IMPLODING STATE: PAKISTAN ON THE BRINK OF COLLAPSE

A Thesis
submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
of Georgetown University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of
Master of Arts
in Conflict Resolution

By

Ayela Khan, B.A.H.

Washington, DC
May 01, 2009
**Table of Contents**

Chapter 1: Introduction .........................................................................................1

Chapter 2: States and Failure .............................................................................3

Chapter 3: Civil Blood ..........................................................................................11

Chapter 4: Nationalism Rising ..........................................................................27

Chapter 5: Extremism and the Taliban ...............................................................61

Chapter 6: Conclusion .........................................................................................73

Bibliography .........................................................................................................77
Chapter 1: Introduction

Borne amidst the chaos of Partition, Pakistan has long struggled for legitimacy and often, for its very survival. Created on the basis of a common religion, the state has failed to forge a cohesive national identity which supercedes other, more localized affiliations.¹ A diverse citizenry, contained within hastily demarcated borders, and with little sense of national unity, created conditions where the threats to the fledgling country came not just from without, but also from dissenting groups within.² While it is not impossible to create a nation out of the citizenry, the practices of several illiberal democratic leaders have exacerbated the ethno-religious divides within the country.

Much has been written about the genesis of Pakistan, with analysts employing an Andersonian argument to explain the constructed nature of the state and its subsequent failure to properly integrate its various ethnies.³ This has been used to question the validity of its founding father, Mohammad Ali Jinnah’s Two-Nation theory – which stipulated that Hindus and Muslims constituted inherently separate nations which could not coexist in peace. By questioning the basis of the state’s creation, scholars argue that the Pakistani state has lacked legitimacy from its very inception. The centre’s inability to provide effective governance has allowed socio-political and ideological subsystems to flourish, all of which compete for supreme power.

This paper will assess whether the Pakistan state is a viable entity which shall maintain its territorial integrity in the face of mass internal discord or dissolve. It shall

assess the likelihood of this and consider the lines along which it would be effected with subsections illustrating causality and probability. I shall argue that Pakistan is a failed state, headed towards collapse. The first section shall define the terminology, and assess the necessary and sufficient conditions for state failure. We shall next follow Pakistan’s road to state failure through its lack of popular legitimacy, its various constitutions, changes in leadership, and the secession of its Eastern wing. The final section shall consider the pathways to possible state collapse through an analysis of the major ethnic fault lines - Sindhi, Mohajir, Baloch, Pashtun, and Punjabi – along which the populace is divided. I will show how the rise of ethnic nationalism is intrinsically linked not to primordial conceptions of difference, but rather structural exclusion as propagated by the state. Born of gross economic inequity, both ethno-nationalism and Islamism have taken root in an unprecedented manner. In a society as fractured as Pakistan’s I shall argue that representative democracy is unlikely to offer marginalized minorities the rights they desire, and might in fact push them to secede.

---

4 Carment, "Assessing State Failure: Implications for Theory and Policy." pg. 414
Chapter 2: States and Failure

The passing of the age of Empire, much lamented by scholars such as Gellner, contained a world where the majority of ethnic and religious groups lived under the dictates of a foreign ruler. The colonizers brought with them largely western conceptions of governance, industry and identity. The systems and institutions created by them remained in place long after their one-time empires were fractured. The seemingly modern notion of states and statehood as a manner of socio-political organization is a bequest of colonialism, and one of its more enduring legacies. This section will lay out the conceptual framework and terminology to be used throughout the paper. The notion of state and conditions for state failure and state collapse will be explored. State collapse is essentially concerned with the crumbling of institutions, whilst state failure is defined by the state’s inability or unwillingness to perform key functions. State failure is a far more uncertain concept, requiring a clear understanding of the state’s core functions.

Before assessing failure, it is necessary to determine what exactly a state is and further identify its tasks. At its most basic, a state is a territorially defined entity under the control of a central government. Max Weber defines it as a compulsory organization which holds a monopoly over the legitimate use of physical force as a means of domination within a territory. Authority rests on the legitimation of governance through constitutionalism and law, representative and bureaucratic institutions, and on doctrines

---

6 Clapham, "The Challenge to the State in a Globalized World."Pg. 776
7 Louise Andersen, "International Engagement in Failed States," (Copenhagen: Danish Institute for International Studies, 2005). pg. 10
of sovereignty and popular consent.\textsuperscript{8} Though forming the cornerstone of a viable state,
sovereignty and legitimacy are not static, but must be reaffirmed through regular popular
elections.\textsuperscript{9} Representative of its citizenry, the state is assumed to have the power to
uphold and implement its policies, have resources with which to finance these, and
safeguard the rights and interests of its populace.\textsuperscript{10} The legitimacy gap is the space
between a state’s recognized rights and duties, and its propensity to fulfil the same.\textsuperscript{11}
Zartman’s definition of the state focuses on sovereignty, calling it the source of “identity
and the arena of politics, a tangible organization of decision making and an intangible
symbol of identity.”\textsuperscript{12} In the globalized world of today, where international and supra-
national institutions impinge on individual state sovereignty, Zartman’s definition,
embracing both institutional and ideational readings of statehood, is more appropriate.
It is in keeping with the constructivist argument that state identity is self-created, and
partly articulated in response to exchanges with others. Civil society and its expectations
are, to an extent, informed and determined by this state identity.\textsuperscript{13} Statehood is separate
from nationhood, and though a sense of shared identity is not a necessary component of
statehood, its absence greatly weakens the state, and impedes accountability to its
population.\textsuperscript{14}

\textsuperscript{8} Harry Redner, "Beyond Marx-Weber: A Diversified and International Approach to the State," \textit{Political Studies} 38.4 (1990). Pg. 640
\textsuperscript{9} Ashraf Ghani and Clare Lockhart, \textit{Fixing Failed States} (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008). Pg. 117
\textsuperscript{10} Lockhart, \textit{Fixing Failed States} Pg. 22
\textsuperscript{11} Lockhart, \textit{Fixing Failed States} Pg. 23
\textsuperscript{13} Hendrik Spruyt, "The Origins, Development, and Possible Decline of the Modern State," \textit{Annual Review Political Science} 5 (2002). Pg. 142
\textsuperscript{14} Clapham, "The Challenge to the State in a Globalized World." Pg. 780
Formed by native elites espousing western rhetoric of nationalism and statehood, post-colonial states were formed along essentially alien modes of organization. Michael Ignatieff illustrates how they "won the right of self determination on the cruellest possible terms: they [were] simply left to fend for themselves."  

Structured along neo-patrimonialist lines, these states tend to revolve around a cult of personality to keep disparate populations within artificially constructed boundaries. They have proven both "illusory and substantial… illusory because [they] work in informal and ineffectual ways and have limited capacity to implement public policy; substantial because control of the state is the ultimate prize for political elites."  

Once ensconced in power, elites engage in client-patron relationships, effecting a system of sanctions and rewards to maximize personal gain. This serves to leech resources from the state and leads to a shrinking of the economy. Those denied access to this wealth ultimately resist the venal rulers and challenge the legitimacy of the state. A powerful elite or “state bourgeoisie” which has institutionalized corruption perverts the social contract, destroying the societal structure. State disorder results from the failure of the centre to legitimate systems of labour and political participation and control. 

Political scientists continue to debate the accuracy of the terminology used to describe ill or non-functioning states. The Crisis States Research Centre defines a failed state as a condition of state collapse. When a state cannot perform basic security and 

---

17 Andersen, "International Engagement in Failed States."Pg. 5
18 Clapham, "The Challenge to the State in a Globalized World."Pg. 781
19 Hesselbein, "The Slippery Road: The Imperative for State Formation."
development functions and has lost control over its borders and territory, it is called a
failed state. Within this, however, elements of statehood can remain through local
organizations.\textsuperscript{21} State failure is neither a linear nor a static process. A state is considered
failed if it cannot provide basic amenities such as electricity, health care and education to
its citizenry, when physical infrastructure breaks down, the economy weakens and
violence spirals out of control.\textsuperscript{22} The interconnectedness of these functions means that
the weakening of one adversely affects the others. States can have failed in particular
areas, without necessarily qualifying as collapsed states. They are deemed collapsed
when they lose traditional or charismatic or institutional sources of legitimacy; in other
words, when they can no longer perform the functions required of them to pass as
states.\textsuperscript{23} State collapse results when the state does not fulfil any of its roles: laws are not
made, order not kept, when the state fails to provide symbolic meaning to its populace.
Government falls into a vacuum it has created through its suppression of demand-bearing
groups within civil society.\textsuperscript{24} State collapse invariably involves the breakdown not just of
the governmental structures but also of societal infrastructure.\textsuperscript{25} State collapse differs
from societal collapse, which “is the extended breakdown of social coherence: society as
the generator of institutions of cohesion and maintenance, can no longer create,
aggregate, and articulate the supports and demands that are the foundations of the state.\textsuperscript{26}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{21} Hesselbein, "The Slippery Road: The Imperative for State Formation."
\item \textsuperscript{24} Zartman, ed., \textit{Collapsed States} Pg. 8
\item \textsuperscript{25} Zartman, ed., \textit{Collapsed States} Pg. 7
\item \textsuperscript{26} I. William Zartman, ed., \textit{Collapsed States} (Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc., 1995).Pg. 6
\end{itemize}
Zartman outlines the necessary conditions for collapse, only some of which need be present for state failure. Viewed in this fashion, failure is a stop on the road to collapse, which can be reversed. Dividing states and societies into “soft” and “hard,” Zartman argues that the former are created when civil society has become so accustomed to changing regime types, it cannot withstand collapse. In a hard or brittle state, military regimes are able to hang on to power and prevent state collapse by effectively providing a single function – such as security – whilst counting on the soft civil society to allow it to govern unchallenged. The international community, in its attempts to prevent state collapse, often pushes liberalization and democratization on a populace not ready for it. As Zakaria articulates, however, democracy without constitutional liberalism is “not simply inadequate, but dangerous, bringing with it the erosion of liberty, the abuse of power, ethnic divisions, and even war.”

If the modern state fails to control its territory and monopolize the legitimate use of force, it opens the space for private actors to flourish. Rebels, gangs, ethnic, tribal militias all fill the resultant vacuum. Violence begets further violence as different groups vie for control over the whole. Porous borders in politically unstable neighbourhoods further facilitate violence as non-state actors move fluidly between territories. As the neo-patrimonial state weakens, opposition groups which had been successfully repressed are increasingly able to fight back and challenge the state’s monopoly of the use of

---

27 Zartman, ed., Collapsed States.
30 Mair, "A New Approach: The Need to Focus on Failing States."
Some of the core functions associated with the state may be undertaken by different types of non-state actors - warlords, traditional leaders, religious communities, neighbourhood or community groups etc. – who, amid chaos and bloodshed, provide some form of security and stability, perhaps a rudimentary justice system or access to very basic social services. When the centre loses legitimacy, personal patronage networks take over, forming an important rallying point for politicians and would-be secessionists. These alternate networks rival the authority of the state, as they gain power and legitimacy within the state’s territory by providing protection to certain communities. Traditional power systems are thus able to fill the gap left by absent or poorly enforced state institutions.

States today are expected to manage or mediate the effect of globalization on their domestic political, economic, and cultural arenas. As states become peripheral to the execution of commerce, the international system's need for states is as great as ever. Order and stability rest on the assumption that states will continue to accept this role of intermediary. Aside from the obvious dilemmas posed by states engaged in armed conflict, the resulting refugee flows, ethnic and/or religious violence, and the often escalatory effects of biased outside involvement in a conflict are ill-considered by international powers.

32 Andersen, *International Engagement in Failed States*. Pg. 11
33 Hesselbein, “The Slippery Road; the Imperative for State Formation.”
34 Clapham, “The Challenge to the State in a Globalized World.” Pg. 775
35 David Carment, "Assessing State Failure: Implications for Theory and Policy," Pg. 408
The Fund for Peace’s failed states index ranks Pakistan at number nine, a mere two levels below Afghanistan. The Failed States Index assesses state failure and vulnerability by considering the following:

- **Social Indicators:**
  - Mounting demographic pressures
  - massive movements of refugees or Internally Displaced Persons, creating humanitarian emergencies
  - Group paranoia or group grievance
  - Chronic and sustained human flight

- **Economic Indicators:**
  - Economic development along ethnic lines
  - Sharp/severe economic decline

- **Political Indicators:**
  - Criminalization and/or delegitimization of the state
  - Progressive deterioration of the public services
  - Suspension or arbitrary application of the rule of law, widespread human rights violations
  - Security apparatus performing as a “state within a state”
  - Rise of factionalized elites
  - Intervention of other states or external political actors

These offer a useful guide for considering the Pakistani case. While higher rankings on each of these indicators are necessary conditions for state collapse, inadequacy in some and a breakdown in others are sufficient for a state to qualify as failed. The Pakistani state’s woeful inadequacy in meeting the basic needs of its populace through the provision of education, healthcare and even electricity, has served to undermine mass support for the centre. The failure of its institutions to cope with demand, rampant corruption, and its perceived heavy-handedness in dealing with any form of dissent, has solidified extra-governmental allegiances, further delegitimating the centre. A large refugee population from Afghanistan and those internally displaced to escape violence,

---

combined with a youth bulge facing poor economic prospects, have served to alienate the public from the writ of the centre. In an environment where localized, ethnic or tribal groupings afford security and welfare as opposed to the state, and populations move easily along porous borders, the government is fast losing control over the means of violence and its territorial integrity. The government’s policy of alignment with the US in Afghanistan, and its decision to scale down covert support for militants in Kashmir, has created further tensions, giving rise to unprecedented internal terrorism allegedly carried out by sub-state Islamist actors. With a lack of structural and popular support, and an inability to provide security to its citizens, the centre cannot hold for much longer.

Though the government is unable to effectively quash the myriad insurgencies within its borders, its geo-strategic position and nuclear technology shall arguably attract foreign intervention to prevent state collapse.

