REFORMING PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN
IN THE INTEREST OF U.S. NATIONAL SECURITY

A Thesis
Submitted to the Faculty of
The School of Continuing Studies
and of
The Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of
Masters of Arts
in Liberal Studies

By

Maureen Bessingpas, B.A.

Georgetown University
Washington, D.C.
November 21, 2009
ABSTRACT

This thesis analyzes the failures of Pakistan’s educational system and proposes concrete measures to reform it, drawing on local models that have proven successful. Specifically, it seeks to determine a link between U.S. security and a functional primary education system in the state of Pakistan. UNICEF and other global human rights institutions show that educating girls is one of the most lasting ways to increase stability, prosperity, and peace. When girls have the opportunity to obtain an education, their standard of living rises and their families have a better chance of escaping the cycle of poverty. There is a concern within the U.S. that the growing threat of terrorism is being bred among the villages in Pakistan where both education and employment opportunities are non-existent.

The education system in Pakistan is unregulated, underfunded and in need of a complete overhaul. Pakistan has consistently spent less than 2% GDP on education, less than any developed nation outside of Africa. That combined with an exploding population has created an environment rich with uneducated and unemployed youth, who are currently being recruited into the anti-American insurgency known as the Taliban.

U.S. interests in Pakistan have fluctuated and have primarily been based upon military strategy in surrounding countries. After the terrorist attacks in the U.S. on
September 11, 2001, the U.S. began providing millions of dollars in unaccounted for financial aid without any apparent benefit. More recent legislation regarding U.S. aid to Pakistan included the House Resolution PEACE Act 2009 provides aid to Pakistan with some directed at improving the education system, but previous efforts at reforming the education system have failed.

There are small scale success stories of individuals or small groups instituting change from the grassroots, including the Central Asia Institute, The Citizens Foundation and the National Solidarity Program. These programs adapt change from the local level, sidestepping the corrupt infrastructure of the Pakistani government and have proven successful. These groups are providing opportunities to children where the government of Pakistan had failed to offer any.

The U.S. government must use caution in attempting to intervene in Pakistan’s internal governing, but there are several possible actions the U.S. can implement to build on the successes of the grassroots organizations on a large scale and redefine the standards of education from the ground up. It is in the interest of U.S. security to contribute to the improvement of Pakistan’s education system. The thesis concludes with some obstacles and challenges the U.S. can expect in working with the Pakistani government to implement changes.
# CONTENTS

COPYRIGHT..........................................................................................................................ii  
ABSTRACT..........................................................................................................................iii  
FIGURE.............................................................................................................................vi  
TABLES...........................................................................................................................vii  
INTRODUCTION...................................................................................................................1  
CHAPTER 1: THE VALUE OF EDUCATION IN HUMAN SECURITY.........................8  
CHAPTER 2: UNITED STATES INTERESTS IN PAKISTAN .........................29  
CHAPTER 3: THREE CUPS OF TEA CONCEPT.......................................................47  
CHAPTER 4: NEW DIRECTIONS FOR PAKISTAN'S EDUCATION POLICY.................................................72  
CHAPTER 5: OBSTACLES AND CHALLENGES.................................................................97  
BIBLIOGRAPHY.................................................................................................................112
FIGURES

1. HISTORY OF U.S. AID TO PAKISTAN ..................................................32

2. THE CITIZENS FOUNDATION MODEL .............................................66
TABLES

TABLE

1. PRIMARY SCHOOL ENROLLMENT BY GENDER........................................14
2. PRIMARY SCHOOL DROP-OUT RATES BY GENDER.................................14
3. NUMBER OF INSTITUTIONS BY TYPE AND ENROLLMENT BY GENDER...23
4. HISTORICAL REVIEW OF EDUCATIONAL POLICIES AND TARGETS......40
5. VARIETY AND NUMBER OF PROJECTS FUNDED BY NSP.........................70
6. PRIMARY SCHOOL AGED IDP CHILDREN IN PAKISTAN.........................93
INTRODUCTION

Terrorist attacks have become a daily staple in global news headlines. Terrorists continue to inflict pain and suffering indiscriminately on the lives of innocent people all over the world, and the threat of nuclear weapons falling into the hands of terrorists is real. Countering this trend is in the security interest of all nations and the issue has been at the forefront of United States security agenda since the fateful attacks of 9/11. The United States has developed a detailed counter-terrorism strategy addressing a multitude of approaches with four broad goals: defeat terrorists and their organizations; deny sponsorship, support and sanctuaries to terrorists; diminish the underlying conditions that terrorists seek to exploit; and defend U.S. citizens and interests at home and abroad.¹

The lengthy report produced by the 9/11 commission determined that actors and institutions within Pakistan could be linked to the attacks. Now there is great concern within the U.S. about the security of the nuclear weapons stock in Pakistan. Further, the 9/11 Commission Report determined the importance of Pakistan in the struggle against terrorism must not be understated, declaring, “Pakistan’s endemic poverty, widespread corruption, and often ineffective government create opportunities for Islamist recruitment. Poor education is a particular concern.”² Rural Pakistan is an area of concern for U.S. security; terrorism is brewing among the rural regions of the state.


Pakistan’s education system is commonly cited as one of the biggest impediments preventing the country from achieving its potential as a contributor to the global economy. Pakistan is one of only twelve countries in the world that consistently spends less than 2% of its GDP on education.\(^3\) The failing education system has resulted in a large population of radicalized youth that have not been equipped with the skills required to contribute to the economy. Reform of the primary education system is a critical step in providing alternative employment opportunities and deterring the influence of terrorism in the state of Pakistan. This thesis analyzes the failures of Pakistan’s educational system and proposes concrete measures to reform it, drawing on local models that have proven successful.

Studies confirm that education significantly benefits productivity – just one additional year of education can increase employment wages employment by 10 percent even after controlling for other factors.\(^4\) The Social Policy Development Center’s 2002-2003 Annual Review reveals that districts with a higher literacy level have a higher level of development (SPDC 2003). Education is a valuable tool in development and Pakistan’s education system is failing to provide the opportunity to the majority of its youth.


The education system in Pakistan is designed with three parallel but not equal institutions. The three-pronged education system in Pakistan provides multiple avenues to educate children: public government-run schools, Madrassahs (religious seminaries), and elite private schools. Pakistan’s education system faces a multitude of problems including insufficient government investment, shortage of qualified teachers and inadequate teacher training, politicized curricula that promote intolerance and violence, poor quality and lack of textbooks and other learning materials, fraud and corruption, to name a few.

The state of Pakistan is falling short of its constitutional obligation to provide universal primary education. Several major initiatives have been taken to bring about structural reforms in the education sector. The thrust of these reforms is achieving universal primary education and adult literacy, providing professional training for teachers and improving the overall quality of education.

Primary education is the foundation on which all subsequent stages of education are built and a basic ingredient for human development, making education reform at the primary level key to successful reform of the education system. Examination of the educational reforms reveals that few existing primary schools provide a quality education, and many of them are simply money-making schemes for corrupt officials. Insurgents have been destroying schools and threatening the existing educational institution making the challenge even greater, and the need for reform urgent. Pakistan’s educational system is broken and the security of Pakistan, the United States and even the global community depend upon its repair.
There are success stories for some private educational institutions inside Pakistan. One of them was developed by an American climber named Greg Mortenson. He founded the Central Asia Institute (CAI) which is currently credited for building over 130 schools in rural Pakistan where previously there were none. Mortenson understands the greater threat stating:

The real enemy is ignorance, and it is ignorance that breeds hatred. And to overcome ignorance, we need to have courage, we need to have compassion, and most of all, I think what's so important is that we need to have education.\(^5\)

The schools are focused on educating girls and over fifteen years since the inception of the first CAI school, are cultivating a generation of Pakistanis can effectively improve their world.

It is most unlikely that an American could manage to build schools, especially for girls in a Muslim nation in an area where anti-American sentiment is mounting. Mortenson personally raised the funds and managed the logistics of building the first school with seemingly insurmountable obstacles, and he persevered. The key to his success was his understanding and appreciation of the culture, such as his ability to drink tea, listen to the people, and show respect, as described in his memoir of his journey, Three Cups of Tea.

Another model is that of The Citizens Foundation (TCF), which like the CAI is a private organization designed to provide primary education opportunities for Pakistani

children in areas where there are not schools available. TCF is managed by an anonymous group of businessmen with the main focus of providing quality education to low income children that would otherwise not be afforded educational opportunities.

In Afghanistan, a model titled the National Solidarity Program has achieved success through originating change at the village level. The program is designed to involve the community in establishing priorities and then provides funding for planned development. When left up to the community, the result has often been that developing an education program and building a school are a priority.

The education models design implemented by Greg Mortenson, The Citizens Foundation and the National Solidarity Program are all examples of successful education reform in Pakistan, and their success must be expounded upon. There are several factors that must be considered in approaching such a monumental task, ranging from the incessant corruption in the current system to the opposition to U.S. involvement in Pakistan, but the task of reforming Pakistan’s education system must be undertaken to lay the groundwork for stability and security.

There are many stakeholders involved, and the United States cannot institute a total overhaul to transform the system alone. The global community, local communities, businesses, parents, teachers and students must all collaborate to prevent the destruction of Pakistan’s educational system.

Pakistan must embrace proposed reforms as absolute: increasing expenditure, appointing education leaders, organizing community involvement in education reform, constructing and registering schools, developing curriculum, training teachers, student
accessibility and financial accountability are all essential. Required changes cannot entirely be instituted from outside the state; a new commitment to education from within Pakistan is essential.

The U.S. can continue to build on the successes of proven models by enlisting the assistance of Pakistani expatriates living within the U.S. Expanding study abroad programs for students enrolled in education programs, effort will become a collaboration effort of sorts and take some of the spotlight off attempts of direct U.S. action in Pakistan. The U.S. can also contribute by investing in implementation of reforms and provide incentives for established benchmarks in the educational system. Because of the spread of terrorism in some regions inside Pakistan, millions of civilians are fleeing for safety. Some find safety with family in different areas, and others flock to IDP camps. There is an opportunity amidst this crisis to provide educational provisions to children within these camps. Programs of this nature are already established and could be expounded upon with U.S. support to open the door for future development in the villages for these children upon return.

The proposed changes are not to imply that education alone is the silver bullet to removing the threat of terrorism. The insurgents have built their networks, trained and educated their followers and provide them a livelihood - something when given the opportunity in the past, the United States has failed to achieve. Diplomatic solutions are not likely to succeed alone, especially with anti-U.S. sentiment gaining momentum in the region. Historically the U.S. does not have a reputation for standing by Pakistanis when the source of U.S. interest is gone. Military intervention would create even more
instability fuel the insurgency. Economic efforts have failed, as billions of dollars that the U.S. has poured into Pakistan have stayed in the hands of Pakistan’s government and remain generally unaccounted for.

There are multiple opportunities for the U.S. to contribute to education reform in Pakistan, and timing is critical. Each day, week and month that passes, more and more unemployable youth are recruited into the insurgency. The complexity of the problem of security cannot be understated. Education is a root problem that can address the issue of security in the long term. Developing solutions for the long-term to address the security problems of both Pakistan and the U.S. can be initiated in education reform. Increasing the ability of the population to contribute to their local economy and ultimately to the knowledge-based global economy by providing educational opportunities can improve security in the long-term. Education reform must be part of the solution in the fight against terrorism. The security of Pakistan, the United States and the global community are at stake.
CHAPTER 1

THE VALUE OF EDUCATION IN HUMAN SECURITY

Education can be the difference between a life of grinding poverty and the potential for a full and secure one; between a child dying from preventable disease and families raised in healthy environments; between orphans growing up in isolation, and the community having the means to protect them; between countries ripped apart by poverty and conflict, and access to secure and sustainable development.

- Nelson Mandela and Graca Machel, “Opening Doors”

Illiteracy makes people and the societies in which they live vulnerable. Low levels of literacy and education in general, can impede the economic development of a country in the current rapidly changing, technology-driven world. Societies cannot continue to advance when the greatest achievement of the population is mere survival. Inevitably, individuals barely surviving are manipulated, exploited and possibly eliminated by those with skills, money or power. As humans we have the obligation and opportunity to change the environments in which the poor and weak are exploited and to effect unfortunately accepted patterns of societal behavior to allow the weak to thrive; the answer is education.

Without intervention, the weak, or more specifically the uneducated, are becoming nothing more than fodder for manipulative individuals involved in terror organizations and pose a threat to the security of society. Uneducated, desperate youth have become an easy target for terror organizations that offer them money and training, particularly when they have no means to provide for themselves or contribute to the
needs of their families. Illiteracy deprives people of knowledge and power, and reduces people’s ability to understand how political and social issues truly affect their lives. The vulnerability therefore extends from the uneducated individual to society as a whole, making rural Pakistan an area of particular concern for U.S. security.

The World Bank has identified multiple benefits of education: it gives a voice to the disadvantaged; fosters equity and social cohesion; has a positive impact on economic growth; and promotes good health. Achieving better education also enhances income opportunities which helps alleviate poverty, and raises the productivity of society by increasing potential entrepreneurial opportunities. Education equips citizens with basic functional life skills, and prepares them to become responsible and contributing members of society. The list of the benefits of education to society could go on and on; education is undeniably central to the development of a nation.

A danger exists, that members of society lacking education may develop an apathetic attitude toward progress as they turn their focus primarily to survival. A psychological term, learned helplessness is defined by A Dictionary of Psychology as,


4 Andrew M. Coleman, ed., A Dictionary of Psychology, definition for “learned helplessness” (Georgetown University: Oxford UP, 2009), s.v.
“An apathetic condition in an animal or a human being resulting from exposure to insoluble problems or inescapable physical or emotional stress, believed by some psychologists to underlie depression.” Illiterate youth, seeking to provide for their families or even just to live another day, have become a great danger to the rest of society in that they are being trained to kill and destroy the very infrastructure that exists to improve their condition. They are being indoctrinated by terrorist organizations and brainwashed into martyrdom and jihad instead of being educated on how to become productive members of society. Terror attacks in Mumbai, India that were later traced back to Pakistani youth resulted in the lead investigator, Mumbai Joint Commissioner of Police Rakesh Maria stating, “This indoctrination of uneducated youth that is going on in Pakistan is a danger to the whole world not just to India.”

Officials in Pakistan have confirmed that Taliban leaders are buying and selling children for use as suicide bombers. Prior to his death, Baitullah Mehsud was one of the top Taliban leaders in Pakistan and considered an ally of Al Qaeda. His training includes preparing children for suicide attacks with the message that, “only jihad can

---


7 There are reports that Baitullah Mehsud was killed by U.S. drone attacks in Pakistan 8 August 2009, however there may never be conclusive evidence of his death, and even though Hakeemullah Mehsud has been named as his successor, the reports of Baitullah’s death are still refuted by his followers.
bring peace to the world,” which can only be countered with a solid education system that can provide a foundation of core values.

