggests, it is not productive to define cultural tourism in terms of traditional high-art practices because this approach leaves out the realm of everyday culture (McGuigan, 2002). Combining the tourism-derived, motivational, experiential, and operational definitions of tourism (Robinson, 2002) establishes cultural tourism as a type of special interest tourism, highlighting the connected nature of people, place, and culture. Cultural tourists are motivated to see culture while being educated and entertained simultaneously.
Contemporary cultural tourism messages are now produced from a combination of patrimony, heritage, and media technologies. This recurrent combination will assist in evaluating the impact of government institutional intervention and external interventions motivating cultural tourism on a location’s culture. Government institutional interventions are marked by the actions of national or regional government departments and agencies. These entities have a specific interest in the construction of a patrimonial product and message in reference to tourism. In order to accomplish their goals, these government institutions produce promotional materials, host specific events, or financially back cultural endeavors. They use heritage objects and myths to create a cohesive product that builds upon a national legacy. However, unlike in the past, government institutions must temper their actions by taking user-generated content and other forms of media into account. The term mediated environments refers to the variety of media available to potential tourists. Television, movies, guidebooks, and literature are all included under this heading; however, newer media technologies like blogs and travel sites are particularly important for this discussion. Examining the influence of travel sites in reference to the efficacy of government institutional resources is unique to this thesis. New media allows for opinions and resources to be shared across distances and they force governments to adapt with web-resources of their own. This trend media participation places the individual in a prominent position in the globalization process. The suggestions of online users can impact the popularity of cultural sites and can modify the construction of cultural products.
1.1 Research Problem

Initially, this inquiry was informed by the question: If cultural construction relies on selective narrative formation, how much of what one commonly refers to as “culture” is inherent to or representative of places and peoples? To this end, the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the resulting tourism product become dependent outcomes by which to approach this question. This thesis will explain how variations in these three outcomes are impacted by the actions and objectives of several stakeholders. Considering the modern construction of heritage, culture, and place reveals the influence of both traditional patrimonial narrative structures and user-generated participatory models. Heritage becomes redistributed and redefined as government institutions and outside technologies interact to influence not only the tourist product but ultimately the cultural conceptions surrounding a location. This thesis will examine the confluence of government institutional interventions and mediated environments and their impact on the meaning of culture and heritage, especially in reference to authenticity, homogenization, and commodification.

1.2 Argument

Prior discussions of history and heritage place these concepts within the realm of national and patrimonial control, as their use largely dictates the production of culture. However, due to globalization and technological integration, control over the construction of culture no longer belongs solely to the state. Through the lens of cultural tourism, the impact of technologies on global processes can be examined. While it was comparatively easier for national powers to control the cultural messages of their tourism industries in the past, patrimonial producers must now contend with readily available and
widely read travel reviews, blogs, and recommendations. This online, user-generated content gives individuals the power to impact a global industry through their widely disseminated opinions, which, possibly, support, contradict, or otherwise interpret the patrimonial message. It should be noted that national governments also have adopted web-resources to repackage cultural products and devised policy initiatives to respond to the changing nature of cultural tourism. As cultural tourism evolves, so must the heritage and cultural products that are used to define locations and peoples.

1.3 Tourism Contextualization

To understand cultural tourism, it is necessary to examine the general field at large. Considered a major growth industry, tourism is a service sector, extensively linked to the goods of other market areas. While showing a four percent global decrease in tourism arrivals due to the economic crisis, the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) reported 880 million tourists in 2009 and the organization is optimistic for a continued positive trend. Tourism is influential because it reveals peoples choices regarding how to spend their time and money. In the case of international tourism, these choices can have a significant economic impact. International organizations, such as the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) and the World Trade Organization (WTO), have recognized tourism development as having the potential to both alleviate economic concerns and enhance. Other global and regional organizations also deal in tourism issues, like the

---

2 United Nations, World Tourism Organization, 2010
3 Cultural Tourism (2008)
Caribbean Community Secretariat (CARICOM)\(^4\), the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD)\(^5\), and Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD)\(^6\).

While tourism cannot guarantee an end to poverty, it can play a significant role in economic development. It is interesting that the only region in the world with increased tourism revenues in 2009 was Africa with a +5% increase in tourist arrivals\(^7\). Tourism has become a popular remedy for lapsed economic development because, ultimately, it is a product that cannot be outsourced. While foreign direct investment may tip this balance, tourism is location-based, thus requiring local production and development\(^8\). Because of its economic and cultural potential, patrimonial powers have a vested interest in fostering a successful industry.

Tourism promotes local cultural industries while also supporting the growth of infrastructure. According to Ilbery et al., “... tourism can help attract people to an area who then buy local foods and crafts, as well as participating in activities dependent upon the local environment” (2001, pg). In order to support a tourism industry, a country must develop certain amenities. Banking and telecommunications services are often of large concern when establishing a tourism industry (Grosso, et. al., 2007), with the hope being that local citizens will benefit from and use infrastructure created for tourists. However, tourism cannot be an end in and of itself because “… too much dependence on consumers coming to the area is unsustainable in environmental and economic terms…” (Ilbery et

\(^4\) CARICOM statistics organization website (http://www.caricomstats.org/), select “Databases,” select “Tourism,” select country of interest

\(^5\) United Nations Conferences on Trade and Development, 2004

\(^6\) Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, n.d.

\(^7\) United Nations, World Tourism Organization, 2010; See Appendix A

\(^8\) Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 2008
Increased pollution from the production of tourism infrastructure, like hotel construction, or from transportation bi-products, like increased numbers of planes, trains, or buses, also could negatively impact the locale’s ecosystem if not properly regulated.

Tourism is a reflection of globalization, not a ramification of it. Travel and tourism have been around far longer than globalization has been a popular term (Munar, 2007) and tourism, in fact, catalyzes global economic integration\(^9\). However, even with the increased links across countries and cultures, some scholars feel that tourism is a repackaged form of colonialism (Edsenor, 1998)\(^10\). Whether imperialist attitudes emerge from tourists themselves or arise from the way the culture is displayed is unclear.

Modernity and technology have made travel more accessible and, as a result, many governments have established specific departments or ministries to oversee tourism. Civil aviation, mobile banking, and e-tourism booking services are some of the innovations that have influenced tourism by disseminating travel information easily\(^11\). The importance of governmental tourism agencies and boards has increased over time. According to the Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD), the majority of funds for tourism are allocated for international marketing campaigns\(^12\).

In 2004, Morocco created a ten year plan to increase tourism with a goal of hosting ten million visitors by 2010\(^13\). The government will invest a total of 90 billion dirham, or 10 billion US dollars, in Moroccan tourism by 2010, with a 1 billion dollar commitment.

---

\(^10\) See Appendix B  
\(^12\) Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 2008  
\(^13\) American Chamber of Commerce in Morocco, 2004
specifically to fund “modern marketing techniques.” These measures appear to be successful because, according to UNWTO, Morocco received 7.4 million visitors in 2007 alone, an increase from 6.6 million in 2006 and 5.8 in 2005.

The states which signed the 1975 Helsinki Accords declared, “… their aim to facilitate freer movement and contacts, individually and collectively, whether privately or officially, among persons, institutions and organizations of the participating States.” The Accords address tourism under the same humanitarian heading acknowledging that, “… tourism contributes to a fuller knowledge of the life, culture and history of other countries, to the growth of understanding among peoples, to the improvement of contacts and to the broader use of leisure.” These international political pressures have encouraged tourism growth and contributed to the historical perspective that democracy can be measured by the right to travel. This increased mobility encourages cross cultural interaction and increases the potential for the formation of positive perceptions. Positive travel experiences can lead to increased popularity for products from certain places, increased empathy towards foreign nationals, and the increased desire of tourists to return. However, it also is possible that negative experiences while traveling will reinforce negative perceptions as well (Robinson, 1999).

No official body presiding over international tourism exists because such policies are matters of national sovereignty. The UNWTO deals with many aspects of tourism and defines itself as playing, “…a central and decisive role in promoting the development of

---

14 American Chamber of Commerce in Morocco, 2004, pp 82
16 University of Minnesota: Human Rights Library, n.d.
17 University of Minnesota: Human Rights Library, n.d.
responsible, sustainable, and universally accessible tourism\(^\text{18}\),” while placing special focus on the tourism sectors of developing nations. The Organization encourages the dissemination of the *Global Code of Ethics for Tourism*\(^\text{19}\), which highlights responsible and sustainable methods of tourism management, but it cannot mandate compliance with or acceptance of the content. While the UNWTO deals with tourism topics, it ultimately relies upon member state enforcement for compliance (Richter, 2007). Encouraging nations to act collectively on important issues affecting tourism, such as climate control and human rights is difficult. “Cost-benefit analysis discourages any single nation taking action, yet, in the absence of collection action, all countries lose… Such is the Tragedy of the Commons” (Richter, 2007, pp.10). Some global organizations have used tourism, specifically eco-tourism, as an avenue for addressing climate control; however, the reluctance of a few to change has given the rest an excuse to lag behind.

131 member states of the WTO have made commitments in “Tourism and Travel Related Services” in the General Agreement on Trade and Services (GATS)\(^\text{20}\), more than in any other service sector. According to the WTO Services Database, countries have the option to make commitments or add exemptions in four distinct areas in reference to tourism: *hotels and restaurants; travel agencies and tour operators services; tourist guide services*; and *other*. Even if the member states can recognize the importance of liberalizing their tourism services, as evidenced by the high level of commitments, they must go one step further. As the OECD astutely claims, “Improved GATS commitments in important related services (e.g. telecommunications) can significantly contribute to the growth of tourism. However, multilateral progress for some services (e.g. energy and

\(^{19}\)See *Global Code of Ethics for Tourism*: http://www.unwto.org/ethics/index.php
\(^{20}\)World Trade Organization (a)
education) is more difficult to attain\(^{21}\).” Increased understanding of linkages and industry requirements must evolve and more GATS commitments in related sectors must be made.

Thriving on backwards and forwards linkages, tourism can create network nodes that increase its connection to other industries and issue areas. According to OECD, “Backward linkages occur as tourism demands goods and services inputs from other sectors. Forward linkages arise since tourism can also be a supplier of goods and services to other sectors.”\(^{22}\) The backwards linkages are often the most fruitful and helpful for development. According to Singh (2010b), there are “… five major constraints on tourism: transportation and infrastructure, accommodation, utilities and information infrastructure, marketing and promotion activities, and education and training” (pp. 4-5). In addition, a certain amount of political stability is required before an industry can flourish.

Tourism can be broken down into many subsectors and, because tourism is a multifaceted endeavor, many international organizations can specialize in or add expertise to specific areas. Minority cultural rights have been gaining visibility in global governance. Again, there is not an official institution presiding over minority concerns in tourism; however, there are international organizations that provide methods of recourse for wronged groups. UNESCO and the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO) address cultural preservation by focusing on heritage management and through intellectual property patent protections. Among other things, UNESCO generates and maintains the World Heritage Site list which includes both cultural and environmental

---

\(^{21}\) Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 2008, pp. 9  
\(^{22}\) Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 2008, pp. 9
locations and some oh which deal with minority culture. WIPO designates “Traditional Knowledge, Genetic Resources and Traditional Cultural Expressions/Folklore” as an area in which groups can legally protect their rights to products and modes of production.

While adding “cultural” to tourism connotes a specific type of tourism, cultural tourism policies and practices have to be based on an overall understanding of the industry. This thesis will build upon these general tourism concerns and indicators by approaching cultural tourism as an industry that reflects both high art and everyday forms of culture and heritage (McGuigan, 2002). It is linked to many service areas and connotes a type of travel that involves experiencing and observing different lifestyles. This thesis will now continue by examining the changing construction of cultural heritage, focusing on both consumers and producers. Which entities construct tourism markets and under what circumstances are important for determining the impact of globalization on the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of culture.

1.4 Conceptual Definitions

The vocabulary of culture is comprised of words with many interpretations. For the sake of clarity, the operational definitions of such words and concepts will be addressed now with further theoretical discussion continued in the literature review.

Table 1. Conceptual Definitions

| Tourism          | This term highlights the connected nature of people and places (Robinson, 1999) in endeavors related to the “experience economy” (OECD, 2008). A 1994 UN definition referred to tourism as, “… the activities of persons traveling to and staying in places outside their usual environment for not more than one consecutive year for leisure, |

---

business, and other purposes not related to the exercise of an activity remunerated within the place visited.25”

| Cultural Tourism | This term is a subset of tourism. Adding culture to tourism makes a destination and a spectacle out of “…a whole way of life- the common meanings… the arts and learning- the special process of discovery and creative effort” (Williams, 1958; p. 8). Culture is a fluid concept (Sarup, 1996) and cultural tourism is a reflection of the political (Lanfant, 1995). Combining these concepts into one definition results in an understanding of cultural tourism having the potential to draw from every expressive aspect of society. |
| Patrimony | Patrimony originates from a combination of history and social capital, which is left up to the discretion of a nation-state’s elite. It is the use of non-material (Ferry, 2006) and material remains (Silveira & Lima, 2006) of the past to the current day in order to spur an intangible identity linked to predecessors. It simultaneously fills a cultural desire of significance and a political need for legitimacy (Canclini, 1995). |
| Heritage | Heritage is a fluid concept that creates a modern use for the past. It is what society decides to remove from the past (Hall & McArthur, 1998). The form it takes depends on what tourists want to see and what hosts want to share (Müller & Pettersson, 2005). For the purposes of tourism, heritage appeal converts locations into destinations (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998). |
| Globalization | “… the concept of globalization implies first and foremost, a stretching of social, political and economic activities across frontiers such that events, decisions and activities in one region of the world can come to have significance for individuals and communities in distant regions of the world. In this sense, it embodies trans-regional interconnectedness, the widening reach of networks of social activity and power…” (Held, et al., 1999, p. 15). This idea of globalization conforms to the transformationalist approach, which roots the term in a historical process (Munar, 2007). |
| Culture | Culture is signified by many aspects and can be identified as any aspect contributing to the social atmosphere of a place, not only the high arts but also those aspects that are ordinary and every day (Bradford et al., 2000). |
| National Identity | Identity is a relational text in which aspects are open to interpretation and one understands one’s place as a result of the mixing of multiple identities and ways of seeing oneself (Brockmeier, 2004). The national component is informed by Renan’s (1990) concept of a country of citizens with commonalities as well as communally forgotten histories. By adding “national,” the self-conception becomes part of a larger whole. The national identity is rooted in an equally malleable historical perspective, which is manifested in the leadership system (Anderson, 1991). Because of its ties to leadership, national |

---

25 United Nations, 1994
| **Cultural Artifact** | Cultural artifacts represent symbol systems (Greenfield, 1996) and amplify modes of representation (Bruner, 1965, 1966). While they may transmit meaning, their significance must be malleable in order to assist in forging new identities. They often are defined as thought provoking artistic and social goods (Van Grasstek, 2006). |
| **Tourist Gaze** | “The gaze therefore presupposes a system of social activities and signs which locate the particular tourist practices, not in terms of some intrinsic characteristics, but through the contrasts implied with non-tourist social activities” (Urry, 2002). |
| **Government Institutional Intervention** | National or regional departments or agencies that use marketing and economic resources to form cultural messages directed at tourists. |
| **Prosumer** | The individual serving as the consumer and producer (Stalder, 2001) |
| **Mediated Environments** | The world populated by a variety of media. These outlets become resources that aid tourists in decision making as well as encourage peer-to-peer communication. |
| **Authenticity** | According to Cohen (1988), authenticity is a socially constructed construct. While it is part of a wider social phenomenon it also is part of a subjective evaluation. |
| **Commodification** | The adding of monetary value and economic force to cultural products. According to Smith (2003a), this valuation comes from tourist demand. |
| **Homogenization** | This concept speaks to fears about the standardization of experiences among peoples around the world. “As the world becomes more globalised, the homogenisation and standardisation of cultural experiences and activities are perhaps inevitable; hence people may need to travel further afield in order to experience differences” (Smith, 2003a, pp 19). There also is a fear that the host culture will assimilate aspects of the visiting cultures (Smith, 2003a, pp 51-52). |

### 1.5 Methodology

This study of cultural construction will begin with a review of the exigent scholarship, concentrating on theoretical literature and on anecdotal case materials. Various disciplines, including cultural studies, sociology, tourism studies, and anthropology, are drawn upon to reinforce the approach. This interdisciplinary approach is strengthened by allowing for concepts to be investigated from multiple perspectives through its mixed methodology. When taken individually, the theories arising from these
categories each address pertinent aspects of cultural, heritage, and tourism production. However, the strength lies in examining these topics from an integrated perspective that takes into account the interdisciplinary nature of industry construction. Contemporary industry examples of cultural tourism practices will illustrate relevant issues in the field that are tied to the theoretical review.

A structured, focused comparison method (George, 1979) was used to select case studies and compare the explanatory factors across the dependent outcomes. According to this method, the lessons of history and politics can be compared so as to expose the “…inconsistencies and contradictions among the ‘lessons’ of different cases by identifying the critical conditions and variables that differed from one case to the other” (George, 1979, pp 44). In this instance, the standard and generalized questions being asked of each selected case deal with the ways in which government institutions and mediated environments operate in each instance. This method is rooted in J.S. Mill’s Method of Differences, which stresses the importance of the difference among presumably equal circumstances being indicative of “…the cause, or an indispensible part of the cause, of the phenomenon” (Mill, 1884, pp. 256). In addition, evaluations about the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization instances are made. These three dependent outcomes were selected because of their importance to the creation of tourism products. In most cases, authenticity is valued along with lower instances of commodification and homogenization. These outcomes have implications for tourists and for industry providers, as well as being widely recurrent themes in tourism research (Smith, 2003a; McIntosh & Johnson, 2005; Edensor, 1998).
In this thesis, case studies were selected and analyzed based on government institutional interventions in contrast to non-governmental mediated environments. In both cases, would-be-tourists either take inspiration from accidental access to these materials or directly seek them out to plan a trip. By delineating these explanatory factors into “stronger” and “weaker” categories, the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization variations of the sub-tourism industries are revealed. The sub-industries reflect traditional high art and historical cultural tourism interests but also explore newer industries that have an industry-specific primary focus. The following matrix arranges and classifies the aspects of tourism being studied.

Table 2: Case Study Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influenced by Governmental Cultural Elite</th>
<th>Stronger Institutional Intervention</th>
<th>Weaker Institutional Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culinary Tourism</td>
<td>Religious Pilgrimage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Thailand)</td>
<td>(Spain- Camino de Santiago)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Capitals of Culture</td>
<td>Indigenous Tourism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Turkey)</td>
<td>(British Columbia, Canada)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Institutional intervention refers to the influence exerted and actions taken by national government departments or regulatory bodies over the creative control of an event or display being produced. Mediated environments refer to non-governmental informational communities that evolve from various media outputs. It is difficult to pinpoint tourist motivations without an in-depth ethnography. Thus, tourist motivation will be approached through an examination of tourist resources that are media based and participatory in nature. The term mediated environments builds upon Appandurai’s (1990) term *mediascape* and his *imagined worlds*, which explore the disjunctions
between the economy, culture, and politics (pg 285). Movies, television, and books are media whose effect can be seen over time and reflected in popular perceptions about a place or topic. Guidebook, blogs, and websites are media that travelers directly seek out before and during a trip to assist in planning and decision making. Each of the selected sub-industries represents a type of cultural tourism, but different combinations of government intervention and external media forces distinguish each. By separating the categories based on the strengths of patrimonial intervention and on mediated environments, a clearer investigation into methods of construction and meaning can be accomplished.

1.6 Case Study Notes

The selected cultural tourism sub-industries help to classify the impacts of institutions and media on cultural tourism products. Comparisons arising from the aforementioned matrix and cases studies also will comment on the changing perception of culture as a function of modern tourism systems. The four selected sub-industries and their respective countries address a different combination of explanatory factors within the presented matrix.

The European Capitals of Culture program is an appropriate choice for stronger institutional intervention and weaker presences of mediated environments because the participating states are charged with creating cultural displays; however, the event is not widely commented on by tourists or in popular media. The Capitals of Culture program does boost revenue through the allotted year and has the potential to improve tourism in subsequent years (Garcia, 2004). In 2010 three cities share the distinction: Istanbul, Turkey; Pecs, Hungary; and Essen, Germany. Turkey is a particularly salient case study
because its struggle for European Union (EU) accession has prompted the nation to launch new types of tourism and cultural initiatives in order to appear more European and attract Europeans. As a traditional east-west gateway, Turkey has a particularly complex interest in the presentation of its culture.

Indigenous tourism meets the expectations for the presence of weaker mediated environments and weaker government institutional intervention because of its troubled past. While generally considered part of craft culture which is distinct and separate from high art culture (Becker, 1982), indigenous tourism is changing. Some tourists want to experience indigenous culture for more self-reflective reasons; however, it is logical that they also understand that cultural consumption is part of this type of tourism. Indigenous peoples are not typically part of the national, cultural patrimony machine; however, tribal councils and boards are charged with maintaining cultural images. Indigenous tourism in British Columbia, Canada has been selected because of its recent increase in profile due to the 2010 Vancouver Winter Olympics.

Culinary or gastronomic tourism is an emerging field and governmental promotion of it, as well as touristic interest in learning about or experiencing it, places this sub-industry within the stronger government intervention, stronger external intervention box. Culinary arts are very much a part of culture, but tourists specifically engaged in culinary tourism have a different focus than those engaged in other cultural tourism practices. The advent of several recent television travel shows, such as *On the Road Again*, *No Reservations*, and *Bizarre Foods*, reflects the growing interest in culinary tourism. Thailand is a successful example of this trend because of its
government’s keen intervention in promoting culinary tourism and the proliferation of tourist resources.

Religious pilgrimage tourism provides an interesting contrast to the other categories. Religion certainly is part of culture. A perfect example is the Camino de Santiago, or the Way of St. James, in Spain. Governments may encourage pilgrimage; however, they do not dictate the route, the activity, or add significant meaning to the practice. However, nations with pilgrimage routes do encourage pilgrims to engage in cultural tourism along the route. However, the tourist resources available to pilgrims usually focus on the spiritual, self-reflective aspect of the journey. While the practice of pilgrimage is changing, the consumption of culture is of secondary interest to the more physically and spiritually challenging objectives of the journey.

1.7 Research Organization

The ensuing chapters will present a detailed analysis of government institutional interventions and non-government online mediated environments and how these resources impact cultural tourism and heritage products. Chapter Two’s Literature Review will focuses on the meaning of culture, the explanatory variables, and the dependent outcomes. Within these sections, specific concepts relevant to the case studies will be discussed. Chapter Three will present the first two case studies, Turkey and Spain, along the sections and sub-sections identified in Chapter Two. The remaining case studies, Thailand and Canada, will be addressed in Chapter Four. Finally, Chapter Five will evaluate the findings of the case studies in reference to the original research objectives and offer both summary and analytical data tables.
CHAPTER 2. Culture Under Construction

LITERATURE REVIEW

“‘Take the Pyramids. Great blocks of useless masonry, put up to minister to the egoism of a despotic bloated king. Think of the sweated masses who toiled to build them and died doing it. It makes me sick to think of the suffering and torture they represent.’

Mrs. Allerton said cheerfully, ‘You’d rather have no Pyramids, no Parthenon, no beautiful tombs or temples- just the solid satisfaction of knowing that people got three meals a day and died in their beds.’

The young man directed his scowl in her direction.

‘I think human beings matter more than stones.’

‘But they do not endure as well,’ remarked Hercule Poirot.”

_Murder on the Nile_ by Agatha Christie, pp. 112

A physical legacy that stands against the trials of time passes along cultural messages. Monuments, works of art, and ruins all display cultural lessons and milestones that inform the modern interpretation of culture. However, the definition of culture has expanded to accommodate tributes to everyday life and the common person as well. In the past, government institutional interventions exclusively crafted national messages and created patrimonial practices. However, the modern tourism product displays a shift towards the incorporation of mediated environments, which allow for opinions and influential resources to be disseminated widely. While patrimonial powers still determine the ways in which a nation’s heritage is displayed and characterized, online mediated environments have forced government entities to adapt to new methods of communication and be responsive to outside opinions.

Using cultural tourism as the context, this thesis examines the changing construction and meaning of culture, focusing on both consumers and patrimonial producers. This literature review will proceed by first examining culture and then progressing to discussions about patrimonial construction and the interventions of
mediated environments. Initially, patrimonial approaches to construction will be detailed on a national and international level. Marketing and branding for tourists also will be discussed, along with several examples. After government institutional patrimony has been examined, the ways in which mediated environments disrupt the patrimonial process will be discussed. Exploration and new technological methods available to tourists will be treated as access points for evaluating cultural tourism. Networking is particularly relevant to the examination of tourists, as online forums now link tourists together with other tourists or experts in order to impact the decision making process for trip planning. Finally, this literature review will segue into a discussion of the dependent outcomes of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization. The examination of the ways in which patrimonial powers and non-governmental factors disrupt each others’ constructions will be informed by sociological, anthropological, and cultural studies approaches

2.1 Taking Account of Culture

What qualifies as “culture” has been expanding and while this thesis advocates for a broad definition of culture, it is useful to distinguish between older and more recent conceptions of the cultural. According to McGuigan (2002), culture represents two generalities: 1) arts and higher learning, and 2) ways of life (pp. 23). These categorical distinctions contribute to varying perceptions among tourists and industry professionals about which acts are cultural and which are not. As it has been previously stated, there is some cultural aspect to most travel (Singh, 2010b). At the heart of the cultural is the development of an appreciation of something by virtue of where it comes from or what it
represents (Breton, 1964). While Breton intended this description to elucidate cultural nationalism, it also focuses on what is at stake for cultural tourism.

Traditional cultural tourism endeavors are built upon widely recognized high art and history performances and objects. Tourists who are attracted to these sites look for an encounter with another culture, but, as definitions of art and culture expand, this category becomes more problematic to define. These tourists may still engage in other types of tourism or nonexclusive practices, but the primary focus of the trip is to consume a more traditional subset of culture.

As this field grows, more indicators of daily life have become part of the cultural definition. For these tourists, experiencing culture is a motivator for travel; however, the main focus is on completing a particular task or undergoing a very specific experience. The wider cultural significance by which they are surrounded may not be as readily recognizable to these individuals; however, they still absorb cultural elements that are indicative of place. This form of tourism is what Smith calls “Pastiche Tourism” and related to what Canclini (1995) refers to as cultural hybridization. According to Smith, “Pastiche Tourism” is the quintessential postmodern blending of the traditional and the pop (2003, p 18). It fuses high and low art forms to create a new experience. For Canclini (1995), hybridization is the blending of two fields into a new product. Building upon those definitions, examples of this form of tourism are the Olympic opening ceremonies, culinary tourism, and religious tourism. For these types of tourism, it’s the combination of their traditional antecedents along with their modern attractiveness that makes them appealing. Also, in each case, cultural messages are communicated even though the
tourist is there for a different primary purpose and the tourists are required to engage in the cultural act, often without a guide to mediate the experience.

2.2 Explanatory Factors

Approaching cultural tourism from the interaction of government institutional interventions and mediated environments highlights the tension between states and individuals. The following portions of this literature review have been divided between an explanation of the patrimonial process, indicative of government institutional intervention, and the ways in which mediated environments manifest themselves.

2.3 Constructing Patrimony

In order for a government to generate a national image, first a patrimonial message must be established. Governments rely on new interpretations of historical facts, in the form of research, myths, mass products, and institutions. These established products are then placed on the market as representative of the location or nation. Myths surrounding concepts like heritage and identity imply that these entities are unquantifiable and intangible. Their existence for a culture is assumed. However, the elements that contribute to an understanding of these terms are manipulated to create a marketable commodity. Tourists consume these products, forming an opinion about what they have witnessed. The reflections of tourists can be easily shared and ultimately impact the industry. Whether the ensuing cultural product is representative of the culture is another matter. After all, a culture cannot be stuffed into a shopping bag or crammed into a twenty minute cultural display (Hewison, 1991). The patrimonial producers engage in selective narrative formation, which may alter the original cultural aspects of the
nation. Implicit in this discussion are the influences of national patrimony, identity, and heritage. Media and tourist reactions to the patrimonial products determine the success of the messages and future strategies. The ways in which messages are constructed must first be investigated in order to understand tourist responses to patrimonial production.

According to Turnbridge (1994), there is a link between the tourism market and the political sphere. Because tourism implies a movement of people across borders or within a country, the state must be involved because of safety and trade issues (Burns & Novelli, 2007). The political structure can provide the stability required for tourism, and tourism generates important revenue for the continuation of the state.