The next section details Pakistan’s road to state failure – from its birth, through its various crises of government and the loss of its eastern wing. It will provide a historical overview, focusing on the uneasy relationship between Islam and government as a means to attain legitimacy, whilst analyzing the preconditions leading to its present status as a failed state.

---

38 Mair, "A New Approach: The Need to Focus on Failing States."
Chapter 3: Civil Blood

The unclear definition of Islam and nationalism in the Pakistani context at the time of the independence movement created a situation where identities are in flux. Though founded along secular ideals, Pakistan’s leaders used Islam to garner mass support and create a superordinate identity overriding ethno-linguistic, regional affiliations. The state and ulema, or religious scholars, continue to exist in an uneasy détente, both struggling for the hearts and minds of the polity. Pakistan as envisioned by its founding father, Mohammad Ali Jinnah, also known as Qauid-e-Azam, was non-theocratic and “enshrined democratic institutions, peaceful co-existence, social welfare, respect for human rights, and progress for all, irrespective of their sectarian, lingual, regional or religious affiliations.” Whilst seeking inspiration from Islam, it opted for modernity in its institutions and outlook. However, successive governments – both civilian and military – have since brought Islam into politics, and the bedrooms of the nation.

Nation-building requires reaching ideological consensus and building strong state structures which can supersede or incorporate all other subsystems. Therefore, any ethnic, sectarian or ideological differences must necessarily be integrated into the existing system to form an overarching Pakistani identity. Gellner, who found that Islam was a strong force for creating a cohesive society, shows that it is not antithetical to

---

41 Malik, Islam, Nationalism and the West. Pg. 115
modernism. There remain competing ideologies for nationhood within Pakistan; the landed, business and professional elites all proffer variants of a centrist policy, whilst religious groups find the imposition of sharia or Islamic law to be the best alternative to cultural dependence on alien western models.

The state’s patronage of religious parties and institutions has served to exacerbate the schisms which already exist in Pakistan, giving voice to those seeking an ideological revolt in government. The education system, usually the means by which a unifying nationhood is created, remains similarly fractured, perpetuating division in its unequal distribution of resources. With ineffectual state authority, an ever larger number is turning to smaller kinship groups for support and protection, making ethnic affiliations paramount in the daily life of the citizen.

The failure to develop a Pakistani national identity has meant that ethnic and regional identities remain strong, factors which delegitimize the authority of the centre. Islam has become the main determinant for membership in society, offering a unique identity irrespective of class, ethnicity or language group. Over sixty years after its creation, Pakistan remains, in the words of Rupert Emerson, “not yet [a] nation in being but only … in hope.”

---

44 Malik, Islam, Nationalism and the West. Pg. 114
45 Francois Burgat, Face to Face with Political Islam (London: IB Tauris & Co. Ltd., 2003). Pg. 60
46 Hayes, Politics in Pakistan. Pg. 54
49 Burgat, Face to Face with Political Islam. Pg. 45
50 Rupert Emerson, quoted by Jahan, Pakistan: Failure in National Integration. Pg. 1.
Pakistan’s ethnic pluralism necessitated a democratic, decentralized state structure. Despite its modernist leanings, however, the elites favoured policies aimed at short-term economic and political gain, at the expense of fostering civic nationalism.\(^51\) In its attempt at imposing a top-down Islamicization, the state betrayed a desire not to mould a national identity, but control the citizenry and deny them fundamental rights in the name of religion.\(^52\) The state’s dealings with East Pakistan, now Bengal, are evidence of Islamabad’s attempts to control what it viewed as an inferior group.\(^53\) By empowering the mullahs, however, the state inadvertently encouraged a process of Islamicization from below. Promulgating a sectarian, narrow form of religious affiliation, these mullahs draw support from the grassroots level, and are proving increasingly threatening to state sovereignty.\(^54\)

Globalization and the inevitably western cultural imperialism which accompanies it have created a profound identity crisis in Pakistan as elsewhere. This unrest follows a belief that local, ethnic identities are being forced to change in order to become part of an essentially alien reality.\(^55\) Galtung argued that culture is a power force, providing the symbolic, subjective basis for governing norms. “Cultural domination and the imposition of non-local cultural scripts create collective resentments over the loss of social

\(^{51}\) Malik, Islam, Nationalism and the West. Pg. 121  
\(^{52}\) Malik, Islam, Nationalism and the West. Pg. 130.  
\(^{54}\) Burgat, Face to Face with Political Islam. Pg. 54  
identity…. Cultural heterogeneity is likewise linked to territorial conflicts, with different cultural groups contesting legitimized boundaries constituted during colonial periods."

In outlining his notion of Pakistan, Jinnah articulated the criteria for belonging to the collective: “every one of you, no matter to what community he belongs … no matter what his colour, caste, or creed, is first, second and last a citizen of the State with equal rights, privileges and obligations.”

Ethnic divisions, however, sundered the Quaid’s dream from the start. Despite its overwhelming Muslim majority, Pakistan was intended as a secular state, espousing liberal conceptions of Islam until successive short-sighted leaders, most devastatingly General Zia-ul Haq, fundamentally altered the nature of the state and polity. While Islam had been present in state institutions prior to the General’s tenure as dictator, his quest for legitimacy and desire to clamp down on nationalist movements led to his decision to create and use Islamist groups against their invariably secularist nationalist counterparts.

The empowerment of the Islamist parties to the detriment of ethnic ones served to crystallize opposition to the centre, with the Soviet-Afghan war (1979-89) bringing Islamism to the fore in Pakistani politics. It served to radicalize hitherto scholarly religious educational institutions, and began to attract foreign involvement in Pakistan’s domestic sector. After the war ended, these mujahideen or holy warriors, returned to Pakistan, where their attentions were directed to the simmering conflict in Indian-held Kashmir. Controlling the militarized mujahideen who fight what they believe is God’s war on anyone falling outside the pale of their version of Islam, the ulema have carved

---

57 Ahmed, Jinnah, Pakistan and Islamic Identity, Pg. 175
out an important position in politics. Though they make few electoral gains, chosen leaders continued to bow down to the symbolic strength of an increasingly powerful religious community.\textsuperscript{58}

The role of Islam in Pakistan’s government was debated by its very first Constituent Assembly. Despite their initial denouncement of the Pakistan Movement as antithetical to Islam, the \textit{ulema} seized upon the idea of a nation of Muslims, attempting to mould state institutions around the Islamic-nationalism they had hitherto eschewed. Influenced by the radical Islamist scholar Abul ala Maududi, the \textit{ulema} saw the country as an Islamic state, governed by scholars interpreting Koranic texts, where no single group claimed sovereignty. Secular laws were deemed to be against God’s will, and had no place in this utopian Islamic nation. In the new state, all power rested with God and presumably those subjects who interpreted the divine will.\textsuperscript{59} They consequently demanded a constitution based on the \textit{sharia}, and not civil law. While the liberals in power incorporated Islam into the Constitution, they fell short of changing its inherently liberal nature.\textsuperscript{60} In their attempts to push forth a form of secular Islamic nationalism, the centre ignored the demands of the ethnic groups within.

The creation of One Unit rule in 1955 systematized the emerging ethno-political hierarchy in the country. Ethnically diverse West Pakistan was made into a single political entity, subsuming all other administrative units, with ethnically homogenous Bengal forming the other unit. Despite being the majority, Bengalis were systematically

\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
denied linguistic and political rights.\textsuperscript{61} Their relations with the centre were marked by racism, with the ruling elites viewing them as neither "true Pakistanis nor really pure Muslims. Ayub Khan proffered that East Bengalis had "all the inhibitions of downtrodden races..." The prevalence of such attitudes prevented the centre from considering the Awami League’s "Six point" demands as a suitable mechanism for creating a consociational system.\textsuperscript{62} The creation of the National Awami Party (NAP), a coalition of parties with broad based support, strove for the dissolution of One Unit and the creation of four ethnically defined provinces.\textsuperscript{63} When the country’s first Constitution was adopted in 1956, it acknowledged the \textit{ulema} by calling the new nation the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, and spoke of the important role of Islam, but largely ignored the demands of the ethnic parties.\textsuperscript{64}

The military was more interested in turning Pakistan into an Asian power than in meddling in the ethnic or religious affairs of the citizenry. Field Marshall Ayub Khan’s coup in 1958 continued the secular trends in Pakistani politics. Touted as a means of promoting development through educating and mobilizing the populace, a “Basic Democracies” program was put into effect. It combined popular votes with government appointments for positions in municipal councils.\textsuperscript{65} The NAP, meanwhile, continued to

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\addtolength\itemsep{2pt}
\item Zaheer, \textit{The Separation of East Pakistan}. Pg. 47
\item Zaheer, \textit{The Separation of East Pakistan}. Pg. 97
\item Hayes, \textit{Politics in Pakistan}. Pg. 53
\item Swindler, \textit{"Knights, Not Pawns: Ethno-Nationalism and Regional Dynamics in Post-Colonial Balochistan."}Pg. 55
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
lobby for full provincial autonomy, demanding the centre limit its control to defense, foreign affairs and currency.\textsuperscript{66}

These attempts at political concession were consistently denied as the government chose to overcome the thorny ethnic issue by co-opting a particular variant of Islam to nation-build. The \textit{ulema}, tapping into the countrywide network of mosques and affiliated organizations, could not be ignored entirely. Providing mass education, healthcare and welfare services to the poor, religious groups filled the void left by the government in dealing with its own public. Every leader, regardless of his view of the country, has thus had to pay heed to the religious community. Thus, while Ayub propounded an ideology of modernization and economic development and Bhutto attempted to bring socialism to the masses; both had to placate the \textit{ulema}.\textsuperscript{67}

The elevation and manipulation of Islam in public discourse provided inherently conflictual means of identification and legitimation. Political leaders were only too willing to use Islam to attain their goals. The language of the orthodox \textit{ulema} was incorporated into speeches to attract support, and seek legitimacy. In attempting to win mass support, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto (1971-7) spoke to the citizenry’s duty for Jihad – “when men … have left the path of righteousness, and for those who do and should care, [the] time for Jehad has come…. For this Jehad, we invite the masses … until this land brightens up with the divine light of God.”\textsuperscript{68} Pakistani society, meanwhile, remained

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{66} Swindler, "Knights, Not Pawns: Ethno-Nationalism and Regional Dynamics in Post-Colonial Balochistan." Pg. 56
\item \textsuperscript{67} Hussain, Pakistan: Problems of Governance Pg. 4
\end{itemize}
largely inclusive, people identifying with traditional variants of religious belief. Various factors, however, were to cause a shift in societal attitudes towards religion. T

The secession of Pakistan’s Eastern wing in 1971, and the formation of Bangladesh, led Pakistanis to reconsider their views on Islam and its place in society. Many believed their faltering religiosity had cleaved the country in two. The growth of an educated middle class, and migration of unskilled labour to the Middle East, led to social movement and the exchange of ideas. The new middle classes did not identify with the Westernized, secular elites, the resulting dissonance providing the perfect opportunity for Islamic parties to enter the fray. College campuses were turned into battle grounds as both religious parties and Bhutto’s government rallied the masses to demonstrate their strength.

To assuage the polity, Bhutto undertook to amend the Constitution. Despite his reputation as a secular leader, he set Pakistan on the slippery slope to Islam(ism) and began the slow contravention of Jinnah’s ideas of equal rights for all. The 1973 Constitution declared Islam as the state religion, specifying that only a Muslim could hold the posts of President and Prime Minister. Article 228 created a Council for Islamic Ideology (CII) which was given more power than Ayub had conferred upon it; Article 230 requiring the legislature to reconsider any law deemed unIslamic by this Council. Article 40 included a provision for strengthening relations with other Islamic countries, a

---

69 Yasmeen, "Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam." Pg. 76
70 Yasmeen, "Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam." Pg. 76
move towards the global umma or community of believers, so sought after by religious scholars.\textsuperscript{71}

As Bhutto’s economic policies faltered, and the socialist promises of wealth for the masses failed to materialize, a disillusioned public turned to religious parties. The government failed to assess the mood of the public, until a heavily rigged election in 1977 caused a crisis of legitimacy.\textsuperscript{72} The Pakistan National Alliance (PNA) challenged Bhutto’s claim to power, driving him to find favour with the ulama and CII. In an attempt to curry favour with the Islamic groups, Friday was declared a national holiday, and gambling, horse-racing, alcohol, and nightclubs were banned. Sensing the Prime Minister’s desperation, the PNA refused to accept these changes, thereby creating the conditions for Zia’s coup in 1977.\textsuperscript{73} The centre’s capitulation to Islamist parties to bolster its rule, has vested these groups with undue powers, thereby allowing them to challenge Islamabad’s writ.

Zia saw Islam as the sole unifying factor for Pakistanis, believing that “only the religious tradition could prevent a further unravelling of the political and social fabric.”\textsuperscript{74} His vision for Pakistan was similar to that of the ulama, both wished to see Islam assume a more important and dynamic role in state and society. An alliance between the military and Islamic parties, especially the Jamaat-i-Islami under Mawlana Maududi was thus formed.\textsuperscript{75} The ulama’s desire for ideological change had found a sympathetic ear in the new President. Finding political parties unnecessary and, in fact, detrimental to national

\textsuperscript{71} Lawrence Ziring, Pakistan in the Twentieth Century (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1997). Pg. 395
\textsuperscript{72} Yasmeen, “Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam.” Pg. 76
\textsuperscript{73} Ziring, Pakistan in the Twentieth Century. Pg. 419
\textsuperscript{74} Ziring, Pakistan in the Twentieth Century. Pg. 425
\textsuperscript{75} Yasmeen, “Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam.” Pg. 77
unity, Zia, backed by an ecstatic *ulema*, pushed through a series of laws aimed at ending what they saw as pervasive moral decay. Most of the laws Islamicizing Pakistan were to the detriment of the weaker sections of society, such as women and minorities. Of these, the Hudood Ordinance, promulgated in 1979, had the most serious ramifications for Pakistani women. Dealing with crimes of theft, drunkenness, adultery, rape and bearing false witness, the clauses addressing *zina* (adultery) and *zina bil jabr* (rape) were meant to stem the moral decay of society. Rather than protect women, these Ordinances served to codify a system of oppression and abuse towards them.