In Pakistan as well as Afghanistan, building and protecting schools has become a major concern for government officials. The challenge of developing and maintaining educational opportunities for children in these nations which are ravaged by terrorism is intense. Schools are common targets for attacks, and are often destroyed as quickly as they’re built. In Pakistan, over 183 schools were destroyed in the last year, evidence that the Taliban understands the importance of keeping potential recruits illiterate and programmable. As stated by a member of the Kabul (Afghanistan) Press, “…when you fight with illiteracy you can fight security problems and ensure the continued security in the country… so if we fight illiteracy in the country we can ensure the security forever in the country.”

Assessing the Status of Education in Pakistan

There are a number of variables to consider in assessing the status of a country’s educational system. The most commonly evaluated indicators include literacy rates for both males and females in varying parts of the country; drop out rates at all levels of

---


education and enrollment by number of years spent in school by gender; and the amount of resources committed in proportion to the GDP expenditure. In the case of Pakistan, a significant factor is also the quality of the data and information available for analysis. In all areas, available current and historical records reflect poorly on the education system in Pakistan.

**Literacy Rates**

Depending on the source, Pakistan’s reported literacy ranges from as low as 35%\(^{11}\) to as high as 56%\(^{12}\) and by all accounts males represent approximately two thirds of the literate population while females represent a dismal one third. Development organizations appear to show the down side of education statistics to make a stronger case for investment in their projects, whereas government sources appear to inflate numbers to attract international investment and appease electorates. The variance may also be attributed to the definition of literacy used to determine the number; the source on the lowest end defines literacy as, “individuals over the age of 15 are able to read and write,”\(^{13}\) while the high end source considers a person literate if they, “…can read newspaper and write a simple letter in any language.”\(^{14}\) A higher level of literacy is


\(^{14}\) Ibid.
required for functional literacy. The term functional literacy describes a meaningful level of literacy that can be put to practical use. This may encompass people being aware of their basic rights, participating in community life, learning everyday skills, expressing themselves or achieving a measure of self-reliance.\textsuperscript{15} Pakistan is a nation with an estimated population of over 176 million (July 2009 est.)\textsuperscript{16} over half of whom never attended school, is largely failing to contribute to the global economy based primarily on the burden of illiteracy that has fallen on its people. A by-product of this failure is the growing threat to US national and global security.

\begin{quote}
\textit{Drop-Out Rates and Enrollment}
\end{quote}

With already dismal completion rates at the primary school level, Table 1 demonstrates the low enrollment to primary school for females representing only 43\% of the primary school population. The total number represents only 27.5\% of the primary school-aged children in Pakistan.\textsuperscript{17} The problem is multiplied by drop out rates demonstrated in Table 2 below; showing dropout rates for females exceed those of their male counterparts after primary school.

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{17} "Pakistan: Number of School-going Children on the Decline [REPORT],” Welcome, Asia Child Rights, http://acr.hrschool.org/mainfile.php/0133/161/ (accessed October 19, 2009).
\end{itemize}
Table 1: Pakistan Primary School Enrollment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary School Enrollment</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>6,639,788</td>
<td>4,932,846</td>
<td>11,572,634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector</td>
<td>2,770,093</td>
<td>2,223,605</td>
<td>4,993,698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Public Sector</td>
<td>136,748</td>
<td>131,337</td>
<td>268,085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Enrollment</td>
<td>9,546,629</td>
<td>7,287,788</td>
<td>16,834,417</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Education Website 2005-2006\(^{18}\)

Table 2: Drop out Rate % for Primary Schools in Pakistan

Source: The Citizens Foundation, Drop-Out Rates 2001-02\(^{19}\)


A commonly accepted reason for the trend of low female enrollment was that the culture restricted females from obtaining an education, but a study conducted by the Ministry for Women’s Development and several international donor agencies in the 1980s revealed that parents were most concerned about preserving a female’s honor.\textsuperscript{20} The answer to this problem is to enlist female educators, however, the problem perpetuates as female enrollment and drop-out rates fail to improve. Additional studies have found that families don’t receive the benefits of sending females to school since they marry young and contribute to their new family’s income.\textsuperscript{21}

Primary/elementary education is essential to improving the national literacy rate and changing the pattern of uneducated, unemployed youth that continues to threaten development and security in Pakistan. Although the Government of Pakistan has failed to make significant financial contributions, with less than 2\% of GDP dedicated to education, billions of dollars have been applied to the problem from international donors and NGO’s over the last twenty years. The corruption and waste have eaten away at the fiscal contributions and progress is lacking.

According to research findings high dropouts and low enrollment/participation at the primary level may be attributed to the following factors as detailed below; economic, economic,


physical, geographic, administrative, curriculum/educational environment, and teacher
related factors:

I. Economic Factors
- Low level of economic development of the country
- Low per capita income of the people
- Inadequate facilities (walls, classrooms, restrooms) in schools
- Shortage of funds
- Poor standards of health and nutrition
- Costly text-books/learning materials
- Inadequacy of audio-visual aids
- Poor motivation level of parents to send children to school

II. Physical Factors
- Punitive measures adopted by teachers and loss of self-respect
- Non-conducive atmosphere of shelter-less schools
- Heavy load of school bag
- Practice of forcing children to repeat classes
- Induction of formal education from the first day in school
- Learning disabilities
- Unattractive/unfamiliar environment of school
- Over-crowded classes

III. Geographic Factors
- Scattered population patterns throughout country
- Long distances of schools from homes
- Natural disasters in hilly areas

IV. Administrative Factors
- Lax supervision and weak administration
- Indifferent attitude of administrative and supervisory personnel towards
the teaching community
- Teacher absenteeism
- Undue political interference

V. Curriculum/Educational Environment Related Factors
- Curriculum not in harmony with needs and abilities of children
- Lack of relevance of curriculum to the needs of the community
- Poor quality of education
- Rigid system of examinations
- Non-availability of text-books in time and out-dated text-books
- No immediate return of education making poor parents consider it futile
- Rigid formal systems of education at the level of Class I

VI. Teacher Related Factors
- Shortage of teachers
- Hesitation of female teachers to go to remotely located schools
- Inadequate residential facilities in remote locations compelling teachers to remain absent from school to attend family problems
- Low morale of primary school teachers and their harsh treatment towards pupils
- Sub-standard student-teacher ration (normally greater than 1:37)
- Inadequate knowledge of child psychology

Similar results were revealed in the findings of research study titled, “The Causes of Low Enrollment and High Dropouts” carried out under Primary Education Project-III by the Ministry of Education in 1994, the causes of high dropout have been rank ordered and prioritized below, defining the causes as internal and external:

Internal Reasons for High Drop-out
- Lack of facilities in schools
- Defective textbooks and curriculum which is beyond the comprehension level of students
- Harsh attitude of the teacher

External Reasons for High Drop-out
- Parents poverty
- Parents lack of understanding of value education
- Opportunity cost to the parents by sending the child to school

---

There is a great deal of global interest in political, policy and academic circles to reform the education system in Pakistan. Governments have recognized with growing concern that the large number of uneducated or poorly educated and unemployed youth pose security problems to the rest of the world. The United States along with multiple international organizations have contributed billions of dollars to solve the problem identified as the education system in Pakistan.

The typical western response to dismal literacy numbers in Pakistan is to place education at the center of the donor community's agenda, and make large amounts of resources available to the country with the condition that the funding is spent on education. Consistently, the result of the generous contributions and efforts by international governments and organizations has typically been waste and corruption, with little tangible evidence of improvement to the state’s education system.23

Central to salvaging the education system in Pakistan is the government’s level of commitment and investment in education. Over the last ten years, Pakistan has been one of only twelve countries outside Africa that allocates less than 2% of GDP expenditure to

---

education. Pakistan’s Ministry of Education reports education expenditure as high as 2.2% for 2005/2006 with no current information available.

In 1992 the Government of Pakistan launched The Social Action Program (SAP) to increase public expenditure on basic social services, with the intent to improve some of the country’s most neglected social indicators. SAP focused on basic education, primary health care, rural water supply and sanitation, and population welfare. The SAP also targeted urban-rural gender disparities.

According to a summary of the project, the first three years of SAP were budgeted to cost $4 billion of which the Government of Pakistan would fund $3 billion. Asian Development Bank (ADB) the World Bank, the Governments of Netherlands, and the United Kingdom also supported the SAP. ADB approved a loan of $100 million for the Social Action Program Project (SAPP) in 1994 which was completed in 1997.

Reviews of the program yielded dismal results including a decline in net enrollment rates for females and an exodus from government schools to non-government

__________________________________________________________


run schools. Other investments into the Pakistan education system have likewise been significant in the dollar contribution but yielded similar results. While fiscal investment in education is important, the obvious conclusion is that the education system cannot succeed unless there is a strong desire for education at the lowest levels of society, and change must be introduced socially.

**Challenges to the Education System in Pakistan**

At independence in 1947, the priority for the leadership of the new Pakistani state was the creation of a new nation. The lack of infrastructure was not the only issue as the five different provinces (Sindh, Balochistan, Punjab, NWFP and East Bengal) had to establish common ground despite varying cultural heritages and languages. The 1947 All Pakistan National Education Conference (PNE) outlined the aim of free and compulsory education for the first five years in order to address the imbalances left over from the colonial times. Despite this effort, national unification was based on establishing one language and religion rather than an educated middle class. At the PNE Conference that same year, Urdu was established as the national language even though Urdu was not spoken in any of the five provinces.

---


Seemingly contradictory to the changes already mentioned, the founding fathers of the Pakistan established Universal Primary Education (UPE) as a goal.\textsuperscript{31} Military tensions with India and perceptions of national security needs led to relatively high military spending and relatively low education spending. While the state struggled to set up a national education infrastructure, a parallel system of private schools and Madrassahs existed from the start.

The nation of Pakistan is almost twice the size of the state of California with over four times the number of people.\textsuperscript{32} The median age of the population is 20.8, and also according to the CIA’s World Fact Book, the School Life Expectancy (SLE) is only seven years,\textsuperscript{33} yet many outside sources indicate SLE in Pakistan is much lower. The overwhelming majority of children not in school are not being restricted by legal prohibition or threats from terrorists, but more complex problems. The categories outlined below demonstrate the extent to which Pakistan’s education system is falling significantly short of its constitutional obligation to provide universal primary education to Pakistanis.


\textsuperscript{33} “TCF Impact,” The Citizens Foundation, Definition, http://www.thecitizensfoundation.org/impact/index.php?id=6&query_dir=impact (accessed October 01, 2009). School life expectancy (SLE) is the total number of years of schooling (primary to tertiary) that a child can expect to receive.
Education Institution Options in Pakistan

From the Universal Declaration of Human Rights to the Millennium Development Goals, education is a declared right to every human being. The Constitution of Pakistan declares that the responsibility for basic education resides with the State. This obligation is reflected in the principles of policy Chapter 2, Article 37, which proclaims:

The State shall:

(a) Promote, with special care, the educational and economic interests of backward classes or areas.

(b) Remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period.34

Pakistani schools can generally be characterized as mainstream or religious, and there are three avenues of achieving education in Pakistan. First, there are the reasonably good western-style private institutions that operate mostly for profit. These schools educate approximately 5 percent of students between five to eighteen years, a category of about 70 million people. Next there are the religious schools known as Madrassahs, which provide education to approximately the same number of students. In between the two extremes is the other 90 percent of the student population who are dependent on the public system which is inefficient and corrupt. It is, in other words, dysfunctional.

Table 3 shows a distribution of primary school enrollment by type of institution from a 2005-2006 census reported by percent as follows:

---

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Institutions</th>
<th>Number Enrolled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Primary</td>
<td>105,526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Primary</td>
<td>16,823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mosques</td>
<td>14,123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Government Managed/Public Schools

The first and largest education sector in Pakistan is managed by the state and uses the government prescribed curriculum. The quality of government funded education is poor with expected primary education duration of only five years and completion rates around 63%. The public education system is based largely on the structure of the British educational system including five years of primary instruction, three years of secondary,


and two years of high school education. Policies and curriculum are determined at the federal level giving provinces the responsibility to implement. According to the Ministry of Education website, the 2006 curriculum for primary school included blocks of instruction on literacy, general knowledge, social studies, English and Urdu language classes, mathematics, science, ethics and Islamiat (Islamic Studies). The curriculum is not designed to serve a modernizing society and economy and as the only block of organized schooling most Pakistani children will receive, the government version of education is not fulfilling its constitutional obligation, further contributing to the cycle of illiteracy, and increasing future security risks.

Private Schools

The second part of Pakistan’s school system caters to over one million primary school students or nearly 26 percent of all enrolled students and is made up of privately managed schools. Private education is offered at all levels of education in Pakistan and as would be expected, wealthy families tend to enroll their children in high performing privately managed schools and the poor are forced into the public sector system if they enroll

---


38 “(Curriculum) Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan. http://www.moe.gov.pk/ (accessed August 23, 2009). The General Knowledge Curriculum is, “designed for young students to develop basic knowledge and skills, interests, and habits of a mind that will lead them to productively learn and understand areas of knowledge (science, social studies, mathematics, ethics and Islamic Studies) more deeply in later grades.”

at all. This means that the rich have been able to bypass the part of the educational sector managed by the government while the poor have no option but to send their children to public schools. The process of selection according to income levels reduces the quality of the student body in government run schools. Instruction in private schools is usually conducted in English and as with all private institutions, the quality of education varies. Some private schools include traditional Islamic education. For the multitude of registered private schools, there is a requirement to follow government-prescribed curricula however, not all private schools are registered.

Some private schools are well established and prepare students for the examinations of the Cambridge University Local Examination Syndicate. However not all private schools are expensive or elite. Many are affordable to low-income Pakistanis, and Alderman et al. found that the demand for private schooling in Pakistan is directly related to parental perception of better educational opportunities. Private institutions have developed strong links with foreign education institutions to which Pakistan sends some 10,000 students every year of higher education. The private system supports the modern sector of the economy and society. Very little government assistance is


provided to private schools, yet private school enrollment remains a more attractive educational option for Pakistani youth.

Religious Schools/Madrassahs

The third part of the educational system is made up of several thousand Madrassahs that provide education to over a million Pakistani youth, a small number in comparison to those enrolled in either public or private schools. At the primary school level, the Madrassahs focus on basic learning of the Koran and Islamic religion. After the primary level, the education provided at the mosque schools does not stray from religion, and graduates of these institutions receive such a limited education they have no prospect of finding a job in the mainstream economy; they teach in the institutions they graduate from; go to mosques to lead prayers and give sermons; or join the groups of jihadis waging war in various parts of the world. This part of the educational system feeds on itself and fails to contribute to improving the economic standing of its students.

As would be expected, families with the means to enroll their children in high performing privately managed schools do so, and the poor families are forced into the public sector system if they opt for school at all. A recent survey revealed that only 27 percent of the children from the richest 20 percent of the households were enrolled in government schools while the government schools are filled by as much as 75 per cent of the children.