While the specifics of construction may vary by nation, market, and content demand, there are several common methods by which national powers conceive of patrimony. In order to assert dominant ideology, the patrimonial authority must take control of what Bourdieu refers to as “cultural capital” when assuming power (Ashworth, 1994). According to Bourdieu (1993), cultural capital is a form of knowledge that prepares the observer by establishing a deep, personal understanding of cultural relations and artifacts. It relates heavily to the appropriation of heritage and identity in order to exploit the use of the past for the present. Cultural capital assists in establishing cultural citizenship which “…concerns the maintenance and development of cultural lineage via education, custom, language, religion, and the acknowledgement of difference in and by the mainstream” (Lewis & Miller, 2002, pg 1). Messages about nationalism and patriotism are established using cultural capital to define a nation’s identity and place it in relation to other nations.
Heritage and history are necessary for identity formation, but there is a subtle distinction between the two. Simply put, “History is the remembered record of the past: heritage is a contemporary commodity purposefully created to satisfy contemporary consumption” (Ashworth, 1994, p 16). Without a malleability of meaning for its artifacts and cultural markers (Ednesor, 1998), a nation state cannot evolve to create the wide array of products needed to sustain and create nationalism over a long period of time.

In order to create patrimony, the national elite must invest in certain institutions of practice which are visited by both tourists and locals. According to Canclini (2005), patrimony is politicized through the dramatization of the past in the forms of commemoration, monuments, and museums. It is by tracing the lineage of a country or a political movement that authority is reinforced. Educational practices also are essential for the creation of patrimony. By institutionalizing lessons about identity through the framing of history in texts and lessons, pupils come to internalize a vision of themselves, their country, and the role of both in a global context. The mere emphasis of borders and boundaries in a geography course may be sufficient to reinforce the messages of inclusion and exclusion that are inherent in patrimony (Canclini, 2005; Ednesor, 1998). However, it is more common for patrimonial messages to be highlighted in more obvious manners.

Patrimony also is physically displayed in public spaces, like museums which exhibit the heritage product or nationalistic image for both citizens and foreign visitors. Museums offer the opportunity to categorize, contextualize, and codify patrimonial messages for a captive audience. While sometimes considered stale warehouses, many museums have offered innovative presentations and ways of viewing patrimonial objects
(Canclini, 1995). The active renewal of displays and presentations means that patrimonial messages must adapt so as to lend themselves to new modes of representation.

Patrimonial messages are mirrored in the performances and display choices either made or tolerated by the state. For example, one method of identifying state interests is to examine research grant recipients and award winners. The state’s selections send signals about priorities just as the use of cultural artifacts adds to the general message. Highlighting cultural artifacts produces a representative symbolic system and reflects the ways in which individuals process cues (Greenfield, 1996). These symbols amplify modes of representation, clearly transmitting meaning (Bruner, 1965, 1966). However, in the case of patrimony, meanings must be malleable if cultural objects are used to forge new identities.

Inherent in producing artistic or cultural works is the potential for the application of subjective meaning. Becker (1982) suggests that craft is a lesser art because it is made for useful consumption; however, he acknowledges the possibility for art to become craft and vice versa. He suggests possibilities for this change; however, he does not consider tourism as a potential factor. Crafts sold as souvenirs can represent such a shift; objects with rich significances are sometimes mass produced and the original concept is lost on the buyer (Dilworth, 2003).

National governments rarely manufacture the products of patrimony, instead relying upon smaller producers whose arts and crafts become hybrid cultural goods. This hybridization is necessary for the progression of culture and the continued evolution of the elite message, as well as for creating new methods of cultural symbolism. Garcia Canclini (1995) refers to cultural hybridity as a mixing between zones of purity, while
not erasing the original zones. So a hybrid product combines two distinct content areas into a new area. A hybrid product moves more easily between traditional and modern marketplaces than its human producer (Canclini, 1995). A hybrid product also may be defined by a different mode of production. For example, the use of a process or certain materials may change the meaning or significance of a product, like substituting plastic for the traditional bone. The materials and the processes impact the authentic perception surrounding the piece for sale. While Becker (1982) believes that maintaining processes with the same producers is not necessary, it is misleading to suggest that something is not lost by altering a process. However, it is equally deceptive to hold to a vision of traditional cultural products as static objects that cannot become emergent social forces. Ultimately the mass commodification of cultural objects does not signify cultural doom; however, careful attention must be paid to the evolution of the market.

Culture should be viewed as an evolving hybrid force instead of one with a waning presence. Because of its importance to patrimonial construction, it follows that culture itself must shift in meaning and evolve. A static cultural meaning would not lend itself to patrimonial construction because it would not be as malleable. Some believe that culture is a fleeting performance leaving artifacts in its wake as it fades (Lyman & Kahle, 1998). However, cultural artifacts and industry, defined as “…goods and services that provoke thought such as music, literature, drama, communications, documentary, dance, and institutions that house cultural goods and services” (Van Grasstek, 2006), shape the processes of modernity and the creation of new products. The successful union of the modern and the traditional depends on the dynamic of the combination of stakeholders as well as the reconciliation of the tension between preservation and financial concerns.
In the cultural tourism industry, an inherent tension exists between cultural tourism as a product and as a means to protect and preserve cultural heritage. According to McKercher & du Cros (2002), it stands to reason that tourism is primarily an economic product and, secondarily, contributes to preservation. Losing sight of the economic and attempting to use tourism solely for heritage management purposes misuses and misconstrues the industry. The goal is to involve the hosts in the decision making process and communicating the ramifications of certain practices (Smith, 2003a). The product can provide an economic boost and empower a people to control their cultural progression.

Market pressures can cause cultures to concede to industry expectations at the expense of heritage. But could the market be shifted to encourage accuracy? Heritage and tourism have a definite link in that they, “… are collaborative industries, heritage converting locations into destinations and tourism making them economically viable as exhibits of themselves” (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, pp. 151). While a community may want to open itself to outside influence, it follows that maintaining a form of cultural authenticity would be a priority both for cultural continuation and for preservation of the basis upon which the industry was created. However concretely determining what constitutes accuracy and authenticity is difficult, if not impossible.

The concept of the authentic experience can mire and significantly complicate the discussion of tourism. Some scholars posit that because tourism is an experience industry, every discreet experience is authentic because of its occurrence (Edelheim, 2005). While it is accurate to say that a tourist can authentically having an experience, this perspective presents a somewhat egotistical view of travel. If one is only to measure her experience
internally without reference to the quality of the product being consumed, the communal aspect of culture and cross cultural experiences become confounded. Instead of attempting to evaluate authenticity, a better measure is sincerity. This term accounts for both the host’s and visitor’s interactions with each other and implies a value exchange that is authentically experiential for both groups (McIntosh & Johnson, 2005). According to McIntosh & Johnson, “… a ‘sincere’ interaction influenced by hosts’ values creates an understanding and an authentic experience for why traditional cultural aspects are best kept for the host culture’s viewing or experience only, or, alternatively, why some traditions may be commodified for tourism” (2005, pp. 37). It also implies that a certain degree of mutual respect and interest exists between the groups. Sincerity may appear idealistic; however, a lack of it would impair a product’s authenticity.

The aforementioned concepts demonstrate the ways in which patrimonial construction and theoretical constructs explain the basis for cultural construction. A proper understanding of patrimonial construction, and tourists’ reactions to it, requires an understanding of how cultural capital is formed and reinforced through institutions, mass products, and narrative formation. Theories about construction lay a foundation for more specific investigation into construction on a national level.

**Constructing on a National Level**

Establishing a patrimonial message is the first step in constructing a nationally accepted identity. In order to create a national narrative, governments rely on cultural aspects to spark a patrimonial system which takes advantage of history and social capital. These nationalistic conceptions reinforce the regime in power, as well as become a national brand that can be used to further other markets. It should be noted that the degree
to which a nation participates in patrimonial construction can vary by government type, population demographics, and other aspects endemic to a specific nation. However, all nations, to some degree, engage in the construction of national myths in order to inspire unity.

Patrimony comes in many forms but is marked by the passing on of the material remains of the past (Ferry, 2006). While physical remains are easier to identify, non-material goods also are patrimonial ingredients (Silveira & Lima Filho, 2006) and the categorizing of any remains results in the creation of an intangible identity based on linkages to predecessors. Patrimony is linked inextricably to the past because it requires a reference point in order to gain legitimacy as an ingrained quality or representation.

According to Ashworth (2004), patrimony uses history to shape socio-cultural place-identities in support of dominant national organizations. History is a multifaceted discipline that includes events, culture, myth, and other aspects of narrative. These elements inform patrimonial construction and result in an identity rooted in heritage. Cultural patrimony, which is heritage represented through products and values (Canani, 2005), is particularly essential for national identity formation.

Governments use culture as apart of nationalistic rhetoric because of culture’s intrinsic link to personal identity. While culture does imply a group phenomenon, individuals become stakeholders in what culture means for them and how it colors their perceptions and opinions. Through patrimony, governments are able to make their visions appear as natural and logical extensions of the nation’s historical backdrop. Patrimony fulfills two equally important societal requirements: a cultural desire for significance and a political need for historical legitimacy (Canclini, 1995). Both are needed for a state and
its citizens to gain a national identity and function as a more cohesive unit. Patrimony formation is a selective process, however, and whose heritage is featured in the narrative is an important and controversial question (Turnbridge, 1994). By using a broad sense of what culture denotes, it is easy to see the ways in which “…a series of policies or guidelines operate to define what takes place and which versions of the social they privilege” (Lewis & Miller, 2002, pp. 3).

Because the patrimonial picture cannot be comprehensive, some groups are excluded. These types of exclusions can be offensive to those omitted; such is the case when dealing with minorities or indigenous groups (Smith, 2003a). Instead of being able to place themselves within a larger context, they either have to fight to be remembered, fade into obscurity, or form their own smaller groups governed by their own formed identities. Legacies of colonialism have been particularly damaging, as have creating national narratives that acknowledge and justly value minority cultural groups. These choices must be made with care as grafting the modern onto the historic can create a superficial and forced interpretation (Carr, 1994).

Creating a representative cultural product is complicated by commodification, which favors neatly packaged messages. These commodities are economic indicators that assist governments in measuring their success. Because patrimony deals with cultural products and modes of production, it cannot be separated from the marketplace (Canclini, 1995). An economy has formed around them because of their personal nature and ability to connect one with the past. Heritage generates revenue (Newby, 1994) and is a product itself (Ashworth, 1994). Comoditization begs the question of whether heritage, like all products, has a shelf life. In fact, the artifacts and products that emerge from this industry
and the interpretations surrounding them do need to evolve in order to remain relevant to potential consumers.

While it can harvest cultural products to be used for its own devices, patrimony also is subject to cultural influences. Regime changes often bring about or necessitate patrimonial construction changes, but societal innovations, new practices, or popular sentiment also require patrimonial shifts. These shifts partly involve displaying or encouraging the new interpretation publically. Institutionalizing heritage in a museum, for example, is a common way in which governments and societies boost a new perspective (Canclini, 1995). Adaptive heritage, in which a site with an original meaning is appropriated to create a space with new meaning (Turnbridge, 1994) suggests that the state and industry providers shape the meaning of cultural objects.

The impact of patrimony on creating meaning for identity and place formation is integral to the understanding of how culture shifts over time. The methods and priorities for patrimonial construction are revealed by examining narrative formation and product creation. These meanings as applied to the nation are extended to a global stage in order to create an international image, which is necessary for the creation of a tourism industry.

**Constructing on an International Level**

Thus far, discussion of patrimony has limited it to a national sphere. It is when the product becomes an international entity which crosses borders and inserts itself into other cultures that its implications for globalization become apparent. Without an understanding of international image formation and branding, it would be difficult to analyze globalized industries. Past interactions, forms of governance, and other factors influence foreign assessments of a nation. The establishment of a national brand aids in
controlling, to a certain degree, international notions. These brands usually represent a cohesive, nation-wide strategy. A good public relations model and a history of stability and reliability within a nation create trust, make it easier to trade, and draw visitors.

Finland is a good example of a national branding strategy that is resulting in increased visibility abroad. For a remote country like Finland, enticing foreign visitors can be difficult given the location and climate. There also is a global perception, of which the Finns are well aware, that the serious Finnish people are not particularly entertaining to be around. According to Jussi Pajunen, Mayor of Helsinki, “We Finns used to take ourselves and our work very seriously, now we are trying to relax a bit” (2009). However, relax is a relative term as Finnish industries continue to work hard. The Ministry of Education and Culture, responsible for tourism, has begun to identify and promote Finland’s unique cultural aspect in an effort to set it apart from other locations. Design, innovation, and environmental projects have come to be the major areas of Finnish culture.

In addition, the cultivation of an “eccentric games” industry has been beneficial to Finland from both tourism and public relations standpoints. The image of an austere borderland is dissipating to reveal a country with a sense of humor and welcoming atmosphere. Finland has received publicity recently for several alternative sporting events which attracts international participants and spectators. Consider the “Wife Carrying World Contest,” which takes place in the small town of Sonkajärvi, located in central Finland. While there are individual and relay wife carrying events, the main attraction is the grueling obstacle course through which husbands must carry their wives without dropping them. The couple that successfully navigates obstacle course the most quickly
wins the wife’s weight in beer. Many countries, including the United States, the United Kingdom, Ireland, and Australia, have national qualifying rounds before couples and teams are sent to Finland to compete (Sonkajärvi, 2009). There also is the Air Guitar World Championship, held as part of the Oulu Music Video Festival, in which seventeen countries send multiple participants to compete.

Sharing cultural artifacts with others abroad is one way to circulate a brand and spread nationally created patrimony to a global audience. Anything from a traveling museum exhibit to an affiliation with a movie or television show can heighten awareness of culture or place abroad (Beeton, 2005). According to some scholars, bringing culture to viewers instead of having viewers travel is another form of cultural tourism (Smith, 2003a). By that logic, many things could be labeled as tourism. However, there is a difference between engaging in tourism and engaging in acts that create an affinity for a place and may eventually lead to tourism.

One way in which Finland promotes its brand is to import cultural tourists. The Finnish government will pay the majority of the expenses for professionals, especially journalists, to travel to Finland. Using developed networks in the missions abroad, the Ministry for Foreign Affairs, “… brings over 200 cultural journalists and influential personages to Finland each year on study visits” (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2008). Instead of experiencing services abroad, the potential consumer is brought to the products and introduced to them through a meaningful experience. The Finnish government pays transportation and some food expenses, but the program is an investment in positive publicity, increased visibility, and good relations abroad.
Journalists, in particular, can aid Finland in advertising their message using mass media outlets.

Marketing significantly influences international perspectives, and campaigns can entice tourists. Countries are aware of their public images and rely on advertising, public relations, direct mailing/marketing, and sales promotions to present a flattering picture (Avraham & Ketter, 2006). Branding has become a buzzword in the tourism industry for a nations endeavor to locate and promote unique aspects within the culture in order to competitively posture for increased tourism revenues (Nworah, 2006).

The Finnish example speaks to the potential influence of patrimonial construction on global perception. While Finns still have a long way to go to revamp their public image and positively impact their potential as a tourism destination, the steps that the government has taken imply that cultural elites are aware of how the Finnish are perceived abroad. The government has used national marketing campaigns and branding to begin a shift in cultural perception. This example directly speaks to the ways in which selective narration and perception building impact the dominant cultural perception. The success of such campaigns leads to both increases in tourism and visibility of the nation abroad.

**Constructing for Tourists and Branding of Place**

Tourists do not consume an arbitrary product set before them. The indicators created for tourists reflect the patrimonial product, which are then subjected to the tourist’s evaluation. The host industry has anticipated and created a specific type of commodity for consumption resulting from selective narration, patrimony, and simplified
heritage. Creating and maintaining tourist space is necessary for the industry and may ultimately reinterpret the experience of place for the inhabitants.

The physical representation of place in “…symbols, images, signs, phrases, and narratives” (Ednesor, 1998, 12) is a requirement for establishing tourist space. These forms of paraphernalia are reproducible and originate from a variety of sources. Materials organized by tourism companies or national tourism boards, like guide books or pamphlets, create a vision and an expectation for a visitor. Television programs and movie settings can popularize and, in some cases, idealize the potential traveler’s image of place (Beeton, 2005). The sending of postcards, purchasing of souvenirs, and the taking of photographs are other ways in which tourists organize their experiences for themselves and for others (Ednesor, 1998). Even more likely to influence a potential traveler, however, are internet based review sites, where past travelers can give accounts of their experiences. On these sites, ex-tourists construct and comment upon travel options for potential tourists.

As tourism has spread, so too have fears about homogenization of place. Many scholars fear that common tourism practices and infrastructure slowly will make sites less unique (Ashworth, 1994). The presentation of sites will be similar and amenities offered will be of the same type offered globally. But how does a place stay true to its identity while also readying itself for outside influences? It is a potential problem for an industry that thrives on marketing uniqueness of culture and place (Keitumetse, 2007). According to Newby (1994), “The ‘ordinariness’ of a different place can be the basis for its attractiveness, as long as it is different from the ‘ordinariness’ of our own experiences” (pp. 208). As long as the everyday of the visitor differs from that of the host, there always
will be incentive to visit. If places do homogenize through similar development practices, perhaps the environment and eco-tourism will become more valued tourist experiences. Eventually, the most unique aspects of a place will be the natural geography and scenery. If eco-tourism is the future of travel, hopefully, states will take proper measures to preserve nature before it disappears as ecological tourism is not a sustainable long term practice (Smith, 2003a).

Any tourist who believes that he or she is living the authentic experience of someone from the host location is not realizing the impact that an outside presence has on a location. For the host culture, particularly those that have maintained a distance from modernity, the impact of a visitor can be acute. In some cases, hosts must recreate aspects of their culture in a fashion appropriate for tourists (Smith, 2003a; Edelheim, 2005). What the tourist comes to regard as the authentic original is indeed an updated copy.

These tensions are rooted in Baudrillard’s (1981) concepts of simulation and simulacra, where the real and the spectacle become indistinguishable. If a cultural tourism experience has the potential to devolve into an experience of simulacra and simulation, is it possible to retain part of the authentic, especially when the influences that tourism introduces ultimately alter the original? Over time the cultural performance, combined with other influences, impacts the original cultural touchstone and potential alters it.

**Government Institutional Intervention**

Patrimonial construction can be described in terms of stronger and weaker institutional intervention. The ways in which government entities manage and construct cultural heritage reveals differences among tourism subsets. Different types of
governments will approach cultural propagation and preservation in different ways, exerting varying levels of control and transparency. The spectrum of control ranges from those associated with authoritarian systems to those of socialized liberal democratic societies. The type of government dictates much of the approach to cultural construction. In some ways, it seems as though more democratic nations are more comfortable with their cultures and that is why less intervention is needed; however, that may not be the case. While there are many vantage points from which to examine government intervention into cultural construction, the example of national museums may be the best to establish a baseline. Creating national museums is an appealing practice for governments because it offers the opportunity for direct message construction to combine with a captive audience. By using museums as an example, one can describe an essentially universal practice and examine the ways in which different forms of government lead to different types of interaction.

Government responses to concerns over issues associated with cultural tourism vary, although certain practices seem to be universal. The funding of and continued interest in a National Museum of History, Art, or some such subject is an almost universal priority. The degree of control and comfort level with constructing culture, perhaps predictably depends on the government and history of the country. In some ways, museums are, “…an appeal to a certain form of well-behaved citizenship that respects authority and the narratives that sustain it” (Lewis & Miller, 2002, pp. 2). The following will examine the construction of and policies surrounding national museums as an indicator of cultural institutional intervention in China, the United States, and Italy. It should be noted that national museums are created both for international groups visiting a
country as well as for a nation’s own citizens. While not extensive case studies into these nations, these brief accounts assist in the later case study investigations.

China and its communist leadership have a strict ideological interest in controlling cultural perception. The National Museum of China is an impressive four-story building that runs the length of Tian’anmen Square and has taken over the space of the previous Museum of Chinese History and the Museum of the Chinese Revolution (Elsea, 2006). All exhibit material is owned by the state. As China continues to gain momentum in the global sphere while by no means being considered a liberal society, it follows that the control of the patrimonial image is a priority for China. In addition, no admission to the museum is charged (Wenhan, 2009). Free admission is used to encourage visits and the dissemination of the patrimonial images.

China also has begun to export its cultural history on a global level. While China formerly limited the circulation of artifacts (Xianggung, 2008), the state has seen the benefit of introducing global spectators to samples of its history. The most well-known of these displays is the Terra Cotta Warrior display that has been travelling the world. Final statistics have not been released, as the exhibit is ongoing, but, according to the director of the British Museum, Neil MacGregor, the Terra Cotta Warriors received a record breaking 850,619 visitors during their six month stint at that museum alone (Maddocks, 2008). A quick internet search for news articles related to the exhibit reveals article titles such as, “China’s Terracotta Army to Conquer Canada from 2010-2012” (ArtDaily, 2010) and “Terracotta Army awaits British hordes” (Alberge, 2007). By its promotion of this exhibit, the Chinese state attempts to link the modern Chinese state to its historical legacy. It also is interesting that one of the most emphasized aspects of the exhibit is the
uniqueness of the individual soldiers, with each outfit and face being unique (China Odyssey Tours, 2010). The uniqueness of each soldier displays the meticulous craftsmanship and artistic legacy of the Chinese. Militaristic imagery aside, the immense popularity of this exhibit has led to the successful spread of Chinese culture on a global level.

Before 1949, there were several private, non-government owned museums in China. After the People’s Republic of China was established in 1949, the state, “…oversaw the construction and administration of museums as well as regulating the important acquisition, preservation, and research work performed by these institutions” (Xianggung, 2008, p 41). However, throughout the 1980’s and 1990’s, private collections were allowed to grow and smaller private exhibitions took place, eventually leading to a social and legal structure in which the state permitted private museums to be established. For example in 2002, the “Laws on the Protection of Cultural Relics of the People’s Republic of China” emerged in which there was shift in referring to the artifacts of private collections as “scattered cultural artefacts” to “cultural artefacts in non-governmental collection” (Xianggung, 2008, p 46). Although state permission is still required for the opening of private museums, some do exist. GuanFu Museum, founded by art collector Mr. Ma Weidou, was opened in 1996 in a suburb of Beijing as the first private museum in China26. While some ventures have been successful, many private museums struggle to maintain viewership (Xianggung, 2008).

The United States is considered to be the exact ideological opposite of China; however, the American government also has an interest in controlling and creating patrimonial imagery. The egalitarian basis of the nation and its dedications to freedom

26 GuanFu Museum (2006)
require those values to be reflected in the administration of the public institutions. Public museums do not require an admission fee and government permission is not required to establish a private museum. The Smithsonian Institution is responsible for most of the United States’ national museums and according to its homepage, “…is the world's largest museum complex and research organization composed of 19 museums, 9 research centers, and the National Zoo.”

The Smithsonian Institution, a “Trust Instrumentality of the United States,” is not a federal agency nor was it established by the government. However, the majority of its employees are members of the United States Civil Service, and it does accept private donations. Rather, the Smithsonian Institution is the result of a mysterious and generous bequest of British scientist, James Smithson, who bequeathed his estate, “to the United States of America, to found at Washington, under the name of the Smithsonian Institution, an establishment for the increase and diffusion of knowledge among men” (History). In 1846 an Act of Congress brought the Smithsonian Institution to fruition and established a Board of Regents to oversee the administration. The Smithsonian Institution owns the rights to most of the collections that it displays, with the exception of pieces that are on loan from private collections. While the Smithsonian habitually receives international exhibits, it does not loan out its own collections. It does, however, regularly allow exhibits to travel to other United States locations through the Smithsonian Institution Traveling Exhibition Service (SITES).

27 (Smithsonian, n.d.a)
28 Smithsonian, n.d.b.
29 Smithsonian, n.d.c.
30 Smithsonian, n.d.d.
The Smithsonian Institution facilities attract both foreign and domestic tourists. While the United States has no federal tourism agency, in 2004 the United States Department of Commerce estimated that over 10.6 million international tourists engaged in cultural and heritage tourism in the United States and museum visits were listed as a motivating factor in these visits (Craine, 2006, pp. 5). According to the Smithsonian Visit Statistics, the Institution facilities received around 20.4 million visits, without any indication of country of origin\(^{31}\). There is no way to know how many international visitors actually visited Smithsonian facilities. In 2009 there were 30 million total visits, with the National Museum of History reporting the most visits at 7.4 million\(^{32}\).

These examples reveal many central issues for government intervention in heritage presentation and preservation. China, the authoritarian party, and the United States, the liberal democracy, have similar strategies for providing foreign and domestic tourists with nationally sponsored cultural exhibits. The large differences between their two approaches, incidentally also the hallmark that defines them, are the issues of permission and freedom. Americans do not need direct permission from the government to display content in a private museum. In addition, the Smithsonian Institute allows for some outside input into its displays. For example, the Museum of Native American History includes displays created by and narrated by the Indian tribes included in the museum.

Italy is a nation that has had a significant amount of time with which to become comfortable with its culture and has a long legacy to display. First of all, Italian museums, national or private, charge for admission. They also have partially privatized

\(^{31}\) Newsdesk, 2010

\(^{32}\) Newsdesk, 2010
portions of their museums. In 2001, the Berlusconi government passed a law to turn over management for about 3,000 state-run museums to private companies (Henneberger, 2001). Italy now has 400 state-run museums, 4,000 private ones, and more than 100,000 churches and chapels of artistic significance (Sylvers, 2004). If the Italian government attempted to fund all these projects, there would be no funding left for anything else. However, the plan to privatize was not popular with most Italians or historians from other countries.

Italian cultural exhibits often tour other nations and the ticket sales increase state profits. The government still owns the collections and the content, but the daily administration of some museums is left up to private entities (Henneberger, 2001). Concessions in the remaining 400 state-run museums also have been sold to private companies who manage shops, tour groups, and restaurants within the facilities (Sylvers, 2004). More than a change in administration, this trend signals a cultural change in how Italians approach art. In previous times, economies and artistic fields were viewed as two separate entities but the impetus for combining the two is to raise money to support culture as opposed to trying to profit off culture (Sylvers, 2004). It has been, on the whole, successful.

Patrimony orders heritage and society on both a national and international level. Patrimony is used as a tourist attraction that aids in the unique branding of place. However without visitors and tourists, the patrimonial message cannot be efficiently consumed or widely disseminated. Even if tourists understand the message being delivered to them, there is no guarantee that the tourist will internalize, accept, or pass it along to others. As tourism grows and the cultural field expands, the identity of a location
and those in it can be impacted. The development of extensive mediated environments, the other explanatory factor in this thesis, contributes to shifts in meaning and the evolution of cultural tourism.

2.4 Mediated Environments

Tourism is a growing industry, creating natural synergies with a variety of service sectors and fostering the opportunity to boost national economies. In 2009, international tourism arrivals decreased from 920 million to 880 million due to the global economic downturn; however, the UNWTO is already seeing positive growth and predicting increases in tourism for 2010. Classifying the exact percentage of tourism that is culturally motivated is difficult due to problems in defining what counts as cultural tourism and what does not. However, the UNWTO claims that the cultural tourism subset comprises approximately 40% of all tourism (Singh, 2010b). However, what is less understood is how government institutional intervention coupled with the influence of mediated environments aid in this increase while also contributing to differing levels of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization in the produced heritage product.

This section of the literature review will examine exploration, a possible antecedent for tourism, which aids in explaining some the possible motivations for tourism and the ways in which popular media are utilized. The components that comprise mediated environments will be discussed in detail as well as the ways in which networking concepts can help explain the power of mediated environments.

---

33 United Nations, World Tourism Organization, 2010
2.5 The Tourist-Explorer

“There are not so many round pegs in square holes as one might think. Most people, in spite of what they tell you choose the occupation that they secretly desire. You will hear a man say who works in an office, ‘I should like to explore, to rough it in far countries.’ But you will find that he likes reading the fiction that deals with the subject, but that he himself prefers the safety and moderate comfort of an office stool.”

*Death in the Clouds* by Agatha Christie, pp. 183

Over time, travel has progressed from being an elite activity to one that is more accessible for the general masses. The days of professional explorers, in the sense that Christie means, have passed. In their wake, however, are those travelers who become temporary explorers of their own and human nature. Being a tourist can range from a local trip to major international travel. Without innovations in technology, particularly the proliferation of transportation options, travel would not be as accessible as it is today. People travel for different reasons; however, a historical look at this type of travel reveals a close link to exploration. An explorer and a tourist are two very different entities. Part of the psychology of exploration though may be responsible for some of the desire to travel today, especially in the cultural sphere. Exploration offers a way in which to access and understand tourist motivations as well as the media upon which tourists rely. After an understanding has been reached, the media used can be investigated in further detail.

