FIGHTING ON THE FRONT LINES IN THE WAR ON TERROR: WOMEN, EDUCATION, AND SECURITY IN PAKISTAN

A Thesis
submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
of Georgetown University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree of
Master of Arts
in Security Studies

By
Tromila Lanise Wheat, B.A.

Washington, D.C.
April 16, 2010
# Table of Contents

Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1

Theoretical Connections between Education of Women and Violence .................................. 6

Direct Connections ............................................................................................................. 6

Education of Women, Economics and Violence ................................................................ 8

Education and Income ...................................................................................................... 9

Income and Violence .......................................................................................................... 11

Education of Women, Social Factors and Violence ............................................................ 13

Gender Inequality ............................................................................................................. 13

Health Indicators ............................................................................................................... 15

The Youth Bulge .................................................................................................................. 16

Beyond the Youth Bulge .................................................................................................... 18

Education of Women, Islam and Violence ......................................................................... 19

The Education of Women and Violence in Pakistan: Exploration of a Case Study .............. 23

Current State of Education in Pakistan ............................................................................... 23

Direct Connections in Pakistan ......................................................................................... 25

Education of Women, Socioeconomic Factors, and Violence in Pakistan .......................... 29

Educating Women, Islam, and Violence in Pakistan ............................................................ 33

Policy Implications ............................................................................................................ 37

Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 41

Appendix 1 .......................................................................................................................... 44

Bibliography ...................................................................................................................... 45
Introduction

Greg Mortensen’s *Three Cups of Tea* tells the stories of two young girls, Tahira and Jahan, who had been destined to work in the harsh fields of rural Pakistan, marry early, and be illiterate for their entire lives. However, their course of fate changed dramatically when their village decided to build a school and hire a teacher. Both young girls were so successful that they earned scholarships to continue their education. While at university, Tahira planned to return as a teacher for the young girls of her village, and Jahan planned to build a hospital to provide healthcare to hers and the surrounding villages.\(^1\) The same problems in rural Pakistan that had previously destined these girls to poverty and agriculture drive many young men into the arms of violent organizations. If these young women become educated, following a path like that of Tahira and Jahan, they can be part of a creative solution to keep young men from choosing the path of violence.

The current War on Terror is a multi-faceted conflict that requires creative methods that countries do not employ in conventional wars. That is not to say that conventional techniques are unnecessary; drone attacks and military operations have been important in combating terrorists that organizations have already recruited, radicalized, and activated. However, it is unlikely that targeting violent individuals is an effective strategy to combat terrorism in the long term, as President Obama discussed in a March

2009 speech. This reactive solution does not address the underlying causes of the problem, but the education of young women might be one part of a possible creative solution that does. In advocacy for future projects that explore such solutions, the project at hand attempts to establish a connection between the education of women and the relative level of violence in Pakistan.

The violent threat in this region, that often takes the form of terrorism, originated in Afghanistan and has found sanctuary in Pakistan. In a speech to West Point during which President Obama announced his plan to contribute 30,000 more troops to conflict in Afghanistan, he said:

I make this decision because I am convinced that our security is at stake in Afghanistan and Pakistan. This is the epicenter of violent extremism practiced by al Qaeda. It is from here that we were attacked on 9/11, and it is from here that new attacks are being plotted as I speak. This is no idle danger; no hypothetical threat.

Since a military invasion of rural Pakistan is not a viable option for the American military at the present time and the very presence of American soldiers who are training Pakistani police has caused an outcry throughout the region, this international expansion of violence necessitates more creative responses. These responses an integral part of American counterinsurgency doctrine. While the US is not waging a counterinsurgency

---

3 Obama, Barack. Transcript. “Remarks by the President in Address to the Nation on the Way Forward in Afghanistan and Pakistan.” Policy speech, United States Military Academy at West Point. West Point, NY, 01 December. 2009.
5 The development of institutions such as education and food relief that directly support the civilian population is commonly inferred from Steps 3 and 7 of David Galula’s method of counterinsurgency, which serves as the keystone for modern Western counterinsurgency doctrine. Galula, David.
in Pakistan, the lessons and tactics used in counterinsurgency can be effective against violent organizations there.