---

from the poorest 20 percent of households. The rich are able to bypass the government educational sector while the poor have no option but to send their children to the public schools if they send their children at all. This process of education selection based on income level reduces the quality of the student body in government schools and perpetuates the cycle of illiteracy among the most vulnerable facet of Pakistan’s society.

Private and religious schools are generally left unchecked by the government. There is a requirement for registration of these institutions but there is no follow through on the part of the government. Schools may open and develop a curriculum designed specifically for the population they wish to attract be it wealthy internationals in the private sector or poor and destitute candidates for jihad.

The system of schooling left unchanged may increase Islamic militancy in Pakistan, which will be as much an expression of discontent against the policies of the ruling elite as commitment to Islamizing society. Attempts at change implemented by the government have resulted in status quo or worse yet, increased illiteracy and indifference to education among the population. As such, Pakistan and her allies must consider education the forefront on the battlefield against terrorism. Likewise the United States must consider investment into education in Pakistan a priority in the name of national security.

An in depth evaluation of U.S./Pakistani relationships will provide insight on the tension that exists between the two nations and the evolution of the most recent U.S.

---

policy in Pakistan aimed at improving the economic stability of Pakistan through efforts similar to nation building efforts implemented elsewhere since 9/11.
CHAPTER 2

UNITED STATES INTERESTS IN PAKISTAN

Since 2001, the United States has contributed more than $12,000,000,000 to Pakistan to strengthen Pakistan’s governance, economy, education system, healthcare services, and military, so as to bring freedom and opportunities to the people of Pakistan while helping to combat terrorism and to counter a domestic insurgency.

House Resolution 1886, PEACE Act 2009

Since independence in 1947, Pakistan has had to depend on foreign assistance in both development efforts and to balancing international debt payments. The United States has been a major provider of aid since independence. Historically, US support for Pakistan has been distorted towards military aid: heavy guns, tanks, officer training and fighter aircrafts. Given the nature of external threats from India or the Soviet Union, at one point investing in defense made sense. Today the internal threat of extremism in Pakistan seems far greater than any external threat the young nation has faced in its short history. Developments in Pakistan’s domestic affairs are more than just academic interest to American policy makers; the security of our nation is at stake.

United States interest in Pakistan has fluctuated. The U.S. has not always viewed the well-being of the state of Pakistan a contingent of its own security allying with

---


Pakistan as a fair weather friend. Upon the 1947 partition of India which led to the creation of Pakistan, the U.S. found an ally in Pakistan. Pakistan needed U.S. assistance in balancing India’s power in the region, and the U.S. considered Pakistan an ally in containing communism within the Soviet Union and China.

The first true test of the relationship occurred during the Indo-Pakistani war in 1965 when the U.S. failed to support Pakistan, going so far as to cut off military supply at a time of great need for Pakistan. U.S. policy makers did not portray an interest in nurturing the fragile relationship with Pakistan. During the forty plus years between the Indo-Pakistani war in 1965, the U.S. relationship with Pakistan has received varying levels of attention from U.S. policy-makers with no permanent sense of devotion until the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001.

In a recent interview with A Pakistan News, Former Pakistani President Pervez Musharraf stated, “For 42 years, until 1989, we were the strategic partners of the West,” referring to the “lead role” of Pakistan in the Afghanistan War from 1979 until 1989. He added, “We defeated the Soviet Union together. Then what happened after 1989 is the question. We were left high and dry. There was a strategic shift in the United States where they shifted towards India, which was always with the East, and never with the

---


West. Pakistan is united and remains an American ally, but a growing divide is emerging because Pakistanis generally don’t like the U.S.\textsuperscript{5} Discontent for the U.S. was aggravated in 1990 when President George Bush determined that he could no longer certify that Pakistan did not possess nuclear weapons and, as required by the Pressler Amendment to the Foreign Assistance Act, applied sanctions which terminated all United States assistance to Pakistan that was not already in the pipeline.\textsuperscript{6} Aid to Pakistan dropped significantly from 1991 to 2000, and the U.S. blocked delivery of military equipment that Pakistan had already purchased.\textsuperscript{7}

**History of U.S Aid to Pakistan**

Since partition and the independence of Pakistan as previously stated, the U.S. has been a fickle ally to Pakistan. Likewise, U.S. assistance to Pakistan has been intermittent. According to USAID records, assistance to Pakistan has come in many forms from a number of different agencies since the U.S. began an aid program to Pakistan.\textsuperscript{8} Two broad categories of assistance persist: wide ranging economic aid and purely military aid. Figure 1 represents the history of U.S. aid to Pakistan.


\textsuperscript{7} *History of U.S. Aid to Pakistan*, Senate Foreign Relations Committee, Subcommittee on International Development and Foreign Assistance, 110th Cong., 1-9 (2007) (testimony of Lawrence Korb).

Sanctions mandated by the Pressler Amendment were lifted after the September 11 terrorist attacks and U.S. aid to Pakistan under the second President George W. Bush administration was substantial, with numbers in reaching $12 billion in military, economic and development aid. Great scrutiny has finally mounted, due to apparent mismanagement of this fiscal relationship. Accountability of the aid was not a

---


contingent, although a breakdown of the aid by the Center for Strategic and International Studies indicates:

1. Approximately 60 percent has gone toward "Coalition Support Funds," intended to reimburse the Pakistani military for their assistance in combating terrorism. The U.S. government considers it repayment rather than aid

2. 15 percent (nearly $1.6 billion) is for security assistance. The Pakistanis have spent the majority of this money on purchases of major weapons systems

3. 15 percent is for general budget support for the Pakistani government

4. Approximately 10 percent was allocated for development or humanitarian assistance, including the U.S. response to the October 2005 earthquake

Criticisms of the expenditure of these funds have dampened public opinion of U.S./Pakistani relations. There are concerns that aid money has contributed to more corruption. Among Pakistani’s the aid appears to benefit only the wealthy and those directly affiliated with the dictatorship and the military, with nothing trickling to the millions of impoverished in the dilapidated social infrastructure. Dumping a large amount of financial aid into a barely functioning system feeds the anger of those not receiving aid and more exclusions established by those that are. In a hearing on U.S. assistance to Pakistan in 2007, head of the South Asia program at the Woodrow Wilson Center Robert Hathaway summarized the U.S.’ miscalculations regarding aid to Pakistan since 9/11:


We have allowed a blanket justification of counter-insurgency to be used to rationalize assistance programs and arms sales with minimum or non-existent connection to that objective. America’s seemingly unlimited generosity to the Pakistani military has encouraged the widespread belief in Pakistan that the US sides with that country’s dictators rather than its democrats. In doing so, we alienated potential friends and angered Pakistanis who share our values and our vision for their country. We have established unfocused, poorly conceived economic and development programs that are lacking in responsible oversight. There have been no requirements for accountability of our aid, and no performance benchmarks that are routinely imposed on aid recipients. Funds were not restricted to development, education or infrastructure.\(^{13}\)

The United States’ on-again, off again history of alliance and assistance has left the people of Pakistan and its leaders skeptical about the depth and reliability of the U.S. commitment to the long-term wellbeing of the state. Levels of aid have validated this concern. The U.S. policy toward Pakistan appeared to connote that Pakistan could simply be motivated by money. After 9/11 the U.S. attempted to mend years of abandonment and disregard by pouring money into the government of Pakistan to obtain support in the U.S. efforts to defeat Al Qaeda, known to be hidden among the rugged landscape of Pakistan’s border with Afghanistan. The great failure of U.S. policymakers in this effort were the assumptions that: 1) Pakistan culture would discount years of neglect and welcome the return of a U.S. alliance, uncertain of the duration of the commitment, and 2) Pakistan would determine priorities for spending in accordance with Western ideals in support of the War on Terror such as human development, nation building, and the foundation of civil society.\(^{14}\)


Pakistan Culture

Cultural variables alone do not explain a country’s behavior in international relations. In fact, when Pakistan was created there was no clearly defined Pakistani culture. In describing Pakistanis one would describe habits, customs and ways of thinking which varied among the regions of the state.\textsuperscript{15} Loyalty and trust are key characteristics of Pakistanis as noted by Muhammad Ali Jinnah, founder and first governor of the state of Pakistan, “Loyalty and devotion lead to bravery. Bravery leads to the spirit of self-sacrifice. The spirit of self-sacrifice creates trust in the power of love.”\textsuperscript{16} However, both internal and external factors influence how a state will develop to satisfy the needs of its people.

The U.S. had abandoned Pakistan in times of great need, and historically when there was no obvious yield for the U.S. there was no support for Pakistan. Distaste for the U.S. had been cultivated and instilled among Pakistani society from abandonment during the Indo-Pak war and later upon draw down of the Cold War. September 11\textsuperscript{th} generated new interest for the U.S. in Pakistan, and U.S. policy offering generous financial contributions with no accountability was an attempt to buy back loyalty lost. Pakistanis rightfully feared that the United States may just use Pakistan, as it did in the 1980s against the Soviet Union, and then walk away once the US mission is over,


establishing a closer military alliance with India and leaving Pakistan in chaos. This fear, along with the lack of need for accountability in the aid supplied by the U.S. opened the door for corruption and mismanagement.

In an effort to allay any potential caution on the part of Pakistan, then Secretary of State Condoleezza Rice stated, "The situation in Pakistan is very complicated, but our strong view is that we have to have a long-term, consistent, predictable relationship with Pakistan, not with any one person, but with the institutions of Pakistan."\(^{17}\)

Misreading the extent of damage to the U.S.’ reputation and the attention required to repair the tarnished relationship in Pakistan was a critical failure of U.S. policy in Pakistan after the September 11 terrorist attacks. The U.S. did not fully trust Pakistan due to its violation of nuclear testing in 1998. Two key characteristics ingrained in Pakistani culture, trust and loyalty would impair internal progress, as Pakistan prioritized self preservation over appeasing U.S. demands for support in the War on Terror.

*Taliban in Pakistan*

U.S. policies in neighboring Afghanistan have driven Al Qaeda and the Taliban into Pakistan's tribal areas. The government of Pakistan turned a blind eye on the reconsolidation and recruitment of the Taliban in the Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA).\(^{18}\) In fact, a collection of documents declassified and released in 2007 clearly


illustrate that the government of Pakistan directly funded, armed and advised the Taliban.\textsuperscript{19} Now Islamabad has acknowledged the domestic complications created by the Taliban movement in Pakistan and is struggling to disengage with Taliban and combat the advances into Pakistan. Pakistan’s Prime Minister, Yousaf Raza Gilani, said the army in the Swat Valley was fighting for "the survival of the country."\textsuperscript{20}

Outside the Swat Valley, Taliban extremists have targeted institutions, religious leaders, police forces and civilians alike, threatening the daily existence of the average Pakistani. Pakistan’s struggle for survival is at a point where extremists are moving in to regions in search of recruits. They’ve moved into communities by embedding different versions of Islam, resulting in these communities accepting them rather than opposing them. Beyond the spread of extreme Islamist ideals, a potential threat from within Pakistan stems from its vulnerable nuclear weapons arsenal.\textsuperscript{21} Although a majority of Pakistanis consider themselves Muslims, they follow a moderate translation, not the Islam being promoted by the minority extremists.

The Taliban’s claimed intent is to restore peace and security in the Pashtun tribal areas straddling Pakistan and Afghanistan, and to aggressively enforce their radical


version of Sharia or Islamic law, challenging the authority of the Pakistani government.\textsuperscript{22} They support Islamic punishments such as public executions of convicted murderers and adulterers and amputations of those found guilty of theft. They unforgivingly execute non-compliant residents applying pressure to villagers to either support them or face death.

Another part of the struggle with Pro-Taliban militants is their enforcement of their social agenda in the Swat valley of Pakistan; in January of 2007 issued a directive to cease education of females in the Swat region.\textsuperscript{23} Taliban guerrillas have destroyed over 170 schools, most of them for girls, and in December 2008, militants warned in a pirated radio broadcast: “All schools for girls should close by January 15, 2009.”\textsuperscript{24} Muslim Khan, a Taliban spokesman, told the Associated Press, “These schools are being run under a system introduced by the British and promote obscenity and vulgarity in society.”\textsuperscript{25}

Taliban style education is initially conducted in Madrassahs where anti-Western and anti-American values are taught. The problem of Madrassahs appears to be

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{22} “BBC NEWS | South Asia | Who are the Taliban?” \textit{BBC NEWS} | News Front Page, South Asia, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/1549285.stm (accessed September 16, 2009).
\end{itemize}
overstated and amplified as the greatest threat in the education system however the Pakistani government estimates claim that approximately 10% of school children attend Madrassahs and that a mere 10% of Madrassahs have links to militant groups.\textsuperscript{26} The long term greater threat is in the masses of uneducated youth that will perpetuate the cycle of illiteracy and fail to contribute to the future economy of the country. The U.S. and Pakistan both have an interest in strengthening the education system in Pakistan to better prepare its citizens for gainful employment in today’s global economy. This shared interest also includes cutting off the teaching of extremists’ militant values that credited for breeding terrorism.\textsuperscript{27}

\textbf{Efforts to Implement Education Reform}

In 1990, delegates from 155 countries including Pakistan agreed at the World Conference on Education for All in Jomtien, Thailand (5-9 March 1990) to universalize primary education and massively reduce illiteracy before the end of the decade, and asserted that everyone has a right to education.\textsuperscript{28} Participating in the 1990 World Conference on Education for All (EFA), it is apparent that representatives of Pakistan understand the value of education and the need for improvement within the national


education system. Several efforts have been made to address the need for Education Sector Reform (ESR) in Pakistan, with little in the means of results or improvement in any category related to enrollment, completion or literacy rates.

Almost every government education plan, starting from independence in 1947 and on through the most recently published plan in 2001 has included universal primary education as a target. Table 4 provides the details of these plans.²⁹ In most of these plans and strategies, the main operational and managerial issues behind how to execute the plans have not been addressed. The government has demonstrated concern for setting the right targets, but has been consistently ineffective in applying the appropriate measures to achieve these targets.