The lure of the unknown and the veneration for those who have conquered it occupy a special place in history. While it is true that many of the better known explorers come from a Western tradition, there are many who do not, thus allowing for the generalization of this concept. The tourist as explorer has added a romantic aspect to modern tourism. The likelihood of a tourist adding to the physical knowledge of the earth is extremely low. However the term exploration can denote many things, like self-

---

34 Explorers from the 1300's, 2009
exploration, investigation of human nature, or cross-cultural understanding. Tourists can explore a place for the first time in the sense that they have not been there before and their experience may be different from those of previous visitors. In this way, tourism and travel can play upon the human desire to explore.

Just as there is no one typical tourist, there is no one typical explorer and their motivations can be described in a similar way to those of tourists. According to Fairchild (1948), explorers’ biographies cite a myriad of reasons for exploration. From external factors, like gold and glory, to internal factors, like a quest for knowledge and a born desire to discover the unknown, the motivations of explorers are often difficult for biographers to determine (420-421). While on a different plane, these desires still play a prominent role in the personas of the self-described survivalists, travelers, and adventurers of today. One only has to look at a television guide to find such shows as Man vs. Wild with Bear Grylles, Living with the Mek with Mark Anstice and Olly Steeds, and Survivorman with Les Stroud. There is even Meet the Natives on the Travel Channel in which five tribemen from the remote Tanna Island in the Pacific travel across the United States. According to the program’s website, the visit of these men is less about their journey and more about forcing, “…us to look at ourselves through brand-new eyes.”35 While there are many comments that can be made about these types of shows, they all reinforce the idea that some type of cultural, personal, spiritual, or other exploration is possible through travel.

35 About the Show: meet the natives, 2010
2.6 Inspiring Tourists and Modern Exploration

Motivation for travel varies. As previously stated, something of the explorer mentality may be responsible for some tourist motivations and the ensuing issues with authenticity and preservation. This section will identify touristic motivations for travel, certain behaviors of travelers, and popular tourist sites. Over time, changes to conceptions of culture and tourist definitions have led to changes in how tourists think of themselves and others. Technology has facilitated the formation of mediated environments that rely on communities of dialogue connecting individuals across distances.

Travel can be inspired by many things. In some cases genuine curiosity can be the motivator, while in others anxiety about one’s own identity is the impetus. Both of these reasons reflect the motivators of explorers. No matter the motivation, travel results in comparison between the travel experience and the tourist’s everyday life. Travel also is viewed as being rejuvenating to one’s mental health. “If people do not travel, they lose status: travel is the marker of the status. It is a crucial element of modern life to feel that travel and holiday are necessary. ‘I need a holiday’ is the surest reflection of a modern discourse based on the idea that people’s physical and mental health will be restored if only they can ‘get away’ from time to time” (Urry, 1990, pp. 5). Ultimately, the tourist hopes to return home with a description, story, or other meaningful experience.

Tourists do not just leave with abstract messages and stories. They also bring back physical objects that represent their travel, which can either further or retard patrimonial messages. It is possible that a certain object could be used as a marker to hearken back to a certain learned message. However, it also is possible for the meaning of the object to
become more personal, leaving its original meaning behind. For example, one author writes that an antique Kachina Doll purchased for her in the Southwest on a family trip is more a representation from her childhood than a cultural artifact with an understood history (Dilworth, 2003). This is an example of identity being situated within history while being performed and altered on a daily basis.

Who travels and what the tourist does while on that journey are of supreme importance to the tourism industry. As has been shown, the question of who can and does travel has changed over time due to technological innovations and industry structure. For cultural tourism, the definition of the cultural hampers data collection. However, smaller scale studies have been helpful in determining the frequency and the tendencies of cultural tourists.

One such study determined that 66% of tourists in Spain during the 1990’s were engaged in some form of cultural tourism (Fernandez et. al., 2007). While primarily concerned with the success of inland cultural destinations, this study defined a typology of cultural tourism sites. These sites run the gamut of cultural activities: monuments; museums and art galleries; major cultural exhibitions; cultural landscapes and nature; world heritage sites; cultural routes; language study; cultural parks; cultural legacy; popular celebrations; festivals; ethnographic and gastronomic heritage; industrial heritage; and cities (Fernandez et. al., 2007, pp. 150-152). Each place, it can be argued, has a unique cultural draw even if it may be difficult to categorize the experience.

Tourists’ motivations have shaped travel and established popular destinations. However what is and is not popular waxes and wanes over time. As fears about authenticity, homogenization, and commoditization loom, travelers continue to search for
untouched places that will contribute to their global understanding. Aiding in this search are various popular media and user-generated content resources. In Chapter 3, these resources will be examined in reference to various industries in four different countries.

**Popular Media**

Television, films, and literature can have a profound impact on the ways in which a viewer processes and orders locations. They also can influence a desire to travel, either by initially exposing a viewer or creating a cult following (Beeton, 2005). For example, in “… 1978, the year after *Close Encounters of the Third Kind* was released, visitation to Devil’s Tower National Monument increased by a staggering 74%, while in a survey 11 years after the film’s premiere, one-fifth of respondents attributed their initial knowledge of the monument to the movie” (Tooke & Baker, 1996, 2005, pp. 22). In more recent years, the *Lord of the Rings* trilogy has significantly increased tourism to New Zealand and the government used the series as a promotional piece (Hudson & Brent Richie, 2006). These fictionalized stories draw visitors to sites and can result in a tourist consuming supplementary cultural products.

The account need not be fictional, however. The 2009 documentary film based on a bestseller *Horse Boy*, for example, has boosted Mongolian tourism visibility and resulted in Mongolian companies specializing in horse related tourism aimed at families\(^{36}\). In addition, a plethora of reality shows dealing with travel or visiting exotic locals have sprung up across the globe. Variations of *The Amazing Race* have become popular in several countries including the United States, Asia\(^{37}\), Central Europe\(^{38}\),

\(^{36}\) UB Post, 2010
\(^{37}\) AXN, 2010
\(^{38}\) Hilbrand, 2010
Brazil\textsuperscript{39}, Israel\textsuperscript{40}, Latin America\textsuperscript{41}, and China\textsuperscript{42}. In general, films have a greater potential to reach a global audience whereas television tends to be more regionally protected (Feigenbaum, 2010). While in the United States shows like \textit{No Reservations} with Anthony Bourdain, \textit{Bizarre Foods} with Andrew Zimmern, \textit{Great Weekends} with Samantha Brown, or \textit{Rick Steves’ Europe} with Rick Steves are popular, there is no guarantee that they are seen in or impact travel in other countries. However, travel shows or series that focus on both regional and international travel exist all over the world. While there are several examples, a few include the United Kingdom’s \textit{Around the World in 80 Days} and \textit{Full Circle} both hosted by Michael Palin\textsuperscript{43} and \textit{Going Tribal} with Bruce Perry\textsuperscript{44}, Finland’s \textit{Madventures}\textsuperscript{45}; Turkey’s \textit{Haberci}\textsuperscript{46}, Brazil’s \textit{Fantastico}\textsuperscript{47} and \textit{50 por I}\textsuperscript{48}; Russia’s \textit{Neputevye Zametki}\textsuperscript{49}; Canada’s \textit{Bump!}\textsuperscript{50}; France’s \textit{J’irai dormir chez vous}\textsuperscript{51} and \textit{Des trains pas comme les autres}\textsuperscript{52}; and South Africa’s \textit{Top Travel}\textsuperscript{53}, \textit{Studio 52}\textsuperscript{54}, and \textit{Going Nowhere Slowly}\textsuperscript{55}. The expansive network of television shows about travel has provided would-be-tourists with information and inspiration, creating both an affinity for certain locations and for travel in general. Once inspired, tourists consult traditional and new media guides to plan their trips and evaluate potential sites.

\textsuperscript{39} IMDb, 2007
\textsuperscript{40} ActiveTV, 2010
\textsuperscript{41} Discovery en Español, 2010
\textsuperscript{42} Shanghaiist, 2010
\textsuperscript{43} C., 2006, October 11
\textsuperscript{44} Co-produced by BBC Wales and the Discovery Channel: Discovery Channel, 2010
\textsuperscript{45} Madventures, 2009
\textsuperscript{46} Haberci, 2009
\textsuperscript{47} Fantástico, 2010
\textsuperscript{48} Website has a virus on it so using YouTube: 50 por I, 2009, May 5
\textsuperscript{49} Russia Info-Centre, 2009
\textsuperscript{50} Bump!, 2010
\textsuperscript{51} J’irai dormir chez vous (translation: \textit{I Will Sleep at Your Place})
\textsuperscript{52} Des Trains Pas Comme les Autres (translation: \textit{Not Another Train})
\textsuperscript{53} Valpré Top Travel, 2010
\textsuperscript{54} Studio 52, 2007
\textsuperscript{55} Going Nowhere Slowly, n.d.
Guidebooks

Guidebooks, throughout the ages, have been major contributors to the quest for travel and they reinforce the theme of exploration. They promote a view of culture that is somewhat standardized and often draw from patrimonial beliefs. They order and organize excursions, explain sites, and make recommendations that have the potential to define an entire trip. However even though they are rather structured, they still allow the traveler to make choices and reinforce the importance of personal exploration.

The first travel guidebook published in Europe was Rheinreise von Mainz bis Köln by Fr. Röhling in 1828 (Gresley, 2007). Closely on the heels of this German guide, however, was the greatly revered work of Karl Baedeker. His travel guides became a family business and over time more and more guides began to flood the market. These early books included itineraries, maps, and travel tips. They became so essential to travel that they were often referenced in popular literary works, like in E.M Forester’s A Room with a View and Where Angels Fear to Tread. While these guides were on the one hand helpful necessities, E.M Forester makes an observation that is still true today. An English clergyman and ex-patriot, Mr. Eager, comments:

If you will not think me rude, we residents sometimes pity you poor tourists not a little—handed about like a parcel of goods from Venice to Florence, from Florence to Rome, living herded together in pensions or hotels, quite unconscious of anything that is outside Baedeker, their one anxiety to get 'done' or 'through' and go on somewhere else. The result is, they mix up towns, rivers, palaces in one inextricable whirl.

(VI. The Reverend Arthur Beebe, the Reverend Cuthbert Eager, Mr. Emerson, Mr. George Emerson, Miss Eleanor Lavish, Miss Charlotte Bartlett, and Miss Lucy Honeychurch Drive Out in Carriages to See a View; Italians Drive Them)\(^{56}\)

---

\(^{56}\) The Free Library, n.d.
This quotation implies that the typical tourists often see very much, although they internalize or understand very little from their journey. While Mr. Eager is by no means a popular or sympathetic character in the novel, this observation speaks to many self-aware travelers’ fears. While guide books may be a good start in planning a trip, reliance on them risks ignorance and aversion to unplanned experiences.

Unplanned experiences and the sense of adventure associated with them reinforce the spirit of exploration, concepts highlighted in the modern age of guide books. The plethora of guidebook choices does lead one to wonder which is more reliable; however, most cater towards a specific demographic. Rick Steves’ and Fodor’s guides attract a different type of a traveler than the Lonely Planet or the Rough Guide books. Most of these books also specialize in particular regions of the world. Rick Steves, for example, specializes in guides for European destinations. However, all reflect the trend towards more targeted vacation destinations (Mantell, 2006). The day of the Grand Victorian Tour is over as people try to limit their travel area in order to get the most out of their time and money. According to one travel publisher, travelers, "...are valuing time over money, looking for ways to make educated decisions. People want to find something new, have stories to tell, but what that means has changed… The unknown is harder to find today but the craving for adventure survives” (Mantell, 2006). Many guidebooks go so far as to encourage their readers to be spontaneous. In his introduction to France 2009, Steves writes “Above all, slo-o-o-ow down. Spend hours in cafés lingering over un bon café, make a habit of making unplanned stops, hop on the l’arte de vivre barge, and surrender to the play of light as the Impressionists did” (XXIII, 2009). The mix of the practical advice and the romantic imagery aims to inspire travelers to make the travel experience
their own. While guidebooks still are considered necessary, travelers are turning to increasingly digital means of trip planning.

**User-Generated Content: Blogs and TripAdviser.com**

User-generated content has changed the technological landscape and the contribution of the *prosumer* (Stalder, 2001) to tourism has been in the area of blogs and recommendation websites. As peer-to-peer communications become the norm, government and industry professionals will have more trouble crafting messages (O’Connor, 2008). Some have referred to recommendation sites as an emulation of the travel agent system (Delgado & Davidson, 2002); however, the proliferation of web-based resources appears to be more of a reaction against the previously used system. The dissemination of information and the ability travelers to research their travel destinations, pay for tickets, make informed decisions about hotels, and learn about the location is an assertion of the technological independence that the internet provides. The case studies in Chapter 3 rely on this user-generated content to evaluate tourism industries and locate the average motivators for a tourist’s travel. In addition to providing a perceptual barometer, these websites themselves often influence and inspire travel decisions.

It can be difficult to know when to trust a blog; however, they can be a powerful tool and have a great deal of influence when coupled with salient issues (Hsu & Lin, 2008). They are widely viewed and the increase in their popularity implies a certain degree of trust in their content and the opinions of bloggers. In the United States alone, the number of blogs grew from 29,500 in 2000 to a staggering 5,340,000 in 2005\(^5\). Many blogs do not have longevity, either because of lack of a dedicated blogger or readers (Hsu

---

\(^5\) ZDNet Research, 2005, June 7
& Lin, 2008). The opinions shared in blogs have the potential to influence readers through the descriptions of likes and dislikes or by offering practical suggestions for travel. Popular among college students studying abroad, Peace Corps volunteers, or travelers hoping to document their journey, blogs create a digital document that both helps the blogger to not forget their trip and adds to place specific knowledge for the reader. Online travel blogs have become the internet equivalent of a captain’s log on a ship or an explorer’s journal. However, one often does not know very much about bloggers or their qualifications, thus it can be difficult to judge the accuracy or reliability of opinion.58

Online recommendation sites tend to be regarded as more reliable because they aggregate the opinions of sometimes thousands of contributors into one score or rating. According to the Pew Research Center’s Internet & American Life project, the percentage of American adults who have bought or made a travel reservation online has increased to 50% in 2009 from less than 20% in 2000 (Pew Internet & American Life Project, 2010). Booking reservations is only one tourism area that can be addressed online, although the rapid growth from 2000-2009 does reveal the potential influence of the internet. According to O’Connor (2008), TripAdvisor.com is a standalone website that provides “rich and relevant data” (pp. 47) and is not compromised by false reviews. In addition, O’Connor (2008) found that as the number of reviews increases the impact of false reviews is mitigated. TripAdvisor.com’s popularity has grown, receiving 32 million unique visitors per month (TripAdvisor, 2010a), which also speaks to its wide appeal and potential to influence public opinion.

---

58 This can improve if the reader habitually visits and reads the website. However, using google.com to research a location for all the available information can result in temporary visitors to blogs without an prior contact.
The internet is a wonderful tool; however, a few cautions must be offered along with this discussion. One concern about relying on aggregated opinion websites is the tendency for the extreme opinions to be the only ones reflected. Often the most motivated participants are those who either had an overwhelmingly positive or negative experience. In addition, the wealth of the data depends on the degree to which respondents interact with the interface and expand upon their given numerical rating. The briefer the review, the less information a user has to evaluate, especially when dealing with overly positive or negative comments (Sardone, n.d.). In addition, there have been indications that industry professionals in the hotel business have begun approaching travelers and offering incentives for positive reviews (Starmer-Smith, 2010). However, there are some ways to easily spot false reviews, such as reviewing the posters frequency of log-in or past postings and their language (O’Connor, 2008). Like most things, having a multitude of resources will increase the wealth of knowledge available to the tourist. While TripAdvisor.com is a reliable source, travelers should use it as one of many tools for trip planning. Internet resources, in particular, expand individual traveler’s networks and these networks account for the wide dissemination of information.

2.7 Networking Potential and Structural Possibilities

Encouraging tourism results in the formation of different networks among travelers, industry providers, and national tourism boards. In his discussion of ethnoscapes, Appadurai (1990) refers to tourists as part of a complex network of individuals whose actions reveal the global shift towards global mobility. Links among tourism providers and tourists expand the scope and reach of tourism initiatives. Internet technologies and popular media facilitate this networking.
Within the framework of cultural tourism, changes in culture happen over time and are the result of the complex interplay between patrimonial producers and tourist consumers. The continued growth of tourism reflects its network expansion. One way of understanding these changes over time is through a structural, networked approach. Tourism has a networking potential because of its ability to link people and industries over great distances for the purposes of exchanging and sharing information. After patrimonial messages have been established and the tourism market has grown, potential linkages between various stakeholders occur. In some cases, the networks are responsible for attracting more tourists. Networking strategies and actors are not limited to specific spheres of influence, including government institutional intervention, tourists, and beyond. These exchanges facilitate changes to the cultural product. Networking theory aspects, such as node identification and structural linkages, help to identify the main actors whose influence and actions result in shifts in cultural tourism practices.

Tourism not only links countries in networks with foreign corporations and investors, it also connects tourists, tourism markets, and tourism providers. These linkages help to expand the reach of tourism messages. Networks can attract tourists through advertising or shared interest areas. For example, it behooves Italian-American or Italian tour companies to advertise through the National Italian American Foundation because it is a potential client base with an already established affinity for the country.

Networking is fundamental not only for tourism promotion but also often the tourist is there. Networks can be expanded or limited depending on the experience of the tourists and the hosts. For governments and national tourism industries, positive linkages

---

to tourists can be impactful because there is the potential for return visits and for referrals to other tourists. Positive experiences can lead to affinities for products from a certain country or a more positive view about people from a certain locale. Alternatively, the opposite also is possible and negative host-tourist interactions can destroy possible positive benefits. The table below comes from approaching tourism as part of the social contact hypothesis. While its assumptions may appear self-evident, it highlights the subjective nature of perceptions and experience for both hosts and tourists.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Effects</th>
<th>Negative Effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developing positive attitudes about each other</td>
<td>Developing negative attitudes about each other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning about each other’s culture and customs</td>
<td>Tension, hostility, misunderstanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reducing negative perceptions and stereotypes</td>
<td>Increasing or forming new negative perceptions, thus increasing isolation and separation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing friendships</td>
<td>Reinforcing negative concepts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing pride, appreciation, respect, understanding, and tolerance for each other’s culture or for one’s own</td>
<td>Feelings of inferiority or superiority, communication problems, ethnocentrism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing self-esteem (for visitor or host)</td>
<td>Culture shock (for visitor or host)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological satisfaction with interaction</td>
<td>Dissatisfaction with mutual interaction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 3. Cross-Cultural tourist-host contact*

Robinson (1999) and Reisinger (1994)

The above chart illustrates the importance of the tourist experience for both the tourist and the host. The positive or negative results from these interactions imply how successful a patrimonial power will be in successfully communicating its message to a tourist. A satisfied tourist is much more receptive to and accepting of patrimonial messages than one who has had a negative experience. According to Reisinger (1994), the potential negative and positive interactions that result from social contact determine how groups will approach each other. The contact itself decreases the levels of anxiety
and uncertainty regardless of the perception formed. The positive or negative outcome can have numerous impacts on a host nation’s ability to strengthen network connections.

It also is interesting to consider that many of these negative and positive interactions are the result of chance encounters with individuals who are or are not officially tasked with representing their nations. It can be equally provocative to consider these relationships in terms of a networked occurrence, which rules out random contacts (Buchanan, 2002). The perception rests on whom one interacts with and how that individual behaves, which is then compared with all the other interactions that one has had with others in that country and an opinion is formed. A more developed country, which is conscious of that process and in a position to take measures, will try to diminish those variables by hiring people who will be more likely to provide a positive tourist experience. Having a clear and universal tourism marketing strategy and providing businesses with support and incentives also may be of benefit. Unkind or demanding tourists also could color the host’s perception of foreign counties. While hosts typically are viewed as ambassadors for their countries or locales, the same also is true of visitors.

Networking can connect patrimonial entities, like tourism offices and officials, both of which allow for best practices to be shared but also can increase homogenization of approaches to tourism issues. Regions dealing with similar issues and with comparable backgrounds may find it beneficial to interact, learn from each other, and perhaps even cross promote. Often, the parties involved are more intimately aware of the challenges facing their industries and approach them using a more concentrated strategy, resulting in a better solution. That being said, each country is unique and should be treated as an independent situation. Tourism providers should be cautious not to rely entirely on the
experiences and best practices of other locations. It is possible that a homogenous approach to tourism issues could be generated, effectively hindering innovation and impacting the unique basis tourism requires in order to flourish.

Networking is one way of explaining the ways in which patrimonial powers and tourists interact with each other and auxiliary tourism industry players. First because tourism itself is networked to other industries, patrimonial powers are able to create a cohesive picture of national goals and identities. These infrastructure areas reinforce each other. Networking also allows industry providers to target specific groups who will be more likely to partake of their products and show enthusiasm for them. Finally, the positive and negative relationships that result from tourist host interactions have a bearing on how tourists interpret locations and the degree to which patrimonial messages are successful in their aim.

2.8 Dependent Outcomes

The two sets of explanatory factors create tensions and raise questions about who ultimately controls the construction of culture. Just as exploration was a display of power for the state, sending tourists abroad is a signal of a liberal society and attracting them is an indication of cultural superiority. Separating the tourist from the state is difficult; however, tourists have always been free to accept or reject the patrimonial messages of the state. Sharing their perceptions with other travelers is made easier by the advent of certain technologies, which add to the power of the individual in influencing construction and perception. Explorers, at least in their home countries, were considered to have “discovered” the places they encountered, thus those lands and people were open to be claimed by the ruling bodies that funded the expeditions. It has been argued, that tourism
practices stem from previous colonial practices and attitudes (Whittaker, 1999; Simpson, 1996; Nash, 1989). At the very least, some communities have been so deeply impacted by colonial practices or post-colonial violence that the presentation of culture and the concept of an outside viewer remains too salient a reminder of colonialism (Carrier, 1992). From these colonial practices also stems concerns over stereotypes and primitivism as informing tourist expectations about authenticity, as has been criticized in the case of South Africa (Witz et al., 2001; Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998). However, it also should be noted that some interpret tourism as a means for community involvement and socio-economic change (Hinch & Butler, 1996).

The right to shape national discourse and cultural identity ultimately rests with the powerful. The institutions, traditionally governmental, that successfully steer the nation are those with the social and political clout with which to shape culture. Cultural policy plays a large role in tourism industry formation and the struggle for control can be seen in the resulting products. The ultimate goal of cultural policy is to foster an environment that is favorable to one type of knowledge over another (Valtysson, 2010). In the case of government actors, it is the prioritization of certain cultural products over others that send a salient message about identity and lucrative industries (Singh, 2010a). Technological developments and the wide dispersal of internet tools have challenged the hierarchical structure of culture building. The consumer also becomes the producer of content resulting in the evolution of the prosumer (Valtysson, 2010). While some governments have tight control on internet use in an attempt to control this phenomenon, in more liberalized societies it is embraced as a form of social engagement.
The convergence of the previously discussed explanatory factors and their power constructs result in variations in authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the evaluated tourism industry. While the variations in the outcomes are a function of the explanatory interaction, questions concerning authenticity, commodification, and homogenization also have antecedents in exploration practices. In Chapter 3, these outcomes will be used to evaluate the impact of the confluence of government institutional intervention and user-generated media.

**Authenticity**

The location of the craving for authenticity also may originate from the exploration tradition. Explorers, or so the tale goes, were privy to an unadulterated view of an unknown place or people. According to Percy (1975) in his work *The Message in the Bottle*, the first traveler experiences an authenticity not available to subsequent visitors, “…because being first, he has access to it and can see it for what it is. But to no one else is it ever as beautiful” (46). The several assumptions and suspension of belief required to make that statement true aside, the less constructed and packaged a sight becomes, the more authentic it is. However, one does not have to be the first to see a sight in order to experience its authenticity or to interact with it in a meaningful way.

However, tourist sights are constructed and packaged both by government and non-government entities. So, does the industry abandon hopes of authentic experiences simply because the travelers of today were not the first to happen upon a location? The tourism industry is built on a paradigm of authenticity and much debate centers on degrees of accuracy of representation. As was previously stated, it is possible for tourists to authentically have an experience (Edelheim, 2005), in that they experience something
which is new to them. Even if a place, event, or people have been seen and viewed by others, the personal experience of seeing something for oneself is a mode of exploration. The tension here is, “…between the notion of a fixed and immutable authenticity and that of performance which, by definition, creates alteration through repetition (Balme, 1998, pp. 54). A semantic slip has taken place in most tourist sites to allow for viewing the authentic to be possible.

These changes in meaning are easier to see when examining a display or a performance. Authenticity, like heritage, has a flexible, fluid meaning. It, “…is largely a function of what has been termed progressive individualism- itself an important aspect of the ideology of modernization60” (Fife, 2004, p 63). Fife claims that semantic slippage results from the verbal and physical proximity of the actuality with the virtual. The virtualities experienced at a site, like a reconstructed buildings or reproductions of jewelry, are necessary to add to the atmosphere of “hereness” (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, p 169). Semantic slips in meaning lead to generalizations in representation as well. For example, in Haiti the magical insignia of the loas, which are divine voodoo spirits, has become part of a more general representation of Haitian cultural tourism as the image is reproduced on t-shirts and other memorabilia (Anderson, 1982). The image becomes synonymous with and representative of the place, instead of holding its original indicator.

If authenticity is a function of state construction and user-generated approval, it must have signs that indicate its presence or absence. Modern conceptions have slipped into the “staged authenticity” of MacCannell (1973) and the “simulation and simulacra” of Baudrillard (1981). The real occurrence becomes a construct, which while it merely reflects the original, is accepted as indicative of the true touchstone. Both the state and

60 Based on analysis of Richard Handler’s “Authenticity” from Anthropology Today 2:2-4 (1986)
industry professionals are responsible for staging culture and creating touristic simulacra. The Polynesian Cultural Center is an example of these, “…apparent paradoxes woven into a seamless whole of commercially successful tourist entertainment” (Balme, 1998, p. 53). Founded by the Mormon Church, this complex brings together seven distinct Polynesian cultures under one roof for tourism consumption. The Center defies geography but creates a sort of cultural theme park. The demonstrations, food, dances, interactions with “natives”, and souvenirs for sale are all an approximation of the original products. However, all these approximations are necessary to communicate information and to be regarded as representative of place. While tourist performances are notoriously bad (Balme, 1998) and may create an unauthenticated atmosphere, humor may go a long way in dispelling those fears and deconstructing the experience.

While exploration added a wealth of knowledge about the physical and cultural world, a ramification of this activity was colonization and colonialism. In these cases, unfortunately, it is quite easy to locate the patrimonial intervention into the meaning of culture and the identity of place. Many of today’s popular tourism destinations used to be under colonial rule. A colonial past impacts the presentation, interpretation, and construction of tourism messages.

Commodification

The desire for authenticity, perhaps paradoxically, results in intensified commoditization. While authenticity appears to be linked to natural, unstructured occurrences, the tourism industry requires efforts to control perception which results in commodification of the tourism experience. The commodity must be reproducible, yet lamentations about authenticity stem from reproduction. It is not until the first
reproduction that antecedent becomes the authentic original (MacCannell, 1999). In the field of tourism, commodities are represented, dispersed, and reproduced in many ways. Not only can an object become a commodity but experiences have the potential to be commoditized, as well. For example, tour operation is one way in which commodities flourish and patrimonial messages are reinforced.

Ostensibly, independent tour companies and operators appear to be beyond the reach of patrimonial construction, but, upon closer inspection, the relationship is more complex. In most cases, tour operators are allowed to exist because their tours and displays are in the interest of patrimonial messages. This element depends very much on the type of government present, but, in cases where censorship is not a state staple, certain types of excursions may be advocated for over others. In some cases, the government cannot intercede directly into issues that they should not control. For example, a state run tour presenting a message about an indigenous group would be instantly more suspicious than a message presented by a tour company owned by members of that indigenous group. In these cases, the message is legitimized because it is perceived as being independently delivered. There is a danger, however, because sites and experiences become susceptible to the whim of tourism operators who may or may not be experts in their field (McKercher & du Cross, 2002).