The military then turned to minorities within the country. The 1973 Constitution’s allotment of equal citizenship rights to the country’s 3.3% minority population was abrogated. Separate electorates were created for non-Muslims in both national and provincial assemblies, and they were not allowed to vote for Muslim candidates. An amendment to the Pakistan Penal Code (295-C) made blasphemy an offence punishable by death. As the *ulema* tasted power, they began to narrow the definitions of belonging, deeming anyone falling outside their particular interpretation of Islam to be non-Muslim. The *ulema* began to aggressively lobby for the exclusion of groups from the state apparatus, eventually finding members of other Muslim sects, such as the Shias, to be non-Muslim. In 1979, Zia introduced the Shariat Courts which were supposedly meant to supplement and not replace the civil court system. A Federal Shariat Court was established to decide whether existing laws were against Islamic precepts. He further created a *zakat* ordinance, whereby the suggested annual donation

---

76 Ziring, Pakistan in the Twentieth Century, Pg. 445
77 Yasmeen, “Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam.” Pg. 78
was automatically deducted from the bank accounts of Sunni Muslims.\textsuperscript{78} These measures served to legitimize the use of Islamic laws and customs, bringing them in conflict with secular civil law.

By empowering an alternate system of governance, the centre created yet another challenge to its hegemony. The Soviet-Afghan war, bringing with it vast amounts of US military and economic aid, served to change the religious landscape of the country far more quickly and viscerally than any laws could. Thrusting Pakistan into the role of strategic ally, the war proved vastly beneficial to Zia in the short term.\textsuperscript{79} The influx of Afghan refugees was destabilizing for Pakistan, but the military soon turned this to its advantage. In exchange for military and economic aid amounting to nearly 3.2 billion dollars, Zia allowed the US to fund, arm, and train \textit{mujahideen} for its proxy war, on Pakistani soil.\textsuperscript{80} Pakistan’s \textit{madrassahs}, traditionally centres of Islamic study, were the staging ground for this proxy war.\textsuperscript{81}

Through the 1970s, Zia had already implemented a re-reading of history in both state-run school and the \textit{madrassah} sector, advocating jihad in response to perceived insults to the Muslim world.\textsuperscript{82} This proved particularly useful in training militants bound for Afghanistan. Essentially military training camps, these organizations operated under

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{78} Ziring, Pakistan in the Twentieth Century, Pg. 466
\item \textsuperscript{79} Hussain, Pakistan: Problems of Governance, Pg. 5
\item \textsuperscript{80} Hayes, Louis D. Politics in Pakistan, US: Westview Press Inc, 1984. pg. 160
\end{itemize}
the guise of madrassahs to secure the funding and weaponry sent by the U.S.\textsuperscript{83} With the easy availability of funds, weapons and training, Pakistan’s madrassahs, absorbing thousands of Afghan refugees, proliferated.\textsuperscript{84} By supporting the Ahl-e-Hadith schools, which then began to espouse a highly conservative Wahabiism, Saudi Arabia was able to effect an ideological shift in a population that had hitherto ascribed to a fairly secular, liberal and assimilative form of Islam.\textsuperscript{85} In the seminaries of its poor, Iran, funding Shia seminaries, and Saudi Arabia, both battled for the souls of Pakistan’s public. Divided according to sectarian affiliation, madrassahs began to impart a highly exclusionary brand of Islam and identity to their students.\textsuperscript{86} The General’s forceful attempt to structure Pakistani nationalism around Islam created space for sectarian dissent, with not only minority but sectarian communities being identified as the out-group. Hate literature, patronization of madrassahs and support for extremist groups such as the Taliban have contributed to a supra-ethnic and supra-national sectarian conflict. These are linked to a narrow Islamic identity in opposition to a Pakistani identity as articulated by Jinnah.\textsuperscript{87}

The inability of educated ulema to find gainful employ has pushed them to the fringes of mainstream society, causing friction with outgroups varyingly determined by

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{83}] Moniza Khokar, "Reforming Militant Madaris in Pakistan," \textit{Studies in Conflict & Terrorism} 30 (2007). Pg. 356
\item[\textsuperscript{86}] Tariq Rahman, "Denizens of Alien Worlds," \textit{Contemporary South Asia} 13.3 (2004). Pg. 312
\item[\textsuperscript{87}] Malik, \textit{Islam, Nationalism and the West}. Pg. 119
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
class, gender and religious (including sectarian) affiliation. At the margins of society, these groups, when unrecognized, face powerlessness, shame and humiliation. Lacking state institutions through which to articulate dissent, they are ripe for succumbing to the undercurrent of violence bred by irrationalist fears. Since there is no control over one’s destiny, death is celebrated and embraced in an attempt to overcome an empty, thwarted life. Degradation and despair are thus turned into dignity and honour, with terrorism directing anger outwards. Thus, it is state failure to provide a strong, secular education with employable skills that pushes frustrated graduates to extremism.

The madrassahs and mosques, providing their charges with free room, board, and education, jobs in village mosques or madrassahs; also offer welfare services such as healthcare, and have become indispensable to the communities they serve. Recognizing their role in society, successive governments have been loath to take actions alienating the ulema and their support network. Facing the pressures of globalization, individuals entering the sprawling urban centres are confronted with entrenched power structures to which they are denied entry. Fractured and alienated from each other, they turn to the mosque for the articulation of a cohesive identity. Islamicization promises alternatives to secular globalization which has most often left Muslim societies behind. Under economic, political and cultural duress, it proves to be a salient identity marker.

---

90 LeVine, Steve & Zahid Hussain, “Pakistan’s Broad Educational Ills”.
92 Yasmeen, "Pakistan and the Struggle for ‘Real’ Islam."Pg. 82
93 Burgat, Face to Face with Political Islam.Pg. 49
Fundamentalism is a very modern ideology, in a globalized world where identities are fractured and individuals isolated, it provides meaning.94

Continuing the long-standing policy of using religious parties against ethnic and leftist parties who were considered a threat, the military is widely believed to be funding the Islamist Muttahida Majlis Amal (MMA) which is gaining ground in Balochistan and the NWFP. This is part of a larger strategy to weaken the PPP and Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz faction (PML-N) Pakistan’s largest secular political parties.95 The ongoing struggle for Kashmir further illustrates the problematic relationship between the mullahs and military. Militant groups such as Jaish-e-Mohammad (JM), Lashkar-e-Taiba (LeT), and Sipah-e-Sihaba (SS), all based in Pakistan, offer training and arms to insurgents bound for Kashmir. Many of these fought against the Soviets in Afghanistan, and after the war ended, they infiltrated across the line of control to fight the Indian army in Kashmir, becoming a convenient force under the aegis of the Pakistani military’s Inter-Service Intelligence (ISI). While the ISI and madrassahs vehemently deny this link, the government’s complicated relationship with Islamist groups is deeply informed by it. Pakistan has repeatedly been told to disarm militants and wipe out training camps.96 A subsequent section reveals how Pakistan’s failure to do so has exacerbated the crisis of governance faced by the state, as unified Islamist groups work together with a resurgent Taliban to create an ‘Islamic’ society in Pakistan.

94 Langman, Lauren & D. Morris, "The Roots of Terror," Pg. 69.
95 Andrew R. Wilder, "Elections 2002," Pakistan on the Brink, ed. Craig Baxter (Maryland: Lexington Books, 2004).Pg. 113
96 Devin T. Hagerty, "The United States-Pakistan Entente," Pakistan on the Brink, ed. Craig Baxter (Maryland: Lexington Books, 2004).Pg. 10
The US government’s abandonment of its former ally after the end of the Soviet-Afghan war resulted in rising anti-American sentiment, which was exacerbated by the sanctions imposed after Pakistan’s tit-for-tat nuclear tests in May 1998. After 9/11, Pakistan, again led by a military dictator, found itself on the frontline of another US war in Afghanistan. Pakistan’s General in Chief, Pervez Musharraf was placed in the unenviable position of either changing the government’s policy regarding militant groups, or facing the ire of a wounded and angry superpower. While he not have much of a choice regarding his alliance in the US ‘War on Terror,’ Musharraf was reviled at home for abandoning his Muslim brethren. Moves towards reaching a settlement with India over the Kashmir issue were also met with anger and a sense of betrayal by the youths produced by militant madrassahs. To these youths raised to believe in the ascendancy of Islam, any alliances against Muslims were viewed as unholy and illegitimate. Muslims have long held two sets of identity- one derived from their immediate social and geographical surroundings, and the other through the historical, ideological, and cultural ties linking Muslims across the globe. The concept of the umma, providing an overarching identity and purpose, resonates with disaffected sections of society, and is a potent rallying force for groups wishing to challenge a state identifying with geo-political rather than cultural boundaries.

The state’s inability to incorporate dissatisfied elements into the polity, and its failure to articulate an overarching Pakistani identity, have caused the present identity

---

97 Hagerty, "The United States-Pakistan Entente." Pg. 7.
98 Hagerty, "The United States-Pakistan Entente." Pg. 7
99 Ahmed, "Islam, Politics and the State." Pg. 11
crisis. Short-term policies by essentially authoritarian leaders – irrespective of the manner in which they came to power – have led to further disillusionment amongst the public. Articulating a demonized Other, Pakistan’s elites, both spiritual and temporal, have systematized division. Rather than unifying the polity under the banner of Islam, the state, through its grossly inadequate public education and services sector, and its shocking inability to engender social and economic mobility, has served to create further divisions in an already fractured society. Islam, long the rallying cry for Pakistanis of all ethnic backgrounds to unite, remains an imperfect glue to hold its disparate populace together.¹⁰⁰

¹⁰⁰ Malik, "Pakistan: Terror War Bolsters Islamism, Nationhood."
Chapter 4: Nationalism Rising

Pakistan’s current identity woes stem from the policies espoused by its leaders since the very inception of the state. Rather than viewing the nation as a community of citizens sharing common rights and unified by an allegiance to a common set of political values and practices, the Pakistani state contains a multitude of peoples who continue to pledge allegiance to their ethnic or tribal communities.\textsuperscript{101} Provincial boundaries are coterminous with the major ethnic groups in the country – Sindh, Balochistan, and the North West Frontier Provinces (NWFP) – with Punjab at the eco-political heart of the state.\textsuperscript{102} Inter-provincial relations have been marked by the country’s tradition of authoritarian leaders, chronic poverty, ethnic heterogeneity from non-migrant groups, and asymmetric power relations.\textsuperscript{103} Pakistan fulfils Zartman’s criteria of a hard state, with the military being called in to maintain order and provide security. Insurgent groups in Sindh, Balochistan, FATA, NWFP and the burgeoning violence in Punjab show how the military’s inability or unwillingness to fulfil its traditional role can lead to confusion and disarray. It has relegated many of the border regions ungovernable, with private ethno-religious actors openly defying the state’s hegemony.

In this section, we will look at the ethnic discord which has marked much of Pakistan’s history. Years of neglect by the centre have led to a strengthening of regional identities, spurring nationalist revivals in Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP; who have all, at one time or another, sought autonomy if not outright independence. These movements,

\textsuperscript{101} Ignatieff, Blood and Belonging Pg. 6
\textsuperscript{102} Daniel Consolatore, "The Trouble with Pakistan," The Humanist 68.2 (2008).
\textsuperscript{103} Montiel, "Peace Psychology in Asia."Pg. 197
by their very existence illustrate the legitimacy gap between the centre and periphery. Cristina Montiel writes how “subtle, yet powerful distress, seeps into the psychological structures of civilian communities that have lived under protracted-war conditions for decades.”¹⁰⁴ Ethnic movements in the provinces we will examine are coloured by the trauma of Partition, governed by structural violence against ethnic minorities, political repression and economic exploitation.¹⁰⁵ Instrumentalists argue that identity mobilization is a “social and political construction… of elites, who draw upon, distort, and sometimes fabricate materials from the cultures of the groups they wish to represent in order to … gain political and economic advantage.”¹⁰⁶

Through a study of movements in Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP, we shall consider the emotive power of ethnicity, its resilience in the face of governmental neglect and abuse, and its ability to adapt to changing eco-political situations. The section will be subdivided according to the major ethnic fault lines along which Pakistan may potentially fracture. We will examine discord in Sindh, followed by the widening insurgency in Balochistan, before touching upon the Pashtun question. The relationship of each of these groups with the centre in Punjab shall be considered before turning to the growing threat of Islamist groups, specifically the Taliban within Pakistan.

Pakistan remains the arena where the forces of Muslim nationalism, regional particularism and ethnic pluralism conflict for the hearts and minds of the Pakistani

¹⁰⁴ Montiel, "Peace Psychology in Asia."Pg. 206
¹⁰⁵ Montiel, "Peace Psychology in Asia."Pg. 196
Localized identities remained paramount at the time of Partition, a factor which translated into continued regionalism. Rather than redefining administrative divisions to reflect the realities of the new state, the new state maintained the socio-political structures of the Raj. The delineation of Pakistan into four ethnically defined provinces, federally administered tribal areas (FATA), and the separate administrative units making up Pakistan-controlled Jammu and Kashmir (Azad Kashmir and the Northern Areas), were indicative of the state’s centrist policies.

Along with Islam, the dominant politicians within the Muslim League used language in pursuit of their state-building agenda. Power was concentrated amongst a small coterie of ethnically defined elites who promoted Urdu at the expense of other regional languages; a factor which served to strengthen rather than dissolve ethnic identity. Carol Lewin argues that separatist ethnic nationalism develops in response to the largely empty promises of liberal nationalism. Ethnic consciousness does not occur in a vacuum, “but in the immediacy of social interaction and within the contexts shaped by a myriad of external political and economic forces.” Migration, urbanization, arcane communication structures, a weak civil sector and the monopolization of scarce resources by defence, have disallowed any real integration with the centre.