Table 4: Historical Review of Educational Policies and Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POLICY</th>
<th>TARGETS</th>
<th>STRATEGIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1947 Pakistan Education       | Free and Compulsory Education Universal Primary Education (UPE)        | o Free and compulsory  
| Conference                    | within two decades by 1967                                            | o Levying a special tax to finance primary education  
|                               |                                                                        | o Primary School Age Group between 6-11 years  
|                               |                                                                        | o Encourage the private sector to open primary schools                    |
| 1959 National Education       | UPE within a period of 15 years by 1974                                | o Compulsory and Universal Primary Education  
| Commission                    |                                                                        | o Compulsory religious education  
|                               |                                                                        | o Female teachers for primary education  
|                               |                                                                        | o Resource mobilization for additional funds                               |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Policy Description</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>The New Education Policy</td>
<td>- Universal Enrollment up to Class V by 1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Attractive schools to eliminate dropout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Rapid expansion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Emphasis on female enrollment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Female teachers for primary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>The Education Policy</td>
<td>- UPE for boys by 1979, for girls by 1984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Free primary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Priority to rural areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Emphasis on female enrollment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Standardized low cost school building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>National Education Policy</td>
<td>- UPE for boys by 1986-87, for girls by 1992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Rapid expansion of female education, opening of mosque and mohalla schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>efforts to reduce drop-outs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992-2002</td>
<td>National Education Policy</td>
<td>- UPE through community participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100% participation by 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Restructuring the existing education system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Training and recruiting new primary teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Active participation of the community for UPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Special program to retain female students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Provision of special Federal Fund for Primary Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998-2010</td>
<td>National Education Policy</td>
<td>- Enhancing participation rate from 71% to 90% by 2003 and 105% by 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reduction of disparities by 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Opening of 45,000 New Formal Primary Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Revision of service structure of teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Uniform curricula for public and private</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Political will for objective achievements and resource mobilization of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>primary schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Free and Compulsory Primary Education Act shall be enacted and enforced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>in phased manner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Revision of the examination and assessment system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2015</td>
<td>Education for All National Plan of Action</td>
<td>- Gross participation rate at primary level 88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>UPE and universal retention/completion by 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Ensure that by 2015 all children have access to free and compulsory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>primary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>o Eliminate gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and gender equality by 2015 with focus on access to education for girls</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The good intentions of those involved in developing the plans to revamp Pakistan’s education system have failed to improve the literacy rates. The resources and training required have not been applied to these plans. Indicators for literacy, enrollment, and retention depict a dire need for systemic reform. The government’s lack of financial commitment to the plans has created a cynicism amongst the population that questions whether the government really intends to improve the situation. Failure to improve its education system has left many young people unable to contribute to society and worse yet resulted in fodder for extremist recruiters. Pakistan’s internal security is now threatened by its own uneducated population.

*US contributions to education in Pakistan*

Significant external assistance has been provided to education to improve Pakistan’s education system in Pakistan. A variety of major donors such as the Asian Development Bank, the World Bank, the United Nations Children’s Fund, Canada, and the European Union focus on Pakistan’s priority needs as defined in its World Bank-supported national Social Action Plan, which encourages NGO and participation from the private sector in the delivery of social services.31 Australia, Austria, The United

---


Kingdom, Germany, Japan, Norway, Switzerland, Canada, the European Union have also consolidated multi-million dollar contributions to programs aimed at improving the education system in Pakistan.\(^{32}\)

The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) reestablished a permanent presence in Pakistan in 2002 as part of the U.S. Government’s commitment to help Pakistan in the fight on global terrorism. The program is focused on four areas: education, governance, health and economic opportunity. USAID implements most of the U.S. government projects in primary and secondary education.\(^{33}\) According to the U.S. Embassy in Islamabad, USAID has provided more than $250 million since 2002 to reform and revitalize Pakistan’s educational system.\(^{34}\)

\textit{Current U.S. Policy (H.R. 1886 PEACE Act 2009)}

House Resolution 1886, the Pakistan Enduring Assistance and Cooperation Enhancement Act of 2009 which was passed in June of 2009 has outlined an updated approach and renewed commitment to improving education in Pakistan. The Resolution is intended to authorize, “democratic, economic, and social development assistance for Pakistan, to authorize security assistance for Pakistan, and for other purposes.”\(^{35}\)

\begin{itemize}
\item \(^{33}\) Ibid.
\end{itemize}
particular significance, the sponsors recognized that there is a need for a, “balanced, integrated, countrywide strategy that provides assistance throughout Pakistan and does not disproportionately focus on military assistance or one particular area or province.”

The momentum of U.S. policy has progressed necessarily and in Section 101 (purposes of assistance) of the PEACE Act, along with seven additional purposes, the PEACE Act is intended to focus on education stating its purpose to, “strengthen Pakistan’s public education system, increase literacy, expand opportunities for vocational training, and help create an appropriate national curriculum for all schools in Pakistan.” A multitude of relevant objectives are outlined to that end, with the optimistic aspiration of lifting the education system from out of the doldrums into the fast paced, knowledge based global economy.

There are significant challenges in the passage of PEACE Act, none greater than the cooperation of both the population of Pakistan and the Pakistani government. Uniform education is the need of the country and will contribute to security, as determined by U.S. lawmakers; however absorption of this concept must be accepted at the lowest levels of Pakistani society to make progress. The concept of “winning hearts and minds” cannot be overstated as the U.S. attempts to inject itself in a nation that has developed a large entourage of antagonists willing to reject the intrusion of U.S. policy even at the cost of progress. Ashraf Ghani and Clare Lockhart declare in Fixing Failed States, “It is critical to devise ways to empower and enfranchise citizens in decision

making with regard to resources to ensure that they become co-producers of public value."  

Implementation of the new legislation must not be hasty to impose Western ideals, rather to develop an understanding of shared responsibility to resolve the failing education system.

A second challenge of the legislation brought forward through the PEACE Act of 2009 is solidifying the reputation of flittering affection the U.S. has developed in its on-again, off-again alliance with Pakistan. In order to affect the generations that have witnessed U.S. abandonment, it is critical for the U.S. to demonstrate this time an unshakeable coalition that represents understanding of the most basic need of the large population below the poverty line and working to improve their situation rather than that of corrupt government officials that have failed to meet their needs for decades.

In an interview with the Dawn TV and Newspaper, Assistant Secretary, Bureau of South and Central Asian Affairs, Assistant Secretary Robert O. Blake stated, “The United States is very committed to helping Pakistan to address many of its problems; not just security problems…so we see ourselves as friends of Pakistan and working to help the people of Pakistan.” With the intent to apply nation building to reverse the appeal of

---


terrorism and extremism the scars of U.S. abandonment will not heal easily, and the duration of the commitment cannot be understated to be effective.

Instant reform to Pakistan’s flailing education system would be ideal, but it is not realistic or possible. Reforms must be broken down into practical and achievable long-term and short term goals. Funding is important, but the effective utilization of existing funding is critical. Improvements are needed to ensure financial assistance is not wasted through corruption and inefficiency. A shift in the fundamentals of the educational system in Pakistan may not materialize quickly however incremental changes can gain momentum and become substantial movements over time.40 The public, government-run schools, which insufficiently educate the vast majority of children, are where significant reforms and an increase in resources are most needed to reverse the increasing influence of extremist groups and reduce risks of perpetuating internal conflict.

CHAPTER 3
THREE CUPS OF TEA CONCEPT

We build relationships over many, many years with tribal chiefs, with the mullahs, with the imams, with the tribal leaders. And I find pretty much as a whole people really want education.

- Greg Mortenson in an interview with National Public Radio’s Jacki Lyden

Pakistan has consistently ranked among the lowest in the world for expenditure on GDP expenditure on education, historically allocating less than 2% to education.¹ Despite well intended proposals and efforts to implement reform that have been crafted since 1947, Pakistan’s government has not been able to actualize the desired targets of increased literacy and primary level enrollment, nor decrease in drop out rates. These dismal numbers do not reflect the desire for education within the population or efforts of outside donor governments. The government has simply failed to provide the opportunity to the citizens of Pakistan. Many rural locations are being over-run by extremists and many rural locations have received little or no government funding. These locations are where youth are either being forced into followership or turn to extremism as the only resort to provide for their families. Religious extremism flourishes in these remote areas where isolation and conflict are the norm.²

---


spreads, the risk to internal security increases along with the fervor of anti-U.S. sentiment. Consequently, it is imperative to examine alternatives to public education through civil society.

A multitude of experts, advisors and analysts have provided input and developed programs advising how the U.S. should proceed with future U.S./Pakistani relations. Almost without exception the need to improve the education system in Pakistan is highlighted as an immediate necessity. Improvement is achievable but cannot be obtained by trying harder or applying more resources as has been attempted previously, with no specific allocation or accountability. The key to improving both the short-term security inside Pakistan and the long-term security of the U.S. is to develop a different strategy and approach to address Pakistan’s flailing efforts of instilling an education system.

Proposals to reforming public education cover many concepts: charter schools, religious schools, gender equality, parental choice, curriculum, textbook/learning materials policy, provision of missing facilities, merit pay, high-tech teaching, teacher testing, privatization, and a litany of additional reforms. Given the dismal statistics of enrollment and completion since the inception of the nation, it may appear the Pakistanis are content continue the trend of keeping their children home to help farm or care for

---

younger children, or work to contribute to the household income. From the lowest levels of its society, however, the desire to learn is compelling.

**Three Cups of Tea Concept: A Template for Peace**

There is an inspiring example of a grassroots approach to education reform in Pakistan, conveyed by the story’s main character Greg Mortenson a book he co-wrote with David Oliver Relin, *Three Cups of Tea*. In 1993 after a failed attempt to ascend the world’s second highest mountain K2, Greg Mortenson wandered away from his group emaciated and lost, and he found himself in an impoverished Pakistani village called Korphe. The villagers generously nurtured Mr. Mortenson back to health. As he learned more about the village that fostered him, he saw children huddled in the cold using sticks in the dirt for school lessons. He was, “appalled to see eighty two children, seventy-eight boys, and the four girls who had the pluck to join them, kneeling on the frosty ground, in the open. Haji Ali (the village elder), said that the village had no school, and the Pakistani government didn’t provide a teacher.” In return for their generosity and with the intent to fulfill something missing from within himself, Mr. Mortenson made a promise to return and build a school for the village.

---


5 Ibid., 33.
Statistically speaking, the population of Pakistan is generally considered illiterate (49.9%).\(^6\) Beyond the hollow attempts at government reform, there are indications that Pakistanis appreciate the value of education, in fact they long for the opportunity. Haji Ali, the village elder of the Pakistani village Korphe, where Greg Mortenson painstakingly built his first school stated, “I can’t read anything. This is the greatest sadness in my life. I’ll do anything so the children of my village never have to know this feeling. I’ll pay any price so they have the education they deserve.”\(^7\) As is true in many impoverished regions, in Pakistan there exists an inherent human desire to become better and offer something more to the children. Mortenson’s Central Asia Institute has taken the middle men out of the school-building process and is building schools from the grassroots.

Educating girls is a primary focus of the CAI, and Mr. Mortenson highlights the significance of educating girls when he refers to an African proverb, “Educate a boy, and you educate an individual. Educate a girl, and you educate a community.”\(^8\) Once educated, boys usually leave the community to search for work in the cities but girls stay in the community, become leaders and pass on what they've learned. Mr. Mortenson theorizes that in order to really change a culture, empowering women is an essential


When girls are educated Mortenson argues, it decreases infant mortality, decreases overpopulation and lessens the chances young men will join violent jihads. Mr. Mortenson assesses the true enemy, the threat to global security is ignorance, and that is what breeds hatred.

Understanding the stakes has been a significant driving factor in Greg Mortenson’s campaign. Shaukat Ali, a former Kashmiri freedom fighter and Taliban member who now teaches at a school established by Mr. Mortenson’s non-profit organization stated:

If you can’t read, then you must believe what the Imam tells you. If you are only a listener, not a reader, if you cannot read the language, you can get the wrong idea, and this is a misfortune. But slowly, slowly, we can encourage modern education; encourage the people to send boys and girls to school. If we invest, it will come back to us. We have to deal with problems of tradition and culture. But we can stop extremism. If people are educated we can fight against poverty, cruelty and injustice.

Mr. Mortenson’s promise for one school grew into an organization called the CAI, a non-profit organization that has established 130 new schools in remote villages of Pakistan and Afghanistan. CAI’s mission is to promote and support community-based

---


education, especially for girls, in remote regions of Afghanistan and Pakistan, and the philosophy is to empower the local people through their own initiative.  

*Key Elements of Success of Three Cups of Tea Concept*

The great success of CAI stems from a profound understanding of human psychology. Empowering the people through their own initiative is the basis of the “Three Cups of Tea Concept” (TCOT). The TCOT concept allows local residents, parents and civic leaders to design their school systems in a way that makes sense to them. They are empowered by selecting and donating the land, providing the labor and security for the schools, and benefit from watching as their children become educated. The local leaders can choose the range of initiatives to put in place. This possibility develops a great deal of interest, discussion, and citizen involvement. Citizens concerned about improving education have the power to positively affect something in their own communities, instead of waiting for the government to take action or being forced to carry out instructions from the Pakistani government in Islamabad.

The local people are invested in the fruits of their labor. Instead of having outsiders swoop in with money and build fancy institutions and say, “Look what we’ve done for you”, the villagers are the builders, the caretakers and the teachers. The community builds, runs and protects the school. Investing so much of themselves gives

---


them pride in their accomplishment, recognizing their own ability to complete something their own government could not do for them. In his own words, Mortenson states:

> By building relationships, and getting a community to invest its own land and labor, we can construct and maintain a school for a generation that will educate thousands of children for less than twenty thousand dollars. That’s about half what it would cost the government of Pakistan to build the same school, and one-fifth of what the World Bank would spend on the same project.\(^\text{14}\)

Getting the villagers personally invested and putting the fate of their children in their own hands worked. Additionally, the TCOT concept portrays three lessons that must be considered in future investment in Pakistan with the purpose of U.S. security; drink tea, listen to the people, and show respect for the community and culture.\(^\text{15}\) These are the three main points the Commander of U.S. Army Central Command, General David Petraeus gleaned from reading Greg Mortenson’s experiences.\(^\text{16}\) These lessons stem from Mr. Mortenson taking the time to understand the people, their needs, and their culture, and appropriately result in the premise of the Central Asia Institute, “build books not bombs.”\(^\text{17}\)

\(^{14}\) Ibid., 227.


Drink Tea

One of the essential ingredients for Greg Mortenson’s success is his willingness to take the time to gain acceptance from the population he worked so hard to serve. One of the defining conversations relayed in the book is between Korphe’s village elder, Haji Ali and Greg Mortenson:

If you want to thrive in Baltistan, you must respect our ways. The first time you share tea with a Balti, you are a stranger. The second time you take tea, you are an honored guest. The third time you share a cup of tea, you become family, and for our family, we are prepared to do anything, even die. Doctor Greg, you must take time to share three cups of tea. We may be uneducated. But we are not stupid. We have lived and survived here for a long time.  

From fast-paced western perspective, time is money. Cultural etiquette in Pakistan deems that Pakistanis will spend a great deal of time on the ‘getting-to-know-you’ part of relationship building in order to ensure they know and can trust someone. People hang out with their families over tea, chat with friends, exchange news, gossip and jokes. Tea is also a necessary step in the order of business. This etiquette may appear purely social and a waste of time, but relationships take time to grow and must be nurtured in order to move forward with the support of the people. Developing relationships may require several visits, or as Mr. Mortenson discovered, several cups of tea, but it is essential to gain local support for introduction of change, such as building a school where there has never been one. Without Haji Ali’s

---

18 Greg Mortenson and David Oliver Relin, Three Cups of Tea (New York: Viking, 2006), 150.

commitment of support, the school project would not have been achieved. Greg Mortenson learned from the village elder that taking the time to drink tea allowed Haji Ali to evaluate Mr. Mortenson personally, and eventually commit to providing support to build the school for the future education of his village.