Given that many tourism experiences are commoditized and constructed, it is entirely possible that tourists desire a structured experience or, at least, prefer structure in certain situations. In fact, McKercher and du Cros (2002) argue that tourists desire constructed experiences because most, “… may visit an asset only once in their lifetime and consequently wish to get the most of out the experience,” in addition, such
consumption, “… ensures that people on limited time budgets can experience the essence of the attraction…” (pp. 37). These are certainly concerns and valid approaches to managing heritage sites but may not necessarily apply to the entire vacation experience. While getting the most information out of a site may be the goal for many, the larger travel experience may be about more. However, one cannot deny the popularity of themed excursions, bus tours, and tour groups with planned itineraries.

McKercher and du Cros (2002) also offer a somewhat heretical suggestion that standardization creates the opportunity to control the tourist experience, adding that standardization, modification, and commodification are the optimal controls for the movement of people and for the dispersal of information. However, it can be argued that no matter how much control is exerted over the message, there is no guarantee that the message will resonate with visitors. The authors offer the example of an audiotape tour of Alcatraz Prison as being a desirable constructed experience. It must be remembered that while such devices facilitate movement throughout a space and impart information, it still up to the visitor to evaluate and reconcile the messages.

**Homogenization**

With commoditization comes the fear of cultural homogenization. In the case of cultural tourism there are two different types of homogenization to fear: 1) that of the human experience; and 2) that of the tourist experience. If individuals travel to witness the lives of other individuals, it can be somewhat disappointing if the daily life in the host country closely mirrors that of the traveler’s home. Technology and globalization have been common scapegoats for this problem. In addition, as tourism industries continue to grow and as countries share best practices with each other, there is a concern about the
presentation of tourism experiences becoming the same. The establishment of tourism sectors is particularly prone to this phenomenon. Also, it is possible that over time these two types of homogenization will meld into one threat: the tourist sectors or currently untouched areas also will begin the process of the homogenization of daily life.

The content of the experience is what is regarded as different. What happens if that becomes threatened? The same guidebooks mentioned earlier seem painfully aware of the possibility of homogenization. The authors of these books purport that the people one meets while traveling are the most authentic aspect of a place. Getting to know a person is very different from observing daily practices or visiting a location. Of France, Rick Steves writes, “As you travel, you’ll find the most ‘French’ thing about France is the French themselves” (2008, pp. XVII-XXII). This sentiment is echoed by Lonely Planet Taiwan when the authors write, “However, what’s really special about Taiwan is the Taiwanese, who welcome visitors to their island with amazing warmth and hospitality” (Bender, et.al., 2004, pp. 3). Lonely Planet Finland also states, perhaps slightly differently, “And the real bonus? The Finns themselves, who tend to do their own thing and are much better off for it. Independent, loyal, warm, and welcoming- a memorable people in an inspirational country” (2009, pp. 16). These writers locate the experience of travel in the human experience. Whether a truism or sentimental marketing, a clever way to sustain tourism is to frame it as being marked by interactions among individuals instead of visits to places.

Tourism is a resource, and its sustainability is an issue. Sustainability does not only refer to the shelf life of a product but also to the environmental requirements needed
for tourism. In the case of cultural tourism, conservation and the struggle for heritage management often become important issues.

The words *preservation* and *conservation* become linguistically charged because of their associations with stasis. Because culture is an ever-evolving force, it can be problematic to include enshrine aspects of it as part of the historical past. However, it is these enshrinements that reveal patrimonial agendas and preferences. According to Larkham (1995), preservation values the unchanged sites and objects of cultural significance while conservation implies that restoration should be undertaken to bring the old into the modern. Tourism has often been seen as being at odds with conservation and preservation goals (McKercher & du Cros, 2002), but this need not be the case if common ground can be located between tourism industry and conservation officials. Ultimately, “History, commemoration and conservation are all… implicitly political. What a self-defined group or a nation seeks to preserve, and to represent to others, allows us to understand something of what a particular imagined community thinks it is” (Grufford, 1995, pp. 49). Preservation, conservation, and their products become pieces of the patrimonial picture and elements that reflect power balances within a nation.
CHAPTER 3. Case Studies

“Narrow winding streets, high walls, and occasionally, through a doorway, a glimpse of an interior or a courtyard, and moving all around her were laden donkeys, men with their burdens, boys, women veiled and unveiled, the whole busy secret life of this Moorish city. Wandering through the narrow streets she forgot everything else… She was all eyes and ears, living and walking in a dream world. The only annoyance was the guide who talked unceasingly, and urged her into various establishments into which she had no particular interest to go.”

Destination Unknown by Agatha Christie, pp. 92

The following two chapters will examine specific cultural tourism subsets in four different countries. The European Capital of Culture event in Istanbul, culinary tourism in Thailand, indigenous tourism in Canada, and religious pilgrimage in Spain will serve as examples of the previously discussed explanatory factors impacting cultural construction. As government institutional intervention interacts with the mediated environments available to tourists, their combined impact results in changes to the perceived authenticity, homogenization, and commodification of culture. Ultimately the resulting perceptions impact national and place identities as well as the ways in which tourists and hosts interact. This thesis initially examined general views on tourism and construction, progressed to a specific identification of contemporary cultural tourism issues, and will now proceed to examine further sub-layers of the cultural tourism industry in order to isolate and understand the underlying mechanics of cultural construction and their implication for culture. While the theoretical discourse will inform the ensuing discussion, the purpose of this chapter is to deconstruct real-world cultural tourism events and sub-industries so as to identify variations in the explanatory factors of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization.

Each case study includes one country and one subset of cultural tourism that exists within that country. These case studies have been selected because of their appropriate representation of a specific instance of government intervention and tourist
focus endemic to the established matrix. Each country case study will proceed with an initial discussion of the sub-industry or event, and then will discuss the government institutional intervention and multimedia interventions in order to evaluate the impacts on authenticity, commodification, and homogenization. Access points, like media, colonialism, internet, and exploration, will serve as integral resources by which to locate tourist motivations and focus. These elements are important to the discussion because each one influences both the tourist’s and the government’s perception of themselves and others, along with industry structures. The combinations of these explanatory factors result in different experiences and industry presentations in terms of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization.

Determining the concrete meanings of culture, heritage, and history is a difficult task because, essentially, those words can describe and indicate a wide spectrum of objects, experiences, and beliefs. For an industry like tourism, which relies on the assumed universality of concepts like culture, heritage, and history as a basis for marketing, the meanings of these words and how they are constructed have a considerable impact on attracting tourists. The explanatory factors of government institutional intervention and mediated environments represent two types of tourism stakeholders whose interests and activities influence the final tourism product. While these two explanatory sets are described as independent, they do influence and interact with each other. The supply and demand relationship between these two groups creates a tense dynamic and each group’s interests have an impact not only on the tourism product but also on the meanings that can be derived from it. For example, with regard to indigenous tourism in British Columbia, Canada, it is noted that the prestige and image
that state patrimonial powers can derive from supporting indigenous tourism can be at odds with the message of the tourism providers themselves. Types of tourism, particularly the cultural, have broader implications than being an expression of leisure. Tourism reveals important lessons about the ways in which identity is shaped, performed, and communicated in a globalized and competitive arena.

As tourist motivations and government institutions interact, authenticity, commodification, and homogenization are impacted. These three dependent outcomes build national identity and heritage products, in addition to being areas of major concern within the tourism and heritage management fields. By understanding how the fluctuations in these factors change the meaning of the outcomes, it becomes apparent that the tensions between patrimonial producers and tourist consumers reveal an entry point from which to gain a greater understanding of cultural construction.

The ensuing two chapters have been divided so as to address two case studies each. The most fruitful comparison comes from dividing the case studies along extra-national and sub-national lines. Turkey and Spain have been paired because both contend with sub-national forces in constructing the cultures discussed in their tourism sub-industries. The European Union (EU) and the Catholic Church become extra-national stakeholders with which the external factors must contend. While the two cases share some similarities, there are differences in the ways in which government institutional intervention and mediated environments converge. In addition, Thailand and Canada will be compared because of their sub-national industry forces, culinary tourism and indigenous tourism respectively. They both exhibit a similar contradiction between concerns about authenticity and homogenization. While cross case comparisons also will
be made in the conclusion, comparing the case studies in separate categories speaks to the external and internal forces at work that must be taken into account when governments intervene and mediated environments are created. By acknowledging the real world pressures, the cases become less isolated from the global process.

As a reminder, the following matrix will inform the cases studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mediated Environments</th>
<th>Influence of the Governmental Cultural Elite</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stronger Institutional Intervention</td>
<td>Weaker Institutional Intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culinary Tourism</td>
<td>Stronger Presence (Thailand)</td>
<td>Religious Pilgrimage (Spain- Camino de Santiago)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Capital of Culture</td>
<td>Weak Presence (Turkey)</td>
<td>Indigenous Tourism (Canada- British Columbia)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each of these combinations is believed to be indicative of the tension between the degree of institutional intervention and the type of tourism motivation.

3.1 Extra-National Case Studies: Turkey and Spain

In this chapter, Turkey’s 2010 Istanbul European Capital of Culture (ECoC) displays and Spain’s *El Camino de Santiago de Campostela* will both be detailed in order to examine the confluence of the explanatory factors on the authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the ensuring cultural product. This discussion will include an examination of how heritage and national messages change due to government institutional intervention and mediated environments.

In these instances both Turkey and Spain must take extra-national pressures into account when developing cultural messages. In the case of Turkey, its desire to accede to
the European Union dictates the majority of its cultural presentation. Alternatively, Spain must be careful to distinguish its Catholic heritage from the modern and more secularized meanings of *El Camino*. The Spanish government cannot advocate for a particular interpretation of *El Camino*; however, it can attempt to carefully frame it within other cultural structure. In both cases, the governments embrace or respect a transnational image.

Both the EcoC and *El Camino* are established displays of culture; however, each is impacted not only by government construction, but also by intersection with mediated environments. Government and non-governments online websites, blogs, reviews, and news also contribute to a participatory framework in which individuals are capable of impacting global processes. The convergence of government institutions and mediated environments reveals the tensions in civil society and international spheres concerning the use of heritage to construct a cultural identity.

3.2 Istanbul, Turkey: European Capital of Culture 2010

One forum provided for displaying and disseminating culture is the European Capital of Culture (ECoC) event. Istanbul, co-host for 2010, will be offered as an example of an instance of strong institutional intervention coalescing with an exclusive cultural focus for tourists. For the purposes of this thesis, the events and marketing for the Istanbul event will be analyzed because these exhibits involve a great deal of government backing and construction, as well as specialize in traditionally cultural displays aimed at visitors. In preparation for this event, the Turkish government has revamped monuments, renewed preservation initiatives, created new museums, and invested heavily in local
beautification plans. Due to several constraints, websites and a limited amount of newspaper and academic articles will be relied upon for event coverage. This case study will proceed with an overview of the ECoC, an analysis of Istanbul’s events, references to popular events, marketing themes, and, finally, situating the tourist in the discussion.

The mainstream usage of internet technologies to promote and popularize events and causes has resulted in a variety of web-based resources to promote the Istanbul 2010 ECoC. The internet and various social networking sites, like Facebook, are being used to promote the 2010 ECoC cities. Such sites have become assets, as they have allowed distant peoples ready access to each other. The internet is becoming a burgeoning area for cultural policy debate. The internet blurs the line between producer and consumer, creating the prosumer (Stalder, 2001), resulting in a remixed and reinvented structure for cultural interaction (Valtysson, 2010). Technology’s role in promoting events and detailing their occurrence make web-site analysis a salient method of this thesis because one learns about the events and about the framing and language used by the patrimonial powers to package the message.

Identifying tourist motivations and perceptions can be complicated, but creative web-tools allow tourists to connect and share comments. At an event like the ECoC, the open-air nature and the fact that tourists can attend multiple events do not lend themselves to easy counting or population pinpointing (Palmer, 2004). While there is a certain extent to which the type of tourist can be determined based on the content of the itinerary of performance, ultimately these determinations are not exact or definite. In this instance, it is more productive to read travel blogs and travel review sites in an effort to

---

61 HSBC Premiere, 2010
62 There are many groups but two examples: ISTANBUL 2010 Avrupa Kültür Başkenti - 2010 European Capital and Istanbul- European Capital of Culture 2010 (2008)
acquaint oneself with tourism motivations. While these mediums are not exhaustive surveys of tourism motivations and only represent the opinions of those tourists who are motivated to comment, the internet allows for the dissemination of traveler created content which has the potential to reach and to influence the opinions of other travelers.

**Stronger Government Institutional Intervention, Weaker Mediated Environment**

As previously stated, the intersection of stronger institutional intervention is marked by an emphasis on patriotic, patrimonial messages communicated through traditional, high art forms. The Istanbul Capital of Culture reflects this patrimonial display because of the stakeholders involved and the content of the events that comprise the year long event. The government has worked to create a program to reflect the interstices of the past and the present, making this event a relevant display and a progression of advanced artistic thinking throughout time. Adding an analysis of weaker mediated environments, however, reveals the discrepancy between government focus and popular sentiment. Internet resources aimed at tourists from non-governmental sources barely discuss the ECoC events and upcoming displays. While the city of Istanbul spans two continents, one being Europe, the Turkish EU accessions and desire to impress the EU using the Capital of Culture program reveals a cultural creation that differs from popular tourist concepts of the state.

**3.3 Istanbul and the Capital of Culture Program**

Put on by the European Commission, the first Capital of Culture, Athens, was named in 1985 for the purpose of showcasing, “… Europe's cultural richness and diversity, and all the ties which link us together as Europeans” (European Commission
Culture, 2009). For 2010, three cities have received the designation: Essen, Germany; Pecs, Hungary; and Istanbul, Turkey. As of 2005, non EU member states have been allowed to apply for Capital of Culture distinction; however, Istanbul will be the last non EU city to receive the distinction because of cost, publicity, and organizational concerns. Because of the 25th anniversary of the program, each one of the 2010 cities will receive 1.5 million Euros from the EU to put on its display. According to their website, the Istanbul ECoC Agency had received TL 338,486,393, or 160,972,000 Euros. The economic breakdown varies by city and is sometimes not disclosed but, for example, Turku, Finland, which will co-host the event in 2011, is aiming for a budget of 50 million euros from various sources. The ECoC is a year long celebration with events and programming held daily.

As a non EU country, which desires to become one, the Capital of Culture distinction provides Turkey with an opportunity to impress the European Community while also branding themselves as more culturally European than Muslim or Asian. Turkish politics and global aspirations are intrinsically tied to its European Union statehood application, which it applied for in 1987. Particular attention should be paid to the sequence of stakeholders involved in the Capital of Culture production, the language and descriptions on the official Istanbul Capital of Culture website, and the

---

63 DW-World.de, 2006
64 European Commission, n.d.a.
65 At the time of writing, the exchange rate was TL 1 = 0.47556 Euros (http://www.oanda.com/currency/converter/)
66 Malila, 2009: 18 million euros will come from the City of Turku, 18 million from the Finnish government, 6 million from outside sponsors, and 8 million from neighboring states. Alternatively, the European Union will add an additional 1.5 million euros, which is not considered part of the current budget, to the total in the fall of 2011 if the city of Turku and the Foundation can prove that they have abided by program guidelines.
67 While Turkey officially is a secular country, it has a Muslim majority and perceptions about that majority may impact its chances for EU accession (News.am, 2010)
68 Federal Research Division, 2010
events selected. These examples provide insight into the exclusive cultural dynamic from the perspective of the government, patrimonial producers.

3.4 Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders

A variety of government and non-government producers are involved in funding and promoting the Istanbul Capital of Culture display. The complex web of government institutions spans almost all Turkish ministries and local Istanbul public offices. However, private companies also are working in conjunction with the government in exchange for national recognition and marketing space. The degree to which these private corporations are involved in the event vary considerably; capital partners, corporate partners, solution partners, funding partners, media partners, and service sponsors are all separate distinctions made by the Istanbul 2010 ECoC Agency. In addition, one cannot ignore the various local vendors, performers, artists, private museums, tour services, transportation providers, food and restaurant establishments, and the myriad of other industries and businesses tied to tourism endeavors.

Government intervention and support are crucial ingredients for the host city because of the scale and cost of the program. In the case of Istanbul, the Initiative Group, who promoted the city as a viable Capital of Culture, was a smaller non-national force. By 2003, however, the Turkish Foreign Ministry was involved and officially placed the city’s bid with the European Commission. The bid proclaimed Istanbul to be the city of four elements: earth, water, air, and fire. The claim is a nod to Istanbul’s historic

---

69 Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture, 2010a and Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture, 2010b: The partners provide certain amounts of monetary capital based on their distinct group whereas the service sponsors provide a specialized service for a specific and limited contracted amount of time
70 13 NGO’s, local Istanbul government representatives, and the Istanbul Foundation for Culture and Arts comprised the Initiative Group (Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, Contracts Units, 2009)
antecedents connoting the beginning of time with an explicit reference to the elements fundamental to the universe. Over the course of the nomination and appointment process, fifteen specific international and Turkish agencies were mentioned as being integral to the process. For certain of these groups, like the Istanbul ECoC Agency Coordination Board, Istanbul ECoC Agency Advisory Board, and Istanbul ECoC Agency Executive Board, other agencies comprise the institutional framework. For example, the Coordination Board is comprised of 10 actors from a variety of institutional disciplines. While the exact actors involved in the hierarchical makeup of the Istanbul 2010 Capital of Culture is not directly pertinent to this thesis, the important point is the plethora of agencies involved in the event and their variety of contributions. The agencies provide the financial funding needed for the programming. In addition, though, the more widespread the institutional interest and speculation in the ECoC event becomes, the better advertised and promoted the event will be because the government will strive for a return on its investment.

**Types of Events**

The Istanbul Capital of Culture offers several categories of events. According to the 2010 Program Guide, the categories consist of: visual arts; music & opera; film & documentary & animation; literature; theatre & performing arts; traditional arts; urban

---

71 Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, n.d
72 Prime Ministry; Ministry for Foreign Affairs; Ministry for Culture and Tourism; Istanbul Governorate; Istanbul Metro Municipality; Istanbul Mayor’s Office; EC General Directorate for Education and Culture; European Parliament; EU Council of Ministers; Turkish Council of Ministers; Istanbul ECoC Agency; Istanbul ECoC Agency Coordination Board; Istanbul ECoC Agency Advisory Board; and Istanbul ECoC Agency Executive Board are all mentioned (Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, 2007)
73 Coordination Board: Prime Minister appoints the head; Minister for EU Accessions; Minister for the Promotion of Funding; Minister for Interior Affairs; Minster of Finance; Minister of Culture and Tourism; Governor of Istanbul; Mayor of Istanbul; Chairman of Advisory Board; Chairman of Executive Board (Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, 2007)
culture; education; cultural heritage & museums; urban implementations; urban projects; and maritime. In addition, the website lists tourism & promotion and international relations as two additional ECoC topic areas. The Istanbul ECoC website, includes descriptions of the categories. European, contemporary, and youth are words that are often repeated in the descriptions. While there is a specific category for cultural heritage, all of the listed categories contain elements that contribute to or represent culture.

Even though cities may co-host the event, the planned programs of each city may differ widely reflecting the diversity of interests of the EU in awarding this distinction. For example, Istanbul’s ECoC program differs greatly from that of its co-hosts in terms of its focus. Essen, Germany and Pécs, Hungary also are co-hosts for the 2010 Capital of Culture. According to Essen, Germany’s site, “Our programme consists of three guiding themes: mythology, metropolis and Europe. These are interwoven into and portrayed by the disciplines and topic areas of image, theatre, music, language, creative industries and festivals.” Alternatively, Pécs’ motivations for ECoC participation are geared towards revitalizing the city now that its coal mines have been closed. The focus is on investing in the city so that Pécs will emerge with, “…an adequate number of cultural and artistic spaces with proper size that can meet European standards. They promote the utilization of the city's cultural potential and the development of creative industry and tourism.” Most of these projects focus on rebuilding museums and public spaces.

Istanbul’s program list is more extensive than that the other two cities, and the Istanbul ECoC Agency has chosen to focus on traditional high art forms and institutional

---

74 Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, 2010, pp. 2
75 Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture, 2010c
76 Not including times when European is used in the context of “European Capital of Culture”
77 Ruhr.2010, 2010
78 Pécs 2010 European Capital of Culture, n.d.
venues. While there is a focus on the past, Istanbul is striving to make their cultural-historical legacy more overtly European and relevant for today. Istanbul has networked itself with previous ECoC cities, like Liverpool\textsuperscript{79}, and the other non-European countries, like Norway and Switzerland\textsuperscript{80}. Turkey also hosted “What is European Culture?” and “Cultural Policies in Turkey and Europe” symposiums\textsuperscript{81}. In addition the \textit{41° – 29° Istanbul Network} was created, “…to constitute bridges of cultures between Istanbul and other European cities, to create long term and permanent cooperation and to support young artists for intercultural interaction\textsuperscript{82}.” All of these programs attempt to further the political agenda surrounding European Union accession for Turkey. By appearing to be closely linked with other European cities, Turkey strengthens its case for EU membership.

3.5 Locating the Tourist

Identifying the motivations and feelings of tourists is difficult without extensive surveys and interviews. However, the internet offers a variety of outlets for ascertaining tourist perspectives. Blogs and travel review sites will be used to identify tourist interests when visiting Turkey and the Istanbul ECoC. The following will be a survey of travel blogs about Istanbul, the Capital of Culture events, and TripAdvisor.com comments. However before that survey can take place, a quick elaboration on outside perceptions of Turkey must be undertaken.

**Perceptions of Turkey:**

\textsuperscript{79} Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, n.d.a
\textsuperscript{80} Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, n.d.b
\textsuperscript{81} Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, n.d.c
\textsuperscript{82} Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, n.d.d
Turkey’s status as an East-West gateway and its illustrious history as the seat of the Ottoman Empire inform most travelers today. Turkey has captured imaginations and elicited fears for centuries. A quick search on Amazon.com yields 907 results for Turkish guidebooks. The rich and sometimes controversial history of the country makes it a highly desirable destination for travelers looking to witness the intersection of culture and politics. Turkey was never colonized, but Turkey has a link to some African nations through its Ottoman Empire expansionism (Ünal, 2010) and several European nations, like France and Great Britain, had an influence on Turkish politics (Zürcher, 2005). These past associations and histories impact travel today. For example, Turkey is a popular destination for British tourists. Turkey’s struggle with its global identity is particularly interesting when considering its avoidance of colonialism. Instead of trying to locate its identity in centuries of repression and cultural mixing, Turkey is attempting to find itself by depending on European standards to define its global affiliations. These access points provide potential visitors with some background information about the country and invite culturally minded visitors to investigate Turkey’s diverse cultural and political society.

As the Turkish government attempts to reinvent Turkey and portray a European-centric identity, western media consistently separates it from the rest of the EU. According to a recent study of British newspapers, Turkey is consistently portrayed in a negative light with headlines and phrases, such as “Muslim Democracy,” that highlight and dramatize Turkey’s cultural differences (Devran, 2007). As the debate over Turkish EU accession continues, it becomes increasingly obvious that modern nations cannot

---

83 March 25, 2010: Search “Turkey guide book” all departments
84 Imaginative Traveller, 2010
disassociate themselves from their problematic past with Turkey, the Ottoman Empire, and the Muslim faith. In addition, EU accession for Turkey triggers fear and anxiety for some countries like Germany which fears further migration of a people who have not been properly or easily folded into German society (Schaefer et. al., 2005). Coupled with the increasing mistrust towards Muslim immigrants (Pew Survey)\textsuperscript{85}, the European media portrays Turkey as a diverse travel destination but not necessarily part of the West.

Although the Turkish government encourages tourism, it is not politically expedient to place emphasis on aspects of Turkey that do not reflect the European identity being established. In addition, books and movies about Turkey also have the potential to influence potential travelers’ perceptions. Novels like Jenny White’s mystery trilogy: \textit{The Sultan’s Seal}, \textit{The Abyssinian Proof}, and \textit{The Winter Thief} provide some readers with access points that emphasize Turkey’s perceived enigmatic culture and unique history. Also popular films like Ian Fleming’s James Bond classic \textit{From Russia with Love} or Alan Parker’s \textit{Midnight Express} provide a visual context that may or may not entice visitors.

\textbf{Blogs and TripAdvisor:}

The first fourteen blog entries on TravelBlog.org\textsuperscript{86} and the first three questions and comments on TripAdvisor Turkey forums\textsuperscript{87} were selected to determine popular tourist destinations. According to these sites and comments, the most commonly suggested destinations by tourists are: the Blue Mosque, Hagia Sofia, Topkapi Palace,

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{85} Pew Global Attitudes Project, 2005
\textsuperscript{86} Using: Travel Blog » Middle East » Turkey » Marmara » Istanbul as the thread
\textsuperscript{87} Using: Only questions that had appeals for travel advice to Istanbul in the thread title
\end{flushright}
Grand Bazaar, Various Food Experiences, Spice Bazaar, and the Cistern\textsuperscript{88}. These results imply that most tourists find Istanbul’s indispensible sites to be architectural-historical and everyday oriented. Monuments, like the Egyptian Obelisk to the Hippodrome, and museums also are recommended but less frequently than other sites.

Lists and evaluations on blogs are by no means exhaustive. The entries of 14 blogs on TravelBlog.org were written by 9 people. On TripAdvisor, 9 comments were given by 6 individuals and the thread titles were “2 weeks Istanbul, 1\textsuperscript{st} time,” “Istanbul 3 days,” and “Been Istanbul before… due again… need new ideas!” Blogging appears to encourage posters to comment on the comments of others; the entries delve into more obscure issues for seasoned travelers and not general entries about the frequent must-sees of Istanbul. Interestingly, only one blogger from TravelBlog.org, Geramye Teeter, referenced the European Capital of Culture events.

According to the TripAdvisor “Things to Do in Istanbul” list, the top 10 attractions are different from what travelers in blogs and forums identify as being popular. While some locations do overlap, these differences may reflect the difference between relying on one person’s blog or the compiled ratings and opinions of a large group of people. In order to given an indication of what sites are popular, the top 10 from TripAdvisor have been included\textsuperscript{89}:

1) Prens Leather (In the Grand Bazaar)  
2) Sarnic Hotel Turkish Cooking Class  
3) Kariye Museum (Chora Church)  
4) Blue Mosque

\textsuperscript{88} See Figure A: TravelBlog.org and TripAdvisor Suggestions; About chart: mentions of a site or activity were only counted once per blog or post; food includes all references to food or beverages; bloggers often used different names for the same location- ex. The European Fortress and the Rumeli Hisar- which were counted as the same place  
\textsuperscript{89} TripAdvisor, 2010b
5) Cooking Alaturka
6) Istanbul Daily City Tours
7) Bosphorus Cruise
8) Underground Cistern
9) Topkapi Palace
10) Rumeli Fortress

These ratings are assigned by user voting online. While the blogs and forum answers reflect the opinion of a few travelers, the ratings on TripAdvisor include the opinions of many more. TripAdvisor also takes false reviews or those submitted by entities working for stores or companies very seriously. Neither list is more accurate than the other; they merely are aimed at different audiences. The independent blogs and forum answers are meant for first time travelers attempting to navigate their way through a new location. While those travelers may still seek advice on the general TripAdvisor pages, there exists the opportunity for a larger variety of sites to be reviewed and advice to be offered by travel veterans for the benefit of other veterans. It also may be the case that blogs and forum answers may reflect the advice and “must-see” suggestions that these travelers received during their trips. It is important not to assume that the travelers offering blogs or suggestions are industry professionals, expatriates, or individuals with extensive inside knowledge. In some cases, the posters are merely passing on information that they were given for the limited amount of time they were abroad.

3.6 Summary of Explanatory Factors

The balance between the government institutional forces and the mediated environment in terms of which group controls the construction of the cultural message and image is important. In this situation, the government almost exclusively controls the

---

90 TripAdvisor, n.d.
construction of the message for visitors and tourists. Programs are carefully crafted to reflect messages about Turkey’s European aspects and historical links, as well as the modern and innovative culture of Istanbul. Like editing a film, these programs have been selected to create an overall message and image that is discernable from either attendance or study of the program catalog.

However, it is up to both visitors and the Turkish people to accept and reproduce these sentiments. According to a recent survey, only 45% of Turks supported EU expansion into Turkey91, whereas others have suggested that EU accession would change Turkish national identity and culture to a detrimental degree92. The Turkish government must continue to work to reconcile the nations many identities, which is a daunting task. However, tension among citizens and varying accounts of the government’s efficacy will ultimately impact the larger tourism product.