   On a broader level, if as existing literature suggests, violence is energized by poverty, deprivation, and disaffected youths, then it is no surprise that even when traditional warfare is an option, it is ineffective. The question is, have theorists adequately explored all the policy instruments available to stem the growth of violence in these regions? Although established theoretical disciplines on the causes of internal conflict have assessed that violence is rooted in its feasibility and that internal conflict is derived from religious fanaticism, few theorists have considered women as the potentially crucial social links upon which solutions to these problems develop. This analysis attempts to fill the gap in the literature by critically examining the academic debate surrounding the connections between the education rates of women and the rates of violent crime. This paper will contribute to the ongoing academic exploration of other ways to combat terrorism by using Pakistan as a case study for exploring whether or not these theoretical connections exist in practice. Because our policy options are so limited in a place like rural Pakistan, if there is evidence that these connections could help with even a small part of the problem, they are worth exploring further.

   Specifically, in this paper I will explore four theoretical and academic connections between the education of women and the potential it has to reduce violence. I will begin with examining potential direct connections to determine if the level of girls’ primary education has a direct impact on the level of violence in a country. I will then explore the

connections between the education of women, economics, and violence. This section will look at two debates: whether or not education of women increases incomes and whether or not increases in incomes cause a decrease in violence. In order for education to have an impact on violence, education would have to increase incomes, which then has to in-turn decrease violence, an admittedly tenuous connection. I will then explore a similarly tenuous link between the education of women and social factors, specifically the youth bulge and gender inequality. I will examine the literature to see if the reduction of either of these is likely to also reduce violence. I will end with an exploration of the specific relationship between education, Islam and violence, looking at what the *hadith* say about both educating women and whether or not a son needs his parents’ permission to join a jihad, in order to assess any unique benefits of educating women as a counter to violent Islamists. It quickly becomes clear that these aspects of education of women and violence cannot be easily disaggregated, as economics often affect social situations which Islam significantly affects in Muslim countries. These can be intimately intertwined and changing one can potentially change the others as well.

After academically exploring these connections, I will turn to Pakistan as a case study of the connection between educating women and reducing violence. I will first examine statistics to assess whether or not a direct correlation exists between female primary enrollment rates and rates of violent crime in Pakistan. I will then turn to the qualitative ways in which increasing the education of women is changing lives in Pakistan today, which are illustrative examples of the theories explored in the first section. Finally, I will look at the way Islam impacts the education of women and
violence in Pakistan today. I expect to find that the stories of Tahira and Jahan allude to potential solutions for the root causes of internal conflict that, if implemented, could improve stability in conflict zones for years to come.

The paper joins other studies in arguing that educating women and girls in the developing world has measurable benefits. These benefits include improved health indicators, including lower maternal and infant mortality rates and higher rates of child immunization, faster economic growth for the community, and better future prospects for both the woman and her family, which can each have potential effects on long term security. Authors have even compared these benefits to the benefits of educating boys and have found a much greater return on investing in the education of girls. Less often investigated are the connections between the education of girls and increased security. If there is evidence that an increase in the security situation over the long term is one of the benefits of educating girls specifically, policy maker should prioritize targeting the primary female education as one facet of the long-term strategy to win the War on Terror.
Theoretical Connections between Education of Women and Violence

Direct Connections

Before exploring the connections between socioeconomic factors, religious factors, education of women, and violence, it is first necessary to discuss the literature that ties the two together directly. Through a study that combined interviews and historical research, Alan Krueger and Jitka Maleckova found that there is no connection between support for terrorism or hate crimes and the level of education, across time, cultures, and countries. In several cases they found that in terrorist organizations, members had higher than average incomes. In 1998, their data showed that the poverty rate among Hezbollah fighters in Lebanon were more likely to have attended secondary school than the general Lebanese population. They compare terrorism to hate crimes due to the similar motives and methods that the groups have, and they show that the number of hate crimes or hate groups in counties across the United States in 1997 had no relation to the unemployment rate, inequality rates between the races, or education level.6 They conclude the number of hate crimes is more correlated with the complicity of law enforcement officers or breakdown of law enforcement itself than with education level.

In contrast to theorists who state that there is no connection between education and violence, Eli Berman and Laurence Iannaccone discuss the impact of “club goods” on individuals’ decisions to join radical organizations and to engage in violence for these organizations. These organizations, like cults throughout history, are built around people who are inherently sacrificial, as the group demands large sacrifices before admitting

members. In return for these sacrifices of time, money, and other opportunities, members of the group have guaranteed “club goods.” These goods include help in difficult economic times, including assistance for children in case of the death of either parent, and an education for children, even if this education is skewed to support the organization’s worldview. Berman uses nonviolent radical religious groups to demonstrate the theory, including the Amish in the United States and ultra Orthodox Jews in Israel. He recommends that governments provide these club goods, including education, so that people will be less likely to join radical religious organizations. By his argument, increasing opportunities for education outside of radical groups would be one way to combat the appeal of radical organizations.