In a summary of the World Bank’s support for primary education within Pakistan, it was concluded:

The Bank can be seen to be struggling to come to grips with the complexities of working in Pakistan. First there is the federal structure of government, which often resulted in coordination problems between the federal level and provincial governments. Each province has its own ethnic and cultural mix and different alignments of political parties. The Bank was struggling to learn: (a) What is the right thing to do? (b) What is the right way to do it?  

The Three Cups of Tea concept would suggest: drink tea, listen to the people, and show respect.

*Listen to the People*

One of the most compelling anecdotes from *Three Cups of Tea* was of Haji Ali growing impatient with Mr. Mortenson’s quest to achieve his version of perfectionism in the Korphe school. Mortenson had his mind set on the timeline and the structure, and sticking to *his* plan. Haji Ali advised:

> These mountains have been here a long time, and so have we. You can’t tell the mountains what to do. You must learn to listen to them. So now I am asking you to listen to me…sit down and shut your mouth.

---


Haji Ali gently explained to Mr. Mortenson that the villagers wanted to do it the Pakistani way or better yet, the Korphe way, and to their standards. With the best of intentions of completing the school the way he envisioned, Greg Mortenson stopped and listened to the people, yet another explanation for the his success following the Three Cups of Tea concept.

Credible Pakistani governance and buy-in of the population is absolutely essential to affect change. The education system requires a new strategy that is credible to, and sustainable by Pakistanis. A new educational strategy must be resourced and executed through an integrated government-civilian education campaign that earns the support of the Pakistani people and allows them to develop in their current environment. Consequently, it is imperative to listen to the people, determine their vision of public education to bring about social transformation through grass root mobilization.

*Show Respect*

Cultural values of the majority of Pakistanis are derived from Islam. Since an education system reflects and strengthens social, cultural and moral values, intervention in Pakistan’s educational system must be based on the core values of faith and religion. In his journey related in *Three Cups of Tea*, Greg Mortenson was faced with the challenge of being an American in an area where Americans are generally hated. He did not wander into Korphe waving an American flag, nor did he attempt to Americanize any

---

aspect of the village during his time there. He graciously adapted to the customs, demonstrated when he asked, “Will you show me to pray?” Mortenson asked, impulsively. A local named Abdul asked, “Are you a Muslim?” to which Mortenson responded, “I respect Islam.”

In that moment Greg Mortenson likely did more to win support for his cause than any prior. An infidel by rules of Islam, Mortenson stripped away any hatred or doubt of the motives for his cause and demonstrated respect for the most basic tenet of the Muslim faith. He made a commitment when he promised the people of Korphe that he was going to build a school and he came in prepared to do it respecting the people of Korphe. Pakistan must be respected as a nation, the people and their culture must be respected, and the solution must be a Pakistani solution.

Other Considerations

Credibility

In addition to the three lessons General Petraeus gleaned from Greg Mortenson’s journey in Korphe which are the main ingredients to the TCOT concept, the main focus of educational reform will require establishing a new trust between the government and the citizens of Pakistan. Inside Pakistan there is a lack of credibility for the government’s determination to improve the neglected education system. Criticism stems from the laughable performance of the government in the education sector to date and the bleak settings of many government funded schools.

---

Some reports indicate a number as high as 30,000 educational institutions in the country are non-functional, or more popularly referred to as ghost schools.\textsuperscript{24} Professor Anita Ghulam Ali former Sindh education minister stated, “A ghost school might be a school which is not there, it never was built, and they said ‘oh we've built the school’ and there's actually no school there.”\textsuperscript{25} The funding allocated for the institutions is systematically absorbed for personal use by any individual along the corrupt chain of administrators.

The education of Pakistani citizens has been neglected by their government and they are weary of promises for change based on unkempt promises and corruption visible throughout the current system. The detriment to society as a whole has been greater than the dollar amount whisked away from the system by corrupt officials as the number of unemployable youth grows, and extremist groups continue to offer pay and a higher standard of living for recruits.

Pouring money into the chasm of corruption and unskilled educators has proven ineffectual. While NGOs and foreign governments invest in Pakistan’s education, the Pakistani government itself has failed to recognize investment in education as a key step in changing the downward spiral towards becoming a failed state. The U.S. has a challenge of lack of credibility due to past follies of supporting dictators and bailing out


\textsuperscript{25} Ibid.
when the benefits to the U.S. are no longer obvious, but as Greg Mortenson demonstrated by implementing a program that captures the three main highlights from Three Cups of Tea: drink tea, listen to the people and show respect, successful reforms to the education system are indeed possible from the grassroots level.

**Resources**

Many governments feel the path to security in Pakistan is through spending on the welfare of its youngest citizens.\(^{26}\) Grand scale foreign interest and investment has not positively affected the literacy rates or education system in Pakistan. Even given the unaccounted billions provided by the U.S. since 9/11, expenditure on education in Pakistan did not increase. In fact, former Pakistani President Pervez Musharraf recently admitted that U.S. aid given to Pakistan during his tenure post 9/11 was used to strengthen Pakistan’s defenses against India.\(^{27}\)

Although criticism has mounted for the U.S.’ irresponsible fiscal assistance to Pakistan during the last eight years, a report from the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) indicates that more money does not necessarily yield better results.\(^{28}\) Foreign assistance invested into Pakistan’s education system is a powerful gesture in the effort to eradicate illiteracy, but it is not just a matter of money to...
change the direction of the illiterate nation. Since 2002, USAID’s education program has invested over $682 million (US) to reform and revitalize Pakistan’s education system.\(^{29}\) Greg Mortenson got to the point in his program that he could put up a school that would educate a village for about twelve thousand dollars.\(^{30}\)

**US Reputation**

The U.S. has developed an unfortunate reputation as supporters of dictatorships that withhold funding from the population, further repressing them while benefitting the military and elite members of Pakistan’s corrupt government to the tune of over $12 billion since 2001.\(^{31}\) While the money cannot be entirely accounted for, it is clear to the Pakistani people that they were not the beneficiaries of the aid, and many critics allege that it went into the pockets of politicians and bureaucrats, and that it did not benefit the people.\(^{32}\)

The U.S. has also established a reputation for contributing when there is an immediate benefit to the U.S. and leaving when there is not. Repair to the Pakistani education system will require a long term commitment and dedication to implementation of reforms. After making his promise to Haji Ali that he would come back and build a


school, he followed through. Haji Ali’s granddaughter Jahan remembers it well, “Many climbers make promise to Braldu people and forget them when they find their way home.”

An additional success of the Central Asia Institute is the commitment to follow through on the promise of education in Pakistan. The pace of change is slow. Payback is not immediate, but an educated and more economically vibrant Pakistan would likely be more resistant to extremism. The children being educated now will bring change in their time, 10 or 20 years. There is not a quick fix to establishing an education system from where previously there was none, and schools that were established are poor. Greg Mortenson and the template for peace he informally applied, the Three Cups of Tea concept have resulted in establishment of 130 schools in Afghanistan and Pakistan since 1993. These schools are credited for providing education to over 51,000 students, with an emphasis on education for girls.

The Citizens Foundation Model

At the same time Greg Mortenson was celebrating the opening of the Korphe School, another organization was founded which is dedicated to improving the education system in Pakistan. The Citizens Foundation (TCF) was established in 1995 as a group of

33 Greg Mortenson and David Oliver Relin, Three Cups of Tea (New York: Viking, 2006), 96.


six friends, all entrepreneurs and Chief Executive Officers (CEOs) of their own companies.\textsuperscript{36} The group decided to build five schools in Karachi for disadvantaged children living in urban slums who did not have access to education. Their stated desire was to take children off the streets and put them into schools, which later evolved into providing quality education for the poor. Despite their intentions, a central tenet of TCF is that the institution is owned by the citizens of Pakistan; the founders do not have their names linked to TCF publicly. Today the objective has evolved to create agents of positive change who can perpetuate what TCF has started. Their vision now is rooted in the concept of social justice.\textsuperscript{37}

TCF is credited for establishing a network of 600 purpose built schools within Pakistan with a current enrollment of 80,000 students.\textsuperscript{38} The TCF model follows the format of the TCOT concept, but with a more formalized structure and bigger footprint. The TCF website indicates a vision for 50 years, “To remove barriers of class and privilege to make the citizens of Pakistan agents of positive change.”\textsuperscript{39} TCF’s mission statement is similar to that of the Central Asia Institute:

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{37} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{39} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
Our mission is to support the building of civil society in Pakistan by providing quality education to underprivileged children, promoting gender equality and advocating for reform of public education.  

The values established by TCF reflect those practiced by the Central Asia Institute and are posted as follows:

1. Clear and Focused
   - Competent, efficient, and self driven
   - Strive to make the impossible possible
   - Believe in seeking and developing clarity in everything we do

2. Entrepreneurial, Inquisitive and Inventive
   - Nimble, creative, and smart
   - Challenge the status quo for constant improvement
   - Take action and course-correct, rather than not try

3. Owners, not Participants
   - Passionate and responsible
   - Look for flaws and inefficiencies; empowered to address
   - Feel for TCF's every rupee

4. Respectful, Fair & Just
   - Dislike and shun corporate politics
   - Believe in absolute meritocracy
   - Treat all as would like to be treated

5. Honest Transparent & Trustworthy
   - 100% transparent in 100% of what we do
   - Open, respectful, and status-free communications
   - Begin from position of trust towards others; constantly strive to earn others’ trust

6. Cause greater than us

---

- Put cause before personal gains and results before recognition
- Strive to make all efforts enduring, impactful, and sustainable
- Whole greater than sum of the parts

7. Compassionately Devoted
   - Serve the less privileged with humility and respect
   - Take what we do not as a job, but a goal in life
   - Live the change we want to see in Pakistan

The TCF model in Figure 2 represents features similar to those practiced by Greg Mortenson and the Central Asia Institute. By design, TCF is an established network of businessmen with the desire to contribute to social inequities and provide an avenue for other wealthy people to give with direct impact. The five pronged model is based on resolving one of the most commonly identified reasons Pakistani children do not attend school: there are no schools or schools are too far away. The targeted areas for TCF schools are locations with inadequate or no educational opportunities for local children and are built within short walking distance in urban areas.

Addressing a second concern of many parents of young girls, TCF employs only women teachers. This policy gives comfort to families that their daughters’ honor will be safe while attending school, and also provides job opportunities for educated young women. TCF goes even further providing teachers training and transportation to and from the schools. Locals are employed as guards ensuring community involvement in the schooling process.

---


As is also true with the schools built by the Central Asia Institute, the TCF builds schools in solid buildings with natural light and air, many of which are built to sustain earthquakes in regions where the threat of earthquakes is imminent. TCF also clusters schools as needed to prevent overcrowding classrooms and allows for students to progress from primary to a nearby secondary school using quality text books.

Another common reason cited for keeping children home is the high cost of tuition and supplies at existing schools. TCF has developed a reasonable fee program subsidizing books and uniforms with the expectation that families spend not more than 5% of their monthly income on education.
The Citizens Foundation represents the best features of the Three Cups of Tea concept on a much larger scale, demonstrating the possibility of replicating the model. One significant difference in the operations is the source of funding for each operation. Greg Mortenson steered clear of government funding in order to keep his mission streamlined. Government funding would require bureaucracy, a distraction from his self-driven mission and could potentially threaten the trust Mortenson so carefully earned.
between him and the people he was serving. He set off on his mission to build one school by sending 580 letters to people asking for money to support his cause. Money used to operate the Central Asia Institute is largely contributed by individual donors. Greg Mortenson has maintained the pure design which is one of the defining functions of the success of the Central Asia Institute.

The Citizens Foundation does receive funding from donors but is also a recipient of federal monies. The Congressional Commission on the Prevention of Weapons of Mass Destruction Proliferation and Terrorism selected TCF-USA as a recipient of the proceeds of their published report.\footnote{"WMD Congressional Commission - Press Release," The Citizens Foundation - Home, http://www.tcfusa.org/misc/WMDCommissionTCFUSAPressRelease.htm (accessed October 02, 2009).} The report repeatedly stressed the importance of supporting education and other areas of social development in developing countries like Pakistan, in order to prevent them from becoming fertile grounds for extremism. The Commission identified beyond delivering education, the schools can help foster community links and potentially aid in minimizing the WMD threat. The TCF website does not report threats or destruction to any of its staff or facilities, indicating there may indeed be an avenue for the U.S. Government to facilitate improvements in Pakistan’s education system.

**National Solidarity Program**

A third program with a similar conceptual design to the TCOT concept is a program established in Pakistan’s neighboring state, Afghanistan. The National
Solidarity Program (NSP) was designed and initiated in 2003 under Afghanistan’s Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD) and was funded by a group of international donors. The premise behind the NSP is that in order to ensure legitimacy from the affected population, there must be some programs that allow for the active participation of local populations, which NSP titles Community-Driven Development.\(^{44}\)

The program works by building capacity at the community level to build the competence of both males and females in financial management, technical skills and transparency. Council members are elected to a Community-Driven Council (CDC) that then develops a Community Development Plan based on the needs of the community. The NSP provides grant transfers into local banks which are calculated based on the number of families in the community, at $200 per family up to $60,000.\(^{45}\)

The NSP design was implemented in other countries that were in the process of being reconstructed such as East Timor and Rwanda with varying results. Yama Torabi’s 2007 assessment of the program in Afghanistan cites the failures in these other nations were primarily due to challenges of local customs, institutions and practices (Torabi, 2007). The greatest successes in Afghanistan were due to strong local input in both design and implementation, and Torabi cites an example of Hanif Atmar as the reason for the success of the program in his region, stating:

\(^{44}\) Yama Torabi, Assessing the National Solidarity Program: The Role of Accountability in Reconstruction, report (Integrity Watch Afghanistan, 2007), 7.

Hanif Atmar had accumulated many years of experience in Afghan rural development through his work in NGOs and his own academic background likely played a significant role in the design of the program. He remained sensitive to local voices throughout the implementation process. Most of the NGOs who served as facilitating partners worked in Afghanistan over many years and were committed towards and understanding of the rural populations.46

The so called participatory peace building as an imported idea has experiences different degrees of success and is not a one-size fits all solution. Things went wrong in some regions when the program was designed in a way that it challenged local customs, institutions and practices. The essence of NSP’s community-driven approach is the belief that villagers must take responsibility for their own development in order for the projects to succeed. The councils are elected by secret ballot, and are viewed as the community’s legitimate representatives. Without providing numbers, Co-director of the Brookings Institute’s Center for International Education stated that many of the Afghan councils voted to build schools, and the destruction of NSP schools is significantly lower than the destruction of schools built by NATO.47

The funding for the NSP is provided by fourteen separate nations, the European Union and the World Bank by means of grants and bilateral funds, and the money is distributed through the local banking systems with an estimated $929 million dollars

46 Ibid. 44.

committed through mid-2010.\textsuperscript{48} Table 5 represents the variety and astounding number of projects that have been financed through the NSP in Afghanistan.