### 3.7 Dependent Outcomes

The convergence of stronger government institutional intervention and weaker mediated environments indicates a partial failure in the government patrimonial message. The confluence of the explanatory factors interact results in tensions surrounding questions of authenticity, homogenization, and commodification. The European Capital of Cultures program attempts to define the cultural legacy of place. The experience successfully creates a replicable commodity; however, the authenticity is reflects and homogenization it creates become problematic.

---

91 Hürriyet, 2006
92 JGP/Mon Blog Défense, 2010
Authenticity

The subset of authenticity mainly at stake in this situation is cultural authenticity. The European Capital of Culture program attempts to reflect a specifically European standard, and, for cities that are already with the EU, that doctrine does not cause an undue amount of stress. However for an aspiring EU nation and a non-European city like Istanbul, satisfying that burden implies a certain amount of cultural framing and reconstruction so as to feel secure within the European model. Because ECoC is part of a global event and had an obvious link to global governance, the expectation of government intervention and message construction also is more expected and easily accepted.

The state’s prominent intervention in the event also sets an expectation of accuracy. When it comes to factual elements, an ECoC viewer or tourist would expect properly documented and established facts to be incorporated throughout displays and performances. The interpretation and framing of those facts is much more open ended. Given the political aspirations of Turkey as well, ECoC tourists also might have a reasonable expectation of framing Turkish culture in terms of European standards. The interpretation of Turkey as a European state may or may not be accurate, depending on one’s perspective.

Another component of cultural accuracy is representation and whether or not majority and minority culture is reflected in the event proceedings. Religious and ethnic minorities in Istanbul include Greek93, Jews94, Assyrians95, Alevi Muslims96, Kurds97, 

---

93 Hellenic Ministry of Foreign Affairs, n.d.
94 Frommer & Frommer, 1995
95 Pacal, 1996
96 Rainsford, 2008
Armenian\textsuperscript{98}, and Romani gypsies\textsuperscript{99}. These minorities can be found in the official Istanbul 2010 Capital of Culture program guide. The following is a list of individual programs or programming sites that involve the previously mentioned minorities:

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|}
\hline
Minority Group & # of programs or sites \\
\hline
Greek & 8* \\
Assyrians & 2 \\
Romani & 2 \\
Alevi Muslim & 0 \\
Kurd & 0 \\
Armenian & 4 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\caption{Istanbul’s Minorities}
\end{table}

\*One of these references was explicitly to Greek Cypriots

The inclusion or exclusion of these groups in ECoC programming is telling and also reflects Turkey’s EU aspirations. Despite Greece’s history of animosity with Turkey, the inclusion of the Greek minority in the ECoC programming is not surprising because Greece is an EU nation. The European Union also has taken steps to encourage the inclusion of Roma peoples across Europe\textsuperscript{100}. Even though Turkey has persistently refused to recognize Kurds as an independent people\textsuperscript{101}, the exclusion of Kurds from ECoC planning is surprising. In recent years plans to grant Kurds long denied rights have been undertaken in order to make Turkey appear more palatable to the West\textsuperscript{102}. The inclusion of Armenian cultural activities and sites also is not surprising given the recent

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{97}] Houston, 2005
\item[\textsuperscript{98}] Armenians.net, 2010
\item[\textsuperscript{99}] Strand & Marsh, 2006
\item[\textsuperscript{100}] European Commission, n.d.b
\item[\textsuperscript{101}] Washingtonpost.com, 1999
\item[\textsuperscript{102}] The New York Times, 2009
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
controversy over the Turkish genocide of Armenians (Abram, 2010) and Turkey’s desire to change that image, even in light of their vigorous denial of genocide.

Overall, Istanbul’s European Capital of Culture takes its responsibility to accurately report facts and represent the minorities of the city seriously. However, the accuracy of framing Istanbul in a European light might be less than authentic for some Turks but ultimately reflects the government’s EU accession hopes.

Commodification

It is in the best interest of the ECoC programs to both institutionalize and recreate culture as a consumable commodity that can be easily managed. The reproduction of certain messages is particularly important so as to influence visitors by presenting a cohesive and unified message. Taking tangible artifacts and intangible cultural heritage elements and combining them into a public performance of culture particularly reinforces the importance of commodification in the ECoC display. These messages and displays are institutionalized in physical performances, theaters, museums, outdoor arenas, and monuments.

Homogenization

The program content of each ECoC city is different; however, the representation of a unified European Union and the general programming highlights similar cultural aspects. While each city has a different focus based on its culture and history, many include similar elements in their programs. Istanbul 2010 and Liverpool 2008 both included training sessions and workshops in their programs (Garcia et. al, 2010). Turku 2011, Liverpool 2008, and Istanbul 2010 all include maritime and environmental
programming. Patras 2006 and Istanbul 2010 both highlight the theme of urban revitalization mixed with high culture. While these cities emphasize different cultural events and content, they all employ similar methods of heritage management. The convergence of an exclusively cultural focus with a strong government institutional influence creates a form of commodification that is universally supported by certain institutions, like museums, arts centers, or monuments. These types of institutions share similar practices and increase homogenization of experience for the sake of crowd management and information dissemination (Kercher & du Cros, 2005). While the cultural content may not be homogenized, the approaches to managing it may have an effect that standardizes the institutional approach and experience across cultures.

3.8 El Camino de Compostela, Spain: Religious Tourism

El Camino de Compostela, or the Way of St. James, is a major pilgrimage route along the northern coast of Spain. The route to the shrine in Compostela to visit the tomb of the saint and apostle, James the Greater, has been a pilgrimage site since before the 12th century. It is believed to be the final resting place of the remains of St. James, who is said to have spread Christianity to Spain. The route, the Cathedral of Santiago, and the Santiago historic area have all been declared UNESCO World Heritage sites.

---

103 Turku Åbo 2011, 2010; Garcia et. al., 2010; Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, 2010
104 Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency, 2010; Mansfield, 2006
105 “Though a few pilgrims to Santiago are recorded in the 10th century, and many more in the 11th, it was in the early 12th century - and particularly under the energetic promotion of Archbishop Diego Gelmirez (1100-1140) - that Santiago came to rank with Rome and Jerusalem as one of the great destinations of medieval pilgrimage.” (The Confraternity of St. James, 2009)
106 It should be noted that there is a differing of opinion about the accuracy of St. James spreading his mission to Spain and whether the remains are actually those of St. James. Several Catholic sites discuss these claims and the documentation for them: New Advent, 2009; Catholic Online, 2009
107 World Heritage List, 2010a; World Heritage List, 2010b
According to the Office de Acogida al Peregrino, 2,491 pilgrims completed *El Camino* in 1985; 19,821 in 1995; and 93,921 in 2005\(^{108}\). Religious tourism is an appropriate subset of cultural tourism because of the extent to which religion defines self and cultural identity in many countries (Richards & Fernandes, 2007). The popular sites associated with religions reveal architectural, socio-political, and high art trends in a country. *El Camino* is an example of two tourism subsets, religious tourism and route based tourism\(^{109}\). The motivations associated with these two tourism subsets and their intersection results in a hybrid tourism product and one that may dilute the original objective, in the case of *El Camino*. Because it originates from a tradition that exists outside of the Spanish state, *El Camino* exists in a special position with the Spanish government and tourism promoters, in that it is both a featured attraction and something that cannot be entirely controlled by government institutions.

Religious tourism directly speaks to experiences of authenticity and the questions surrounding it that also generally plague tourism. In many ways, religiosity is often viewed as a precursor to the modern tourism practice (Stronza, 2001; Cohen, 1984). MacCannell wrote of tourism that it represents the search for religion in that “both are quests for authentic experiences” (1972:593), each is a search for an “ultimate reality” (Cohen, 1984, 377). This discussion of authenticity gives way to considerations about the degree of commoditization and homogenization present. Because religious pilgrimage tourism manifests itself in a physical route with other locations surrounding the itinerary,

---

\(^{108}\) These are only the pilgrims that asked for and received a Compostela, therefore many more completed the routes (Gilmour, 2008).

\(^{109}\) Route based tourism refers to: itinerary based excursions, such as walking or driving tours, that “…combine cultural consumption with points of scale and are inextricably linked- as with all heritage tourism- to a continuous re-imagining of place and culture that draws inspiration from nostalgia, memory, and tradition” (Murray & Graham, 1997, pp. 514).
the intersection of religion and route becomes an important consideration to the meaning of *El Camino de Compostela*.

*El Camino* is both a religious pilgrimage and a route based endeavor. Religious tourism can take many forms but in this instance route-based tourism is the focus. Religious tourism can be categorized as spiritual tourism or a search for meaning in the cultural tradition of a location, thereby making all tourism religious or spiritual in nature (Smith, 2003b, pp. 103); however, it is most often associated with a tourist’s ties to a specific religious tradition. Religious tourism refers to two different types of tourists: 1) pilgrims motivated to travel for religious, self-reflexive reasons, and 2) tourism motivated to undertake the route for cultural, historical, or other social reasons. Tourists who have an interest in the study of religion or theology but are not members of or self-identified with the religious tradition of the pilgrimage should be placed in the second group.

Identifying the difference between a tourist and a pilgrim can be difficult and problematic. Richards & Fernandes (2007) view the role of the pilgrim-tourist in contrast to Cohen (2001) who introduced a model defining the tourist as a spectator. Instead, they define religious tourists as, “…those who come to observe but who will also occasionally engage in worship. The religious tourist in particular is in an ambivalent position, sometimes experiencing the festival as a spectacle, but also sometimes experiencing its transformatory effects” (pp. 218).

Religious pilgrimage tourism is not similar to other types of tourism. Government institutional messages may reach the pilgrim before the journey or even after; however, once the pilgrim leaves for the journey, he or she effectively is gone. With a focus on historical sacrifice, no home-base, and meager accommodations, communication with a
pilgrim along the route is difficult. If government or patrimonial intervention did take place along the route, marketing or attempts to construct or mold the El Camino experience would probably be met with hostility. Even though Spain is a well developed country, much of El Camino requires escaping from modernity and experiencing the beauty of the surroundings.

Route based tourism refers to the importance of a journey, sometimes at the expense of the end goal (Richards & Fernandes, 2007; Puczkó & Rátz, 2007, pg 138; Murray & Graham, 1997, pp. 514). Route based tourism does not refer exclusively to religious tourism. Central to route based tourism is the selection of theme, which qualifies and justifies the presence of the tourist (Puczkó & Rátz, 2000). In the case of pilgrimage, these routes represent both the literal and metaphorical journey of a pilgrim. Religious tourism, in the sense of an association with the religious tradition of the route, connotes a spiritual inner journey to mirror that of the physical expedition (Richards & Fernandes, 2007). In addition, these descriptions are closely associated to exploration. The type of self-reflective examination and the historical following of a time-honored path both contribute to a tourist’s or pilgrim’s sense of discovery and exploration.

El Camino combines these tourism pursuits in a meaningful way and, while not the original goal, has created a tourism destination away from Spain’s typical sun and sand sites. The end destination of El Camino is the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela but the route is equally important, if not more so. The journey and the destination appeal to different groups of tourists, “Indeed, the route can be experienced without necessarily ever arriving at its objective; in turn the destination can be experienced without following the route, even though that will- to a large extent- define the tourism representation of the
destination” (Murray & Graham, 1997, pg 514). The path and the site are part of an established and historical tradition, documented and traversed by centuries of pilgrims.

While *El Camino* and the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela can be accessed through various transportation methods, there are two traditional routes. The French route starts in the Pyrenees and goes through two different cities, eventually meeting in Puente la Reina110.

![Map of El Camino](image1)

From: Turespaña, 2010a

The Spanish route was originally conceived of to allow pilgrims to avoid Muslim territory in the Middle Ages, upon reaching Oviedo one can either proceed with the Northern Route or chose the Primitive Route111. The Primitive Route “…recreates the route taken by King Alfonso II the Chaste in the 9th century to visit the tomb of James the Apostle when it was first discovered. It starts in Oviedo, and passes through the woods and valleys of Asturias, to link up with the French Route in Palas de Rei112.”

![Map of Spanish route](image2)

Turespaña, 2010b

---

110 Turespaña, 2010a
111 Turespaña, 2010b
112 Turespaña, 2010c
Both routes end in Santiago de Compostela and with a visit to the Cathedral. The route itself and its historical-religious significance make it a large attraction for Spanish tourism and the Northern Spain region. *El Camino* can be walked at any time during the year; however, many pilgrims and travelers attempt to coincidence their arrival in Santiago with the Feast of St. James on June 25th.

**Weaker Government Institutional Intervention, Stronger Mediated Environment**

For the purposes of this thesis, *El Camino* is established as an instance of the confluence of weaker government institutional intervention and stronger popular and user-generated resources. As previously stated, there are different types of religious tourists who embark on *El Camino*, each with varying motivations. However, the primary motivator for all types of tourist in this case is to experience *El Camino*, which is defined by its extra-state properties. The way in which a tourist wants to experience *El Camino* and the lessons taken from it may or may not frame the journey in terms of religious significance.

The original purpose of *El Camino* is rooted in the Catholic religious tradition and it still exists somewhat outside of the power of the modern Spanish state. The tradition originates from a belief system outside the state and it would be inappropriate, not to mention ill received, for the Spanish government to attempt to dictate aspects of *El Camino*. However because it takes place within its borders, Spain has an interest in promoting and drawing tourists to the area. Unlike in Thailand, however, the Spanish government does not need to approve of activities surrounding *El Camino* like the Thai...
government does with culinary tourism. 94% of Spanish citizens identify as Catholic and Church-state relations in Spain have been particularly strong over the decades (Davies, 2005). Enthusiasm about and interest in promoting *El Camino*, can be partially explained by Spain’s Catholic creed. In a country less friendly to Catholicism or with a more problematic history with organized religion, promotion would not be as prevalent.

### 3.9 Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders

As with other tourism subsets discussed in this thesis, internet websites must be relied upon for information concerning government institutional intervention. This portion of the analysis will be confined to the heavily developed website, [http://www.spain.info/](http://www.spain.info/), of the Institute of Tourism of Spain and the official website of Spanish tourism. This website also features the Spanish tourism slogan: “I need Spain.” This new slogan, released March 9, 2010, is accompanied by a graphic, the well-recognized sun of Joan Miro; both the words and image will be used along video and web campaigns to highlight Spain’s cultural assets. This will be the only website analyzed in detail because this website is the predominate outlet for Spanish government information about *El Camino*. The lack of a plethora of government websites is to be expected because of the weaker degree of government institutional intervention and the increased amount of autonomy and self-determination allotted to private groups, as necessitated by the nature of the religious tourism industry.

The Spanish government promotes *El Camino* in international tourism markets through online, web-based sites; however, it does so in a way that attempts to promote supplementary cultural experiences and not construct or add definitive meaning to *El Camino*.

---

113 Central Intelligence Agency, 2010
114 VisitSpain, 2010
**Camino.** According to http://www.spain.info/, the national government stakeholders involved in the online promotion of Spain’s tourism industry include el Gobierno de España (Government of Spain), Institute of Tourism of Spain, Turespaña (TourSpain), and el Ministerio de Industria, Turisme, y Comercio (Ministry of Industry, Tourism, and Commerce). Turespaña, which is the corporate site that runs http://www.spain.info/, is an administrative unit of the Central Government “…in charge of promoting Spain abroad as a tourism destination.” Turespaña itself is comprised of multiple stakeholders, including press offices and regional Spanish tourism offices. While the portion of the website dedicated to *El Camino* is small and only one of many themed attractions, the Way of St. James is featured on the site and the publicity for it is highly developed.

The government website promotes *El Camino* through visual and textual references that put the journey in the context of a specific Spanish culture. In addition, as previously mentioned, UNESCO has established *El Camino* and historic sites in Santiago as part of not only Spanish heritage but world heritage. Upon arriving at http://www.spain.info/, a visitor will be presented with one of several rotating stock photos. One of those photos features a young man hiking one of *El Camino*’s routes and interacting with an older man who is seated along the route. While not a definitive deconstruction, the photograph implies serenity and a search for self understanding. The young man walking alone appears to be in good physical and mental condition, as evidenced by his appearance and his smile, and the sun is either rising or setting. This

---

115 Turespaña, 2010e
116 Also listed are: Secretary of State for Tourism and Commerce, Secretary General for Tourism, General Direction [sic-director?], Tourist Offices of Spain, Congresses Center, Department for the Promotion and Marketing of Tourism Abroad, Department for the Planning and Coordination of the Tourist Offices of Spain, Department of Economic and Administrative Management, Cabinet, Press Cabinet, Paradores (Luxury Hotels): Turespaña, 2010f
117 See Figure 2
photograph includes has the word “Conoce,” which is the third person or second personal formal conjugation of the Spanish verb “Conocer” or to know, to be familiar with. While the subtle meaning of this word and it’s inclusion on the website may be lost on non-Spanish speakers, “Conoce” could refer to knowing: Spain, yourself (traveler), fellow traveler, locals, the route. This type of advertising creates an image of a worthwhile endeavor, during which a participant will gain valuable knowledge from the route itself and from those older and wiser locals that will be encountered. The photograph creates a positive image of the route and encourages a positive image of Spain. However, this picture would not be an indicator of El Camino except for those who were already acquainted with the symbols. The link to El Camino is made clear by the shell marking in the foreground of the photograph, which is the symbol of St. James and El Camino.

For those not versed in El Camino cues, the static banner below the picture features four topics that viewers can select for more information: “Easter Week,” “World Heritage Site,” “Green Spain,” and “The Way of Saint James.” While these banners may change during the year and depending on the season\(^\text{118}\), the featuring of the Way of Saint James on the homepage allots the route a certain amount of prestige and importance. Upon selecting “The Way of St. James,” the visitor is directed to a webpage with information about El Camino. The same page can be accessed by selecting “Discover,” then “Great Routes,” then “The Way of St. James.” The webpage includes a map of the “French Route” and the “Spanish Route,” both of which can be selected for more information; Practical Advice; an Agenda; sightseeing recommendations along the route; and a drop down menu that lists various motivations for journeying El Camino. The

\(^{118}\) When this site was accessed March 21, 2010, Easter was April 4, 2010 and the Feast of St. James was June 25\(^{\text{th}}\), 2010
question posed on the site is “How would you like to experience it?” and is followed by the phrase, “I want to experience the way of Saint James”\textsuperscript{119}, which is accompanied by a drop down menu containing the words: *Cultural, Nature, Sports, Health Tourism, Gastronomy*, and *On the coast*. Depending on the selection, the visitor is given different options and descriptions of locations along *El Camino* that may be of interest.

The Spanish government has a significant interest in the Way of St. James as a promotional tool for encouraging travel arrivals to Spain and as a symbol of Spanish unity and cultural identity. The government cannot control the message of the actual *El Camino*. It can only place The Way of St. James in the context of Spanish heritage. Being proud of the heritage and encouraging visitors are separate from controlling aspects of the actual event or what it means for visitors. In short, unlike the European Capitals of Culture program, the government cannot control the actual content of the event; however, they can seek to diversify the type of tourists and pilgrims drawn to *El Camino* by advertising other stops along the way.

Further complicating Spanish government institutional intervention is the involvement in *El Camino* of the autonomous Galician government. Regions that support the route of *El Camino* also become stakeholders in this brand of tourism. The regional government of Galicia, where *El Camino* ends, is such a stakeholder. Galicia, in particular, has the largest interest\textsuperscript{120} in attracting pilgrims and tourists to The Way of St. James in an effort to draw tourists to its region, which historically has been poor. In addition to general promotional methods, the government of Galicia has invested in

\textsuperscript{119} Turespaña, 2010g
\textsuperscript{120} Xacobeo, 2010
hostels for pilgrims along the final section of the route. The Galician government also has been assisting with the filming and research for Emilio Estevez’s forthcoming film *The Way* (Silva, 2009). These promotional materials bring revenue and recognition to the region, as well as create resources and materials that are of use to those considering the journey.

The impact of government campaigns and marketing for *El Camino* remains unclear, especially in light of reported motivations for making the journey. Government websites and information may be a starting point for some Catholics who undertake one of the routes and these websites may encourage pilgrims to experience other sites in Spain. In 2004, according to the Archdiocese of Campostela, the majority of pilgrims reported religious motivations as the primary reason to undertake the journey, followed by religious-cultural and cultural reasons. The motivational statistics appear to shift dramatically in 2006 and 2007 to favor religious-cultural/religious and other reasons as being the main motivators for traveling *El Camino*.

*Table 5. El Camino and Tourism Motivations*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religious</td>
<td>134,330 (74.7%)</td>
<td>41,793 (41.6%)</td>
<td>43,581 (38.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Cultural/</td>
<td>35,528 (19.7%)</td>
<td>49,726 (49.6%)</td>
<td>60,944 (53.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious and Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural/Not religious reasons</td>
<td>10,086 (5.6%)</td>
<td>8,858 (8.8%)</td>
<td>9,501 (8.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>179,944 (100%)</td>
<td>100,377 (100%)</td>
<td>114,026 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Compiled from: Archidiocese de Santiago de Campostela, n.d.

Initially it may appear as though the government appeals are working; however, 2004 was a Jacobean, or Jubilee, Year meaning that the Feast of St. James fell on a Sunday.

---

121 Diaz, n.d.
Jacobean years are the most popular for traveling The Way of St. James (Zito, 2010). The most useful information that can be gleaned from these statistics is the realization that there are a limited number of Catholic tourists traveling El Camino and most of them prefer to travel during the Jacobean year. Because of this preference, national and local promotional materials are aimed to inspire other tourists or pilgrims.

It cannot be denied, however, that the meaning of walking El Camino has shifted over time. While the journey was once focused almost exclusively on traveling to the body of St. James to have sins forgiven and plenary indulgences granted, it is now much more focused on a path to inner discovery\(^{122}\). Whereas the end destination was the main driving force, the pilgrimage of today does include stops at other religious sites and occasionally non-religious sites for some pilgrims. In some ways, there has been a shift from specifically religious focus to more general spirituality. Something that was once an exclusively Catholic act for fervent believers, has added non-Catholics and those looking for an interesting, challenging vacation.

While the Catholic Church has a very large interest in preserving El Camino as a Catholic activity, it also can use the journey as a way to share faith and heritage with non-Catholics. The presence of the Catholic Church adds an important external pressure on the Spanish government and Spanish promotional activities. While Spain is a secular state, its historic link to the Catholic Church has remained strong and separating the history of Spain from its Catholicism would be impossible. The Catholic Church reinforces El Camino, and pilgrimage in general, through its institutional teachings and occasional announcements. Pope Benedict XVI was on hand to assist with the inauguration of the 2010 Jacobean Holy Year for the Way of St. James and sent a public

\(^{122}\) Ward, n.d.
letter to the Archbishop of Santiago\textsuperscript{123}. The Pope’s involvement highlights the importance of the pilgrimage for Catholics but also makes a public relations announcement to the rest of the world. Promoting \textit{El Camino} reinforces the Church’s place in world history, creates empathy and cross-cultural experience between Catholics and non-Catholics, or could lead to a discovery of faith or spirituality. Because pilgrims now stop at other sites along the routes, many of which are churches, encouraging \textit{El Camino} is a step towards encouraging the importance of preserving churches in the region. The Cathedral at Santiago, in addition to the historic town surrounding it, already is a protected World Heritage Site\textsuperscript{124} but donations or other financial support may result from a pilgrim. The Catholic Church encourages travel along the Way of St. James in the same way that a nation would encourage tourism for cultural and financial reasons,

\section*{3.10 Locating the Tourist}

Religious pilgrimage is not popular subject matter for contemporary novels, films, and televisions; however some outlets for \textit{El Camino} do exist. The most popular and well-known pilgrimage stories are Thornton Wilder’s \textit{The Bridge of San Luis Rey} and Geoffrey Chaucer’s \textit{The Canterbury Tales}. Previously mentioned films like \textit{The Way} have the potential to increase the visibility of \textit{El Camino}. Some television travel shows like \textit{Spain: On the Road Again} have included \textit{El Camino} in episodes\textsuperscript{125}. While some books do detail fictionalized accounts\textsuperscript{126} of \textit{El Camino}, the majority stick to pilgrimages’

\textsuperscript{123} Catholic News Agency, 2010
\textsuperscript{124} World Heritage List, 2010b
\textsuperscript{125} Spain… On the Road Again, 2008: \textit{Episode 102: Pilgrimage to Galicia}
\textsuperscript{126} Examples: \textit{Dead End on the Camino: A Noa Webster Mystery} by Elyn Aviva;
reflections\textsuperscript{127} on their journeys. According to Amazon.com, a search for \textit{El Camino de Santiago} yields 185 nonfiction books and only 53 in the fiction category. These media outlets have the potential to provide tourists with accessible references points that could influence their decisions to undertake the \textit{El Camino} journey.

Tourist sites and organizations that cater to \textit{El Camino} range from fraternal organizations to the more informal blogs of travelers. The Confraternity of St. James is a British non-profit organization of past pilgrims and \textit{El Camino} enthusiasts who offer advice and guidance to future pilgrims\textsuperscript{128}. The majority of blogs offer personal perspectives on the journeys as well as advice on completing the trip. Sites like http://www.caminodesantiago.me.uk/ offer extensive historical information, blogs, and a forum. The forum is divided into four topical sections: Lounge (General Chat; Religion and Spirituality; Forum Feedback); The Caminos to Santiago de Compostela (Camino Frances; \textit{Via de la Plata}; Camino Portugues; Santiago to Finisterre; Camino del Norte; Camino Ingles; Camino de Madrid; and Camino Aragones); Information for All Camino Routes (Cycling; By Horse; Weather; Pilgrim Books; Hotels; Traveling to and from; Medical Problems; Equipment; Miscellaneous); and, finally, Santiago de Compostela (Where to stay and What to do). According to the website’s analytics and statistics, there are 747 threads; 3,658 posts; and 1,775 members\textsuperscript{129}. Another site, http://www.caminodesantiagome/, also includes a forum. It boasts 49,638 total posts; 7,698 total topics; and 6,192 total members\textsuperscript{130}. While more people probably visit these

\textsuperscript{127} Examples: \textit{The Pilgrimage Road to Santiago: The Complete Cultural Handbook} by David M. Glitz; \textit{My Father, My Daughter: Pilgrims on the Road to Santiago} by Donald Schell; \textit{Pilgrim Stories: On and Off the Road to Santiago, Journeys Along an Ancient Way in Modern Spain} by Nancy Louise Frey; and \textit{The Pilgrimage: A Contemporary Quest for Ancient Wisdom} by Paulo Coelho

\textsuperscript{128} The Confraternity of St. James, 2009a

\textsuperscript{129} Statistics found on April 18, 2010 (Bulletin, 2010)

\textsuperscript{130} Statistics found on April 18, 2010 (Rekve, 2010)
websites than post, these active communities of participation imply a high degree of interest in *El Camino*, especially given the relatively low profile of these sites. Most the information contained in the forums is of a practical nature. There are a multitude of websites dedicated to *El Camino* and the proliferation of internet access makes them increasingly accessible to modern pilgrims.

Pilgrimage is entering the digital age in other ways too, further exposing it to more potential travelers. *Busted Halo*, “an online magazine for spiritual seekers,” has begun a “laptop pilgrimage” of the Way of St. James. The pilgrimage of 9 participants began their journey on March 20, 2010 and internet viewers who are unable to participate themselves are able to watch and follow online. The popularity and success of the event is unknown, as it is ongoing, but this format is a new and innovative one by which to experience pilgrimage. Certainly watching online is not the same as being there but technology has lent itself to encouraging different approaches to popularizing and publicizing *El Camino*.

More popular and widely used sites, like TripAdvisor.com, also are a good place to look for *El Camino* information. A quick search for “El Camino de Santiago” reveals reviews, forums, and traveler articles; however, most are in Spanish. Searching for “The Way of St. James” generates 9,460 forums; 130 travel articles; and 1 attraction listing. The Galicia Travel Forum is the most applicable to this topic area. Among the first 20 entries, 6 deal directly with *El Camino* and received a variety of responses. The 6 forum threads dealt with suggestions for itineraries and specific logistical questions about the Way of St. James. These types of questions and responses imply that most tourists do not

---

131 The Editors, 2010
132 Not all these results refer to the Way of St. James, some refer to other sites with the words St. James in it
come to websites and boards without any information on or knowledge about *El Camino*. Most appear to have made up their minds to travel, but hope to gain insider knowledge from other pilgrims to maximize the experience.