The centre’s weakness and inability to launch the necessary economic, judicial and military reforms led to the greater assertiveness of landed elites and other local power

---

108 Zaheer, The Separation of East Pakistan, Pg. 47
109 Zaheer, The Separation of East Pakistan, Pg. 47
111 Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan." Pg. 686
systems. Competition between the various governments has led to a devolution of power to ethnic groupings.\textsuperscript{112} The state’s preference for force rather than dialogue when dealing with internal dissent, has hardened the stance of multiple ethnic groups within the polity, who increasingly use violence in their attempts to wrest control from the dominant group.\textsuperscript{113} As the cases of Sindh, Balochistan, and NWFP show, demands for provincial autonomy are part of an ethnic elite strategy to protect themselves from the vagaries of politics, approaches with invariably result from the barring of these groups from the political process.\textsuperscript{114}

**Sindh**

At the southern tip of Pakistan, with an area of 140,914 square kilometres, the province of Sindh has a border contiguous with India. Initially part of the same administrative unit as Bombay, in 1936 Sindh, by dint of its socio-linguistic heritage, was deemed worthy of full provincial status within the British Raj. Sindhi was made the official language of administration, the judiciary, and was the medium of instruction in state-run schools. By the time of Partition, Sindhi had thereby become the dominant language in the province.\textsuperscript{115} The transfer of vast numbers of socio-linguistic groups brought on by Partition challenged the hegemony of Sindhi in the province, causing tensions between the natives and immigrants from India. As the overarching identity marker for varying groups of Sindhis, language subsequently assumed primary

\textsuperscript{112} Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization." Pg. 181
\textsuperscript{113} Carment, "Assessing State Failure: Implications for Theory and Policy." Pg. 415
importance in nationalist discourse, especially when faced with the threats posed by other linguistic groups.

Absorbing large numbers of refugees from India, the local populace of Sindh had to cope with a drastically altered socio-economic and political landscape. Instrumental in the creation of the new state, and voluntarily uprooted from their homesteads, these mohajirs, as the Muslim refugees from India came to be known, assumed economic and political control in Pakistan. With an agricultural based economy and little industry, Sindhis were unable to compete with the immigrants, who brought to the new state a capitalist ethos. Ethnically diverse, the mohajirs brought with them the urbane and sophisticated culture of India’s great cities, which they viewed as intrinsically superior to that of the Sindhis. With Urdu as a symbol of this High Culture, the mohajirs, greatly overrepresented in the machinery of state, sought to effect a top-down re-culturation of the newly Pakistani polity; and soon came to dominate the Low culture of Sindh.

Changing language policies saw the use of Sindhi in education and the public sector diminish, with the promotion of Urdu leading to a visible reduction in the number of Sindhi language schools Believing their language and hence socio-economic advancement to be besieged by the more dominant Urdu, nationalists in the province rallied behind a linguistically defined sense of nationhood. Under the stewardship of Ayub Khan (1958-69), a large number of civil servants and military officers were given

---

117 Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement." Pg. 1009
land grants in Sindh. The fact that they were Punjabi, and displaced locals from the land by bringing in a Punjabi workforce, built further resentment against a distant central government.\textsuperscript{120}

Though predominant in the rural areas, Sindhis became a minority in the urban centres, a fact which the the burgeoning Sindhi nationalist movement used to great effect by casting “sons of the soil” as foreigners in their own cities. The rapid growth of Karachi and Hyderabad, Sindh’s largest cities, attracted rural migrants from other parts of Pakistan, including refugees from other countries. The induction of large numbers of Pashtuns and Punjabis, as well as the more settled mohajir populace, continued to alter the local demographic structure.\textsuperscript{121} The population infusion led to increased competition for scarce resources – housing, education, social services and employment – creating ethnically defined neighbourhoods in Karachi and Hyderabad.\textsuperscript{122} Language riots in 1957-8, sparked by the University of Karachi’s refusal to allow students to answer exam questions in Sindhi, took on wider significance as symbolic of the wider cultural, educational, economic and political deprivation of this group.\textsuperscript{123} Ethno-regional actors try to maximize representation in the civil bureaucracy, military and business elite, since these are perceived to run the state.\textsuperscript{124} Ethnic politics in the province are complicated by the different meanings of belonging. Whilst Sindhi-speaking locals view themselves as

\textsuperscript{120} Zaidi, "Sindhi Vs Mohajir in Pakistan."Pg. 1296
\textsuperscript{122} Ahmar, "Ethnicity and State Power in Pakistan: The Karachi Crisis."Pg. 1040
\textsuperscript{123} Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."Pg. 1009
\textsuperscript{124} Kennedy, "The Politics of Ethnicity in Sindh."Pg. 941
true natives, the mohajirs also view the province as their own, sharing many grievances against perceived Punjabi dominance.\textsuperscript{125}

Islamabad’s reliance on military structures to deal with Sindh’s oft fractious politics has resulted in further alienation of the urban Sindhi populace.\textsuperscript{126} The dominant culture further solidified structural economic violence.\textsuperscript{127} The centre’s use of ethnic preference in bureaucratic employment, education, and entry into the military, have only solidified perceptions of marginalization at the periphery. Introduced to address regional socio-economic grievances, the quota system stipulated that 20% of vacancies in the public sector and education were to be filled on merit. The remaining 80% were allotted according to ethnicity.\textsuperscript{128} Viewed as benefitting the most from this system, most ethnic groups resent the Punjabi dominated eco-political elite, perceiving them as completely removed from the rest of the country.\textsuperscript{129}

Sindhi nationalism took a while to be articulated precisely because it lacked a charismatic leadership to organize and lead the struggle.\textsuperscript{130} Ghulam Mustapha Syed, inspired by Sheikh Mujeeb’s rhetoric in East Pakistan, popularized Sindhi nationalism with his Jeay Sindh Mahaz (JSM). Casting Sindhis as victims of “Punjabi-Mohajir imperialism,” Syed’s JSM contested the 1970 elections on a platform of provincial autonomy and the dissolution of the One-Unit rule which had relegated Sindhi involvement in provincial politics to the backwater. Their demands were, however,

\textsuperscript{125} Ahmar, "Ethnicity and State Power in Pakistan: The Karachi Crisis."Pg. 1036
\textsuperscript{126} Ahmar, "Ethnicity and State Power in Pakistan: The Karachi Crisis."Pg. 1035
\textsuperscript{127} Montiel, "Peace Psychology in Asia."Pg. 206
\textsuperscript{128} Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."Pg. 1012
\textsuperscript{129} Smith, "Profiling the Politically Violent in Pakistan: Self-Construals and Values."Pg. 283
\textsuperscript{130} Zaidi, "Sindhi Vs Mohajir in Pakistan."Pg. 1297
eclipsed by the crisis unfolding in East Pakistan, which attained independence shortly after.\(^{131}\)

The 1970 elections provided some gratification for the Sindhi public. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, scion of the Bhutto dynasty and founder of the Pakistan People’s Party’s (PPP), was instrumental in rousing Sindhi consciousness and gaining mass cross-country support.\(^{132}\) Restoring Sindhi as the official language of the province, the PPP co-opted the support base of the JSM. Syed’s demands, however, included sending the Mohajirs back to India, a factor which, combined with Islamabad’s vacillating language policies, led to violence in 1972. The introduction of the 1972 Sindh Bill, which mandated the compulsory teaching of Sindhi for certain grade levels, caused the Urdu daily *Jang* (War) to decry the “death of Urdu,” a dramatic stance which reflected emotion in the province which was soon engulfed by violent clashes amongst the language groups.\(^{133}\) The JSM continued to agitate for maximum provincial autonomy, arguing the centre should only have control over defence and foreign affairs. Lobbying for an increase in the quota for Sindh, he further demanded the expulsion of all non-Sindhis from lands they had received under Ayub Khan. It was only after his imprisonment in 1973 that Syed began to call for outright secession from Pakistan.\(^{134}\)

Z.A. Bhutto’s overthrow and execution brought to the fore new strands of Sindhi nationalism. Syed continued to demand secession and the creation of an independent Sindudesh. The autonomists, which included the Sindhi-Baloch-Pakhtun Front headed

\(^{131}\) Kennedy, "The Politics of Ethnicity in Sindh."Pg. 943
\(^{132}\) Zaidi, "Sindhi Vs Mohajir in Pakistan."Pg. 1297
\(^{133}\) Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."Pg. 1014
\(^{134}\) Kennedy, "The Politics of Ethnicity in Sindh."Pg. 944
by Mumtaz Bhutto, advocated devolution of authority to the Sindh Government. Finally, the gradualists, led by the PPP and Benazir Bhutto, focussed on ending martial law and restoring the 1973 constitution. By finding a common goal – ending Zia-ul-Haq’s rule – the three nationalist groups were able to work together to achieve that end. Disturbances by the Movement for the Restoration for Democracy (MRD) forced Zia to appoint Sindhis to his various councils, and select Muhammad Khan Junejo - a Sindhi - as prime minister after martial law was lifted in 1985.\textsuperscript{135} It was, however, too little too late to stem the tide of ethnic nationalism with the country.

Bhutto’s nationalizing policies and Zia’s addition of ethnic preferences in military recruitment led to waning mohajir dominance over the state and industry. Fearing Sindhi domination, the MQM clamoured for Karachi to be made a separate province.\textsuperscript{136} Hitherto loyal supporters of a Pakistani nationhood, these Mohajirs began to articulate a unique identity within the polity, rallying around the Mohajir Qaumi Movement (MQM) [Refugee National Movement].\textsuperscript{137} This party fulfilled a fundamental need for belonging to the disenfranchised youth of Mohajir descent and enjoyed widespread support amongst students.\textsuperscript{138}

The site of internecine warfare throughout the mid-1990s, Karachi witnessed increased ethnic and sectarian polarization as Sindhis, MQM loyalists, and Pashtuns struggled for dominance in the provincial capital. Iftikhar Malik’s rather dramatic statement, that “Karachi bled while the country needed a new Jinnah to steer it toward a

\textsuperscript{135} Kennedy, "The Politics of Ethnicity in Sindh."Pg. 947
\textsuperscript{136} Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."Pg. 1012
\textsuperscript{137} Zaidi, "Sindhi Vs Mohajir in Pakistan."Pg. 1296
\textsuperscript{138} Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."Pg. 1015
new consensus," speaks to the failure of the centre to evolve systems whereby dissent could be articulated without the resort to violence. The state’s highly centralized structure and lack of proper channels to articulate dissent have led to violence becoming a routine means of lobbying for change. Ethnic politics in Sindh, particularly in the rural areas, are characterized by its hierarchical tribal structure, with political dissent often appearing indistinguishable from common criminality in the cities.

The use of violent strategies for political expression is commensurate with the culture of violence that has developed in the region. It allows proponents to fit into a subculture of resistance when norms of fitting in through employment or usual political avenues of dissent have been blocked. As the case of Sindh and more recently, other provinces show, civilian governments have developed a dependency on the military, frequently sending it to restore order. Ethnicity is “adaptive in face of changing circumstances and serves as a tool in furthering the interests of political leaders and their constituencies.” The case of Sindh illustrates this fluidity of identity markers; as ethnically diverse mohajirs constructed entirely new parameters of belonging in order to represent their eco-social and political interests. By recasting mohajir as a separate ethnie native to Sindh, this group has come to co-exist with ethnic Sindhis. Both peoples are fully vested in the province which, for most mohajir, is also the only home either of them have known.

---

139 Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan." Pg. 686
140 Smith, "Profiling the Politically Violent in Pakistan: Self-Construals and Values."Pg. 284
141 Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan."Pg. 687
142 Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization."Pg. 172
The nationalist movement in Sindh has been marked by large periods of malaise and bouts of frenetic activity, when political opportunists articulated the very real grievances of the public to demand a change in economic and linguistic policies in the province. Home to the ethnic mosaic that is Karachi, the port city which is the commercial heart of the country, and currently headed by the PPP in coalition with the MQM, Sindh is unlikely to break away from the republic and form a Sindudesh. An independent Sindh would be unlikely to remain so for long. Access to warm water ports, which have long motivated landlocked powers to wage war, would serve as factor in absorbing the region into either India or in tandem with Balochistan.

The factionalized nature of the polity within the province would necessitate a careful balance of power-sharing amongst the various ethnic groups which call Sindh home. As experience in Pakistan has shown, striking the right balance is exceedingly difficult. Aside from political entrepreneurs who seek only to maximize personal or tribal gains, international and non-state actors could well turn a Sindudesh into the arena where they compete for regional supremacy. China’s quest for economic expansion could lead it to seek access to the Indian Ocean, whilst India may well attempt to absorb it to bolster its internal security and provide a counterweight to China. Add roving ideological warriors into the mix, and an independent Sindh could potentially be sucked into a vortex of violence.

The probability of an independent Sindh, however, is very low. Mumtaz Bhutto, a co-founder of the PPP and now head of the Sindh National Front (SNF), argues that “there is not enough nationalist sentiment to taken the masses to the assemblies or make
huge impressions in a show of public support. The people of Sindh are very laid back, there is a history of submission to whoever comes along...''143 Dissent continues to be displayed through criminal violence rather than organized rallying by the public. With a localized presence in the popular media, Sindhi national sentiment remains largely confined to a minority within the country. Mumtaz Bhutto argues that the Sindhi cause has not garnered as much attention as the Baloch one, largely because of the corruption of the local language media, which ”supports government of the day rather than fostering journalistic integrity.”144

Though Sindh’s largest cities were rent by ethnic and sectarian strife through much of the 1980s and 1990s, they involved many different players with conflicting goals – a fact which prevented a cohesive challenge to the centre. The Pakistani political system revolves around client-patron relationships rather than institutions. As the Sindh nationalist movement shows, and the Baloch insurgency further reveal, despite their avowed ethnic nature, political and social upheavals have been greatly influenced by economic considerations.145 These concerns could be assuaged by a centre responsive to the needs of the people.