Table 5: NSP Projects by Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Total Number of Projects since start of NSP through 22 Sept 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>5,879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Response</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrigation</td>
<td>8,239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livelihood</td>
<td>2,428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power</td>
<td>6,351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Building</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Development</td>
<td>1,456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>11,683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Supply &amp; Sanitation</td>
<td>11,224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Projects</strong></td>
<td><strong>47,416</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NSP MIS Department

The successes of the NSP highlight one of the main lessons Greg Mortenson brings to the forefront of his interactions during the planning and building of his first school in Pakistan: listen to the people. The information posted by NSP does not attribute dollar amounts to donors, but the United States contributions to the NSP are separate from the development projects being funded by the U.S. through NATO, with greater survivability. The National Solidarity Program provides yet another approach to successfully affecting long term education reform inside Pakistan.

The fundamental causes for the weak performance of the education system in Pakistan remain the lack of commitment to education and the lack of implementation of education policies on the part of the Pakistani government. Greg Mortenson and work of the CAI along with the work of The Citizens Foundation and the NSP debunk the theory that the people don’t care and are uninterested in educating their children. Change is necessary for the security of the people of Pakistan, the United States and the global community. New approaches and that serve the interests of the stakeholders will be considered in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 4

NEW DIRECTIONS FOR PAKISTAN’S EDUCATION POLICY

I think the Taliban’s greatest fear is not the bullet but the pen. The real enemy is ignorance. Education should be a top priority.

- Greg Mortenson in an interview for Bozeman Daily Chronicle

The stakes in Pakistan are high, and; the internal threat continues to intensify, leading to a more volatile and unstable situation for those outside the state of Pakistan. Pakistan is a nuclear state and the threat of terrorists obtaining access to those weapons remains a critical element in relations with foreign governments. At the same time terrorist organizations are gaining momentum within the borders, widespread corruption within Pakistan’s government makes it difficult for foreign governments to provide much needed assistance. The state’s failure to provide basic life services and offer economic opportunity contributes to the growth of the terrorist insurgency. The insurgents are struggling to gain acceptance by the people of the state for their claim to political power by providing education and paying otherwise unemployable individuals to join their efforts.¹ Addressing the need for educational reform is a holistic approach to transform Pakistan from a terrorist breeding ground to a contributing member of the global economy.

Who are the Stakeholders

The United States’ national security and global security are at risk if the education system in Pakistan remains unchanged. Terrorism feeds on ignorance. Hatred for western nations is rampant as U.S. foreign policies to date have inadvertently contributed to the desperate plight of the uneducated in Pakistan. U.S. actions, combined with anti-U.S. campaigns have contributed to the hostility and volatility of U.S. and global security. Educating the population is the only antidote for ignorance, and a key step in transforming the future direction of Pakistan as a nation.

The stakeholders are those entities that have a common interest in resolving the security concerns perpetuated by the lack of a quality education system in Pakistan. There are numerous stakeholders that must all be involved in education reform, and absolute buy-in is critical to the success of any effort to change in both the education system in Pakistan and the security of the United States and the global community. The beneficiaries students, parents, teachers, members of the local community, the local economy and work force, the international community, the global economy, U.S./national and global security. In short, the stakes are huge.

The global economy is threatened by uneducated, unemployed, brainwashed individuals setting explosive devices, igniting suicidal explosions and skillfully coordinated attacks in unsuspecting cities. Tourism is threatened as attacks occur in foreign locations that typically attract westerners. Investors spend more money to cover high insurance and additional costs for security in overseas locations, and tighter
immigration laws have restrained the flow of blue collar labor in markets. In a place like Pakistan where political corruption and instability are widespread, foreign investors steer clear. A globalized economy cannot be restricted to certain parts of the world. Creating haves and have-nots increases the level of threat by the uneducated (the have-nots). Educating Pakistan’s society in knowledge-based economic ventures will improve stability and increase the possibilities of foreign investment into Pakistan.

The international community is a relevant stakeholder considering terrorist attacks are not limited to Muslim countries or Arab soil. 9/11 is a perfect example of the capabilities of a small number of people causing atrocious catastrophe regardless of the location. Terrorist attacks in Great Britain, Spain and Southeast Asian nations demonstrate that no location is immune to attacks. Planners of attacks have been found located across the globe and more attacks are anticipated. The international community must commit to education reform in Pakistan, which is a known breeding and training ground for terrorists to prevent continued needless tragedy.

Inside Pakistan, the local economy and work force are first-hand beneficiaries of education reform. Individuals recruited by the insurgency do so as a last resort. Basic human needs cannot be met without a source of income, and an educated populace would result in opportunity to advance. An educated populace can result in resistance to the insurgency from the lowest level. Providing citizens the ability to care for themselves eases the burden of local government. The Pakistani population is a source of leverage for insurgents which can be threatened and manipulated to meet their requirements. As a stakeholder, the local community must determine the needs of the local labor market and
initiate reforms to the education system reflecting those needs. Reforms initiated by citizens and civil society developed at the provincial and local levels lead to autonomy and ownership of the educational system, making them key players in the education reform process.

Teachers, students and parents are stakeholders at the lowest level. Teachers are the forefront of the war against terrorism. They have the ability to provide options through a reformed education system allowing children to learn, achieve, and become productive members of society. Successful teachers encourage their students, and when teachers model acceptance and caring for all children, the students are likely to follow their example. Teachers combined with parents are the most immediate influence on children and are significant stakeholders in education reform.

Pakistan’s existence as a nation is being threatened, and the heart of the threat has developed from the state’s inability to provide for its citizens. The state must improve governance, implement a standardized system and curriculum, provide quality textbooks and learning materials, create an appropriate learning environment and meet the needs of the labor market. A common complaint of students completing matriculation in Pakistan is that their skills are not needed in Pakistan. This leads to either disgruntled unemployed citizens who become targets of terrorist recruitment, or brain drain – departure of educated people from Pakistan seeking employment elsewhere ultimately contributing to the economies of other nations. The departure of educated citizens contributes to the vicious cycle of inept leadership at the top and poor education in Pakistan. The insurgency has developed a training program and ensures recruits and their families are
paid. Where there is no alternative income, terrorism pays. The state must change or risk being overtaken or eliminated by terrorist organizations that threaten internal security.

**Total Overhaul for Pakistan Education Reform**

Given the magnitude of the problems facing the education system in Pakistan, Pakistan’s own National Education Policy of 2009 addressed the need for a “Paradigmatic Shift.” There are impressive private initiatives and NGO-run schools in the country, but Pakistan as a nation is unable to provide basic education to its ever-expanding population that threatens to become a feeding pool for terrorist organizations. Overhauling and implementing an education system that was never successfully created in a nation during a time when an insurgency is tearing the nation apart will be a significant challenge. The enemy must be widely recognized as ignorance, with education reform a critical solution to the survival of the state. The solution cannot be oversimplified by developing a new fiscal solution and hoping for improvements, although management of and expenditure of resources must be addressed.

A significant factor commonly identified as a source of the failing education system in Pakistan is the dismal percentage of the country’s GDP dedicated for expenditure on education, however review of international contributions to education have more than subsidized for this deficiency without producing improvements in literacy rates. Likewise, the experience of World Bank and the failed Social Action Program demonstrate that simply applying more money has proven ineffective.

---

Resources and the management of resources are indeed critical, but improvement in this one critical area will not repair the failing system alone.

*Leadership for the Education System*

The paradigmatic shift the government is seeking must be driven from the top down and executed from the bottom up in order to succeed. As the first step in making this shift, the government must appoint trusted leadership to oversee the program, and decentralize the management of educational system providing local authorities the opportunity to determine how to meet their needs. Ideally, the education administration should be separate from the government entirely. The TCOT and TCF models are succeeding because the people managing the programs trudged and muddled their way through the corruption to achieve the desired end-state of functioning schools as determined by the stakeholders directly involved, the local community and the parents. Although these programs are succeeding in methodically creating a change from the grassroots level, changing the system to educate the masses must include designation of authority at the top in the federal government and at the local community simultaneously. The declaration of the value of education must be backed up by a determined commitment to implement reform where needed, and create systems where there are none. Hence the first steps in reforming the educational system are designating competent government leadership to oversee the program from afar, and simultaneously soliciting representatives from the local communities to design and implement the program at the lowest levels.
The United States is indubitably a stakeholder; however U.S. involvement in appointment of the education delegation must remain discrete. Implementation of a campaign of this magnitude requires appointment of a trusted and influential delegation from within Pakistan or of Pakistani descent. The locally designated education appointees must be methodically selected for their influence within their village. Greg Mortenson assembled a group of village elders to determine where the next schools should be built. The value of education must be widely determined as essential in order to motivate parents to educate their children. A delegation to inspire this change must be emplaced at the government level and simultaneously within the villages as a first step in the paradigmatic change.

Parent/Teacher/Community Organizations

With a new drive to heighten awareness of the value of education, the equivalent of the U.S.-style Parent Teacher Association (PTA) should be created. Parental involvement in education is critical to success for children. These organizations should have the ability to manage and allocate funds to what they deem most essential, whether to build a school, purchase supplies, fund teacher salaries. Parents are vital in improving schools and can create a nurturing environment that would allow children to learn both at home and in the classroom through development of a similar organization. Public meetings and activities can highlight the importance of education and parent involvement in education from the community level. With a PTA or some version in place parents can send their children to school with confidence because they are involved first-hand in the daily activities ongoing at the school. Adjustments can be made to the curriculum or
administration immediately to ensure the school is meeting the needs of the local community and addressing the concerns of parents.

*Construction and Design of Schools*

Developing the physical locations of the schools must be managed at the local level. One of the common reasons determined for non-enrollment or drop-out during analysis was access to schools. Construction location and design of the schools must accommodate the privacy requirements for girls. Parents must feel secure in their decision to send girls to school which requires an environment appropriate for learning. Given the ability to establish the location of the school at the lowest level provides security to parents in their decision to send their children. A standardized list of options for school construction should be made available from the federal level. Among the options should be school designs proven by CAI and/or TCF constructions, but the final decision for the school that is constructed must be achieved at the local level.

*Registration of Schools*

Another change is to require all schools to register and achieve certification from the federal education authority, and there must be an authority in place to enforce this requirement. This standard currently exists however it is not enforced. There are unregistered private schools and Madrassahs that continue to educate young Pakistanis with no repercussion for failing to meet a standard and no inspection of the education being provided by all schools. The certification should qualify the curriculum being offered by the school as meeting minimum education standards which could eventually be used to develop a quality scale for evaluating school performance. As with school
designs, the local education authorities or PTAs should be provided a variety of standards from which to register the school. Not all areas will immediately be equipped to achieve the highest standard but there must be accepted minimum criteria from which to establish a school where there is currently none and there must be benefits and penalties tied to compliance. This reform will streamline the education standards with the objective of educating the masses to an equal but not substandard level.

Curriculum

A core curriculum must be established and taught in all schools through matriculation. This reform is a staple in education policies in Pakistan including the most recent version, National Education Policy 2009. The newest policy precisely delineates a multitude of changes to the curriculum that if actualized has the potential to lead to education of the masses. Some of the main points derived from the policy include reflecting important social issues, sensitivity to fundamental cultural and religious principles and allow creativity at the teacher level. A reasonable selection of books should be made available to support the curriculum in a way that makes choices available at the local level without sacrificing the standardization of curriculum across the board.

Teachers

Another reform must address the widespread discontent with the quality of teachers in the government sector. Teacher education and professional development opportunities must be standardized and made widely available in order to certify teachers.

---

Access to professional resources is essential in progression of teacher’s careers and most importantly improving the level of education they can provide in their environments. Investment must be made in ensuring teachers are educated not only in the subject of their instruction, but in the psychology of the children they are teaching. Complaints of abusive teaching techniques stems both from the hostile environment teachers endure as well as lack of knowledge about how to constructively change behavior. Developing a standardized certification will provide assurance to all stakeholders that the most valuable resource, the student, is being instructed by someone with appropriate qualifications.

**Accessibility for Lower Income Families**

The government must make efforts to provide the opportunity for children from less affluent families to gain admission to schools with reputation for quality education. Low income families are often forced to sacrifice the education of some of their own children to educate others, and boys are typically sent to school leaving the girls home and uneducated. Many families cannot afford to send any of their children. With the appropriate administration, grants or vouchers for low-income children would balance the opportunity inequalities created by fees charged by the private run schools.

**Technical/Vocational Reform beyond the Primary Level**

An effective educational reform strategy is to provide multiple learning pathways focused on skill development past primary level education. Instead of focusing entirely on formal schooling, alternatives such as combining technical training, functional literacy and numeracy, and business skills development can be immediately applied in the work
force and are linked to demands of the local labor markets.\textsuperscript{4} Formal school credentials are often highly valued by youth, however achieving formal education does not always result in productive employment. Investing in vocational schools which can feed graduates directly into the work force would provide the immediate return incentive needed for parents to invest in education for their children.

\textit{Manage Expenditure}

Evaluation of expenditure on public education is required. Federal administration of funds has resulted in an overabundance of ghost schools with payment to ghost teachers, and the education of the children has suffered. An additional result is inflation of the operating cost of the schools. CAI has developed a strategy that consistently expends approximately $12,000 to start a school from the ground to up and running, approximately half the cost paid by the government to run a school. With the help of village elders, Greg Mortenson determined a method to minimize corruption in dealing with individuals at the local level. Together with a unified sense of purpose and a common goal, the local community has the ability to wean out corruption and use designated funding appropriately. Accountability for money designated for educational system reforms will increase the productivity of the resources.

\textit{Security}

Security for both the physical structures of the institutions and the students attending them must be considered necessary reforms, since they are constantly

threatened by the insurgency. Recently, suicide attackers bombed the International Islamic University killing six students and resulting in a nationwide closure of all schools and universities. The Taliban insurgency has destroyed over 150 schools in the SWAT Valley since the beginning of 2008, most of them were for girls. The CAI has determined a working formula, by having the local community take ownership of the entire project. They provide the land for the school, build it and send and protect their children allowing them to learn. Interacting with and involving the people results in a shield from the violence, coercion and corruption. It is not ideal to have a schoolhouse protected by men bearing weapons, but in some cases in Pakistan is necessary at this time to prevent schools from closing. The community that supported the development of the educational institution will protect it.

Community

A general theme in the reforms recommended internally within Pakistan is that they are centered at the community level. The power of the village elder cannot be underestimated. Based on the culture, with the support of the elder the community will work to achieve the goal. The communities have the flexibility to implement their own version of education reform within the guidelines provided by the government. The community must be empowered to identify the developmental needs to feed the local labor markets and be allowed to make adjustments to the curriculum for gender, cultural,

---

religious and other issues that are deemed most important by the communities without sacrificing the overall intent of improving the literacy within the community.