There is a possibility that there are other direct connections between the levels of education and violence for women. In countries where women are traditionally not educated, increasing their levels of education could increase their potential to be targets of violence. Violent organizations could target girls’ schools in order to convince families that the girls are in danger. There is also potential for domestic violence to increase as women become more independent from their husbands. There is evidence from Pakistan that girls’ schools become targets of jihadi organizations, which increases the rates of violence when there are more schools for girls. While there is the potential that domestic violence could increase as women are educated, a man would not allow his wife or daughter to go to school if he were against their education. There is far more evidence

---

from NGOs that domestic violence decreases with increased female education because women are more aware of their rights and resources.  

Direct academic connections between the levels of female enrollment in education and the levels of violence in the country are not common and are strongly debated. One side of the debate says that government education would reduce violence because it competes with the education that radical religious organizations provide; the opposite side says that it may actually increase violence, especially in cultures where men do not want women to be educated. In the middle is the possibility that education has no effect on the choice to participate in violence, meaning that there must be other root causes to violence. Because this debate does not provide a clear answer about the effects of education on levels of violence, it becomes necessary to explore more indirect connections to see if they exist. The following section does so, examining how education impacts economics, social factors, and religious factors, which then can be potentially traced to violence through the academic debates.

*Education of Women, Economics and Violence*

While there is a general lack of consensus as to whether or not a person’s education level will determine if he or she will become a terrorist, there are other important dynamics at work in the relationship between the education of women, economics, and violence. The Millennium Development Goals (MDG), a set of global targets aimed to halve the rate of worldwide extreme poverty between 2000 and 2015, included universal primary education and parity in education for girls and boys as

---

10 South Asia Partnership-Pakistan. “Ending Violence against Women.”
individual targets. The 2009 MDG Progress Report devoted an entire section to the premise that “progress in development and girls’ education go hand in hand.”\textsuperscript{11} This recent elevation in the priority of educating women reflects the recent trend in academia and the international community on the potential for educating girls to impact poverty levels. It is possible to trace this impact through various indicators, including increased income and improved health statistics.

\textit{Education and Income}

One of the most intuitive impacts of increased education is the increase in production capability, which leads to an increased ability to earn income. This is often an increase in income not only for the individual woman but also for the family and the entire village. Barbara Herz conducted an aggregated study for the U.S. Council on Foreign Relations of the benefits of educating girls in the developing world. This report concludes that educating women increases the individual wages of the women, increases the GDP for the entire country, and has significant benefits on the agricultural productivity of the region. In Guinea and Brazil, women with more education were less likely to work in informal or domestic jobs, which have particularly low wages. By moving women into the formal work sector, they increased their individual wages and helped the general economy to grow.\textsuperscript{12} Paul Glewwe, a researcher from the University of Minnesota and the World Bank, additionally found in 2002 that cognitive skills learned in

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
school have a direct impact on wages for all students. Women who are educated are able to get higher paying jobs, become government teachers or innovate with new technology utilizing their income from agriculture. Herz discusses several African countries, including Kenya, in which women with increased education have a much higher agricultural productivity. Gary Becker, a Nobel Laureate in Economics, discusses the ways in which an increase in physical capital is insufficient to increase incomes unless there is also an increase in the education levels. He cites the exponential growth of economies of East Asia like Japan, Hong Kong and South Korea that have limited natural resources but increased their education levels, which he translates into an expansion of human capital.

While this academic evidence illustrates positive correlations between education and income, the other side of the debate says that an increase in education, especially primary education does not necessarily lead to an increase in incomes for the women or the villages. William Easterly examines how nations around the world, especially those in Africa, have had impressive increases in their primary enrollment rates, from 15% to 80% since 1960 in some countries. Yet the economic growth of these countries has not kept pace with these escalating enrollment rates. He attributes this to the lack of increased physical capital in the counties, which is a corollary of Becker’s argument. He shows that if there is a similar increase in both human and physical capital, there will be significant

---

14 Herz, pp24-25.
economic growth, using the same examples of East Asia between 1960 and 2005.\textsuperscript{16}
Pritchett supports this theory with cross-national data that shows that increases in educational attainment around the world have not lead to the expected increases in economic growth.\textsuperscript{17} George Psacharopoulos clarifies these issues by saying that there are “tangible and measurable returns to investment in education” on the micro level, but these cannot be extended to macro level analyses, like that of Easterly and Pritchett.\textsuperscript{18} These studies are important in discussing the links between education and violence because if education does not increase income, it does not matter if levels of violence are connected to increased incomes.