143 Mumtaz Bhutto, interview 24th April 2009
144 Mumtaz Bhutto, interview.
145 Carment, ”Assessing State Failure: Implications for Theory and Policy.” Pg. 412
Balochistan

The state’s failure to develop an overarching Pakistani identity which subsumes regional affiliations has meant that ethnic and regional identities remain strong.\textsuperscript{146} Little binds Pakistanis to each other and the state, without an interweaving of social groupings, individuals cannot satisfactorily interact with the state.\textsuperscript{147} Deprived of access to education and resources, an ever larger number is turning to smaller kinship groups for support and protection.\textsuperscript{148} An internet presence allows Baloch dissidents to air their grievances to a wider audience, and gain the legitimacy denied them within Pakistan. The declaration of a “Government of Balochistan in Exile,” complete with a monarch and flag, remains unknown within the country.\textsuperscript{149} Threatened by the rallying power of the tribal leaders and the alternate system of governance they embody, Pakistani leaders have tried to contain tribal autonomy by attempting to break down the power of the tribal chieftains. This has been done through the use of military force and megaprojects which the state claims will alleviate the plight of the Baloch masses.\textsuperscript{150}

At 347,190 square kilometres, Balochistan is the largest of Pakistan’s four provinces. Making up 44 per cent of its land area, the region is home to a mere 7.1 million, or 5.1 per cent of its population.\textsuperscript{151} Though named after the Baloch, the majority

\textsuperscript{146} Ahmed, Jinnah, Pakistan and Islamic Identity. Pg. 171  
\textsuperscript{147} Burgat, Face to Face with Political Islam. Pg. 27  
\textsuperscript{148} Hussain, Pakistan: Problems of Governance. Pg. 6  
\textsuperscript{149} Govt of Balochistan in Exile  
of the province’s citizens are not Baloch speakers.\textsuperscript{152} Official government estimates put the ethnic make-up of Balochistan at 54.7 per cent Baloch, 29.0 per cent Pashtun.\textsuperscript{153} Despite their linguistic differences, Balochistan’s various ethnic groups share similar social organizational structures. Each ethnic group is divided into several subgroups, and headed by tribal leaders or \textit{sardars}.\textsuperscript{154} The tribe or clan in Balochistani culture can be considered a microcosm of what Anderson termed “the nationally imagined community.”\textsuperscript{155} It is, as Walker Connor writes, “not chronological or factual history that is the key to the nation, but sentient or felt history.”\textsuperscript{156} Differing as it does from the identity articulated by a hegemonic Pakistani state, this Baloch identity brings it in conflict not only with the former, but also with other ethnic groups within the province.\textsuperscript{157}

The primary loyalty is to the local sardar rather than bureaucrats in Islamabad. Baloch nationhood can be seen as instrumentalist; controlled by tribal overlords who “tend to view ethnicity and nationality as sites and resources for collective mobilization by interest-maximizing (and often rationally discriminating) elites.”\textsuperscript{158} “Regardless of the actual inequality and exploitation that may prevail in each, the nation is always conceived as a deep, horizontal comradeship.”\textsuperscript{159} It is, however, necessary to remember the fundamental point that “nationalism is, above and beyond all else, about politics and that politics is about power. Power, in the modern world, is principally about control of

\textsuperscript{152} Harrison, \textit{In Afghanistan’s Shadow}, Pg. 12
\textsuperscript{154} Smith, \textit{Nationalism and Modernism}, Pg. 191
\textsuperscript{156} Smith, \textit{Nationalism and Modernism}, Pg. 163
\textsuperscript{158} Smith, \textit{Nationalism and Modernism}, Pg. 157
\textsuperscript{159} Anderson, \textit{Imagined Communities}, Pg. 7
the state.” As the vacillating political fortunes of Balochistan’s sardars reveal - it is when they are denied access to power and resources that Baloch elites use ethnic identities as a rallying point for movements for autonomy. This is evidenced by the fact that nationalist sentiment has consistently been expressed by those that previously held federally appointed positions of power.

The longstanding conflict in Balochistan stems from the quantum of autonomy the province was promised when it joined Pakistan in 1947 and again under the 1973 constitution. Today, a large faction continues to campaign, sometimes violently, for an autonomy which Balochistan's citizens believe to be their due under the promises made to them by various Pakistani leaders. The British divided Balochistan during the latter half of the nineteenth century, giving much of the western territories to Iran in 1871 and ceding a portion of the north to Afghanistan. Unlike Sindh, which entered Pakistan willingly, separatist sentiment existed in Balochistan prior to Partition, with a group called the “Young Baloch” putting forward a map of Balochistan that included those parts that had been ceded to Iran and Afghanistan. Due to its strategic position, the Khanate’s accession to Pakistan was viewed as crucial to that state’s security. Despite being allowed to retain its autonomy, the Khanate was soon absorbed into the Pakistani polity through a combination of guile and force. The Baloch thus entered independent Pakistan with a distinct national identity and memories of a degree of self-rule. Pakistani

---

161 Breseeeg, Baloch Nationalism. Pg. 35
162 Breseeeg, Baloch Nationalism. Pg. 35
163 Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan
165 Ahmed, Balochistan: Its Strategic Importance. Pg. 140
166 Sherbaz Khan Mazari, A Journey to Disillusionment (Oxford Oxford University Press).Pg. 82
policy-makers continued to follow the British policy of using handpicked tribal chiefs to control the territory on their behalf, enhancing the power of those sardars locally, and ousting others who defied state control.\textsuperscript{167}

As ethnic loyalty remains the primary identifier, overriding allegiance to a larger political community, movements rise to make borders congruent with nations. Lacking legitimacy in the province, the centre has held on through force.\textsuperscript{168} The Pakistan Army first marched onto Balochistan’s soil in 1948 and has remained since, involved in varying levels of engagement.\textsuperscript{169} Balochistan under Ayub Khan’s military rule (1958-69) witnessed an armed revolt, with the left-leaning militants, led by Sher Mohammad Marri and including Mengal and Bugti tribesmen, operating under the Baloch People’s Liberation Front (BPLF).\textsuperscript{170} Through the 1960s, the BPLF and its student wing – the Baloch Student Organization (BSO), began demanding an independent Balochistan, advocating the use of guerrilla warfare against the machinery of the state.\textsuperscript{171} The army responded by arresting prominent Baloch dissidents, violating agreements on safe conduct and amnesty, and executing rebels who had surrendered. Military expansion through cantonments further alienated the Baloch.\textsuperscript{172} The Baloch grievances against the centre mirrored those of the East Pakistanis, who, despite their larger economy, were systematically denied access to participatory government, causing them to secede in

\begin{footnotes}
\item[167] Khan, Politics of Identity, pg. 115
\item[168] Mansur, pg. 327
\item[169] Rahman, "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement." Pg. 161
\item[170] Ahmed, Balochistan: Its Strategic Importance, Pg. 150
\item[171] Syed Iqbal Ahmed, Balochistan: Its Strategic Importance (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 1992) Pg. 251
\item[172] Mazari, A Journey to Disillusionment, Pg. 101
\end{footnotes}
1971; setting a precedent for state failure in maintaining the territorial integrity of Pakistan.\textsuperscript{173}

In addition to armed resistance, the Baloch used political channels to gain their rights within the polity.\textsuperscript{174} Khan Abdul Wali Khan’s National Awami Party (NAP), which included prominent Baloch politicians, contested the 1970 elections on a platform of provincial autonomy. Allied with the Pashtun-majority Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI), the NAP formed Balochistan’s first provincial government in the newly truncated Pakistan.\textsuperscript{175} The “amorphous nationalism” of the NAP, however, never appealed to Balochistan’s 28% Pashtun and 12% Sindhi population. Localised tribal interests, coming into conflict with the nationalist government, prevented it from carrying out any real reforms.\textsuperscript{176} In a bid to end the ethnic discord between the Baloch and Pashtuns in his province, Chief Minister Mengal suggested that the northern Pashtun-majority belt of Balochistan be transferred to Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) and the Baloch majority areas of Sindh and Punjab (Jacobabad and Dera Ghazi Khan) be incorporated into Balochistan.\textsuperscript{177}

Consistently raising expectations before failing to deliver, the government drafted a new constitution in 1973, creating a parliamentary and federal bicameral framework.\textsuperscript{178} The 1973 constitution also created a number of bodies and mechanisms to regulate inter-provincial and centre-province relations and to ensure provincial autonomy. Having

\textsuperscript{173} Mazari, A Journey to Disillusionment. Pg. 136
\textsuperscript{174} Ahmed, Balochistan: Its Strategic Importance. Pg. 150
\textsuperscript{175} Syed Iqbal Ahmed, pg. 178
\textsuperscript{176} Feroz Ahmed, Ethnicity and Politics in Pakistan (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1998).Pg. 173
\textsuperscript{177} Breseeg, Baloch Nationalism: Its Origins and Development Pg. 102.
\textsuperscript{178} Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan (Brussels/ Islamabad: International Crisis Group, 2007). Pg. XX
given Pakistan a democratic constitution, Prime Minister Bhutto proceeded to ignore the conventions enshrined within it. The NAP government was dissolved in 1973, and Baloch leaders, including Governor Bizenjo and Chief Minister Mengal, were accused of attempting to undermine the state. Illustrative of its heavy handedness in dealing with any and all opposition, the government banned the NAP in 1975. By closing political avenues of expressing dissatisfaction, it therefore pushed radical elements within the NAP towards the militancy that had begun with the provincial government’s dissolution. Launched by the Marri and Mengal tribes, and run from Marri territory and sanctuaries within Afghanistan, it was led by the left-leaning Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA). The Balochistan National Army (BNA), another leftist militant group, also surfaced at this time. The BSO, divided though it was among competing factions, established itself as one of the most important recruiting grounds for the Baloch nationalist parties.

The military responded, then as now, with indiscriminate force. Some 80,000 troops were deployed to the province and thousands of militants killed. Civilian loss of life served to increase local support for militants who also inflicted substantial damage on the Pakistan Army. The military operation heightened Baloch political awareness and alienation, particularly among the youth. The insurgency ended when General Zia-ul Haq ousted the democratically elected Bhutto in 1977, withdrew the army and released

---

179 Mazari, A Journey to Disillusionment Pg. 292  
180 Khan, Politics of Identity Pg. 67  
181 Ahmed, Ethnicity and Politics in Pakistan Pg. 175  
182 Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan  
183 Ahmed, Ethnicity and Politics in Pakistan Pg. 176
Baloch leaders and activists.\(^{184}\) The settlement, however, yielded darker returns for the Baloch polity. Throughout the 1980s, Balochistan served as a key staging ground for the U.S-led, Pakistan-supported war in neighbouring Afghanistan.\(^{185}\)

While the nationalists of the 1970s fought for a Greater Balochistan, uniting Balochis in Pakistan, Iran, and Afghanistan; current politicians wish for a more equitable distribution of resources within the state.\(^{186}\) Baloch nationalists’ demands for greater political rights, autonomy and control over their natural resources, have led to three insurgencies, all of which were suppressed by the military. A fourth is now underway, and largely follows the same patterns as those that preceded it.\(^{187}\) Viewing all dissent as illegitimate, the state’s uneven distribution of economic resources, the population transfers resulting from its military campaigns and covert operations, have sharpened divisions in the province. The oft unlawful actions of the state security apparatus, which tend to go unpunished, together mean that the situation in Balochistan matches many of the indicators for state failure as proposed by the Failed States Index.

Tensions had been simmering in Balochistan before the current insurrection gained momentum. Troop increases in the province, which already had one paramilitary post per 500 citizens, aggravated a populace which saw the military as an occupying force, there to subordinate locals and facilitate the pillaging of their lands by an

\(^{184}\) Ahmed, Ethnicity and Politics in Pakistan. Pg. 177
\(^{187}\) Frederic Grare, “Baluchistan”
opprobrious central government. In 2005, the rape of a female doctor at the Pakistan Petroleum (PPL) plant in Sui, the heart of Bugti territory, was the spark that ignited the latest insurrection, hundreds of armed Bugti tribesmen storming the PPL installations in protest. Military troops were brought in to calm the situation, hundreds being deployed to guard gas installations and other key locations. The insurgents, however, were not cowed. Country-wide guerrilla attacks targeting railway tracks and power supply lines disrupted the production and supply of gas to the entire country. The Bugtis were inflamed with righteous indignation on account of the doctor who had been victimized by the same Punjabi military personnel who harassed locals and sidelined the ethnically Baloch police.

The military government’s use of brute force against nationalist leaders and their families has served to solidify the Baloch populace’s perception that they are engaged in a battle for their very survival. Security agencies have targeted scores of Baloch dissidents, including political activists, students, doctors, lawyers, journalists and shopkeepers. In 2006, the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) found numerous instances of intimidation, arbitrary arrests, torture, disappearances as well as extrajudicial killings by security forces and intelligence agencies. As the insurgency continues, these practices have worsened. Referring to the heavy military presence in the province, Nawab Bugti exclaimed “they are, it seems, using a hammer weighing a ton to kill a fly.”

---

189 Hussain, "Gathering Storm."
190 Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan
191 "Baloch and Sindhi Leaders met with US lawmakers to highlight the Pakistan’s human right violations in Sindh and Balochistan." The Baluch 29th Sept, 2008
192 Haroon Rashid, Interview with Akbar Khan Bugti, Newsline, February 2005
Refusing to acknowledge the root cause of the general discontent and alienation in the province, the military believed that by removing Bugti it would also terminate popular support for the insurgency. The assassination of the 79 year-old leader had just the opposite effect. A jirga, or gathering of tribal elders, convened in the wake of Bugti’s assassination, resulted in a petition to the International Court of Justice (ICJ) to address the “violation of…territorial integrity, exploitation of Balochistan’s natural resources, denial of the Baloch right to the ownership of their resources and the military operation in the province.” By taking their case to an international forum, the Baloch citizenry expressed its lack of faith in the centre, which was considered indifferent to their plight.