*Education Systems*

Systems are required to ensure implementation and enforcement of the established educational goals. The government must develop a standardized system to establish the minimum basic requirements that will allow students to matriculate and contribute to the nation’s economy, with intent to achieve the goal of Education For All (EFA). An organizational method of communication is necessary between high-level decision makers and teachers to foster discussion from the classroom to the government level which will allow teachers to voice concerns and recommend modifications, and administrators to facilitate implementation. A system to specifically manage resources marked for education is necessary, as distribution and availability of resources is absolutely critical to the new design.

**Way Ahead for the United States in Pakistan Education Reform**

The multitude of reforms previously mentioned, while necessary, must be driven from within Pakistan. Gallup Poll Surveys conducted between 2001-2005 indicate that the majority of Americans surveyed believe the United States should play a ‘major role, but not the leading role’ in trying to solve international problems. Likewise, anti-

---


American sentiment in Pakistan creates a hostile environment for would-be assistance originating from within the U.S. The United States has vested interest in facilitating education reforms where possible. There are potential programs which the U.S. can initiate to pursue new directions for Pakistan’s education system.

Expansion of Private School Opportunities

In the past, the donor community has focused on primary education reform and relied on the Pakistani government to deliver; this model has failed. The United States must take full advantage of programs that are already succeeding to further expand their success. CAI and TCF schools are among them, and there are additional schools with a reputation for producing students into higher education which can be used as models to expand upon. These models have developed a functioning formula that is now producing educated students with all of the aforementioned changes implemented on a small scale.

Greg Mortenson has maintained his distance from U.S. federal funding as it threatens the premise upon which his success has been built – his credibility. Drinking tea, listening and respecting the people are the cornerstone of each one of his schools. Replicating this example and the TCF model can achieve the desired effect.

Study Abroad Programs/Peace Corps Expansion

In order to accomplish this monumental task there are steps the United States can take in the direction of ‘Tea for All’, ultimately EFA. Restructuring of professional teacher training is necessary to improve education planning and delivery of education at

---

the local level. Here, the United States can sponsor an exchange program to administrative and education students. U.S. students can obtain credit towards their baccalaureate level degrees and likewise for the Pakistani students, but the focus of this exchange is to get Pakistani students to participate in the exchanges in the U.S. or another allied country. The students would be placed into primary, secondary, or administrative level positions in the partnering nation and return back to their province or region to implement what they have learned.

Analysis of study abroad programs currently available through internet research reveals a multitude of programs in technical and medical fields, but education programs are scarce. The United States promote educational professional development for teachers by broadening existing study abroad programs and initiating new ones to educate future teachers of Pakistan.

Study abroad for education programs for Pakistani teachers will provide the benefit of exposure to functioning programs and increase the perceived value of education within Pakistan. Offering scholarships or grants to the students will allow them to pursue higher education in their field and return to their community with an enhanced understanding of their profession. Students must be guaranteed a salaried position preferably with their local community upon return from their study abroad. The money to support this exchange program can come from that allocated in the 2009 PEACE Act.

Exposing western students to the education system in Pakistan using study abroad programs will also work to publicize the state of the education system and highlight the
challenges in reforming the system. U.S. exchange students can benefit from the program but the focus must be on educating Pakistani teachers.

Another avenue the U.S. should explore is increasing Peace Corps opportunities inside Pakistan. Thirty-five of the work done by the Peace Corps is focused on education.\(^9\) They do not have a standardized model for their efforts, instead they work with the host government and local community to assess the needs and work accordingly. Based on the current global economy, Peace Corps volunteer applications have risen 15% in the last year. These members can be used to surge in the development of education in rural areas of Pakistan using the Three Cups of Tea model. Although the security risks are high for inserting a Peace Corps mission in Pakistan, the risk in taking no action is greater.

*Expatriate Enlistment*

There is a surplus in manpower in Pakistan which in recent years has led to a steady stream of Pakistanis leaving their homes in search of jobs, training and education in America and Europe.\(^10\) The 2005 American Community Survey conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau revealed over 200,000 Pakistanis reside in the U.S.\(^11\) Over half of this group is in the age group of 25 years and over, and over 50% of that population have accomplished a minimum higher education of a bachelor’s degree. The United States can

---


develop scholarship programs to target children of these families to pursue education as a career field and coordinate entry level positions in communities in Pakistan in need of educated teachers. According to the 2005 survey over twenty thousand individuals of Pakistani descent were enrolled in colleges or universities within the United States. Awarding scholarships to a percentage of these students with a requirement to spend part of their education or initial employment in Pakistan will increase the number and quality of future teachers.

In 2006, Pakistani expatriates remitted over $6 billion US dollars back into Pakistan, or 4% of Pakistan’s GDP.\textsuperscript{12} Economic expert Shahid Burki said that the Pakistan Diaspora in the United States was one of the largest in the world with an annual income equal to 25% of Pakistan’s GDP.\textsuperscript{13} At a recent conference on education, former World Bank Vice President stated that this is, “an enormous resource that could be pressed into the service of education in Pakistan.”\textsuperscript{14} The U.S. cannot direct the flow of individual fiscal decisions; however we can create a tax-deductible forum in which these remittances can be directly applied to education. With the technological advances of the internet, the U.S. can establish education applications that will be directly deposited for use at the local level. For a large number of educated Pakistani/Americans, the technical


\textsuperscript{14} Ibid.
skills they have achieved through their western education cannot be applied to the Pakistani economy, but they value education and are passionate about necessary improvements to the educational system.

One Pakistani immigrant I interviewed, Rahmat Ali is a resident at Yale-New Haven Transplantation Center.\textsuperscript{15} He was educated in Pakistan’s government system until receiving scholarships to pursue medicine. He grew up in the FATA and sees no future for himself in Pakistan as a heart transplant specialist, however his family remains. Rahmat recited the faults of the educational system in Pakistan without hesitation, and hopes for a better future for Pakistan. He passionately insisted that education is the only solution to change the tide of terrorism in Pakistan and argued that focusing on girl’s education was a necessary step. He sends remittances to two of his brothers who have moved to the city to pursue educations as engineers. Rahmat and his family are an example of Pakistani immigrants that can benefit from a tax-deductible remittance program. The schools in his village are currently closed due to the recent Taliban attacks, and many in his area have been destroyed. Money applied directly toward his regional education fund through a tax-free remittance program could allow him and other expatriates to contribute to the educational reform in Pakistan. This system can be established through U.S. banks currently organized to distribute remittances.

\textit{Materiel Resources}

Much has been addressed about the mismanagement of financial resources the donor community has committed to Pakistan education. Rather than simply applying

\textsuperscript{15} Rahmat Ali, ”Education Reform,” telephone interview by author, October 28, 2009.
monetary funds, the United States can contribute by greatly increasing the availability of textbooks and classroom resources. There are currently hundreds of non-profit organizations structured to provide books to under-developed nations’ education systems, none that are set up specifically to provide additional resources to Pakistan. In cooperation with the Pakistani education commission or authority on education, the approved text book list can be made widely available for publishers and distributors. The U.S. can provide tax benefits to companies that support the education reforms in Pakistan. Allocation of education funding towards the acquisition of books and instruments for learning is a step the U.S. can take to improve the Pakistan’s educational system.

The internet allows for endless avenues for the United States to address the physical resources needs of schools in Pakistan. The United States can emulate an on-line Resource Bank as was done in New York City to improve low-income inner city schools.\(^\text{16}\) The Resource Bank allows schools to post a list of shortages or “wish lists” of supplies that were not included in the school budget ranging from art material, office furniture, musical instruments and services. Community members companies search for materials to match the needs of the schools and donate. This concept is one that can be applied to provide a surge in educational supplies that are lacking in Pakistani schools. As with the remittances, the material donation site can be established to direct donations to specific areas within Pakistan, or allow donors to donate items where needed. With

U.S. companies downsizing and companies closing, donation of unwanted materials to Pakistan’s school system with the benefit of a tax deduction could change the face of many schools.

Many of these efforts constitute a small contribution to a colossal problem. The success of both the TCOT and the TCF models make it clear that small steps are steps nonetheless, and over time they are changing the face of education in Pakistan. In addition to the lower level endeavors the U.S. can embark upon to address the failing education system in Pakistan, there are some larger scale efforts that can contribute to the overall administration of education in the nation.

Crisis of Opportunity

According to the Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre, displacement of Pakistanis due to internal conflict is ongoing in several regions within the state, the latest figure accounting for over three million people. An opportunity exists to build upon the already existing refugee locations to develop educational opportunities for the children and families that are encamped there. UNICEF and other aid organizations have realized this opportunity, but here is an avenue the U.S. can exploit by supporting and funding networked NGOs to establish a system within the camps.

Greg Mortenson’s Central Asia Institute acted on a similar opportunity. In Afghan refugee camps in Schamshatoo and Jalozi which are located near Peshawar, Pakistan, CAI set up tent schools and provided teachers for the refugees from 1996 to

When the refugees returned to their homes, CAI trailed them to their villages and established some schools where there were previously none. The U.S. could take steps during the current IDP crisis in Pakistan by recruiting teachers among the camps and establishing classes that can eventually return to their homes and continue with education.

Many fleeing Pakistanis turn to extended families in different communities, referred to as host communities. Host communities rarely have established education centers, and those that do cannot support the influx of refugees. In coordination with the education commission, the U.S. could focus aid toward adding appropriate educational structure to both the refugee camps and the host communities. Table 6 represents the number of primary school aged IDP children in Pakistan that can be targeted for educational reform strategies.

---

Table 6: Primary School Aged IDPs in Pakistan by Accommodation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification of Primary School Aged IDP children by accommodation</th>
<th>First wave of Displacement</th>
<th>Second Wave</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of registered IDP school-aged children</td>
<td>Estimated number of school-aged children reached by Ed Centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In refugee camps</td>
<td>27,404</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In host communities</td>
<td>124,883</td>
<td>4,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>152,287</td>
<td>14,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: United Nations Humanitarian Response Plan Revision as of May 2009

The structure has been created by UNICEF, but the numbers indicate the education centers reaching only a mere percentage of the targeted population. Additional support to programs designed to create educational opportunities amidst the refugee crisis in Pakistan is another alternative method of assistance the U.S. can provide.

**Implementation of Systemic Changes**

One of the most drastic changes required in reforming the education system is the establishment of a trusted education commission or delegation separate from the current system of government designees. There is no room for U.S. involvement in designating these appointments; however the U.S. must contribute to an education commission with stipulations of notable achievement.

---

In a press release on 29 October, Secretary of State announced just such action with the stipulation that these funds will be used for four primary purposes:

1. Expand relationships between Pakistani universities and U.S. institutions through increasing additional academic exchanges

2. Increase university and technical education for students who have been displaced by violence and to those living in vulnerable areas such as southern Punjab and the North West Frontier Province, which serves students from the Federally Administered Tribal Areas

3. Enabling the Higher Education Commission to exempt displaced students from fees, expand opportunities for students to become health professionals, and expand engineering and women’s education

4. Supporting infrastructure upgrades and improved teacher training at both vocational and university institutions

Funding for this contribution has been earmarked from part of the $1 billion pledge made by the United States at the April 2009 Tokyo Donors’ Conference which is separate from the money authorized in the PEACE Act 2009.

The next step for the U.S. in regards to education reform in Pakistan is to establish a robust education task force within the embassy in Islamabad to support the reforms financed by the PEACE Act and the most recent announcement of $45 million for the higher education commission. The United States can assist in the development and execution of reform initiatives and with the fiscal contributions being provided to the education commission in Pakistan and the history of failed attempts, it is in the interest of

---

U.S./Pakistani relations to have both sides involved in planning and accountability of the funds. The U.S. must strengthen regional relations inside Pakistan through official channels to achieve the desired reform results and accomplish the desired effect of the TCOT concept.

Along the lines of accountability and transparency, the U.S. must provide incentives for cooperation and progress in reforming the education system. Pakistan’s 2009 National Education Policy addresses many of the issues that need reform, and with the financial and administrative support of the U.S. there is a chance for actual progress. Incentives must be carefully designed in order to prevent backlash from a society where trust and the U.S. are not often combined in the same sentence. Incentives must be designed specifically to prevent the implication that the U.S. is throwing money into education without ensuring that the education system is fundamentally reformed, and also provide assurance to Pakistani officials that the reforms themselves must be driven from within Pakistan.

The main ingredient the U.S. has failed to achieve in U.S./Pakistani relations is longevity. The multitude of reforms required must be synchronized. The stipulations designated by the U.S. must associate the reforms with long-term strategic agenda of national security for Pakistan and global security, while achieving the balance of education reform and the TCOT lessons learned of listen to the people, show respect and drink tea.

Educational reform in Pakistan has a long history of failure, and the foregoing proposals will suffer a similar fate if not carried out in ways that depart from this negative
historical pattern. These significant challenges to implementation of these reforms will be discussed in the following chapter.
CHAPTER 5

OBSTACLES AND CHALLENGES

And let it be noted that there is no more delicate matter to take in hand, nor more
dangerous to conduct, nor more doubtful in its success, than to set up as the
leader in the introduction of changes. For he who innovates will have for his
enemies all those who are well off under the existing order of things, and only
lukewarm supporters in those who might be better off under the new.¹

-Niccolò Machiavelli

Obstacles and Challenges

The current situation of Pakistan’s education sector is critical. Appraisal of the
education system has revealed a multitude of necessary reforms that could positively
affect future security inside Pakistan and extend to a more secure global community.
Many professionals within Pakistan have identified the weaknesses of the current system
as is highlighted in the 2009 National Education Policy. The U.S. government has
approved the 2009 PEACE Act with specific contingencies related to progressive
education reform in Pakistan. Therefore it is well established on many levels that change
is necessary; however there are obstacles and challenges that must be considered within
Pakistan to institute reform, and also those driven by foreign contributions.

Internal to Pakistan: Challenges and Solutions

The range of problems and possible solutions are numerous. The key challenges
can be categorized into four areas of reform: institutional, financial, curricular, and

---

1992), pg. 13.
security. Policy makers and education leaders have successfully identified a multitude of flaws in the current system. The strategic center of education reform is at the grassroots level where drinking tea, listening to the people and showing respect are key, however systemic reforms are also necessary to change the course of education in Pakistan and the reforms face many challenges.

Institutional reform is a significant challenge partially because there is not currently an institution that appropriately represents the majority of the population, and secondarily because the institution that does exist is greatly flawed. The education system needs to be built from the ground up. Completely reforming an institution presents multiple challenges, mainly that the recipients of the foreign aid will essentially be cut-off from their livelihood and this will likely create tension among these officials, of which there are likely many since corruption is so widespread.

The head of the education institution should be credible and distinguished Pakistanis from within the society. These people must be of the highest ability and integrity, and come from the entire range of stakeholders- the government, the community, parents, educators and NGOs. A feasible solution to meet the standard would be to follow the NSP model holding elections at all levels providing opportunities to people that have previously been left out of managing the educational institution.