\textit{Income and Violence}

In order to continue the exploration of education and violence, I will move beyond the previous debate temporarily in order to discuss the connections between income and violence, returning to it shortly to explore the overall connections. James Fearon and David Laitin found a statistically significant correlation between per capita income and incidence of internal conflict and use Africa, the Middle East, and Asia to show that “$1000 less in income corresponds to 34\%$ greater annual odds of outbreak [of civil war].”\textsuperscript{19} In fact, they found that income had a much greater impact than inequality, although competing theorists contend that inequality is the much more important

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{17} Pritchett, 367.
\end{flushleft}
measure.\textsuperscript{20} Paul Collier, a professor of economics at Oxford University, has done multiple studies about the impacts of economics on internal conflict and repeated his study again in 2009, which found once again that higher per capita incomes correlate with more stable societies. He also found that a strong correlation that increased GDP per capita steadily decreases the risk of conflict.\textsuperscript{21} Richard Posner, a Court of Appeals judge, examines the differences in the impact of income inequality against the impact of average income in a society. Like Collier and Fearon, he finds that lower incomes correlate much more strongly with instability. He says that this could be due to the fact that destitute people are less likely to care if the government changes, believing that it could not be much worse for them even if there was someone different in power.\textsuperscript{22} While most of the academic evidence says that higher levels of per capita income will increase levels of stability, Collier also discusses the cost of rebellion in comparison to the cost of a legal political party.\textsuperscript{23} Because it is so much more expensive to run a rebellion, the increase in income could potentially make a rebellion more economically possible.

Education of women, economics, and violence weave a tangled web of potential effects, without clear relationships or lines from cause to effect but intricate pathways. There is an academic debate as to whether or not education impacts income and an entirely separate debate as to whether or not incomes impact violence. There is potential for there to be positive impacts, negative impacts, or simply none at all. However, when

\textsuperscript{22} Posner, p349.
\textsuperscript{23} Collier, 5-6.
discussing these connections in reference to fighting a war without conventional military methods, any connection can necessitate further exploration. When options are limited, even weak connections become possible solutions, even if only for a very small part of the larger problem. This leads us into further exploration of the potential connections of women’s education and violence, looking now beyond incomes to the social impacts of these decisions.

**Education of Women, Social Factors and Violence**

Education can affect many aspects of a society beyond its economics, and these effects can potentially have an impact on the levels of violence. This section will look at three separate social aspects that education potentially impacts: gender inequality, the health indicators, and the youth bulge. After discussing the academic debate about whether or not education affects each of these social factors, I will then explore the ways that these factors may or may not affect the levels of violence in developing countries. This exploration of ideas may produce a thread of relationship from women’s education to violence through society that could be important for policy makers.

**Gender Inequality**

The Millennium Development Goals clearly state parity of boys and girls in education as one of the targets for 2015. Gender equality in education is in the development goals because it can help reduce poverty, but it also has potential effects on long term security. Mary Caprioli’s 2005 study concluded that states with higher incidents of gender inequality also experienced a higher rate of violence. While she says that it is possible to predict the likelihood of intrastate violence based on the rate of
gender inequality or discrimination, she does not directly tie the two together. Galia
Golan similarly explains the importance of women’s role in conflict resolution by looking
at the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. Again, she does not draw a direct connection but she
does offer insight into the importance of women in the reduction of future violence.
Systematically concentrating on educating women can decrease the levels of gender
inequality, which could decrease the likelihood that a state would experience internal
conflict.

Glewwe’s work further found that specific types of education, like health or
mathematics has an impact on socioeconomic factors outside labor productivity,
especially when concentrated on the female students. In Ghana, for example, the rates of
return on investment in education were much higher when the quality of education was
improved, rather than just the time spent in school.24 Paul Schultz says the marginal
benefits of educating women outweigh those of educating men and shows that these
results are based on statistical analyses around the world, which provides incentive for
countries to focus disproportionately on building an education system that supports
girls.25 The Council on Foreign Relations report found that in countries like Brazil, Chad,
India, and the Philippines, “increasing women’s education by one year beyond the
average boosted the probability of children’s enrollment in schools by 1-6 percentage
points.”26 This argument provides a basis for why it is important to concentrate on
increasing the rates of educating women, rather than education in general.