The latest insurgency within Balochistan has witnessed a resurgence of activity by the Baloch Liberation Army (BLA). Founded by Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri, a tribal leader in self-imposed exile in Afghanistan from 1980-1992, the BLA originally comprised Marri tribesmen, veterans of the armed insurrection of the 1970s, who joined their leader in exile in the Afghan provinces of Kandahar and Helmand. These cross border connections imply a wider support base for such autonomy and independence seeking movements, an issue exacerbated by the plethora of substate actors within the border regions. Islamabad’s heavy handed tactics have bolstered support for the group, with educated Baloch uniting with the belligerent BLA tribesmen, if not on the ground then ideologically.

---

195 Tohid, “Baloch Nationalism Rises as Pakistan Fights War on Terror.”
196 Hussain, “Gathering Storm.”
Launching attacks across the province, the BLA has targeted government installations, railways, gas supply lines, as well as Frontier Corps (FC) posts. Locals say the militants are mostly young men operating in small groups which total in the hundreds. Training camps, their numbers ranging from 15 to 40, and allegedly housing between 300-500 recruits, are located in buildings abandoned by the Pakistan Army after its 1973 operation in the province. Armed with Russian Kalashnikovs, heavy machine and anti-aircraft weaponry and RPGs, the tribesmen claim to be waging a war for the rights of the Baloch population.

Increasingly disaffected with the central authorities, younger members of the BLA are advocating outright secession from what they consider a repressive state apparatus. Engaged in open battle with the paramilitary FC, they have targeted foreign workers in the province, in what can be seen as a show of frustration at their dismal economic prospects. The kidnapping in February of the head of United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) by a previously unknown group calling itself Baloch Liberation United Front (BLUF) catapulted the Baloch cause to prominence within and without Pakistan. Citing human rights violations in the province as the catalyst for this action, BLUF demanded the release of 141 women allegedly held prisoner by the state before setting their captive free. Such a high profile kidnapping

---

197 Tohid, "Baloch Nationalism Rises as Pakistan Fights War on Terror."
199 Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan
200 Interview with Sherbaz Khan Mazari
201 Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan."
allowed the BLUF to leverage their hostage for the return of state-held prisoners, whilst publicizing their grievances to a broader audience.  

Walls across Balochistan display graffiti favouring a ‘Greater Balochistan, exclaiming ‘Watan ya Kafan’ – independence or death. A proposed national anthem for an independent Balochistan is currently in circulation, and parallels are regularly drawn with the rumblings in East Pakistan pre-1971. Nawabzada Balach Marri professes a desire to see that “all provinces have equal economic and political rights and maintain their own armies. The federal army must have equal representation from all four provinces. In case of war, the provincial armies will fight alongside the federal army.” This desire for provincial armies has, unsurprisingly, not met with enthusiasm in Islamabad. Since a state’s stability depends in large part on its control over the military, it cannot be shared.

Accounting for 36% of Pakistan’s total gas production, and meeting more than 40% of its energy needs through its gas and coal reserves, the province is rich in energy and mineral resources, large reserves of which remain untapped. Significant deposits of uranium, an important source of weapons-grade fissile materials for Pakistan, have also been found in the province. It further contains deposits of gold, copper, silver, platinum and aluminium. Without Balochistan’s resources, the Pakistani state would lose substantial income. However, as with Sindh, ethnicity continues to play a major role in the allocation of development projects.

---

203 Ansari, “Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan.”
Despite its vast mineral wealth, however, Balochistan remains the least developed province in Pakistan, with 46.6% of households lacking the electricity they supply to the rest of the country.\textsuperscript{206} The Karachi-based Social Policy and Development Centre finds that poverty levels in Balochistan are twice that of Punjab, Pakistan’s largest and most prosperous province; whilst urban unemployment is 12.5%, compared to the countrywide average of 9.7%. According to a World Bank report, half the population lives below the poverty line, and, at 30.1%, literacy levels are well below the country average of 51%.\textsuperscript{207} Federal money continues to be distributed according to population rather than need; translating to a mere 5.11% funding for Balochistan.\textsuperscript{208}

Infrastructure in the province is closely linked to the military, roads being built and areas receiving gas as the much-contested Pakistan Army cantonments proliferate.\textsuperscript{209} Dera Bugti, home to the Sui gas fields which supply the country with most of its gas, began to receive gas only after the establishment of a paramilitary camp in the mid-1990s.\textsuperscript{210} It is telling that only four of Balochistan’s 26 districts are supplied with gas – as compared to nearly every village in Punjab and Sindh.\textsuperscript{211} Constant economic exploitation and military repression have thus expanded Baloch nationalism.\textsuperscript{212}

Aside from the controversy over oil and gas, Islamabad’s enthusiastic endorsement of mega projects within the province has further alienated an economically marginalized populace. The construction of a major port in the coastal city of Gwadar

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\item\textsuperscript{206} Compendium of Environmental Statistics of Pakistan – 2004. (Islamabad, 2005).
\item\textsuperscript{207} Pakistan Development Forum: Balochistan Perspective.
\item\textsuperscript{208} “Provisions made for Rs 70 bn Balochistan Budget” \textit{Dawn} 20\textsuperscript{th} June 2008
\item\textsuperscript{209} Carroll McC. Lewin, “Introduction.” Ed. Paul Titus \textit{Marginality and Modernity}. Pg. xxv
\item\textsuperscript{210} Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan.”
\item\textsuperscript{211} Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan.”
\item\textsuperscript{212} Taj Mohammad Breseeg. \textit{Baloch Nationalism} (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2004). Pg 33
\end{thebibliography}
was put into place without the approval of either the Provincial Assembly or the Balochistan Government, lending credence to the claims of Baloch nationalists such as Habib Jalib, that it is part of "a conspiracy to control our resources and land."\textsuperscript{213} In a refrain common against nationalist groups in Pakistan, economic development has not let to any real gains for locals, with most jobs resulting from mega projects likely to go to foreigners - and Punjabis in particular.\textsuperscript{214} Companies such as Pakistan Petroleum Ltd (PPL) which was at the centre of the rape scandal, conversely argue that the inability of Bugti tribesmen to gain employment at PPL implies deeper patronage issues with businesses, sardars and their subordinates.\textsuperscript{215}

The construction of mega projects has caused great disruption to many communities across Balochistan, and a humanitarian crisis is welling as Islamabad blocks aid to internally displaced Balochistanis. When asked if he is proud to be a Pakistani, a Bugti tribesman summed up the opinion on the ground: "If I am a Pakistani, where are my rights? They don't treat us like Pakistanis…they use us for target practice and test their new weapons on us. There is a reason why they don't want anyone to come here. They don't want the world to see that they are treating people like animals."\textsuperscript{216} Balochistanis have no ownership over the various development projects proposed for their province by the centre. Any attempts to improve infrastructure or establish businesses meets with resistance on the grounds that locals are neither consulted nor

\textsuperscript{213} Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan."
\textsuperscript{214} Hussain, "Gathering Storm."
\textsuperscript{215} Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan."
\textsuperscript{216} Ziad Zafar, "Pakistan's Other War," Newsline June 2007.
employed. By imposing these development projects, Islamabad is viewed as an illegitimate force by the public it allegedly seeks to help.\textsuperscript{217}

To circumvent the troublesome issue of ethnic nationalism, the Pakistani state has long adopted divide and rule policies, in both Sindh and Balochistan. Whilst the secular Sindhis conflicted with mohajirs and other more recent immigrants to their lands, Islamabad since Zia-ul-Haq has sought to empower Islamist parties in order to contain the avowedly anti-clerical tribalism of Balochistan. Many of these parties draw support from deeply religious Pashtuns, who have recourse to a larger support base outside the province.\textsuperscript{218} Though the government has tried to tar Balochis with the Islamist brush, the fusion of tribal and Islamic customs within Balochistan creates cohesion within the various tribes.\textsuperscript{219} In the exceedingly hierarchical tribal system, the sardar as opposed to the local cleric, commands total loyalty.\textsuperscript{220} As their various struggles with the centre have shown, the Baloch have never turned to the mosque to articulate dissent with the ruling classes, thus preventing the creation of any real Islamist presence in the province.\textsuperscript{221} The Russo-Afghan war further altered the demographic makeup of the province, with Balochistan playing host to more than two thirds of the more than 2.2 million Afghan refugees escaping to Pakistan.\textsuperscript{222} A rise in extremist sentiment has helped parties such as the Jamat-e-Ulema-Islam (Fazlur Rahman) or JUI-F, expand their influence, particularly

\textsuperscript{217} Ansari, "Between Tribe and Country: Crisis of Balochistan."
\textsuperscript{218} Ahmar, "Ethnicity and State Power in Pakistan: The Karachi Crisis." Pg. 180
\textsuperscript{219} Akbar S. Ahmed, ed., Trial by Ordeal among Bugtis (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1996). Pg. 52
\textsuperscript{220} Harrison, In Afghanistan's Shadow Pg. 10
\textsuperscript{221} Harrison, In Afghanistan's Shadow, Pg. 10
\textsuperscript{222} World Health Organization Centre of Excellence http://www.who.int/disasters/repo/14790.pdf
within Balochistan’s Pashtun belt. The political and material support they provide is alleged to have helped the Taliban recoup, rearm, recruit and launch attacks into Afghanistan from Balochistan.

In its attempts to carve out an embracing Pakistani nationhood, the state has further promulgated centralizing and cultural homogenization policies, imposing Urdu as the national language and relegating regional languages to a secondary level in the state apparatus. Anderson’s stress on a print culture as fostering a sense of nationalism translates into Baloch nationalists’ calls for the Baloch language to be taught in the province’s schools. The adoption of the Balochistan Mother Tongue Bill in 1990 mandated the use of Balochi, Brahui or Pashto as the language of instruction in primary schools within the province. Elite English-speaking schools were, however, exempt from this legislation. By reducing access to Urdu, this legislation served to effectively ghettoize the already isolated rural poor, by preventing access to the host of jobs requiring proficiency in Urdu. In contrast to the Sindhi movement, language has remained a peripheral issue in the Baloch conflict. While the ruling elite have “used the coercive power of the state to suppress Baloch nationalism, the language movements have been … ignored rather than suppressed.” The province’s natural wealth has brought with it a resource curse – as locals are denied access to jobs and education within

---

224 International Crisis Group, The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan.
225 Khan, Politics of Identity, Pg. 66.
226 Anderson, Imagined Communities, Pg. 110.
their province, they turn to their sardars, who, when not serving the federal government, take up the cause of their tribesmen.\textsuperscript{229}

Ethnonational conflict as epitomized by the secular Baloch struggle, results when “a particular community within an existing state is faced with blocked social mobility because its culture is not of the majority, and therefore not protected by the policies and institutions of the existing regime. In this case the ambitious nation will, to the best of its ability, seek recourse either by political accommodation within the existing state, or by secession.”\textsuperscript{230} The Baloch resistance has long attempted both approaches simultaneously, meeting with little lasting success on either front. The Pakistani government must recognize that a state which “depends solely on coercion and violence betrays weakness rather than strength…[a] resort to frequent violence indicates a lack of legitimacy on the part of the state, whereas the lack of legitimacy indicates the ideological frailty of the state.”\textsuperscript{231}

By testing the integrity of the multi-ethnic Pakistani state, Baloch separatism has the potential to undermine the stability of the region and consequently affect the centre’s response to the myriad insurgencies within its borders. An independent Balochistan with a large Pashtun population and a porous border with its Iranian and Afghan counterparts would destabilize an already insecure region. Attempts to recreate a Greater Balochistan would necessarily involve wrestling territories ceded to neighbouring Iran and Afghanistan, which would undoubtedly create tumult along these boundaries. Lacking

\textsuperscript{229} Walker Connor, Ethnonationalism: The Quest for Understanding (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994). Pg. 78
\textsuperscript{231} Khan, Politics of Identity. Pg. 78
infrastructure, an independent Balochistan would likely rely on its mineral wealth to provide an income to sustain it. The strong tribal culture present within would make effective centralized governance difficult, and it could well become a haven for anti-statist elements.

The assertion of nationality within Balochistan would call into question the viability of statehood in the region, as a ripple effect would undoubtedly follow. The divisions within Baloch society and its resistance to the centre preclude the possibility of this occurring. Various tribal leaders have resorted to separatism only because the centre has proven itself impervious to the needs of the Balochistani populace. By addressing the social, economic and political concerns of the public, as voiced by their tribal sardars, Islamabad could well stem the secessionist tide by providing moderate leaders with some form of leverage.

The conflict in Balochistan, as in Sindh, stems from a common belief of being second class citizens within the larger Pakistani polity. Overwhelming poverty and oft crushing feudal obligations, coupled with a long and bitter history with a very visible Pakistan army, have rendered the populace ripe for manipulation by powerful elites. The longer the battle in Balochistan rages, the greater the risk that the insurgents will drop their demands for autonomy and rally their brethren for outright independence. The state’s inability to engender social and economic mobility within Balochistan has served to create further divisions in an already fractured society.
The Pashtun Question

The geographically delineated North West Frontier Provinces, bordering Balochistan, Afghanistan and the disputed Kashmir territories, have historically been the portal to the subcontinent. The Pashtun peoples, also known as Pakhtuns or Pathans, have an 86% majority in the NWFP and Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). They form a substantial minority in neighbouring Balochistan and Sindh, the commercial centres of which draw many migrants for work. Pashtun society is structurally similar to those of both Balochis and Sindhis, with a strong tribal affinity surmounting other identity groupings. The Pashtuns as an ethnic group straddle the Pak-Afghan border, and their close familial links with the neighbouring state have made the international border extremely porous.