Additionally, a concerted effort must be made to design an educational chain of responsibility where one level is responsible for delegating authority and another is responsible for executing institutionalized changes. In doing so, each stakeholder
involved in the newly designed education sector is held accountable for implementation of the reforms.

Financial reforms must address the system’s structural design to contend with inherent corruption. The culture of corruption in the government has been perpetuated by the constant inflowing of foreign aid, which has resulted in officials in high positions siphoning money from the aid to improve their personal situations. In doing so, the rich minority continues the cycle of repressing the poor majority, robbing them of their chance to improve their situations through obtaining education. The history of corruption extends deep making the challenge of generating, managing and investing resources significant.

Transparency has become a catch-phase during the global economic crisis, and is mandatory for success in educational reform. The head of the education system must develop a reporting structure and accountability of education funds must be made accessible to all stakeholders. Raising, distributing, managing and investing monies allocated to Pakistan’s education reform are all absolutely necessary to reduce the distrust of the government among stakeholders and can be accomplished through developing accountability through official reporting.

Another possible solution to the challenge of fiscal accountability is to use local banking institutions to distribute funds to the lowest levels of the education system. This model was successfully used in Mexico and resulted in quick development in regions where opportunities for education had not previously existed.²

Curricular reform is another reform category filled with challenges. The quality of the current curriculum is questionable in some cases and unknown in others. The schools that are not registered in the government system, which are plenty, are also able to manipulate the teachings and in some cases the result is violence. In some cases schools are forced to use whatever can be made available which is not standard. The challenge in streamlining the curriculum is weeding out the political influence of what is being taught.

A feasible solution is to institute an oversight mechanism that would oversee the contents and direction of the curriculum preventing undue influence. Creating a centralized curriculum authority would help in quelling any negative response from conservative and religious segments of society. This authority would be responsible for approving the quality of the curriculum, respects religious and cultural protocol, and is deemed appropriate for the targeted student population. A competent, trusted member of Pakistan’s academia could conduct curriculum review and oversight.

Security is a seemingly insurmountable challenge, for the education institution inside Pakistan is constantly under threat of attack. The insurgency is targeting the schools and the government is incapable of neutralizing these forces because the schools are scattered all across the country, some in extremely remote areas. The insurgency has caused the Education Ministry to completely shut down schools nationwide due to a
standing threat against the schools and recent attacks that resulted in the death of six students.³

In considering the utilization of the military in providing security for schools, Brigadier General Amir Bajwa from the Pakistani Army stated:

The military can be involved in a supporting role but I do not think it would be too keen at this stage to take a lead role partly because of its excessive involvement in (state) security and counter-terrorism tasks. It basically has its hands full and a major effort of this scale involves substantial involvement.⁴

Instead, the challenge of security can be addressed by combining the strategies implemented by the CAI and NSP. Both models enlist the local community as the schools’ best advocates. The communities take complete ownership of the project including providing security when necessary. Interacting with and involving the people results in a shield from the violence, coercion and corruption. It is not ideal to have a schoolhouse protected by men bearing weapons, but in some cases in Pakistan is necessary at this time to prevent schools from closing. The community that supported the development of the educational institution, as demonstrated through CAI’s strategy, will protect it.

United States: Challenges and Solutions

The challenges the U.S. faces in implementing the recommended changes to the education system in Pakistan are enormous and predominantly stem from the inherent

---


mistrust between both governments and the Pakistani population. The U.S. must balance the need to drink tea, listen to the people and show respect with tangible progress in regards to stability of the security situation which in part stems from within Pakistan. The intent of the recommended changes if implemented as proposed is to achieve long term improvement to the internal security of Pakistan as well as improving the security posture of the United States.

Corruption

The trend established in U.S./Pakistani relations appears to have resulted in the U.S. serving as a funding source for corruption in the government. The U.S. and other donors put too much of a burden on the system that did not have the capacity to absorb such large amounts of money. Rather than continuing the trend of pouring money into Pakistan and allowing the government to spend the money with no accountability, the U.S. must determine a technique for supporting the recommended changes and ensuring the funds are used for their intended purpose: education reform.

One possible solution for managing the education resources is to enlist the Pakistani judiciary. The U.S. could recommend that Pakistan designate its Supreme Court Chief Justice Iftikhar Mohammed Chaudhry as the fiscal delegate for funds destined for Pakistan’s educational system. The judiciary detached itself from the corrupt government when the Chief Justice stood against then President Musharraf and the lawyers all marched for his reinstatement, which was eventually granted under great pressure from the population. The Chief Justice is now a very popular figure in Pakistan.
has become a symbol for everything the people of Pakistan aspire to: a modern, democratic society, where everyone including the president is equal before the law.

The legal system is established in Pakistan even where there are no established education facilities. The rural villages have legal channels which are typically channeled through the village elders. Using the same design CAI has succeeded in to build the schools, the villagers determine the location of the school and then they build it. Education of the teachers would be the responsibility of the village, financed by the education system funds facilitated through the legal network. With the precedence set by the Chief Justice as a government official standing up for what is right, the population is likely to support U.S. funding of the education system and it is also likely to succeed.

*Enlistment of Expatriates*

While attempting to expand private school opportunities, care must be taken to ensure the least possible U.S. face is visible initially until the Pakistani people are convinced of the good purpose and intentions of the schools.

One way to accomplish this is to use the models that are succeeding through the efforts of CAI and TCF. An NGO structure established with credible and distinguished individuals from Pakistan’s society to manage the affairs of the school system with U.S. providing the necessary wherewithal. Ideally this structure would allow for Pakistanis to eventually manage and operate the schools without the assistance of the United States however, it must be clear that this is not a short-term endeavor.

Enlisting the assistance of ex-patriots living within the U.S. there is a tender balance between preserving their rights as citizens or residents of the U.S. and pleading
for their involvement in education reform in Pakistan. There cannot be any form of demand placed upon these citizens or residents in the reform efforts.

There can be tax benefits applied to those that contribute. Although some Pakistanis residing in the U.S. may not be employed, the benefit may be applied to remittances that have been designated specifically for a fund set up to receive their monies with the intent of applying it towards education reform. The U.S. can establish accounts by region or district as demand requires, which will ensure the remitted money is applied directly where individual donors instruct.

Current remittances are typically charged as much as 20% from the U.S. into Pakistan through certain money transfer organizations. Banks apply certain fees that reduce the amount that actually reaches the intended recipients. A policy can be established among the federally owned banks, such as Citibank which charges the highest fees of any money transfer organizations listed on World Bank’s Remittance website, to reduce or remove this service charge when remittances are directed for education reform.

Innovations

The concept of expanding on private school opportunities funded by the U.S. presents challenges in implementation. Putting such system into place will require special attention to ensure the U.S. contribution to the effort is low profile, at least until both the government and population are completely convinced that the purpose and intentions of the schools are beneficial. Innovations that promise better results for

---

children could run into opposition if they disrupt routines, responsibilities and power relationships among those in charge of the government-run education system.

As a solution, the U.S. could use the CAI model, utilizing trusted and respected tribal authorities or individuals from within the community to develop the schools. This is an immense task given the broad geographical areas of Pakistan that require schools. While the problem appears quite complex, the tribal authorities that represent the population are sometimes more capable of achieving the goals, even though they have no formal education. Greg Mortenson learned this by taking time to drink tea, listen to the people and show respect with Haj Ali. Having a person that has been accepted by the community in charge of the school is a necessary ingredient for success.

**U.S. Commitment**

Anti-U.S. sentiment in Pakistan continues to increase as the U.S. strategy in Afghanistan has resulted in civilian deaths from the use of armed unmanned aerial vehicles being fired into Pakistan. The greatest challenge among them is indeed the need for the U.S. to establish a long-term relationship of trust and cooperation with Pakistan. There is a sixty-year history of on-again off-again relations between the two nations and the U.S. must be prepared to make a declaration of long-term assistance to Pakistan. The most recent legislation approved by the U.S. government regarding aid to Pakistan, the PEACE Act of 2009, only authorizes appropriation of funds for each of the fiscal years 2010 through 2013.6

---

The U.S. must take efforts to demonstrate the intention of longevity in the relationship with Pakistan, and several steps have been taken in this direction. Lifting the sanctions after 9/11 was a beginning in the effort to reestablish amicable political relations. Approval of the PEACE Act of 2009 makes it clear that there is more work to be done in the category of listening to the people and showing respect, but; Pakistanis criticize the legislation saying the conditions imposed violate Pakistan’s sovereignty. U.S. policies must incorporate the objectives and intentions of the state.

One possible solution is to appoint a Pakistan delegation from the U.S. that has a detailed understanding of the history and the personalities involved. Richard Holbrooke is currently the regional envoy, appointed as the special adviser on Pakistan and Afghanistan. Pakistanis consider it an insult to be bunched in with Afghanistan because even though they’re neighbors, within Pakistan they believe they are very different internally and having a high ranking diplomat assigned just to Pakistan could be a considered a sign of respect.

Conclusion

President John F. Kennedy was quoted as once saying, “Our progress as a nation can be no swifter than our progress in education.”7 Using Pakistan as a case study, what he says here is clearly true. From inception, Pakistan has struggled to define itself as a nation. Struggles at the highest levels to create an identity for the nation resulted in a power-centric government that was focused on anything but education. Sixty two years

7 "John F Kennedy quote- Our progress as a nation can be no swifter than our...from iWise.com," Famous quotes and Inspirational quotes of wisdom! iWise.com, http://www.iwise.com/3PhZJ (accessed November 06, 2009).
later, the nation is exceedingly close to becoming a failed state on the verge of collapse threatened by an insurgency. This same insurgency is considered one of the greatest security threats to the United States. In order for progress to continue in development of the global economy, measures must be taken inside Pakistan to neutralize the insurgency.

A clear link has been identified between education and societal welfare, particularly for girls. Pakistan’s population is exploding and there must be an institutionalized system for providing them the basic human need of education.

A system of government schools, private schools and Madrassahs represent the demand for education among Pakistanis. The weaknesses and failures of the education accumulate to what is a monumental systemic disaster. There are economic, physical, geographical, administrative, teacher and curricular related issues, each with multiple concerns that must be addressed. Enrollment is astoundingly low, and with high drop-out rates the average student that does enroll fails to complete five years of education. The schooling that is provided during the primary years does not provide skills that will contribute to the needs of the economy, therefore creating a pool of frustrated, unemployed youth cheated an opportunity to contribute to the economy.

The education system in Pakistan does have success stories. Somehow Rahmat Ali, a resident of the FATA managed to attend medical school with a residency at the highly reputable Yale-New Haven Heart Transplant Center after working his way through Pakistan’s government system. He is an exception. The majority of the population never makes it past the fifth grade. The education system is infested with corruption and mismanagement.
According to the constitution of Pakistan, education is considered a right of the people, however the government of the state has failed in it’s obligation to provide many basic rights, including education for over sixty-percent of the population.

The Taliban insurgency offers an alternative. They have established a system for recruiting, educating and paying individuals to join the fight against stability in the name of terrorism. Part of the success the Taliban has realized in Pakistan has stemmed from the blatant failures of the U.S. to recognize and address the needs of the population in regards to foreign aid and foreign policy. The insurgents are Muslim extremists, and point to past and present U.S. actions and occupation as evil.

Since 2001 alone, the U.S. has poured over $12 billion dollars into the state of Pakistan. The Pakistani people are aware of this aid but have never realized even the slightest improvement in their lives. The money contributed by the U.S. is essentially unaccounted for and the citizens are angry and assume the corrupt government officials are the only ones that have benefitted from this aid. This creates the right atmosphere for Taliban recruitment: insurgents attack the U.S filling their desire for vengeance, and get paid for doing it, filling their need for livelihood. The security of Pakistan and those that support it are at risk.

The insurgent’s enemy is the corrupt government and those that support it, especially the United States. An exploding population of uneducated, unemployed youth combined with an opportunity to get paid and fight against the perceived evil that is the United States, sets the framework for an explosive future.
The U.S. must adjust its approach to aid in Pakistan. Applying millions of dollars into a corrupt system has overwhelmed the recipients and failed to achieve positive results. Pakistan has consistently contributed among the lowest of all nations outside of Africa to its education system, less than 2% of GDP. Looking at this, an outsider may attempt to resolve the inadequate contribution of the state by supplementing with cash. Several aid organizations, international institutions and nations including the U.S. have applied billions with no improvement in the basic standard of literacy. Lack of funding is only a symptom, the education system in its entirety is the root problem, and it cannot be solved with money alone.

Greg Mortenson applied basic human values in his approach to build a school in a remote area in Pakistan. The odds were stacked against him in many ways; he was broke, he didn’t speak the language, he was American, and he was not a trained businessman, politician or educator. He was passionate and committed, and ultimately succeeded because he took the time to drink tea, listen to the people and show respect.

Mortenson’s Central Asia Institute has successfully built over 130 schools since 1993 and continues using the same philosophy that helped him complete the first project. The Citizens Foundation which is run anonymously by businessmen uses the same model Mortenson developed for CAI and is equally as successfully in its education model. The National Solidarity Program has been functioning in Afghanistan since 2003 and follows the concept of community adoption/acceptance of the project of reforming education. The U.S. can adapt these programs to affect education reform in Pakistan.
Many of the necessary reforms to Pakistan’s education system must be driven from within Pakistan. The structures, programs and people involved all require drastic changes from making schools accessible to providing qualified teachers, every area requires change. For the programs to succeed, Pakistan must overhaul the culture of corruption and abandonment of the education system and invest fully to prevent further decline of the nation.

Efforts to affect reforming the educational system in Pakistan by the United States cannot be apparent, at least as reforms are implemented. Anti-U.S. sentiment in Pakistan could result in disaster as programs with a U.S. signature would likely be targeted for marked for failure, at least until the U.S. can change its reputation.

There are potential avenues for contributing, including expanding upon the successes of the CAI, TCF and NSP and developing private institutions for the government to emulate. Study abroad programs tat are already in place can be expanded to offer scholarships for Pakistani students interested in obtaining higher education to teach. Enlisting expatriates by offering tax incentives or financial relief in remittances could fund reform from the grassroots.

The U.S. must design a new approach to address a broader enemy; ignorance. The complexity of the problem of security cannot be understated. Education is a root problem that can address the issue of security in the long term. Developing solutions for the long-term to address the security problems of both Pakistan and the U.S. can be initiated in education reform. Increasing the ability of the population to contribute to their local economy and ultimately to the knowledge-based global economy by providing
educational opportunities can improve long-term security in the long-term. Education reform must be part of the solution in the fight against terrorism. The security of Pakistan, the United States and the global community are at stake.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Parrott, Sally, and Susie Williams. "Grassroots Education Alliance of Rome (GEAR)." Berry College. Grassroots Education Alliance of Rome (GEAR) (accessed September 28, 2009).