24 Glewwe, 477.
26 Herz, p30.
Health Indicators

One of the most immediate impacts of educating girls is the improvements in the health care indicators of women and children. Herz’s report for the Council on Foreign Relations examined countries across the developing world and found that this was one of the most predictable effects. As education levels for girls increase, maternal and infant mortality rates decrease; family size gets smaller; and immunization rates and child survival rates beyond five increase.\(^{27}\) On average for every four additional years of education that women receive, the birth rate for the entire country drops by about one birth.\(^{28}\) Schultz finds that a single additional year of nationwide girls’ education can reduce the infant mortality rate between 5-10%.\(^{29}\) There is little academic debate as to whether girls’ education improves the health of their families and villages. These studies have been repeated and confirmed throughout the world.

Once again, these improvements are only useful to policy makers in the War on Terror if they potentially impact the security situation, which is a more debated connection. The potential that health effects have on security could work in two separate ways. The first is through the reduction in the size of the youth bulge, which I will discuss in the following section. The second is through the improvement in the economic situations of the families of the individual women. With fewer children per family, the family’s income is more concentrated on each child, and this provides a higher economic

\(^{27}\) Herz, p4.  
\(^{28}\) Herz, p4.  
\(^{29}\) Schultz.
status to the family.\textsuperscript{30} This increase in income cycles back to the academic debate as to whether or not income levels affect violence. If one agrees with Berman, that greater access to resources reduces violence then improving health indicators can be indirectly connected to increasing the security situation. If one agrees, however, that income is not linked to violence then the health impacts of educating women cannot be linked to levels of violence.

\textit{The Youth Bulge}

There is evidence that countries with an unusually large proportion of young people, commonly known as a youth bulge, have a greater likelihood of suffering internal conflict, especially when there a greater proportion of young men. Collier, who had not found a significant relationship to the youth bulge in earlier articles, used more data and more accurate data in his 2009 study, in which he found that having a “doubling in the proportion of the population in this category [males 15-29] increases the risk of conflict from 4.7 per cent to 31.9 per cent.”\textsuperscript{31} Fearon and Laitin also find that violence is correlated with a youth bulge but that it is not statistically significant.\textsuperscript{32} In his study, Henrik Urdal supports the finding that large youth bulges correlate with increased instability, and his study explores some of the reasons. He found that the larger the youth bulge, the lower the opportunity cost for young men joining an insurgency or violent organization. He finds that the risk is greatest when a youth bulge is combined with a

\textsuperscript{31} Collier, p19.
\textsuperscript{32} Fearon, p86.
high dependency ratio.\textsuperscript{33} Having a large number of young men without opportunities to be involved in productive activities like further education or employment creates a large unoccupied cohort that make violence much more feasible.

Education of women can potentially reduce the threat of a youth bulge in two separate ways. As stated previously, one of the health benefits of educating women is a decreased family size. With fewer children per family, the proportion of young men to the total population will begin to decrease over time, which makes this a long term solution to this variable.\textsuperscript{34} In addition to reducing the size of the youth bulge, education of women potentially has the power to impact the economy, according to authors like Glewwe and Schultz. If education prompts economic growth, educating women can also lead to increased economic opportunity for the young men around them and for their children. By increasing the opportunity cost of engaging in violence, based on Urdal’s study, it is more likely that young men will choose to be productive rather than violent members of society.

While the education of women could reduce the threat of the youth bulge, it is also possible that the education of women could actually increase the unique problems of this demographic anomaly. According to Jack Goldstone, an educated youth bulge is just

\textsuperscript{33} Urdal, Henrik. “A Clash of Generations? Youth Bulges and Political Violence.” International Studies Quarterly. Vol. 50, No. 3, (2006), p611. An age dependency ratio is the comparison of the population who are below 14 or 65 divided by the population between the ages of 14-65. This is intended to quantify the responsibility each working person carries for the nonworking people, basing the ability to work solely on age.

as dangerous, if not more so, than an uneducated youth bulge. Educating women could potentially increase the education levels of their children. Yet if educating women fails to also improve the economic status of the community, it can produce an educated youth bulge with high expectations that cannot be met by the demand of the local economy. Because these educated young people often have fewer responsibilities to their families, they are “relatively easily mobilized for social or political conflicts.” When considering the effects that educating women can have on violence through the lens of the youth bulge, there could be a long term positive effect or it could actually increase the likelihood that violence will continue. Therefore, it is necessary to consider this possibility strongly when looking to use education as a policy tool for the War on Terror.