A young Winston Churchill articulated: "People talk glibly of 'the total disarmament of the frontier tribes' as being the obvious policy... But to obtain it would be as painful and as tedious an undertaking as to extract the stings of a swarm of hornets, with naked fingers." No imperial power has managed to subdue the region, the British managing, just barely, to contain the fiercely independent Pashtuns by ceding some of the territory to independent Afghanistan. The Durand Line of 1893, which thus separated British India from Afghanistan laid the basis for enduring conflict.

---

The division of Pashtuns along either side of the border led the post-colonial peoples to challenge the legitimacy of the borders and demand a separate Pashtunistan.\textsuperscript{235} Afghanistan organized and funded a movement for the Pashtunistan cause, supplying resources to activists on both sides of the Durand Line.\textsuperscript{236} Upon voluntarily entering the Pakistani union, the Pashtuns were not nationalist to the same degree as their Baloch counterparts. However, changing eco-political realities in the country, and Islamabad’s strategy of playing ethnic and ideological groups against each other, served to politicize the Pashtun populace.

The most prominent nationalist movements were led by Ghaffar Khan and his \textit{Khuda-e-Khitmatgar} or God’s Helpers, also known as the Red Shirts, as well as Abdul Samad Khan Achakzai, whose Balochistan-based \textit{Wrore Pushtoon} movement was instrumental in articulating Pashtun national sentiment.\textsuperscript{237} Claims to territory are based on transnational ethnic affinities, and come to the fore when the gulf between the minority in-group and the centre widens. Carment and James articulate that ethnic groups’ refusal to recognize the legitimacy of the centre can lead to disruption in the state, it can invite external parties’ participation based on ethnic affinity, or lead to third party states conflicting with the state under question.\textsuperscript{238}

\textsuperscript{235} Swindler, "Knights, Not Pawns: Ethno-Nationalism and Regional Dynamics in Post-Colonial Balochistan." Pg. 47
\textsuperscript{236} Swindler, "Knights, Not Pawns: Ethno-Nationalism and Regional Dynamics in Post-Colonial Balochistan." Pg. 53
\textsuperscript{237} Swindler, "Knights, Not Pawns: Ethno-Nationalism and Regional Dynamics in Post-Colonial Balochistan." Pg. 52
led to internal migration and, as in Sindh and Balochistan, resentment of Punjab and its disproportionate share of power and state resources grew.  

The Soviet-Afghan war, with the influx of over 3 million Afghan refugees into Pakistan, 75% of which settled in the NWFP, impacted heavily on the tribal areas, where one of three members of the population were refugees. The flow of refugees and weaponry destabilized Pakistan, introducing militancy into the political culture, giving rise to criminal networks dependent on contraband trade and smuggling, as well as transforming militant organizations into paramilitary ones. Pashtun nationalists like Afzal Khan Lala from NWFP, advocated provincial autonomy rather than outright secession, proposing, like their Sindhi and Balochi counterparts, that the centre deal only with foreign policy, defence, currency and communication. Unwilling to entertain yet another nationalist movement, the Pakistani military began to support the Taliban and other extremist groups to balance the threat of Pashtun separatism along the Afghan border. However, this policy of using Islamist groups against the Pashtuns has backfired, with consequences that are only just being felt. Sharif Shuja articulates how “inept, ill-prepared and heavy-handed military operations in the tribal areas and adjacent Pashtun localities have spawned seething resentment towards the Pakistani state,” with

241 Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization." Pg. 180
242 Witte, "Strains Intensify in Pakistan’s Ethnic Patchwork.".
the deeply religious Pashtuns joining forces with Islamist forces, led by the Taliban, to attack the machinery of the Pakistani state.\textsuperscript{244}

Pakistan’s governance issues “owe much to a fractious political culture, rent-seeking politicians, a vetoing army, and a monopolistic civil bureaucracy.”\textsuperscript{245} Islamabad’s centrist policies and the legacies of successive inept leaders, have systematized violence. As Carment argues, when a society gets attenuated to violence, it becomes a normative part of its culture and identity, thereby becoming a useful political tool.\textsuperscript{246} The growing presence of the Taliban, working in conjunction with local Islamist groups within Pakistan, reveals how territory is captured through control of the population rather than military advance.\textsuperscript{247}

The three nationalist challenges to Pakistani hegemony reveal the state’s failure in maintaining either the rule of law, monopoly over the legitimate means of violence, functioning bureaucracy, in fostering economic growth and access, citizenship rights through social policy, provision of infrastructure, and the management of public resources.\textsuperscript{248} The Pakistani Taliban’s burgeoning success, as illustrated by Islamabad’s acquiescence to their demands in Swat, reveal a deep seated desire for peace and justice in underdeveloped regions with crushing feudal obligations which have been riven by conflict. Since Pashtun nationalism is often linked to and now overtaken by Islamist movements which draw support from there, we shall assess the likelihood of Pashtun

\textsuperscript{244} Shuja, "Pakistan: Islam, Radicalism and the Army." Pg. 57
\textsuperscript{245} Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan." Pg. 680
\textsuperscript{246} Carment, "Assessing State Failure: Implications for Theory and Policy." Pg. 416
\textsuperscript{247} Andersen, International Engagement in Failed States. Pg. 7.
\textsuperscript{248} Lockhart, Fixing Failed States. Pg. 161
separatism within the section detailing the Islamist, specifically Taliban, threat to the viability of the Pakistani state.
Chapter 5: Extremism and the Taliban

Pakistan has been insecure about its territorial integrity from the very beginning. Its military has thereby designated keeping India at bay, the development of nuclear weapons, and the creation of a friendly government in Afghanistan, as its primary goals. The creation of strong institutions, a constitution, democracy and thriving economy have all been secondary to the achievement of the elite-military defined national security goals. Ahmed Rashid points to the two relationships which have dominated Pakistani politics – “that between military power and civil society and the one between Islam and the state.”249

Vali Nasr writes that the “high politics of international relations has shaped the low domestic politics of Pakistan.”250 The proliferating Islamist groups working in tandem with a resurgent Taliban within its borders emphasize this close linkage between both high and low politics in the region. This section looks at the growing threat of the Taliban to the viability of the Pakistani state. Unlike the diffuse ethnic challenges to Islamabad’s dominance which are largely based upon economic grievances, the Taliban present an ideological threat which aims to alter the fundamental nature of the state.

Ethnic identity, Zartman argues, "may be more intense because of its narrowness, but religious and ideological identity provides a broader and more unifying appeal. The relative strengths of ideological versus national identities are very situational..."251 Traditionally drawing support from the Pashtun well, the Taliban are now articulating

250 Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization."Pg. 173
251 Zartman, "Need, Creed, and Greed in Intrastate Conflict," Pg. 274
more wide-ranging class grievances as they mount what is the most serious challenge to
the Pakistani state.

As Governor-General, Jinnah claimed that Pakistan would never be a “theocracy
or anything like it.” Whilst propounding a secular Muslim identity for the new state, he
saw it as a democratic country not “to be ruled by priests with divine mission.” 252
However, the “combination of defiant pluralism and stubborn administrative machinery
has continued to rock the Pakistani polity.” 253 Constant disillusionment with successive
governments – military or civilian, has led to a mushrooming in fundamentalist parties
espousing a reformist, Islamist agenda. 254 The failure of the state to provide promised
development packages – including a lack of long-term planning, corruption – whether
direct or through patronage networks, disproportionate investment in security forces and
a population explosion, have together exacerbated the social, economic, and cultural
alienation felt by the masses. 255

State neglect during a time of rising expectations has sharpened collective
deprivation; the polity just requires mobilization by political entrepreneurs who use creed
to articulate need, both of which are overtaken by greed as political actors seek to gain.
Greed (personal gain) is thus masked by creed (identity mobilization) in the framing of
the conflict. 256 The coalescing of various Islamist groups under a reformist agenda
propounding not only religious but class change exemplifies Zartman’s theory of need,

252 Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan." Pg. 683.
253 Malik, "The State and Civil Society in Pakistan." Pg. 685
254 Smith, "Profiling the Politically Violent in Pakistan: Self-Construals and Values." Pg. 284
256 Zartman, "Need, Creed, and Greed in Intrastate Conflict." Pg. 269
creed and greed. In the absence of strong institutions, the country is held together by a military which is often called upon to resolve crises bred by civilian mis-governance.257

Conditioned by decades of state malaise and changing regime types, Pakistani society can be viewed as ‘soft,’ reliant on the hard power of the military to rescue it from the excesses of its citizenry. The army inculcates in its soldiers “hatred for India, distrust of the United States, contempt for all civilian politicians, and a heightened religiosity and respect for Islamic militants fighting the army’s foreign wars in Kashmir and Afghanistan.”258 Imbued with a particular Islamic variant of nationalism in Pakistan, many officers reaching the rank of three star general, were recruited during the Zia era.259 By actively encouraging Islamicization within its ranks, the military can no longer be entirely confident of the loyalty of its soldiers.260 Created during the heady days of the Cold War, when the US filtered weapons, training and money to Afghan mujahideen through Pakistan, Islamist groups embodied the wider Islamicization of the state under Zia. The same groups that coordinated formal aid to the Afghan resistance also facilitated the illicit weapons and narcotics trade - these being Pakistan's Inter Service Intelligence (ISI) and National Logistics Cell, its military and police, and by extension, U.S intelligence agencies.261

After the war ended, hitherto bountiful foreign assistance dried up, and once-patronized groups were left to fend for themselves. This led to an escalation of conflict

257 Malik, "Pakistan: Terror War Bolsters Islamism, Nationhood."
258 Rashid, Descent into Chaos. Pg. 46
260 Zaidi, "Sindhi Vs Mohajir in Pakistan.”Pg. 1298
between one-time allies. The "culture of permeability... [where the Pak-Afghan] borders could be traversed by anyone with ambition, resources, or pressing need" which so greatly aided the US in its proxy war in 1979, obfuscated post-war politics. The flow of refugees from Afghanistan who wished to maintain their ties to land and occupations back home greatly destabilized their host states. With their religiously sanctioned ire harnessed by Pakistan’s shadowy defence forces, militant groups have long operated to secure state interests in India and Afghanistan. These have enjoyed the patronage of the Pakistani state’s intelligence and military agencies, which allow them to function unmolested. These varied militant groups can largely be disaggregated according to the school of Islamic thought and operational goals. The Deobandi and Ahl-e-Hadith or Salafist, also known as Wahabbist interpretative traditions influence the aims and ideologies of the major Islamist groups within the country.

Religion and politics both establish rules of conduct within their domains, in order to maintain the integrity of the system. While the two areas can co-exist in peace, problems arise when one part includes in its definition of itself, activities of the other; what Zartman terms the "God and Caesar problem." The state's cooptation of religion would be an attempt to make Caesar God. Conversely, religious groups' attempts to subsume and define politics through a narrow doctrinal lens, excluding all who do not

---

262 Newberg, "Surviving State Failure: Internal War and Regional Conflict in Afghanistan's Neighbourhood." Pg. 215
263 Newberg, "Surviving State Failure: Internal War and Regional Conflict in Afghanistan's Neighbourhood." Pg. 218
264 Shuja, "Pakistan: Islam, Radicalism and the Army." Pg. 57
265 Christine Fair, "Antecedents and Implications of Let."
ascribe to the same beliefs, makes God Caesar. The Pakistani centre has long attempted to make Caesar God by controlling and directing the activities of the Islamist groups it allowed to flourish within its borders.

In the wake of the 9/11 attacks, Musharraf was faced with the unattractive option of having his country branded a state sponsor of terrorism, and face military strikes by a wounded superpower, or align himself unconditionally with the US, no matter the domestic fallout. By opening Pakistani airspace and intelligence to US forces, the ISI continued to play a dangerous double game; giving refuge to the Taliban leadership including Gulbuddin Hikmetyar, leader of the Hizb-e-Islami party, who was able to live and operate from NWFP under the protection of the ISI. Hikmetyar opened an office in the Shamshatoo camp for Afghan refugees, which soon turned into a Hizb-e-Islami base. Jalaluddin Haqqani, a ‘moderate Taliban,’ was backed by the ISI and also given sanctuary in North Waziristan, where he rebuilt his group on either side of the border. Other foreign groups settled in South Waziristan. Fearing a loss of its influence in Afghanistan, the ISI protected the Taliban while handing over al-Qaeda Arabs and other non-Afghans to the US. To effectively continue this policy, the ISI contracted its work of promoting the Taliban to a new arm falling outside the purview of the military and US intelligence agencies. Logistics and expenses were funneled through the Frontier Corps rather than the ISI. Covert operations such as this, whether carried out with the support of the government or by rogue elements within it, are illustrative of the military’s

---


268 “Asia: A Wild Frontier; Pakistan's Tribal Areas,” The Economist 20th September 2008.

269 Rashid, Descent into Chaos. Pg. 222
tendency to act as a state within a state, contravening the professed aims of the incumbent government.

Pakistan’s support of the Taliban indirectly strengthened Al-Qaeda, with Pakistani militants providing manpower and offering logistical support to the former.270 The sanctuary afforded Taliban fighters within Pakistan’s tribal belt have enabled them to regroup. Important havens in Waziristan and Balochistan remain untouched by Pakistani forces, with Taliban leaders alleged to be meeting freely in Karachi.271 Jihadists groups banned by the Musharraf regime in 2001 re-emerged under new names, espousing a revised social services mandate.272 Providing services traditionally falling under the purview of the state, these Islamist groups have positioned themselves as visible and legitimate alternatives to the state.