### 3.11 Summary of Explanatory Factors

The power to construct this experience is completely outside the reach of the Spanish national government, at least theoretically. Spain and Catholicism are intrinsically linked. However, in this case, if the Spanish government were to market the religious or spiritual product instead of the cultural product, it may have an adverse impact on the perceived authenticity of the product. Patrimonial powers, however, are able to exert some control by marketing to certain types of tourists and shifting the focus of the event. By marketing the cultural, sport, health, and culinary elements along the route, the government attracts different types of tourists and may succeed in making some pilgrims into tourists. Of course, one unintended result may be that some tourists become pilgrims, i.e., that Government and Church efforts may yield some converts to Christianity. The tourist has the majority of the power to determine how he or she will experience *El Camino* and what he or she will take away from it.

### 3.12 Dependent Outcomes

The convergence of weaker institutional intervention and stronger mediated environments results in imbalances among authenticity, homogenization, and commodification. The precarious relationship between religion and state is a nuanced one, which in the case of Spain and the Catholic Church has a historical basis; however, it is in the interest of both institutions to remain as separate entities. The Spanish
government does promote *El Camino* as a way to experience Spain’s cultural landscape and suggests other activities that run along the route. However popular and online media highlight the spiritual side of the journey, in addition to the cultural and historical. The tourists focus in creating a community of global pilgrims and the government’s focus on culture are not at odds with one another; but the potential for a clash of interpretation and further changes to the global cultural meaning of the route are very real possibilities.

**Authenticity**

Examining the perceived authenticity of *El Camino* requires evaluating the confluence of government institutional intervention and tourism motivations. In this instance, the government intervenes by marketing the Way of St. James as a cultural route and not focusing on the religious aspect. Outside providers influence tourism motivations by highlighting the self-discovery, spirituality, adventure, and physical challenge of the journey. The authenticity of travel and experience are at stake in this instance, in addition to cultural authenticity.

These elements converge to focus on an event and a product that is outside of the state. The influence of fellow travelers, who shape the experience to be one of personal discovery and adventure, coupled with the government’s supplementary messages about cultural creates a type of discovery tourism that views the experience through a different lens than that used for traditional cultural tourism. In a way, the experience is not constructed by the government but rather by the pilgrim or tourist.

The authenticity of experience is valued by all pilgrims and something not influenced by government intervention. Religious pilgrims have an interest in having an authentic encounter with God, challenging both themselves and their beliefs to reach a
type of enlightenment. Non-religious or more culturally focused pilgrims and tourists also have an interest in an authentic experience, for self discovery or personal challenge, for example. Government advertisement does not attempt to construct this type of authenticity because it would be viewed as strange for the Spanish government to push Catholic pilgrimage as an essential religious commitment. With the Hajj, for example, because Muslim institutions received support from the Saudi Arabian state, it is not out of character for the government to actively promote the pilgrimage or to outlaw non-believers from participating. Catholicism in Spain is waning and becoming more of a cultural market, so keeping the faith relevant and changing its meaning may be more of a method of preservation. No matter the motivation though, pilgrims along El Camino will authentically have an experience.

The Catholic Church, like the Spanish government, cannot easily validate a pilgrim’s experience as authentic or inauthentic in a theoretical sense; however, the Church does control the definition of who is and is not an authentic pilgrim along El Camino. This identification has nothing to do with faith but rather with stamps in the Credencial or Pilgrims Passport. This passport is purchased at the beginning of the journey and stamped along the way, in hostels or villages, to verify that a pilgrim has completed the entire journey\(^\text{133}\). The Credencial is necessary for pilgrims seeking accommodation in free pilgrim refuges or in hostels catering to pilgrims\(^\text{134}\). Upon reaching the Cathedral at Santiago, a full passport will be stamped with the Compostela, which is an exclusive document verifying the journey and its completion\(^\text{135}\). La Oficina del Peregrino issues the Compostela and separate documents are issued for religious

\(^{133}\) The Confraternity of St. James, 2009c
\(^{134}\) Saranjan Tours, Inc., 2009
\(^{135}\) American Pilgrims on the Camino, 2010
pilgrims and those who complete *El Camino* for non-religious or spiritual reasons.\(^{136}\) This distinction implies knowledge and awareness about the changing nature and meaning of the Way of St. James and its travelers, yet still encourages non-Catholic visitors.

The *El Camino* experience highlights the link between place and authenticity; a connection that cannot be transferred between locations. This specific pilgrimage has significance because of a historical lineage and could not take place in another location. It also cannot be recreated anywhere else and retain its meaning. If the Spanish state hypothetically was hostile to the journey or the route, that lack of patronage would not diminish the historical knowledge about the location or its importance. It should be noted that an alternative route was created during the Middle Ages to avoid Muslim settlements along the way and ensure the safety of pilgrims and both routes are now traveled. Even though the route was altered, the end destination was not; and because that was the focus of that age, the meaning of the journey was not significantly impacted.

*El Camino* may be traveled in stages but it is far from a staged event. The tourist actively participates in the journey and typically does so without any local guide to add context or meaning to the experience.\(^{137}\) It differs from other types of tourism discussed in this thesis because a local is not performing or interpreting the experience for the tourist. It is an active and participatory type of tourism. In addition, while many Spaniards participate in the pilgrimage and have historically done so, modern pilgrims are drawn from many nations and those participating are experiencing an act that does not

\(^{136}\) Nelson, n.d.

\(^{137}\) Groups do sometimes travel *El Camino*; however, those led by individuals outside the state, the local Galician tourism industry, and other Spanish tourism providers are significantly different than such tourism industry guides or companies.
belong only to the Spanish. The journey itself can be experienced as close to or as far from the original conditions of historical pilgrims as one desires.

The culture that arises from *El Camino* is one that belongs to the pilgrims who experience it. The interaction with other pilgrims, and the action itself, add meaning, apart from state institutional intervention. The state does add supplementary information about a variety of cultural and specialty sites in order to peak the interest of pilgrims and potential pilgrims. The government narrative that is constructed highlights historical antecedents, welcomes tradition, and encourages cultural experimentation.

**Commodification**

In theory, religious belief and spirituality should not be commodities. The reality, however, is that the commodification of faith is a common and widespread phenomenon. Faith and economics have been intertwined for some time; but it is the *El Camino* experience and not the faith behind it that have become commodities in this case. The Way of St. James was a commodity before it progressed from being an exclusively Catholic practice, however increases in its secularization have resulted in commoditization. As *El Camino* becomes a more common place occurrence, open to non-Catholics, its meaning shifts from a representation of Catholic religiosity to one of a more universal spirituality. It also lends itself to be culturally descriptive of Spain, which makes commoditization even easier. However, it is important to note that that while *El Camino* can be marketed as a commodity, it is not a product with a guaranteed meaning or outcome.
Homogenization

As previously stated, the Way of St. James could not occur in another location and the route specific to it does not lend itself to replication or homogenization of content. The churches, towns, natural elements, and other major parts of the route could not be exactly copied.

Other religious routes may have similar structures or be arranged in similar fashions; but the content and traditions of each protect them from cultural homogenization. However, many other religious sites and pilgrimage have experienced a semantic shift in the meaning of religious locations as they apply to pilgrimage and tourism. Secularization makes the original religious intentions difficult to see but modern tourists closely resemble traditional pilgrims. Japanese tourists who flock to Buddhist sights in Japan for tourist reasons, like architecture, artwork, music, or Cherry Blossoms, are reenacting the same paths as their pilgrim ancestors and their entertainment, cultural focus actually bind the groups together because “…tourism has always been part of pilgrimage and many of the functions of pilgrimage survive in tourism” (Foard, 1982, pp. 231).

Globalization and cross cultural interest also take a toll on religious pilgrimage. The yearly pilgrimage of Romani gypsies to les Saintes-Marie-de-la-Mar in France is another example of a religious pilgrimage that has become more secular and cultural over time. Because this progression for St. Sara, patron saint of the gypsies, involves a marginal group and attracts a large group of outsiders, an aspect of “aggressive performance” is constructed in the public spaces of the town (Wiley, 2005, pp. 139). In a reversal from other cultural performances, the pilgrims perform the attraction and are observed by other outsiders.
Because pilgrimages focus on different elements and are dedicated to specific events or deities, the homogenization of content would be difficult. While the content of pilgrimages may be different, there certainly hallmarks of a pilgrimage journey that have come to be homogenized and standardized over time, such as traveling alone, small amounts of luggage, or “roughing it,” and the purpose of pilgrimages as a self-reflexive endeavor is becoming more common. Pilgrimages to Irish shrines of Saints are another route-based activity and an example of a specific type of non-homogenized religious tourism because of the focus on significant sites instead of objects or artifacts (Nolan, 1983). These examples do not highlight the process of the journey in the same way that El Camino does; however, they provide helpful examples to see that not all pilgrimages are the same. Nor do they address similar themes; although many pilgrimages do face similar shifts in meaning and struggles with modernity.

3.13 Conclusion

The European Capital of Cultures program and religious tourism are similar in that each must reconcile extra-national pressures when constructing cultural messages. Both of the given examples also are events with an established legacy and documented purpose. However they differ in their purposes. The ECoC program provides nations with the opportunity to revitalize specific cities as well as build upon established cultural elements to create innovative new products. In the case of Istanbul and Turkey, government institutional intervention is influenced heavily by the government’s EU accession hope. This hope does not necessarily reflect the desire of all Turkish people. In this case, government institutional intervention is extremely strong while weaker mediated environments are present. In contrast, religious tourism, specifically El Camino
*de Santiago*, displays weaker government institutional intervention with the presence of stronger mediated environments. While *El Camino* and St. James are both important parts of Spanish nationalism, it is in the interest of the Spanish government not to dictate or qualify the cultural meaning of the experience. The government instead has begun a nuanced marketing technique that frames *El Camino* in terms of cultural, gastronomic, and environment activities and stops along the route. In both case studies, the proximity of the government institutions to the creation of the cultural message influences the messages acceptance and impact.
CHAPTER 4. Case Studies

4.1 Sub-National Case Studies: Thailand and Canada

Hercule Poirot: “Now we were just about to take some lunch, would you care to join us?”
Mrs. Tolliver: “Lunch? In a native place, you mean?”

Adaptation of Problem at Sea by Agatha Christie

In addition to their sub-national interest groups, culinary tourism in Thailand and indigenous tourism in Canada are comparable in that they are two types of more general industries as opposed to events or displays. The sub-national actors and interests at stake in both of these industries require both governments and mediated environments to take account of them. However, these stakeholders also use technological tools to establish this presence in mediated environments. In both instances, intrastate non-governmental actors, national government entities, and outside tourists or observers use and create online resources in order to comment on or create cultural landscapes.

The following two case studies represent different instances of combining government institutional interventions with mediated environments, resulting in different combinations of stronger and weaker presences. However, both of these cases share a contradiction between cultural authenticity and homogenization. The tensions and balances created and destroyed imply the fluidity of terms and concepts describing cultural construction which result from global processes.

--------------------------------------------

4.2 Thailand: Culinary Tourism

The study of culinary tourism is a more recent phenomenon; however, sampling the foodstuffs of a country has long been a motivation for travel. Thailand has come to be known as a culinary destination that uses its exotic background to attract tourists and
export its cuisine. According to Lucy M. Long, who coined the term in 1998, culinary tourism is defined, “…as the intentional, exploratory participation in the foodways of an other- participation including the consumption, preparation, and presentation of a food item, cuisine, meal system, or eating style considering to belong to a culinary system not one’s own” (2004, pp. 21). Culinary tourism products require government backing and local, independent producers. In the case of Thailand, the government exerts influence on the Thai culinary market by providing funds and creating programs that make food based tourism a national priority. Alternatively, tourists partake in culinary tourism to deepen their understanding of the industry and of food.

For the purposes of this thesis, culinary tourism includes self-proclaimed “foodies” for whom food is a motivation for travel, those traveling to learn culinary skills, and food consumed within one’s home that has been influenced by outside forces\(^\text{138}\). It does not strictly refer to “Gourmet Tourism,” which implies that tourists want to experience the fare at highly rated restaurants. Rather, the phrase “unique and memorable” is key to understanding culinary tourism. A culinary tourist could have a unique and memorable experience at a Michelin Star Restaurant branch in Taipei, like the three-star Michelin restaurant *L'Atelier de Joel Robuchon*,\(^\text{139}\) or experiencing the work of two-star chef Rene Dittrich at D'Sens French Restaurant at *Dusit Thani*\(^\text{140}\), in contrast to having an equally notable experience at the Shinlin Night Market in downtown Taipei or at the Talad Kaset Market in Phuket. What defines a unique and memorable experience is up to the tourist.

---

\(^{138}\) International Culinary Tourism Association, n.d.

\(^{139}\) Taiwan News, 2009

\(^{140}\) Dusit International, 2010
According to the International Culinary Tourism Association’s definition of the industry, “It encompasses cooking schools, cookbook and kitchen gadget stores, culinary tours and tour leaders, culinary media and guidebooks, caterers, wineries, breweries, distilleries, food growers and manufacturers, culinary attractions and more. Authenticity is also of critical importance to culinary tourists.” Culinary tourism destinations brand themselves as such so that it is virtually impossible to divorce the food or beverage product from location and local industry. This practice tends to be easier for beverages, for example the Napa Valley as “wine country,” the Champagne region in France, Bassano del Grappa in Italy. However, good food often goes along with good wine, beer, or liquor. National cuisines are thought to be specific to countries and, thus, deemed more authentic when produced in the countries or by nationals of them.

While culinary tourism is a viable motivation for some tourists, it should be remembered that desired levels of authenticity vary. Industry professionals and associations argue that tourists deeply desire authenticity in food; however, Cohen & Avieli (2004) claim that the majority of tourists do not desire total authenticity with food because of the bodily risk involved and the hygiene guaranteed by modern cooking appliances. They claim that the “simplified register” (pp. 785) of menus from ethnic restaurants at home, as well as an expectation that local food will be turned into an acceptable, tourist-focused alternative, causes tourists to desire a degree of sameness and familiarity. While Cohen and Avieli may be correct when examining the average tourist for whom food may be merely a necessity or of secondary interest, tourists who have prepared themselves to experience the cuisine of other places have weighed the concerns of illness, table manners, language, and hygiene. They still find the local culinary

---

141 International Culinary Tourism Association, n.d.
experience to be one worth having. Culinary tourists fall into Cohen’s category of the “existential tourist” (pp. 774) who completely switches to a local diet during a trip in order to gain a fruitful experience.

Again, evaluation of government approach to this industry and tourist focus must be done through website analysis.

4.3 Culinary Tourism in and from Thailand

Whether traveling to Thailand, eating out in a Thai restaurant close to home, or attempting to cook Thai dishes, there is no doubt that Thai cuisine has made its way around the globe. Away.com, which provides expert and consumer travel advice, recently named Bangkok, Thailand as the #1 Foodie Destination\(^\text{142}\). One of the experts who made this determination was Kendra Bailey Morris, who is well-renowned in the culinary industry and whose opinion carries significant weight\(^\text{143}\). The International Culinary Tourism Association has identified Thailand as an emerging hotspot\(^\text{144}\) for culinary tourism in its *2010 Culinary Tourism State of the Industry Report and Readiness Index*. Thai domestic food producers have begun to increase profits after a period of economic downturn and the Thai beverage industry is expected to recover as tourism increases (King, 2010).

Besides the previously mentioned government endeavors, like culinary schools and international franchises, Thailand has begun to diversify its culinary products in the

\(^{142}\) Morris, n.d.
\(^{143}\) “Kendra Bailey Morris, boasts an impressive background as a published author, renowned chef instructor, restaurant critic, newspaper columnist, television and radio personality, food and travel writer and more. Morris regularly contributes food and travel articles to Away.com and her well-informed opinion, especially in regards to the culinary arts, holds great weight as an expert within the community. A self-proclaimed “foodies” that relishes in traveling solely to discover new tastes, Morris has traveled the world many times over, experiencing the local cuisine of hundreds of destinations – Morris’s high regard of Bangkok, Thailand cuisine to be the world’s best is no small matter” (Business Wire, 2010).
\(^{144}\) International Culinary Tourism Association, 2010
hopes of attracting new types of tourists and supporters. Thai wine and wineries are emerging as part of a new latitude vineyard trend and are creating wines that are internationally competitive despite the lack of a historic wine industry (Rivers, 2010).

Even as Thai food products may evolve, four main culinary regions dominate the country. The Central, Northern, Northeast, and Southern are the most typical delineations for regional cuisine, although some include Bangkok as its own region too (Tan, 2007). Cities like Bangkok are joined by Chain Mai in the North and Phuket Island in the South as popular culinary destinations. These distinct regions and cities each have diverse culinary traditions that create unique destinations for culinary tourism motivated by eating or by learning about food.

**Stronger Government Institutional Intervention, Stronger Mediated Environment**

Culinary tourism relies on cultural nuances to create a place specific focus on gastronomic activities which motivate travel for some tourists. Food and culinary products add to the experience of a tourist and to the atmosphere of a travel experience. The Thai Government uses culinary tourism to attract tourists, establish a national brand, and support small businesses within Thailand. It also has an interest in promoting Thai culinary tourism abroad. The mediated environments that deal with food include extensive food blogs and restaurant reviews that are readily available to potential travelers. The materials and websites that are available to potential tourists create a myth of authenticity along with a focus on uniqueness, both of which are at odds with the commodification and homogenization of the Thai culinary industry and government business plans abroad.
4.4 Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders

Culinary tourism in Thailand does display stronger institutional intervention than some other locations and industries because of the Thai government’s consistent and publicized involvement in the industry. Unlike with exclusive cultural focus tourism, some of the power is taken away from government entities when it comes to forming the culinary tourism industry. Instead, government institutions must support and promote culinary tourism through financial enterprises and marketing. They do not have much influence over the daily menu of a restaurant or recipes at cooking schools; however, government institutions can create an atmosphere that encourages culinary tourism as a representation of place.

Tourism Authority of Thailand (TAT), Thai Ministry of Commerce, and local government authorities appear to be the most common government stakeholders in Thai culinary tourism given their consistent involvement and the high visibility of their websites. In addition, government backed franchises and culinary institutes are representations of this intervention. Finally, chefs, restaurants, instructors, and hotels are all industry stakeholders too.

Government institutional marketing of culinary tourism can be found in television ads, internet sites, and tourism sites. All of these mediums are meant to attract the attention of potential tourists or industry aficionados. The Tourism Authority of Thailand website has an extensive Restaurant Search\textsuperscript{145} function that locates restaurants based on “Province,” “Type of Restaurant,” and “Type of Food.” After selecting a restaurant, a potential diner can connect to the restaurant through the TAT website, as well as view

\textsuperscript{145} Amazing Thailand, n.d.
address, telephone, and website information. By centralizing and easing restaurant searches, the Thai government sends the message that culinary experiences should be a priority for travelers.

Hosting international culinary events has aided Thailand in expanding its culinary brand. According to Mrs. Juthaporn Rerngronasa, the TAT’s Deputy Governor for Marketing Communications, “Promotion of Thai cuisine is one of the TAT’s top-most priorities because it builds bridges between travel and tourism, the country’s largest service industry, with agriculture, the largest overall industry.” According to a TAT press release, “…Thai dishes, food and beverage consumption is an important component of visitor expenditure in Thailand. In 2007, visitors to Thailand spent an average of 4,120.95 Baht per person per day, of which 731.10 Baht or 17.74% was on food and beverage.” In September of 2009, “Amazing Tastes of Thailand” and “Thailand Brand” were held by TAT to assist industry professionals in expanding culinary tourism pursuits. Government sponsorship of such programs represents a commitment to industry development.

Beyond developing the domestic resources for culinary tourism, Thailand aims to influence Thai restaurants around the world. The Thai government attempted to launch a program called “Global Thai Restaurant Co. (Frank, 2001; Walkup, 2001)” in 2001, which would have created a government owned international franchise of Thai restaurants abroad. Even though that idea did not receive Parliamentary approval, Thailand has seen increases to its tourism industry as a result of culinary exportation. According to Frank, culinary ventures abroad boost tourism “… as fans of the food are

---

146 Tourism Association of Thailand, 2009
147 Tourism Association of Thailand, 2009
enticed to sample the country itself” (2001). Ethnic restaurants around the world are an example of cultural tourism, even if the trip required is just down the street (Molz, 2004). John Urry observed that “…people are tourists much of the time…” (1990:82), implying that the tourist experience is not limited to major vacation travel. Rather, the observing and encountering an exotic other can occur just as easily in everyday situations. An act as common as dining out becomes part of identity definition (Lu & Fine, 1995) and influential to the development of global perceptions. The Ministry of Commerce has been integral in developing the “Kitchen of the World Project” which aims to improve and control Thai food production abroad. Government sanctioned Thai restaurants abroad are projected to increase to 15,000 locations in 2010, up from 13,000 in 2009148.

The Thai government provides information and support during all levels of development of restaurants abroad. The two largest goals are:

1) To encourage Thai restaurants abroad to become tourist information and marketing centers through the establishment of superior products
2) To increase Thai restaurants abroad that are linked to Thai standards regarding taste and ingredients

Thai Food to the World, n.d.d.

The “Thai Food to The World” website149 includes information about securing a financial loan to open a Thai restaurant abroad150 and what other culinary programs the government supports. National Research Council of Thailand, Kasetsart University, the Thailand National Food Institute, Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives, Ministry of Industry, Department of Export Promotion (Ministry of Commerce), and Ministry of Public Health are all listed as stakeholders and contributors to the “Kitchen to the World”

---

148 Tourism Association of Thailand, 2009
149 Thai Food to the World, n.d.a
project. In addition, the website provides recipes, a global restaurant finder, and training information.

Two different types of culinary schools are emerging in Thailand: those aimed at locals and those for tourists. In addition to training a high achieving domestic culinary staff, Thailand offers many cooking courses in hotels, restaurants, and homes around the country. Some of these are small, privately run schools, like Classic Home Cooking School\textsuperscript{151} and Chaing Mai Thai Cookery School\textsuperscript{152}, whereas others have explicit government support or recommendations, like the Wandee Culinary School\textsuperscript{153} and Hua Hin Education Center\textsuperscript{154}. In addition, Thai culinary programs have been opening around the world, like Blue Elephant Cooking School\textsuperscript{155} and Thai Cooking School USA\textsuperscript{156}, both of which receive government approval but neither of which are funded directly. Offering government approval or accreditation for schools are two ways that the government supports and strengthens its culinary industry. While some of these institutions are privately owned and operated, government acknowledgement and promotion of them on websites adds legitimacy and increases trust for potential tourists.

4.5 Locating the Tourist

Culinary tourism is an emerging field of study. As such, determining the exact number of culinary tourists or their exact participation interests is next to impossible. However, there is no doubt that culinary tourism is growing and gaining interest.

\textsuperscript{151} Classic Home Cooking, n.d.
\textsuperscript{152} Chiang Mai Thai Cookery School, 2010
\textsuperscript{153} Wandee Culinary School, n.d.
\textsuperscript{154} Dechapanya, n.d.
\textsuperscript{155} Thai Food to the World, n.d.c: has 12 global locations
\textsuperscript{156} Thai Cooking School USA, n.d.: Required and was granted government approval but it did not receive government funds, according to the website
According to a 2007 survey paid for by the Travel Industry Association of America, *Gourmet* magazine, and others\(^{157}\), 27 million Americans included culinary activities in their travel after 2004; and of the 160 million Americans who travel, 1 in 6 participated in a food tour, a cooking class, winery tour, or other culinary activities (Gross, 2007). Most revealing is the information that nearly half of that group chose the destination because of the wine and food activities. These travelers represent the emerging group of “serious” culinary travel whose main motivation is to seek out unique and memorable food experiences (Keefe & Chandler, 2007). While the motivations behind participating in culinary tourism may be clear, it is not certain what motivates someone to find value in and seek out these experiences. Guidebooks can be helpful for culinary tourists but provide meager or pedestrian starting points for the more serious culinary tourist. While blogs and websites provide some insights, culinary tourism owes a debt to both television and global migration.

**Popular Media**

In recent years, the Travel Channel and the Food Network have produced popular culinary themed shows that either directly incorporate travel or at least include exotic recipes. It cannot be determined how big of an influence these shows have had on actual travel decisions, but their popularity implies a widespread dissemination and a growing familiarity with traveling for food. For example, Andrew Zimmern of *Bizarre Foods* dedicated an episode to Phuket and Anthony Bourdain of *No Reservations* recently aired an episode on Thailand. Television is a major mass media outline that is able to influence tourism destination preference through visual stimuli and narrative association (Beeton,

\(^{157}\) “… TIA study, which was performed by Edge Research and surveyed 2,364 leisure travelers between July 21 and Aug. 9” according to Gross, 2007
Television provides culinary tourism with a wealth of possibilities because, unlike in films, the viewer is able to travel to the same location and sample the same food as the television host. That appeal, especially when the information comes from a trusted source, may motivate some to travel to certain locations or try particular foods.

**Blogs and TripAdvisor**

Blogs and travel advice websites also provide insight into popular culinary destinations. However, one aspect of culinary tourism is seeking out personal favorites and little known culinary gems, again harkening back to the spirit of exploration in tourism. The majority of food blogs include recipes or tips on where to eat. Paknam Web, an English language site devoted to Thailand, has a forum devoted to Thai food\(^{158}\). However the topic areas are broad and range from recipes, etiquette, restaurant suggestions, and discussions of favorite dishes. TripAdvisor.com has several articles and suggestions about Thai Cooking Schools and restaurants. For example an article about cooking schools in Chiang Mai received positive responses from travelers. The Chiang Mai forums include some threads directly about food, like “Best Food Stalls at Kalare Food Cout [sic]\(^{159}\)” or “Invitation to Xmas Dinner Eve in Chiang Mai\(^{160}\)” In each post, expatriates and travelers offer food suggestions about little known restaurants and stalls.

There is a sense of exploration and discovery about culinary tourism that is similar to general tourism motivations. Culinary products are bountiful and the type of market exploration is very specific, thus heightening the chance of a tourist’s actually making a unique or new discovery. It also should be noted that, as with other types of

\(^{158}\) Paknam Web Forums, 2010
\(^{159}\) Desslock, 2010
\(^{160}\) Retired_in_Thailand, 2009
tourism, language and preexisting knowledge may factor heavily into the culinary experience. Knowing what to ask for and being acquainted with the region are vital for a foreign visitor and a serious culinary tourist.

4.6 Summary of Explanatory Factors

As with most industries that assist in national identity formation, a struggle for the power to control the message and image occurs. The Thai government encourages culinary tourism through advertising, promotional backing, and the providing of certifications. In addition, the materials, seminars, and the businesses they support imply that the Thai government believes that it is in the best interest of their economy and culture to advertise the superiority of their culinary product. Ultimately, government institutions are not experts in the preparation of food or culinary professionals, so they must yield some degree of control to the smaller, private providers who own and operate the industries being promoted. In doing so, government entities create an appearance of trust and support between government and citizen, an image which usually is a palatable one for an outside consumer. It appears that by relinquishing some control, governments actually gain.

While they can control the message they promote, government institutions cannot necessarily control the acceptance or adoption of the message by tourists and outsiders. The tourist must decide for themselves whether the location of the meal or the nationality of the chef makes a difference in the quality of the food. It appears as though in the case of Thai culinary tourism, tourists and consumers are willing to accept that Thai chefs and Thai ingredients do make a significant difference for a culinary experience.
4.7 Dependent Outcomes

The convergence of stronger institutional intervention and stronger mediated environments results in tensions surrounding questions of authenticity, homogenization, and commodification. The culinary experience becomes either a literally consumable product or one that can be experienced through participation. A tourist’s expectation combined with the government’s message sometimes results in similar conclusions and concerns, as with authenticity, or in fears that challenge certain industry aspects, as with homogenization and commodification.

Authenticity

Authenticity is brought to the forefront in the culinary tourism debate. It is used as an excuse to engage in cultural tourism and offered as being of supreme concern to both culinary tourists and government institutions. Governments and tourists share a preoccupation with authenticity when it comes to culinary tourism. In both the experience of the product and cultural ownership of it, authenticity becomes an important issue.

When it comes to food, cultural authenticity deals in culinary exclusivity. The location of the culinary experience often determines perceptions about the authenticity of the experience. In general, food experiences in the home country of a specific cuisine are considered to be more authentic because of the proximity to certain ingredients and a belief in local knowledge. If visiting the country is not an option, food cooked by an individual who studied or is from the country is preferable because of the assumed specialized knowledge.

Experiencing food can give the culinary tourist an impression of cultural authenticity because of the participatory nature of food. Food incorporates the taste and
the local preferences of a place into a commodity that can be directly experienced by the consumer. A tourist has the opportunity to experience a host’s daily life in a more direct way, and, because of this, greater empathy is possible. A host may have particular cultural reference points for a certain dish or a recipe, but tasting and experiencing a dish in the same way a host does gives the tourist a more direct access point into the culture.

**Commodification**

Food, by nature, is a commodity. By defining or highlighting it in the tourism industry, commodification increases. However, further commodification of a product prone to it is hardly surprising. Food is accepted as a commodity and is more outside the patrimonial structure than other cultural elements that become commodities. Perhaps because the culinary industry benefits domestic consumers and producers as much as international visitors, it becomes less controversial as a cultural commodity. In addition, food can be prepared in many styles and with different ingredients and a plethora of food options is available in most countries. Culinary tourism does not represent the commodification of a scare heritage product, in most cases.

**Homogenization**

By creating a strong, national industry that prides itself on authenticity, homogenization of culture becomes less of a threat. While certain restaurant or franchise practices may challenge that assertion, culture is diversified by encouraging small, unique producers to enter the tourism market through food. A global franchise, like what has been suggested and partially implemented in Thailand, creates a problematic situation. Comments like “We want to be the McDonalds of Thai food” (Frank, 2001) in reference
to a government owned chain further add to fears that too much regulation can result in unwanted sameness. Despite the possibility that the speaker could be referencing McDonalds in terms of a highly successful globalized chain, the comment also raises fears about convenient recipes, frozen ingredients, and lowered standards.

The appeal of culinary tourism is the uniqueness and the superiority of the product. For countries that have a colonial past, this expression of their culture can be complicated. However for Thailand, which was never colonized, most of the food is either indigenous to the country or any outside influences have been given a unique Thai twist. Given Thailand’s past, there is no reason to fear homogenization through culinary tourism.

4.8 British Columbia, Canada: Indigenous Tourism

British Columbia stretches over 364,764 square miles, is home to 4.1 million people, and includes six regions: Northern British Columbia, Cariboo Chilcotin Coast, Vancouver Island (Victoria & the Gulf Islands), Vancouver, Coast & Mountains, Thompson Okanagan, and Kootenay Rockies. British Columbia attracts sport and adventure destination seekers as well as cosmopolitan travelers. The Government of British Columbia estimated $9,786,000 in tourism revenue from 22,886 visitors for 2005 (Dobinson, 2008). While British Columbia relies on the United States for the majority of its international tourism arrivals, it has grown as both a domestic and international destination (Dobinson, 2008), especially due to increased visibility from 2010 Winter Olympic Games.

---

Tourism British Columbia, n.d.
Hosting the 2010 Winter Olympic Games gave Canada, British Columbia, and Vancouver an increased profile and platform, resulting in changes to indigenous tourism management. These games were the first instance of indigenous peoples co-hosting the Olympic Games with the host nation. The 2010 Vancouver Winter Olympic games increased the global profile of the region and was the first instance of indigenous co-hosting of the games. As co-hosts, the Four First Nations received some of the financial profit. The involvement of the Four First Nations extended beyond the anticipated Opening Ceremonies display and the increase in profile contributed to the establishment of a different type of indigenous tourism industry marked by aboriginal owned wineries and resorts (Scalza, 2009). As a result of the Olympics, indigenous tourism providers have the opportunity to increase their revenues by taking advantage of the global interest in Vancouver and British Columbia. The Lil’wat, Musqueam, Squamish and Tsleil-Waututh, known as the Four First Nations, participated as Olympic co-hosts. However, their inclusion did spark controversy among First Nation tribal members and other tribes in the area who believe that collaboration with the government will silence longstanding grievances, particularly over land rights (Kaste, 2010). There are 272 First Nation Bands in British Columbia, each one possessing a wealth of traditions and history. In addition, British Columbia is home to 792 Inuit people. The uniqueness of British Columbia’s indigenous cultures demonstrates enormous potential for the further development of indigenous tourism in the region.

An increase in aboriginal awareness and advocacy groups, as well as natural population growth, is redefining how British Columbia Canadians self-identify race.

---

162 The Vancouver Organizing Committee for the 2010 Olympic and Paralympic Winter Games, n.d.
163 BritishColumbia.com, n.d.
164 BCStats, 2006a
According to the 2006 Census, 196,075 residents identified as North American Indian, Métis, or Other, which is “…an increase well above what would be expected from natural increase” from 2001’s figure of 170,020 and 1996’s total of 139,665\(^{165}\). This increase implies a change in atmosphere that allows more people to feel comfortable self-identifying as aboriginal minorities. There was a particular increase in individuals who identified as Métis, or mixed aboriginal and European background. This increase in aboriginal identification is coupled with an increasing interest in British Columbia as an indigenous tourism destination.

4.9 Indigenous Tourism in Canada

Establishing baseline definitions and current industry trends will inform the discussion of the industry in British Columbia. This thesis will use Smith’s (2003), broad definition of indigenous tourism as “…an overarching term for both ethnic and tribal tourism, and any form of tourism that involves contact with indigenous peoples of their culture” (pp. 117) and will use Smith’s chapter “Indigenous Cultural Tourism” as a foundational text. The sustainability of indigenous tourism and its potential economic impact are central issues for the industry. The general opinion is that including indigenous minorities in heritage management practices is the optimal approach to sustainability questions (Wall, 1999). Wall (1999, pp. 270) emphasizes five vital interactions of indigenous peoples and government institutions that will determine the success of heritage management projects:

1. The precise meaning of partnerships and shared and cooperative management;
2. The role indigenous people play in management;

\(^{165}\) BCStats, 2006b
3. The ownership of land;
4. Implementation mechanisms;
5. Relevant legal, constitutional and socio-economic contexts

It is interesting to note the high dependency on state legislative intervention in implementing heritage management projects. Along these lines, minorities must become more involved in the representation of their cultures in the arts and museum worlds, since their absence from decisions about display and meaning have placed them generally outside of these institutions in the past (Smith, 2003a). While government intervention is required in establishing the role of indigenous minorities in cultural heritage management, the interpretation and construction of the cultural messages must be left up to the indigenous groups.

**Weaker Government Institutional Intervention, Weaker Mediated Environments**

Indigenous cultural tourism in British Columbia, Canada displays the confluence of weaker government institutional interventions and a weaker mediated environment. While government entities in and tourists to this region display an understanding of the importance of indigenous heritage tourism, the topic is not widely discussed on tourism websites or on resources directed at tourists. The exception is the website of the Aboriginal Tourism Board of British Columbia, which is an independent not-for-profit organization. However, one website does not make for the presence of a stronger mediated environment.

Indigenous tourism adds to the tourism discussion because of the contemporary focus on indigenous cultures as adding a rich layer to a country’s identity. Contacting the indigenous and experiencing their history and culture from their perspective is motivated

---

166 As seen in the regional tourism survey and the government departments
by the same desires as traveling to a museum, monument, or urban cultural environment. While indigenous cultures are mainly thought to deal in craft as opposed to high art, folk art forms are coming to be regarded highly. In addition, while indigenous tourism used to draw exclusively adventure tourists, there is an increasing trend to visit an indigenous community or area for the same reasons that one would visit a nation’s capital city (Smith, 2003a).

4.10 Government Institutional Intervention and Other Stakeholders

The Canadian Parliament, Canadian government, and the British Columbian government are the obvious government stakeholders. In addition, the British Columbia Ministry of Tourism, Culture, and the Arts and the Tourism British Columbia Corporation promote regional tourism. Besides financial and commerce government agencies and departments, the Canadian government has dedicated several offices to aboriginal and heritage issue areas. According to their website, the Canadian Heritage Department “…is responsible for national policies and programs that promote Canadian content, foster cultural participation, active citizenship and participation in Canada’s civic life, and strengthen connections among Canadians” and includes a Aboriginal Programs, Policy, and Research division167. The Indian and Northern Affairs Office works towards “…a future in which First Nations, Inuit, Métis and northern communities are healthy, safe, self-sufficient and prosperous… make their own decisions, manage their own affairs and make strong contributions….168" The First Nation’s Statistical Institute is part of this office, as are sub-departments dealing with education, gender, and federal programs.

167 Canadian Heritage, 2010; Canadian Heritage, 2009
168 Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, 2010
While many government departments are involved in indigenous rights, they are not directly involved with tourism and most of these departments deal with empowerment instead of message construction, thus still classifying for weak institutional intervention.

The Canadian government has recognized, “… that aboriginal people have an inherent, constitutionally-protected right to self government" and as per a 1995 revised policy to recognize aboriginal self-determination rights as part of Section 35 of the Constitution Act, 1982 requires separate treaties between the government and the tribal group be established (Hurley, 2009). While some have debated the actual effect of these proclamations and treaties claiming that they are not indicative of a trend towards aboriginal representation but rather create further legal impediments (Dalton, 2006), the first instance of this policy was the 1998 Nisga’a Final Agreement in British Columbia which extended land and self-government rights. While certain Canadian government agencies and departments do have an interest in promoting indigenous tourism, intervention in too direct a manner in constructing the cultural experience would be at odds with the self-determination spirit.

While these government institutions provide policy support and advocacy outlets, many non-government organizations head the organization of marketing and cultural construction. The regional tribes and bands, themselves, are important stakeholders and they are supported by a variety of indigenous tourism organizations. The most important resource is the Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia (AtBC). In addition, the First People’s Cultural Foundation and BC Treaty Commission both are independent bodies that advocate for aspects of aboriginal cultural heritage and rights.

---

169 BC Treaty Commission, 2009
170 First Peoples’ Cultural Foundation, 2010
According to their corporate website, the Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia (AtBC) is a non-profit organization that encourages the growth of a responsible and sustainable indigenous tourism industry\(^\text{172}\). Upon traveling to the AtBC Travel site\(^\text{173}\), one is met with the organization’s slogan: “Our story. Your experience.” From a marketing standpoint, it is meant to attract visitors to take part in indigenous culture. However from a more academic perspective, this slogan is problematic. The phrase makes the indigenous tourism providers static and passive in the experience. The word “story” places the indigenous as part of a pre-written narrative that is there only to provide context for the active experience of visitors. The website includes three permanent banners by which to funnel visitor traffic: “Art & Culture Connoisseur;” “Authentic Experience Seeker;” and “Nature & Beauty with a Twist.” These categories speak to the change in indigenous tourism demographic. Smith (2003 pp.118) cites the transition from “allocentric” or adventure seekers to other forms that emphasis heritage, arts and crafts, and village tourism. Selecting one of these categories leads a visitor to a variety of other resources that fit those various profiles. In addition, the website includes a trip planner and links to brochures and maps.

These types of materials create the impression that independent, non-profit groups are the most reliable for indigenous tourism information, as well as the most authoritative source. Websites like that of AtBC construct indigenous cultural tourism in such a way that the cultural tourism strategy of a larger nation is replicated on a smaller scale. The AtBC website makes no mention of Canada and some brief references to traveling in British Columbia. For the most part, the website establishes indigenous tourism as an

\(^{171}\) BC Treaty Commission, 2010
\(^{172}\) Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia, 2010a
\(^{173}\) Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia, 2010b
entity outside of the national rhetoric. Tourists must come to these resources for information and the National Government redirects inquiry into indigenous tourism to these outlets.

4.11 Locating the Tourist

As in other cases, websites and blogs will be relied upon to find popular tourist resources and expose opinions about indigenous tourism. However, newspaper articles and the extensive statistics kept by the government of British Columbia also will add to this understanding. The discussion begins by examining popular media available to tourists that may breed interpretations of Canadian and indigenous culture. Individuals encounter these media cues daily and these access points have a significant influence on cultural interpretation.

Popular Media

In this instance, the focus is not on Canadian media in general, but rather on that which is specifically relevant to indigenous minorities in Canada and may reach or otherwise influence potential tourists. Much of the television media is directed at Canadian citizens and not as readily accessible to international views. For example, the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) has television and radio programs dedicated to Aboriginal news and music, respectively. The Inuit Broadcasting Corporation (IBC) of Nunavut creates television programming “…by Inuit, for Inuit” and is the first native language network in North America. While it is broadcast by satellite, its limited target audience and potential language barrier, all programming is in Inuktitut, make it unlikely

---

174 CBC Aboriginal, 2010
175 Inuit Broadcasting Corporation, 2007
that non-Inuit would be influenced by the shows. However, the existence of these resources and the implied vibrancy of indigenous life and activities may interest certain types of visitors. The National Film Board of Canada supports the IBC and supports an extensive database of shorts, documentaries, and fiction films about a variety of topics, including aboriginal life and rights\textsuperscript{176}. In addition to online access, tourists can travel to the National Film Board of Canada in Montreal, Quebec to view these films and access the institution’s entire catalog. Other television travel shows have traveled to Vancouver and British Columbia, Anthony Bourdain’s No Reservations\textsuperscript{177} for example, but they tend to either not include or not focus on indigenous cultural aspects.

Two areas in which indigenous peoples have been more successful promoting themselves have been film and the recent Olympic Games. Atanarjuat: The Fast Runner is a globally recognized, award winning film with an entirely Inuit cast and production crew\textsuperscript{178}. This Cannes film festival award winner may not be widely known but is available on Netflix for distribution and has received an average rating of 3.4 from 63,620 ratings\textsuperscript{179}. However, many indigenous and aboriginal directors feel misunderstood within the global industry. While Western discourse tends to focus on the individual filmmaker, indigenous producers prefer to be associated with an ongoing part of a social activist movement that moves beyond the individual examples auteurship (Ginsburg, 2002).

\textsuperscript{176} National Film Board of Canada, 2009  
\textsuperscript{177} Vancouver, British Columbia [Television Series Episode], 2008  
\textsuperscript{178} Igloolik Isuma Productions, 2007  
\textsuperscript{179} Netflix, 2010
Statistics, Blogs, and TripAdvisor

Both the Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia and Tourism British Columbia have conducted extensive industry surveys concerning the cultural tourism industry. According to a 2004 survey of Cultural Tourism in British Columbia’s Okanagan Valley, 40% of respondents cited internet resources as the most important part of trip planning\(^\text{180}\). In addition, visiting heritage displays or First Nation sites was often referred to as important by respondents but infrequently visited, with 37% of respondents being classified as cultural tourists. According to AtBC, the typical aboriginal cultural tourist is a well-educated, upper-middle class, female baby-boomer\(^\text{181}\). In addition, over half of the 200 aboriginal tourist businesses offer cultural tourism packages for visitors and 36% of surveyed travelers had visited aboriginal sites and 63% plan to return for aboriginal tourism within three years. The importance of internet sites and the definite statistics regarding cultural tourism are helpful in locating the tourist. If 40% of respondents relied on the internet in 2004, it can be assumed that this number has increased with the continuing proliferation of and dependency on internet materials.

TripAdvisor.com, more so than blogs, is an internet resource that provides an indication of tourist opinions and popular travel sites to visit. Searching “British Columbia Aboriginal” on TripAdvisor.com leads to tips about visiting the Canadian Museum of Civilization\(^\text{182}\), National Gallery of Canada, the Vancouver Museum\(^\text{183}\), Vancouver Island\(^\text{184}\), Whale Centre Maritime Museum\(^\text{185}\), and Pacific Rim National Park.

\(^{180}\) Tourism British Columbia, Research Services, 2004  
\(^{181}\) Aboriginal Tourism Association of BC, 2010c  
\(^{182}\) CanuckGirl, 2007  
\(^{183}\) Rdclarke, 2007  
\(^{184}\) Judy_in_Calgary, 2006a  
\(^{185}\) Country_wife, 2006
The number of museums referenced in these user generated articles is surprising given the focus on the outdoors in that area. However, searching with the word “aboriginal” in the keyword search may indicate that most travelers relegate indigenous tourism to museums. A search on the forum returns 62 threads and out of the first ten, the Museum of Anthropology at the University of British Columbia and the Royal BC Museum in Victoria were recommended in response to six of the first ten threads. Two of the threads specifically mentioned desires to see First Nation villages or authentic displays. Those inquiries were met with suggestions about contacting aboriginal tour companies, recommendations for the Canadian Museum of Civilization, and one suggestion to visit Tyendinaga Mohawk Territory. A particularly interesting response to a thread asking for suggestions for a honeymoon itinerary suggested traveling to Tofino and “…maybe even kayak to an island with trees that are thousands of years old in the company of an Aboriginal guide who tells you the history of her people’s interaction with the local ecosystem.” The reliance on aboriginal tour companies or guides to experience aboriginal cultures outside of museums is indicated in these responses and signals the belief that, outside of museums, the aboriginal cultural experience cannot be a self-guided one. Blogs about indigenous tourism are not plentiful but those that could be located were ones highly touted on the Tourism British Columbia site or those specifically related to the Olympics (Henry, 2010).

---

186 RemyScalza, 2009  
187 Judy_in_Calgary, 2006b  
188 Tourism British Columbia, 2010
4.12 Summary of the Explanatory Factors

The indigenous people control their message and their industry, to an extent. Their government granted autonomy results in some limited government institutional support but not in terms of constructing culture. Even though the government is not directly intervening, it creates a perception of openness, freedom, and acceptance by allow indigenous peoples to control their tourism industry. Thus, a message about the national psyche and patrimonial values is still being sent to the tourist. The burden of message acceptance still rests with the tourists.

4.12 Dependent Outcomes

The convergence of weaker government institutional intervention and weaker mediated environments in constructing the cultural heritage product results in tensions surrounding questions of authenticity, homogenization, and commodification. Indigenous cultural tourism has become an observable product and not a specifically interactive one.

Authenticity

The cultural authenticity of indigenous tourism products is closely linked to their accuracy and authority as well. The location of the tourism experience especially is important because the indigenous experience of a specific people in one location could not be replicated elsewhere. The experience is linked to the land on which the historic habitation and cultural exchange took place. Canadian indigenous groups have a significant interest in protecting the authenticity of the tourism product and guaranteeing authenticity of experience for the tourist. Because of decreased state intervention, the indigenous tourism product is seen as being more candid and, thus, authentic. However,
even without government intervention, the independent tourism providers have created standardized processes to qualify authenticity.

By controlling the designation of authenticity, tourism providers both create a standard of the authenticity and protect against outsider cultural infringement, while also increasing commoditization and homogenization. The Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia (AtBC) has created the “Aboriginal Cultural Authenticity Program” which thrives on an application process by which businesses can be certified as “culturally authentic.” The measure helps tourists identify the most culturally appropriate and accurate representations of aboriginal culture in British Columbia’s market; however, the program also requires majority aboriginal ownership, market-readiness, and standards for safety and hospitality in order to meet the criteria. By controlling the definition of authenticity, the organization constructs a cultural narrative and standard. While these standards are created by AtBC, it is important to note that they are supported by state entities, like the Parliament, Federal Interlocutor, and the Indian and Northern Affairs Canada department, which recently appropriated five million dollars to AtBC. The first tourism operators to qualify for this designation are Haida Heritage Centre at Kaay Llnagaay, Skidegate; Nk’Mip Desert Cultural Centre, Osoyoos; St. Eugene Golf Resort Casino, Cranbrook; ‘Ksan Historical Village and Museum, Hazelton; and Squamish Lil’wat Cultural Centre, Whistler. While it is theoretically problematic to certify the authenticity of anything, at least the designations are being

---

189 Aboriginal Tourism Association of BC, 2010d
190 Indian Country Today, 2010
191 Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, 2009
192 Indian Country Today, 2010
offered by an aboriginal, non-profit agency hoping to manage its region’s heritage in the most responsible way possible.

Indigenous tourism also contributes to the authenticity of place by displaying the roots and heritage of the modern state. Even though indigenous and aboriginal groups often were neglected or abused by patrimonial powers, their existence can be used to provide a legacy to the state. Most take for granted the progression of the primitive to the modern and indigenous groups represent a step between an unpopulated location and a modern state. If links can be established and woven into the patrimonial fabric, indigenous peoples can provide legitimacy for some state powers. In the case of Canada, the pride displayed during the 2010 Vancouver Olympics in reference to indigenous groups not only indicated the basis for modern Vancouver but also created an image of a free state in which minorities have a voice. Regardless of whether that is true, these forms of constructions and partnerships between the aboriginal and the state add to interpretations of cultural authenticity.

**Commodification**

The commodification of tourist products results from the desire to create replicable cultural products for consumption. In turn, an industry thrives on being able to reproduce experiences and wares for a multitude of different tourists. For tourists, a highlight of indigenous tourism is witnessing or interacting with the lifestyle and traditions. There is a primitivism that appeals to some tourists as they cannot experience it in their daily lives. While commodification of indigenous culture may make some uneasy, having this industry enter the market requires the formation of commodities, like
performances, messages, and products. Indigenous tourism contributes to narrative formation and through that construction it becomes an entity for sale.

**Homogenization**

The absence of government institutional intervention in creating a strong, patrimonial message that qualifies and explains indigenous culture results in indigenous peoples and interest groups controlling the construction of their cultural product. However, the cultural content being controlled by a minority group does not edge it away from the dangers of homogenization. Networked indigenous groups often share best practices and approaches. Therefore maintaining innovative and individualistic forms of representation is important. Something like the Sustainable Arctic Tourism Association is an effective way for Arctic tourism stakeholders, particularly indigenous peoples, to work on sustainable practices. However, these types of groups can result in a standardized procedure and presentation of culture. In addition, the previously mentioned authenticity program is an example of using a standardized process to assign a designation to tourism providers. In both cases these standards are created to protect culture and environment but they also could result in an emulation of other global tourism practices, which may or may not be a positive feature.

Another aspect of homogenization is the quality of homogenizing the human experience to the extent that daily life is relatively similar in most places. The degree of human interaction between indigenous hosts and tourists in indigenous tourism models ensures that the tourism product remains unique. However, as indigenous groups are increasingly exposed to outside influences their culture and daily experiences change. For

---

193 European Union Regional Development Fund, 2008
indigenous peoples in Canada who have extensive contact with non-indigenous peoples and whose existence is largely modern, maintaining and controlling indigenous practices is the best way to maintain cultural authenticity. Some may argue that indigenous groups should try not to change and remain in a pre-modern state with a focus on preservation; however, if they wish to evolve their culture through modernization they should be the ones making that choice. Without proper heritage management techniques that involve the community in vital decision making, the sustainability of the indigenous product can be called into question.

4.14 Conclusion

The intra-national forces at work in culinary and indigenous tourism both assert local pressures on the industries. These industries both must deal with a wide variety of stakeholders. Culinary tourism in Thailand requires representation for corporations, small business owners, and overseas businesses. Food becomes a marker of place that is heavily associated with authenticity. Stronger government institutional interventions and strong mediated environments are both present. In contrast, indigenous tourism in British Columbia reflects weaker government interventions and weaker mediated environments are present. In this case, historical biases and non-indigenous peoples’ hesitations to brand an indigenous product result in an overall decreased dialogue. In both cases, subgroups are allowed some independence and autonomy from centralized government. However, differences result because of perceptions about the products involved. Gastronomic products also mark a wide array of food products that contribute to an identity; however, indigenous cultures are most obviously and specifically linked to
certain groups and ways of life. Ultimately, food is much easier to accept as a commodity, while commoditizing indigenous culture makes many uneasy.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 6. Summary Chart</th>
<th>Stronger Gov. Institutional Intervention</th>
<th>Weaker Gov. Institutional Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stronger Mediated Environments</strong></td>
<td><strong>Culinary Tourism</strong></td>
<td><strong>Religious Pilgrimage</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Authenticity</strong>: Both of the factors makes claims about the authenticity of the food; the reality, however, is that the authenticity decreases - more popularity breeds different modes of creation to keep up with demand, also the further one gets from the source of the food and ingredients the less authentic it gets; popularization of tourist foods as the authentic and not necessarily what people always eat.</td>
<td><strong>Homogenization</strong>: decrease even though the food itself is unique; the names for things become merged; exported items are standardized; dishes are made in a tourist style.</td>
<td><strong>Authenticity</strong>: The authenticity that pilgrims are concerned with is different than “cultural authenticity”; the meaning of the journey is changing and becoming culturally oriented; overall increase because of the focus on self and the helped to smaller “mom and pop” businesses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homogenization: Increase even though the food itself is unique; the names for things become merged; exported items are standardized; dishes are made in a tourist style.</td>
<td><strong>Commodification</strong>: Increase but a more anticipated or expected increase; food experiences as a commodity is not unexpected; the things that are commoditized are often the more acceptable tourists products and not representative.</td>
<td><strong>Homogenization</strong>: decrease; unique-participatory event.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this case, the state takes a direct intervention role and the external motivating factors advocate and popularize this tourism subset. Government funds and mounts campaigns directed at gastronomy, constructing culture in such a way so as to support it. The external factors talk about tastes and locations and personal experiences.</td>
<td><strong>Commodification</strong>: Increase hypothetically it should not be a commodity; however, it’s becoming one; it’s increasing but not overwhelming.</td>
<td><strong>Commodification</strong>: hypothetically it should not be a commodity; however, it’s becoming one; it’s increasing but not overwhelming.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Weaker Mediated Environments** | **Capital of Cultures** | **Indigenous Tourism** |
| **Authenticity**: Authenticity from whose perspective: political motivations obscure or change the culture; however, it is representative and accurately documented from a factual standpoint; decrease or increase is less clear cut (decrease?) | **Homogenization**: danger of creating similar atmosphere as other ECoC’s; however, there’s an overall decrease because new products are made and the culture is usually strong enough to maintain its uniqueness; celebrates different aspects of culture. | **Authenticity**: not in a position to pass judgment on how authentic the culture is; however, the involvement of the indigenous groups and their control makes this an overall increase; note: what is displayed usually panders to the tourist. |
| **Commodification**: Increase | **Commodification**: Increase; should be outside that structure. | **Homogenization**: increase-standards for authenticity stamp; museumification; culture is still a strong product. |
| The government has a large interest in constructing and promoting the event; receiving the distinction is a prestigious honor; External factors do not publicize it, however- guidebooks don’t include the events because it’s temporary and time sensitive; movies and television are not themed around it; could be included on user generated websites but it’s largely not. | It is in the state’s interest to be less involved; it still offers support through structures and some donations to non-profits; government does not construct the culture, usually redirects to a non-governmental website; External interventions, with the exception of AtBC, they focus on suggestions for museums; any tribal bands with websites are fairly sparse. Guidebooks usually reference the First Nations in passing and provide limited resources. |
Chapter 5: Conclusion

“Wherever he steps, whatever he touches, whatever he leaves, even unconsciously, will serve as a silent witness against him…. This is evidence that does not forget…. Only human failure to find it, study and understand it can diminish its value.”

Paul L. Kirk (1953 pp. 4) on Locard’s Principle of Exchange

Cultural tourism is simultaneously an ode to the past and a representation of the present. Concluding this thesis with a quotation concerning a foundational principle of forensics is not meant to imply that globalization practices or tourism are crimes; rather, it serves as a reminder of the impact that outsiders have on their host environments and the constant exchange that takes place between visitor and host. According to Locard whose Principle of Exchange revolutionized modern forensics and police investigation, a perpetrator cannot avoid leaving some form of evidence behind no matter what precautions are taken (Söderman, 1929). While Locard and Söderman may be referring to dust particles and fibers, examining cultures through the tourism lens yields a similar observation. Evidence of the interaction between visitor and host can be seen in product promotion and construction. This observation especially is true when dealing with expansive internet technologies, which allow for easier peer-to-peer communication. While national and local industry providers have an idea of the messages and performances they would like to present, they, to a certain extent, must be responsive to tourist desires and interests.

Each of the preceding case studies examines instances in which heritage and tradition combine and intersect with modern life194. In these narratives, the influence of both government institutional intervention and mediated environments on the tourism product and, ultimately, on cultural construction can be observed. The resulting cultural

194 See comprehensive chart on page 148
product serves a dual purpose, both to represent a location and to serve as an enticing advertisement for travel. The combination of the explanatory factors results in various outcomes in the forms of authenticity, commodification, and homogenization of the ensuing cultural product.

Travel, at its root, is a form of escapism. It removes travelers from their everyday lives and displays alternate realities (Smith, 2003a). However, ironically, the escape is highly constructed and controlled, so much so that questions about the accuracy and authenticity of the experience arise. In order to analyze an industry that touches the jobs, livelihoods, and leisure time of so many, one must examine the influences that impact and shape it. Travel also influences the traveler’s sense of self and helps to pinpoint her location in a wider global context. Without an awareness of what influences perceptions and establishes identities, the individual gives up a critical part of her autonomy.