Operating in the regions bordering Afghanistan, the Frontier Corps (FC), a federally controlled paramilitary force, faces multiple problems in tackling militancy in the region. This organization was used to train the Taliban in the 1990s and many are suspected of having ties to that organization. Despite large infusions of donor funding, the FC remains incapable of mounting an effective challenge to the militancy. Like much of the military, the FC is not impervious to the Islamist ideology of the militants and has been infiltrated by and/or is sympathetic to the local militants they are charged with rooting out.273 Even if they are not sympathetic to the militants, Frontier Corpsmen are often hesitant to fight “due to fear of sparking a sanguinary blood feud in which they or

their families may be ensnared. Despite ideological cohesion, Islamist groups remain divided along tribal lines, with a command structure that necessarily takes this into account. The army remains reluctant to fight in the increasingly lawless border regions, not only because it is fears it will exacerbate the security situation there, but because of possible divisions in its ranks on the efficacy and legitimacy of an alliance with America at the expense of compatriots.

Islamist movements are, Zartman writes, "inspired by a deep-seated belief in the wrongness - indeed even the infidelity and apostasy - of the previous governments and in the divine command that legitimizes the movement's activity. It cannot fail; God has ordered its members' activity. It dare no fail; a religious movement is even less likely than other political incumbents simply to admit failure and withdraw from power or to call for open elections and a public accounting of programs..." Building their support base in Pakistan since being edged out of Afghanistan, the Taliban united various Islamist groups under the banner of the Tehreek-i-Taliban (TTP). Tolerated by the Pakistani military, the Taliban are able to move about on either side of the border, procuring drugs and arms with which to finance and fight.

Pakistani groups have provided aid not only to the Taliban, but also Al-Qaeda, with Jaish-e-Mohammed (JM), helping its senior members reorganize in the Punjabi

---

276 "Asia: A Wild Frontier; Pakistan's Tribal Areas."
277 Zartman, "Islam, the State, and Democracy." Pg. 232
278 Hosenball, "Pakistan’s Dangerous Double Game."
heartland. LeT has also been closely connected to Al-Qaeda, and other jihadists groups, propounding a longer term goal of liberating Muslim lands under non-Muslim rulers. Abandoning their one-time patrons, many ISI-backed groups have veered from its anti-India agenda to espouse a more global Jihadist ideology. The government’s failure to effect broad development has alienated large swathes of the population. Providing a sense of purpose and superordinate goals, the Islamist groups are able to find committed recruits, fulfilling a need for order and speedy justice. A youth bulge, coupled with economic struggle and static class boundaries leads to growing frustration, which is being effectively harnessed by militant jihadist groups. Challenging traditional tribal societal norms in the area, the Taliban are making inroads amongst otherwise secular populations within Punjab.

While the Taliban were initially limited to the regions bordering the Pak-Afghan border, they have begun to move inland toward Punjab – the populous heart of the country, whilst expanding their presence in Sindh as well. In FATA, the Taliban have "established a de facto emirate, imbued it with rudimentary state institutions, and are employing its infrastructural resources to broaden their political and ideological writ to encompass more mainstream portions of Pakistan." Speaking on Washington’s National Public Radio (NPR), Khadim Hussain, an expert on NWFP, talked about how

---

279 Rashid, Descent into Chaos, Pg. 224  
280 Petrou, "Trail of Terror."  
281 Rashid, Descent into Chaos, Pg. 220  
284 Fair, "U.S.-Pakistan Relations."  
the Pakistani military’s failure in Swat could lead to a widening insurgency. He articulated that this could “have a very negative impact for the integration of Pakistan as a whole. There might be civil war, and there might be disruption and chaos.”

According to a survey carried out by the University of Maryland's Program on International Policy Attitudes (PIPA), whilst many Pakistanis favoured the application of Sharia, they all had their own interpretation of it. Less than 8% supported a Taliban-like state.

Cross border incursions by US military forces are further de-stabilizing the Pakistani state, hampering its ability to maintain control over its territory. The aggressive policy is factionalizing the populace, pushing tribal elements from the margins to overt support, and facilitating the radicalizing of a generation of youths caught between Islamist rhetoric and American bombs. A US official articulated how this could “widen the war further and undermine the already shaky Pakistani government. It could also create more Islamist sympathizers inside the Pakistani Army and ISI.”

The recent takeover of Swat by Maulana Fazlullah, leader of the banned Tehreek-e-Nifaz-e-Shariat-Muhammad (TNSM) on behalf of the Taliban is evidence of the growing reach of Islamist organizations within Pakistan. Not only have they begun a territorial expansion within Pakistan, the Taliban are further disrupting NATO supply

---

289 Hosenball, “Pakistan’s Dangerous Double Game.”
290 Gould, "Stemming the Taliban Tide in Afghanistan and Pakistan."
lines into Afghanistan through the Khyber Pass.\textsuperscript{291} A preponderance of opium trafficking in the region is continuing to fuel the insurgency in both Afghanistan and within Pakistan.\textsuperscript{292} In 2007, Afghanistan produced over 92\% of global opium production, the farmgate value rising to USD 1 billion, with a total export value of opiates to neighbouring countries valued at USD 4 billion.\textsuperscript{293} With access to these high yields, and the resultant cash flow, the Taliban and allied groups have been able to finance their operations within Pakistan, likely with the collusion of the military.

The Taliban believe in the Hobbesian state – disorder and anarchy are ended when a group decides to reap the economic rewards by providing order which furthers the productivity of subjects.\textsuperscript{294} The Swat valley saw 12,000 Pakistani troops battle 3,000 Taliban fighters since 2007. As the population fled and infrastructure was destroyed, the Taliban brought their unique brand of stability and justice to the valley, carrying out beheadings, burning down girls' schools, attacking police and government officials.\textsuperscript{295}

Islamists believe Pakistan’s future lies in its citizens’ ability to live by the moral codes of Islamic jurisprudence. Like ethnic affiliation, Islam has come to be packaged as an alternative political affiliation for disaffected youth in Pakistan.\textsuperscript{296} A proactive approach towards changing the structures which restrain growth and actively repress a populace are lauded, giving rise to a mujahid culture where death is idealized.\textsuperscript{297}

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{291} Klein, "The Scariest Places."
\bibitem{292} Rashid, Descent into Chaos.Pg. 332
\bibitem{293} World Drug Report, (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2008).Pg. 37
\bibitem{295} "Taliban Rising."
\bibitem{296} Shuja, "Pakistan: Islam, Radicalism and the Army."Pg. 58
\bibitem{297} Smith, "Profiling the Politically Violent in Pakistan: Self-Construals and Values."Pg. 280
\end{thebibliography}
presence of foreign fighters and increasing criminalization of the Islamist sector has led
to changing tactics and a new willingness to kill indiscriminately. The intertwining of
religious militancy and common criminality has made it harder for the state to control.298

“The principle of territorial sovereignty is now a constitutive feature of the
modern state. Rule is territorially demarcated.”299 The state’s withdrawal from Swat
indicates its inability to maintain this territorial sovereignty, as it has revealed itself
unable or unwilling to take on the growing threat of the Islamist groups operating within
its borders.300 Appeasement, as articulated by political columnist Ardeshir Cowasjee, “is
doing deals with men who have insatiable territorial appetites with the wish to impose
their own brand of false theological practices and beliefs. It is an indulgence in wishful
thinking — peace in our time — at the price of surrender.”301 This action is
demonstrative of state failure, if not outright collapse in Swat. The centre has indicated
to those who wish to defy its power that Pakistani sovereignty is tenuous - with enough
coordination and sustained terror acts throughout the country, the Taliban could
conceivably begin to carve out the umma they desire. With militancy spreading
throughout Pakistan, including its largest cities, the spectre of Taliban rule looms large.

While it “takes a leadership agent to crystallize the subjective reactions to
objective conditions into conflict. It takes a pyromaniac to throw a match into the social
tinder heap.” 302 The TTP qualify as these leadership agents who are attempting to rouse

298 Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization."Pg. 180
299 Hendrik Spruyt, "Origins and Development of the State," Annual Review of Political Science 5
(2002).Pg. 134
300 Gould, "Stemming the Taliban Tide in Afghanistan and Pakistan."
301 Ardeshir Cowasjee “The Price of Moral Cowardice” Dawn, 19th April 2009
302 Zartman, "Need, Creed, and Greed in Intrastate Conflict."Pg. 267
the public through class and religious ideologies tailored to their problems. By ceding
territory to them, the government is inadvertently revealing its weakness. Unless the
state responds forcefully to the Taliban, it will only empower them, and slowly lose its
own hold over the rest of the country. Not only does this involve launching a military
campaign against Taliban and allied strongholds, but also the overhauling of the
economic structure which has enabled the Taliban to popularize support for a system of
governance not necessarily preferable. The consequences of Pakistani collapse in the
face of Islamist warriors would destabilize the entire region, allowing for the easy
movement of humans, drugs, weapons and black market goods through its borders to
neighbouring countries. With Pakistan’s military arsenal and nuclear weapons, the
Taliban could well begin to realize their dream of an umma stretching across
geographical boundaries.
Conclusion

This paper has sought to analyze the ethno-religious grievances which threaten to rent Pakistan. Though large and interventionist, the state espouses a “dispersed domination,” where neither the state nor social forces have country-wide power, thereby constricting the writ of the centre. Its tribal social structure, Islamic ideology, and British-based legal and political framework have laid the basis for an inherently conflictual system. Pakistan has failed to establish a pluralist decentralized political structure which includes the ethno-linguistic and economically differentiated segments of society. Framing Pakistan as a failed state, teetering on the brink of collapse, we have assessed the nature of and threats to the state. Examining the oft troubled marriage of Islam with secularism in the state’s institutions and outlook, we have focussed on the ethnic as well as religiously articulated challenges to the centre’s hegemony.

By edifying Islam in public life, the centre has vainly sought to build an overarching national identity to unify its multi-ethnic polity through the promulgation of a localized ummah. Rather than “imparting ideological cohesion or strengthening national integration,” Islamicization “unleashed primordial loyalties centred on ethnic and sectarian affiliations.” As shown in the sections detailing ethnic grievances in Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP, demands for secession were largely peripheral to more vocal lobbying for greater autonomy within the Republic. Instead, the state’s consistent policy of appearing to acquiesce to provincial demands, but failing to follow through,

---

303 Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization." Pg. 174
304 Shuja, "Pakistan: Islam, Radicalism and the Army." Pg. 55
305 Shuja, "Pakistan: Islam, Radicalism and the Army." Pg. 54
306 Malik, "Pakistan: Terror War Bolsters Islamism, Nationhood."
have made it appear illegitimate in the eyes of the majority of its dissatisfied citizenry. The state that exited in 1947 has already ceased to exist, with East Pakistan forming the independent country of Bangladesh. The creation of Bangladesh provided various ethno-national groups with the impetus to lobby for greater autonomy or even independence.\(^{308}\) It is possible that this indicator of state failure steeled the centre to demands for more power by provincial actors, leading them to espouse ever more polarising policies in their dealings with the latter.

The use and manipulation of Islam in the national discourse has served to create competing identities and communities of belonging within the state. Due in large part to its own machinations, the centre must now contend with ethnic as well as religiously articulated challenges to its dominance. Without fully addressing ethnically articulated provincial grievances, Pakistan’s simmering conflicts threaten to erupt in an orgy of violence which will devour Jinnah’s state from within.

The most potent threat to the integrity of the state, however, comes not from the ethnic groups who have long lobbied for change. While they are a destabilizing influence, the more immediate threat is posed by the Islamist parties created, trained, and supported by the state’s covert forces. Long oscillating in its stance towards militancy – reigning it in domestically whilst promoting it in Afghanistan and Kashmir, the Pakistani state has helped created the Taliban monster which portends its possible demise.\(^{309}\) The wide reach of the Taliban, appealing not just to religiously minded groups, but to all

\(^{308}\) Montiel, "Peace Psychology in Asia." Pg. 205
\(^{309}\) Nasr, "International Politics, Domestic Imperatives, and Identity Mobilization." Pg. 179
disenfranchised members of the society, poses the most pressing challenge to the viability of Pakistani statehood.

Zartman posits that "a state's collapse almost inevitably brings out the dogs to fight over its corpse..."\(^{310}\) As the Pakistani state frays, and political infighting between the various parties, the military and Islamist parties continue, one wonders if Zardari’s PPP and the Sharif brothers’ PML-N could be those canine harbingers of doom. The failure to provide promised development packages - including a lack of long-term planning, corruption - whether direct or through patronage networks, disproportionate investment in security forces and a population explosion, have together exacerbated the social, economic and cultural alienation felt by the masses.\(^{311}\) The state’s inadequacy in providing health, educational and basic services has allowed a plethora of non-governmental organizations to fill the gap left by a distant centre, seen too often by the polity as ineffectual at best, extractionary and repressive at worst. With loyalties localized to community and tribe, the centre is largely irrelevant to the lives of many citizens.

This failure to weld a nation out of the disparate peoples in Pakistan leads the centre to espouse coercive policies in an attempt to maintain control. Having already failed, Pakistan teeters on the brink of collapse, its territorial integrity under question as it loses control over swathes of the country. While Balochistan and Sindh wish for autonomy or independence for those provinces, the Taliban aim to effect a new order.

\(^{310}\) Zartman, "Need, Creed, and Greed in Intrastate Conflict." Pg. 266
With mounting challenges to its power and sovereignty, the state must evolve a policy of cooptation and control to isolate and address the economic grievances of ethnic groups, from the Islamist ones. Unless the centre asserts its power and broaden its reach to encompass all parts of Pakistan, it threatens to implode along the ethno-religious lines long manipulated by Islamabad.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

"Asia: A Wild Frontier; Pakistan's Tribal Areas." The Economist 20th September 2008.
"Baloch and Sindhi Leaders met with US lawmakers to highlight the Pakistan’s human right violations in Sindh and Balochistan." The Baluch 29th Sept, 2008
Blutto, Mumtaz. Interview 24th April 2009
Fair, Christine. "Antecedents and Implications of Let."
Fund for Peace, Failed States Index


Pakistan Army Faces Key Test in Taliban Fight. 4th February. 2009.


"Provisions made for Rs 70 bn Balochistan Budget" Dawn. 20th June, 2008
---. "Language and Politics in a Pakistan Province: The Sindhi Language Movement."


Refworld, available at: http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/486a52df0.html