Once aware of methods and concepts of construction, it becomes difficult to ignore. Much like a film student discovering shot properties, individuals perceive construction everywhere once they have the tools with which to identify it. The awareness gained changes the individual’s interaction with the field or product. However, the knowledge need not ruin the experience by deconstructing the instance into minutia. In fact, knowledge can engender a deeper understanding and appreciation for a well constructed product. Not merely an academic exercise, cultural tourism and heritage conception are widespread and real world areas that infiltrate digital worlds and media that surround the everyday.

Recognizing, questioning, and analyzing construction practices not only yields a more informed consumer but also a tourist who is prepared to encounter global processes
and cultures from a mature, thoughtful perspective. To this end, the theoretical contributions of this thesis first will be discussed, followed by an empirical discussion, and concluding with methodological contributions and suggestions for future research. As cultural tourism continues to gain economic and global force, more study outside of the field of tourism studies will be needed in order to fully understand its evolution and impact.

5.1 Theoretical Contributions

Previous scholarship has approached heritage as an ingredient in a patrimonial mixture, usually the business of the state and often in the context of preservation and management (McKercher & Du Cros, 2002; Munar, 2007; Conti & Perelli, 2007). Using the question of how representative a presented “culture” is of the location and people involved, the examination progressed to evaluating the methods by which culture is constructed and consumed by others with a particular focus on heritage. Heritage is a legitimizing force that provides a basis for assertions about culture. In recent years, however, heritage has become more than a nationalistic tool. This thesis makes contributions to wider conceptions about authenticity and heritage as well as to the specific field of cultural tourism studies.

Authenticity is a concept widely discussed in the field of cultural tourism as well as in many others. Previously, authenticity has been conceived of as a function of the tourist experience (Edelheim, 2005; McIntosh & Prentice, 1999). The tourism industry is built upon representations of authenticity; however, this thesis purports that attaining a standard bar by which to evaluate authenticity is impossible, perhaps because authenticity may not be the correct term. Authenticity means something very different to tourists.
when compared with industry providers, local hosts, and national patrimonial producers. Resting authenticity upon the viewpoint and experience of the tourist does not do justice to the concept or the actions being evaluated. In the instance of the European Capital of Culture event in Istanbul, the message and events are created to attract attention; but far more emphasis is placed on creating a cohesive message without a regard for what tourists would find to be an authentic message.

Nonetheless this thesis does employ an authenticity description when investigating cultural tourism. However, the discussion of authenticity is much more akin to the concept of accuracy. While something being authentic and something being well-documented with a historical basis are not always the same, the conception of authenticity as a degree of accuracy puts heritage at the forefront for the construction of patrimonial messages. Through case studies, this thesis has examined authenticity in terms of the incorporation of heritage in creating a patrimonial message. However, the input of tourists and other industry stakeholders in evaluating the accuracy of these messages has been taken into account using the other explanatory factor of mediated environments.

This thesis has separated heritage and cultural construction from exclusive government control, acknowledging the role that technology and popular media play in establishing aspects of culture. Cultural tourism provides a prospective from which to examine this shift in meaning. In the past, presenting a cohesive and defined cultural message along with established “must-see” sites was a standard and unquestioned practice (O’Connor, 2010). Patrimonial powers still define their industries in this manner; however, technology has disrupted this practice, requiring new methods in order to
compete for modern consumption. Compared to other mediums, the internet provides quicker more responsive forums for discourse. While technology has been discussed in many fields, framing the control of heritage and culture through a tourism lens adds to the understanding of the interstices of technology and culture. Studies on various aspects of host-visitor interaction, internet participation, and on the most popular aspects of cultural tourism have been conducted; however, building off of these aspects gives a more holistic impression of the industry.

This technological revolution in tourism has grown steadily over time. From the beginnings of exploration to the mass production of guidebooks to the popular use of the internet, the ease with which an individual can share an opinion and influence others has increased. However internet technologies and user-generated participation have catalyzed this process, resulting in individuals having a significant impact on the evaluation of cultural messages, heritage legacies, and the economics of locations or countries that they have visited. Building upon the concept of the prosumer (Valtysson, 2010; Stadler, 2001), this thesis links the term directly to tourism and the active role that travelers play in online dialogue. As the field continues to evolve, governments must embrace these technological forms and give credence to user-generated materials to ensure that institutional interventions remain relevant in the tourism discussion.

The use of the term mediated environments adds to the ontological discourse as well. Appadurai (1990) identified these “dimensions of global cultural flow” (pp. 285) as technoscapes and mediascapes, both of which contribute, along with three other factors, to perspectives about the origins of cultural and societal disjunction in his “imagined worlds.” Mediated environment implies a habitable world in which individuals come
together as a growing, evolving community of practice. While Appadurai acknowledges the role of individuals, he relegates them to, “…the last locus of this perspectival set of landscapes, for these landscapes are eventually navigated by agents who both experience and constitute larger formations, in part by their own sense of what these landscapes offer” (1990, pp. 254). The technological tools of today make the individual of primary importance to the realm of cultural construction and the basis for the emergent communities of dialogue. This thesis brings the individual to the foreground and globalizes her importance.

5.2 Empirical Contributions

The combination of these specific case studies and the resulting data add further evidence and examples to the continually evolving understanding of cultural construction. In the past, tourism has been investigated and evaluated in terms of host-visitor tensions (Edelheim, 2005; McIntosh & Johnson, 2005), tourist typologies (Wickens, 2002; Cohen, 1979), and globalization (Richter, 2007; Munar, 2007). Accessing tourism through both governmental institutional promotion and external tourism motivators, such as user-generated media, independent literature, and popular culture, combines two previously separate areas of research. Studies concerned with TripAdvisor.com, for example, have been undertaken previously (O’Connor, 2008). However instead of focusing on the accuracy of user-generated content, this thesis builds upon previous study by contrasting the tourists’ unsolicited opinions with the influence of government generated content and programs. This discussion reveals the priorities of each group, and the impacts each has on the future shape of cultural tourism through the opinions and resources generated by both groups which are available for the use of
potential tourists. In addition, examining more than one motivating force external to the tourist provides multiple access points by which to investigate the sub-industries while acknowledging that a combination of various forms of information have an impact on the tourist and the ensuing tourism product, either as a reaction to or affirmation of the established status.

The following table can be used to order the conceptual contributions of this study.

Table 7. Summary of Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Authenticity</th>
<th>Commodification</th>
<th>Homogenization</th>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>The creation of a European image exposes tensions between Turkish citizens who want to be considered European and those who do not</td>
<td>Increase in the creation of replicable products and messages for consumption</td>
<td>Takes cues from other ECoCs but the government desires to reform the culture into a strictly European format which it isn’t</td>
<td>The ECoC format may not reflect the identities of various stakeholders but is not enough of a threat to result in widespread dissent195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Subtle balance between history and heritage in which the state must not interfere with the construction of the actual event</td>
<td>What the state does to reframe the experience does increase commodification slightly but on the whole there is little increase</td>
<td>What it means to be a pilgrim is homogenizing but the actual sites involved are not</td>
<td>Maintaining the product as separate from the state is key to its preservation and uniqueness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Government has an interest in promoting national brand as the only brand</td>
<td>Food is a natural commodity and the business plans amplify it</td>
<td>Wanting to brand the food results in a standardization process</td>
<td>The branding contradicts authenticity but creates homogenization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>References the heritage of a specific subset and it’s not place within the language of the state</td>
<td>Increase in the definition of the commodity</td>
<td>The created standards of authenticity result increased homogenization</td>
<td>The independence of the indigenous producers is both a blessing and a curse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>The burden to produce196 authenticity rests with the state and the mediated environments exist to point out discrepancies or extol; increasing reliance on reviews and reproductions of experiences continues the divorce from the original too</td>
<td>Most of these products should be outside the construct of commodities but because it’s an industry and business, there is an obvious increase</td>
<td>The variety of user generated experiences speaks to the possibility for a lack of homogenization of experience; however the products conform to industry standards and tend to homogenize</td>
<td>The amplification or absence of the opinions of certain stakeholders, esp. within mediated environments, sends messages about the relative popularity of a product; cultural tourism is no longer dominated by patrimony</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

195 As evidenced by the overt government intervention but lesser popular participation
196 To produce authenticity refers to either constructing an authentic product themselves or allowing for others to do so unhindered
While the burden to produce authenticity rests with the state and commodification is difficult to avoid, homogenization is reflected in the accounts of tourists, although each person authentically experiences a culture with her own individual lens. The combination of these aspects and the media generated online assist the tourist in evaluating the tourism product. As the cultural becomes political, user-generated opinions serve as counterweights by judging and offering their own interpretations. Ultimately, authenticity and homogenization contradict each other. If a product is authentic, its increased homogenization should not be a possibility. However, as was pointed out in the chart, authenticity is constructed and when creating a product homogenization becomes a side-effect. Marketing and individual accounts imply unique products, when in fact many experiences and reviews are similar. The ways in which the products are managed and presented homogenize over time, as well. However, the cultural content itself is unique and highlights the important role that heritage and legacy play in maintaining the product.

The cases selected and the combination of the tourism sub-sectors encourages examining tourism and culture from a variety of angles. The case studies and the subsets were selected for their contemporary subject matter as well as for their diverse representation of locations. The Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture was an ongoing event at the time of study and, to date, no other studies examine the workings and programs of this specific ECoC’s marketing campaigns or construction of national patrimony. While the 2010 Winter Olympic Games have brought the First Nations of British Columbia a certain amount of attention, the investigation of their tourism industry from government and non-government institutional perspectives also is a unique and timely contribution. It has been established by this work and by others, that the Thai
government has a sustained and well documented interest in popularizing its nation’s culinary tourism (Horng & Tsai, 2010). However, the more nuanced distinction between the state’s interest and the tourist’s perspective had yet to be addressed using internet technology as an investigative basis. While past studies have investigated government websites exclusively, this thesis also integrated user feedback and non-governmental culinary tourism into the analysis. The Way of St. James has been increasing in popularity over the years; again, however, approaching it with an internet based inquiry provides a new window into the ways in which this traditional journey is evolving. While interested in promoting non-traditional aspects of the route, the Spanish government cannot intercede in the construction of the event. Each of these case studies reveals emerging avenues by which to hypothesize about the interstices of cultural construction and tourism.

5.3 Methodological Contributions

The structured, focused comparison methodology (George, 1979) relies on variations in two sets of explanatory factors to organize and reveal differences among dependent outcomes. The explanatory factors emphasize the interaction between degrees of government intervention and non-government sources of tourist information in framing cultural tourism experiences. This approach particularly focuses on the role of the individual in the globalization process. By not relying on an analysis of interaction across nation states, this thesis focuses on the importance of in-country presentation and interaction in creating a palatable tourism product and hosting a successful industry. In addition, it is not only in-country participants that define their cultural and patrimonial messages. Previous visitors and tourists create content that has the potential to influence
the tourism market of a country that is not their own. By not underestimating the power of the prosumer (Valtysson, 2010; Stalder, 2001), this thesis contributes to the approaches of the larger social sciences and cultural studies by using popular media forms to investigate politics, economy, and globalization in specific reference to cultural tourism.

5.4 Limitations and Future Studies

During the thesis writing process, several limitations impacted the study. It was not possible to travel to the locations discussed in the case studies, even though some of the smaller examples do come from personal experience. Being able to travel and observe these events and locations would have enriched the analysis. However, in other ways, conducting research that primarily uses internet-based resources is similar to the way in which a tourist would plan for an upcoming trip. This process does provide an indication of what tourists encounter during a search process, while delving deeper and illustrating the range of informational media available.

Linguistic limitations also impacted analysis and the subsequent selection of case studies. While Spanish and English were not problematic, Thai and Turkish languages required reliance on the English version of the website, if one existed; the use of a dictionary; outside translation by a native speaker; or the exclusion of unintelligible information. The smaller Finnish, African, Russian, French, Brazilian, and Chinese examples sometimes required the same. However in each case, except for Finnish, native speakers\textsuperscript{197} provided some direction for uncovering websites and relevant statistics.

\textsuperscript{197} Yixian Li (Chinese); Onur Uyyun (Turkish); Francisco Felliti (Portuguese); Vauldi Carlese (South Africa assistance); Ekaterina Gabalova (Russian); Anna Britz (France): All are nationals and fluent speakers of the corresponding countries and languages.
English language materials are widely available and all the major, governmental tourism sites include extensive English materials; however, language knowledge would have aided in more thoroughly investing the user generated content and other media. Again, however, it is likely that a tourist might encounter similar barriers, once again adding a realistic aspect to this research method.

In future study, being able to more specifically pinpoint tourist interactions with websites and media would be helpful to aid in better understanding the confluence of tourism, culture, mediated environments, and government. Surveys were not used in this thesis; however, they would be useful to determine at least a preliminary reading on the popularity of tourism materials from various sources. Also, it would be useful to study the ways in which potential tourists interact with user-generated review sites. Do they return after the trip to contribute themselves? Do they use the resources again?

No matter the avenue of research, however a continued focus on the individual and his or her interaction with globalization should be emphasized. The increasing opportunities for civil society interaction and participation create interesting implications for government and global policies. However, it also is vital to remember that this dichotomy does not exist everywhere. Further research on the tourism of developing countries, focusing on emerging forms of participation, or the lack of it, along with government intervention would be a potential contribution to the field.

5.5 Concluding Remarks

The influence of technology on the practices of government institutions and on the mediated environments results in new practices for evaluating and constructing heritage and culture. Construction and narrative formation creates commodities in which
authenticity and homogenization are at odds. While the cultural content of each of the discussed sub-industries of cultural tourism is unique, approaches to tourism become more similar over time as best practices are shared. Individual reviews of places and trips result in a perception of decreased homogenization because each individual should interact differently with the environment and have a unique reaction. However, even if a plethora of reviews are available, each one may inspire a tourist, who then has an experience, writes a similar review, and over time the scope of popular opinion will skew towards creating similar reviews of similar places. Innovation and creativity are required on the part of government institutions and industry providers to inspire tourists to review, blog, share, and explore a variety of experiences. Hopefully these actions will encourage future tourists and travelers to not only replicate the experiences of others but also to build upon them with new encounters, thus expanding the cultural tourism sphere.

Ultimately, tourism must become more integrated as a field of study if its potential for economic influence, cultural creation, and intercultural communication is to be understood. In addition to the impact on individual tourists, industry leaders, and academics who seek to understand the ramifications of tourism trends, examining cultural tourism has widespread implications for international policymakers. A more complete understanding of tourism would result in recognition of areas within the GATS that could be strengthened and liberalized. The economic power that tourism wields requires a more complete understanding of the forces that influence it. Tourism’s underlying connections to several other industries and fields of study make it a perfect access point from which to examine globalization, technology, and cultural progression.
Figure 1:

TravelBlog.org and TripAdvisor Suggestions

Number of References

Location

Blue Mosque
Hagia Sophia
Topkapi Palace
Ark of Ataturk Museum
Dervishes
Chora Church
Rooftop Bars
Grand Bazaar
Bath
Bridge
Hippodrome
Food
Rumi Kervansara
Mosque
Rumeli Hisar
Spice Bazaar
Cistern
Cleopatra's Pool
Islamic Arts
Mosaic Museum
Princes Island
Aya Irini
Concerts
Arasta Bazaar
Rezzan Has Museum
Istanbul Modern Museum
Pera Museum
Eyup Mosque
Panoramic Museum
Aquarium
Figure 2: Conoce El Camino

Conoce
Appendix A:

Africa Regional Case Study

In selecting the methodological matrix for this thesis, care was given to include countries from different regions. However, some continents have been excluded. One would be remiss not to discuss African regional tourism, especially in light of recent developments and upcoming events that have placed parts of Africa in the spotlight. African nations are emerging as cultural attractions with unique destinations for travelers looking for a new way to experience a region with a long history. Using the issues and areas discussed in this chapter,

Despite regional instability, poverty, and infrastructural issues, Africa was the only continent in 2009 to see positive growth in tourism. According to the UNWTO’s World Tourism Barometer of January 2010, international tourism arrivals in Africa were up by 5.1%. This figure is particularly dramatic when taken in comparison with Europe’s -5.6%, the Americas’ -5.1%, Asia and the Pacific’s -1.9%, and the Middle East’s -5.6%. Overall, the world saw a -4.3% decrease in international tourism arrivals. The global economic downturn and the swine flu are often cited as two contributing factors to this decrease; however, Africa’s success in spite of these trends is particularly interesting.

First of all, statistics can be deceiving. Perhaps one reason that African tourism arrivals were not as hard hit as other markets is because Africa’s stake in tourism is relatively small. Only 5% of global tourism arrivals were to Africa, or 50 million out of 900 million tourists\textsuperscript{198}. However, it cannot be denied that tourism has increased in certain areas, with Kenya and South Africa being particular standouts.

\textsuperscript{198} BBC News, 2010
It is difficult to say how much of the UNWTO statistics can be attributed specifically to cultural tourism. However, cultural tourism in Africa is a golden opportunity. With some nations being more successful than others, most African tourism still focuses on safaris and beach tourism (Akama, 2000). African nations are betting on the popularity of Western attractions to begin to wane as tourists looks for more exotic locations. Akama (2000) writes, “Nevertheless, the diverse indigenous African cultures can be perceived as having a latent comparative advantage in the development of cultural tourism because they possess unique cultural and nature based attractions. These are the very tourist attractions which people from major tourist generating countries are looking for” (14). Africa offers a cultural tourism side that is based on a living culture of dance, performance, and the contemporary lives of people, which is in contrast to European and Western monument and museum tourism (Tomaselli, 1999). However, before African nations can effectively promote these attractions, government and social tensions and violence have to be resolved.

While some nations on the African continent like Morocco and Egypt have strong tourism traditions, the growth of others have been stunted or curtailed because of political strife. Collier (2007) cites many traps for international development and, while he does not discuss them in terms of tourism, his traps can be adapted to address industry creation. Conflict, lack of natural resources, being landlocked with bad neighbors, and bad governance in a small country are all conditions that would hinder tourism development. Ongoing or recent conflicts are not attractive behavior for tourists when selecting a destination. In general, visitors will not make a journey unless their physical security can be more or less guaranteed. Similarly, the threat of terrorism also will hinder
tourism growth (Richter, 2007). When considering tourism, natural resources can be considered in two ways: as commodities that provide profit to be put toward development or as natural beauty that will entice visitors. The lack of either, especially the latter, will make tourism development more difficult. If the nations surrounding the host country are in turmoil or pose a threat, tourists may be deterred for the same reason they are when conflict is present within the country. Regional safety threats are equally devastating to tourism. Hostile neighbors also could impede travel to or from a country depending on the method of transportation. Lastly, governments must make sound policy and economic decisions, or at least learn to adapt from their mistakes. Africa’s continued progress in tourism suggests that it has dealt with some of these issues; however, recent news from that region also implies that these issue areas will need to be closely monitored in the future.

**World Heritage List: Africa**

Placement of sites onto UNESCO’s World Heritage List is a prestigious and meaningful accomplishment for any government. It adds legitimacy through international recognition of a country’s heritage sites as being worthy of preserving and distinguishing. While it has been UNESCO’s goal to recognize sites from all over the global, in reality the site locations were originally skewed towards European and Western nations (Cleere, 2000). In recent years, however, a renewed call for more diverse recognition has occurred.

World Heritage Sites in Africa have grown over the years. In 1994, African nations had 70 sites on the List\(^\text{199}\). However, today UNESCO counts 78 sites and

\(^{199}\) According to table in Richards (2000).
qualifies what is and is not African differently. Today, Algeria, Mauritania, Sudan, Tunisia, Egypt, Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, and Morocco are counted as part of the Middle East even though they are part of the African continent. Counting North African states as Middle Eastern has a large effect on Africa’s cultural heritage statistics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World Heritage Sites African Continent</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Number in Danger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Sites: 117</td>
<td></td>
<td>Total in Danger: 14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World Heritage Sites in “Africa” as Defined by UNESCO</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Number in Danger</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Sites: 78</td>
<td></td>
<td>Total in Danger: 13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***These were compiled from the UNESCO World Heritage List website.

Depending on the classification of African nations, either as a continent or according to UNESCO cultural standards, the above charts mean different things. However, there are three important takeaways:

1) Natural sites are abundant in either definition.
2) Natural sites being described as “in danger” belong entirely to countries that are “African” no matter the definition.
3) There is a difference of 34 cultural sites between the two definitions. Those 7 countries in dispute, i.e. Algeria, Mauritania, Sudan, Tunisia, Egypt, Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, and Morocco, make up 44.7% of the sites on the African Continent. According to UNESCO, the remaining 55.3% sites are located in 29 countries.
It also is important to note that there are 17 African nations that have no sites on the World Heritage List. Ultimately the ways in which African heritage is categorized on a global scale is largely as natural sites. In general, Northern African nations particularly those that are sometimes not defined as being part of Africa, possess more cultural sites than other African nations. If UNESCO’s goal is to include a more diverse set of sites on the World Heritage List, definitions about what is cultural and the ways in which they are managed may need to be addressed in Africa.

**Kenya and South Africa**

While several African nations have made gains in increasing tourism arrivals and establishing vibrant industries, Kenya and South Africa have made pertinent advancements aimed at cultural tourism. Why these two countries, one might ask? There are many factors for both cases. However in the case of South Africa, there is evidence that the impending World Cup has had a significant influence on travel to the country, perhaps in preparation for the event. South Africa held the World Summit on Arts and Culture in September, 2009 one focus of which was to display Johannesburg as a potential cultural capital (Madumo, 2009). The World Cup is an opportunity for South Africa and Africa to show its organizational and cultural know-how (Edwards, 2009). The South African government also has made an effort to change the ways in which culture is institutionalized in museums so as to reflect current culture and not the colonial sentiments and perspectives of its racially charged past.

Kenya traditionally has been able to more easily market its indigenous tribe, the Maasai. However, displaying the Maasai to tourists has been problematic and tends to pander to colonial identities (Bruner, 2001). But recent increases in tourist interest have
been attributed to the election of President Barack Obama (BBC News, 2010). His international popularity has given rise to interest in his Kenyan ancestry. In this instance, the implication is that there are Kenyan cultural features that aided in the formation of President Obama’s character and personage which are worth exploring through travel to Kenya. The cross-cultural implications of an American president increasing tourism in a country in which he never lived adds a new way in which tourism influences can cross borders.
Appendix B:

Colonialism and Tourism

For citizens of an ex-empire, travel to an ex-colony can be appealing because of the familiar and long established cultural infrastructure. While there also is tension, there is a natural synergy between certain locations because of linguistic and administrative similarities established through colonial practices. There has been some discussion about whether or not indigenous groups have been able to deconstruct the tourist gaze using a conscious and playful approach to tourism representations (Pearce, 2008). The Polynesian Cultural Center in Hawaii has been cited as employing “colonial mimicry,” to address its colonial legacy; a technique that, “…is not directed at the tourists themselves, but rather at the tourists’ tacit expectations of Polynesian culture” (Balme, 1998, p. 54). Whether or not the humorous, self-reflexive awareness of stereotype comes across the viewer, this approach adds a new dimension to authenticity. It also implies that there is a potential for the performer to dictate the message being presented to the audience, which may or may not challenge patrimonial goals. According to Balme (1998), no longer is just the artifact or performance evaluated for authenticity, but, in addition, the position of the spectator must also be investigated.

When considering the tourist-spectator, it is important to consider both her motivations and her relationship to the display. The viewer and the audience are placed in a precarious place during this debate. If we are to believe in the audience’s desire to explore and in their abhorrence of a theatrical performance, then the audience, in fact, does not want to be an audience at all. In this case, a denial of the role of audience means that the spectators have a goal to experience something they would see if they were not
the audience (Anderson, 1982). It is a quest for authenticity that drives a tourist. According to Urry (1990), “The tourist is a kind of contemporary pilgrim, seeking authenticity in other ‘times’ and other ‘places’ away from that person’s everyday life. Tourists show particular fascination in the ‘real lives’ of others that somehow possess a reality hard to discover in their own experiences” (9). While tourists may seek these things, whether or not they shall find them is a far different matter.

Authenticity is impossible to measure and the feelings which tourist gaze produces are different for each person. When defining cultural experiences, MacCannell refers to these feelings as the “influence” which spurs from modifications to belief or feeling as a result of a representation of life (1999). It seems more likely that tourists may come closer to an authentic understanding when the depiction of events is more tragic than everyday. Instances of tragedy and anguish are more universally recognizable and the meanings more obvious than at other types of sites which may be more open to interpretation. Walking the grounds of a Holocaust internment camp produce similar feelings in most visitors and, perhaps, produce a minor reflection on the feelings of those who experienced internment. However, a Holocaust internment camp is a different category of display from say something like the Polynesian Cultural Center, which is largely synthetic and includes performances.

An institution which is more similar to the Polynesian Cultural Center is the town at Colonial Williamsburg. While usually classified as a living museum, it does not differ greatly from the Polynesian Cultural Center, which calls itself an ethnic theme park. Balme’s (1998) characterization of the two locations as being fundamentally different because Polynesian Cultural Center employees, “…do not perform roles from the
historical past but supposedly represent their own cultural heritage” (pp. 56) is incorrect. The peoples of the cultures represented at the Center may maintain some of the same traditions but their day-to-day lives are very different from the ones being portrayed. In some cases, the cultural center is preserving ways of life that are no longer practiced. In addition, the distance between the historical past and cultural heritage is not all that far.

Colonial Williamsburg has been criticized in the past for it’s version of history: bloodless, patriotic, and white (Eggen, 1999); however, in recent years the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation has attempted to expand its programming. A mock slave auction is one example of the type of program added. Slavery is an unfortunate but large part of America’s cultural history (Janofsky, 1994). There is evidence that this program was mentally traumatic for both the actors and the audience (Eggen, 1999). According to Eggen, “This edgy new representation of Colonial life casts costumed actors as slave leaders and slave owners while paying tourists find themselves in the roles of slaves. The reenactments are so realistic that some audience members have attacked the white actors in the slave patrol, who have had to fight to keep their decorative muskets.” Participants in these displays can only experience a modicum of the despair felt by actual slaves but the empathy engendered through the display adds an interesting layer to the debate over authenticity and audience experience. Cultural tragedy may be the only type of experience that can be partially recreated authentically or emotionally understood by tourists. These displays, or mediums, link the model (an aspect of life) and the ideal (the emotional response) to create a cultural experience (MacCannell, 1999) and thus create a more understandable commodity.
Works Cited


About the Show: meet the natives. (2010). Retrieved from http://www.travelchannel.com/TV_Shows/Meet_The_Natives/About_The_Show/Meet_The_Natives


American Chamber of Commerce in Morocco (2004). Tourism Retrieved


**Problem at Sea.** United States: Acorn Media Group Inc.


Istanbul 2010 Avrupa Kültür Başkenti - 2010 European Capital (n.d.).
Retrieved April 16, 2010 from:

Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture (2010a) *Our service sponsors.* Retrieved February 15, 2010 from:

Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture (2010b) *Our partners.* Retrieved February 15, 2010 from:


Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency (n.d.). *On the edge of passion.* Retrieved April 2, 2010 from:


Istanbul 2010 European Capital of Culture Agency (n.d.b) “*Extra-europa: joint project with linz.*” Retrieved March 12, 2010 from:


Retrieved from:
http://books.google.com/books?id=0t89AAAAIAAJ&pg=PA80&lpg=PA80&dq=method+of+diifference+Mill&source=bl&ots=vz-9-XokSB&sig=2uAGtbuoIZU_XJF0BVxZOmMUa40&hl=en&ei=53TcS-mRM46E9AS-oa2rBw&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=10&ved=0CDQQ6A
EwCTgK#v=onepage&q=method%20of%20difference%20Mill&f=false.


Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development (n.d.). *Tourism*. Retrieved April 2, 2010 from Centre for Entrepreneurship, SMEs, and Local Development: http://www.oecd.org/department/0,3355,en_2649_34389_1_1_1_1_1,00.htm.


March 28, 2010 from TripAdvisor.com: 


cultural identity. New York: Columbia.


from: http://www.csj.org.uk/about.htm.


Tourism British Columbia, Research Services. (2004). *A Profile of visitors to*
British Columbia's Okanagan Valley: Focus on Cultural Tourists
Victoria, British Columbia, Retrieved from:


TripAdvisor (n.d). Our guidelines for travel reviews. Retrieved March 19, 2010 from:


TripAdvisor (2010b). Things to do in istanbul. Retrieved March 19, 2010 from:
http://www.tripadvisor.com/Attractions,g293974,Activities,Istanbul.html.


http://www.spain.info/.


Wenhan, Z. (2009, May 19) *Should museums collect tickets from foreigners?*