*Beyond the Youth Bulge*

This phenomenon could potentially increase violence, even if there is no youth bulge. Ted Gurr’s seminal work on rebellion shows that relative deprivation leads to internal conflict. By educating the population and giving them expectations that the economy cannot keep, it creates the situation Gurr describes as “aspirational deprivation.” This is also a potential danger that policy makers must keep in mind before choosing to employ the tactic of increasing education.

Educating women potentially affects gender inequality, health indicators, and the youth bulge; and each, in turn, has the potential to affect levels of violence. Gender inequality is correlated with violence levels, and an increase in the education of females

---

36 Goldstone, 11.
decreases that gender inequality. Experts widely accept that educating women improves health indicators, but there is not clear evidence that this would then lead to a decrease in violence. Finally, increasing female education may lead to an improvement in the problems caused by the youth bulge, but it also has the potential to exacerbate these problems through inflated expectations that developing economies cannot meet. It is possible to find a relationship between these factors, although it a debated and tenuous one. Due to the possibility that it could increase violence over the long term, policy makers need to weigh the evidence for either side before deciding to pursue the education of women as a tactic to reducing violence.

**Education of Women, Islam and Violence**

According to the President’s speech at West Point, our security depends on the stability of Afghanistan and Pakistan, and discussing security in these two countries is impossible without addressing the impacts that Islam has the societies and the militancy there. Because much of the current threats from these areas originate in jihadist organizations rather than criminal violence, it is important to understand what people believe that Islam says about joining these organizations and the ways in which educating women may influence these decisions.

There is a debate, especially in the conservative Muslim world, as to whether Islam permits girls to go to school. On one side of this debate are those who adhere to two hadith that make it obligatory for all Muslims, men and women, to acquire
knowledge. The first, relayed by Abu Hurairah, says that “The word of wisdom is the lost property of the believer; so wherever he finds it, he has a better right to it” (Tr 39:19). The Arabic word for find in this context means to persevere after an object, meaning that each Muslim believer is to persevere after wisdom and knowledge. The second, which is on weaker authority reported by Anas, says “The seeking of knowledge is obligatory upon every Muslim” (Bhq-Msh 2). A different version of this hadith even includes the phrase “both men and women” at the end of it. According to these two hadith, there should be no discrimination in education because all Muslims are required to seek it. However, not all Muslim clerics interpret these hadith to mean that girls should be allowed to attend school. For example, Shah Dauran, a radical cleric in Pakistan declared, “Female education is against Islamic teachings and spreads vulgarity in society.” These are not mainstream Islamic views; the Ministry of Education in Saudi Arabia, one of the most conservative Muslim states in the world, has built schools and universities for women, steadily increasing the female enrollment rate over the last fifty years. However, the more restrictive interpretation of Islam, barring women from school, has had impact on Muslim societies where radical Islamist groups are taking over land, including Pakistan.

---

38 Hadith, as an Arabic word, is already in its plural form, which negates the need to make it plural in English.
Another important debate within Islam relevant to counterterrorism efforts is whether or not a son must obtain his parents’ permission before joining a jihad. One argument for educating women could be that women are less likely to give permission to their sons to join violent organizations. This could impact the level of violence in Pakistan if Islam requires sons to get permission from their parents before joining a jihad. Supporters of required parental permission cite the following hadith to demonstrate that the Prophet Mohammad required this permission:

Abdullah b. 'Anir reported that a person came to Allah's Apostle (may peace be upon him) and sought permission (to participate) in Jihad, whereupon he (the Holy Prophet) said: Are your parents living? He said: Yes. Thereupon he (the Holy Prophet) said: You should put in your best efforts (in their) service. (Book 032, Number 6184)\(^{43}\)

Narrated Abu Sa'id al-Khudri: A man emigrated to the Apostle of Allah (may peace be upon him) from the Yemen. He asked (him): Have you anyone (of your relatives) in the Yemen? He replied: My parents. He asked: Did they permit you? He replied: No. He said: Go back to them and ask for their permission. If they permit you, then fight (in the path of Allah), otherwise be devoted to them. (Book 014, Number 2425)\(^{44}\)

However, there is another school of thought within Islam that suggests that parental permission is unnecessary to join jihad. They use three hadith to support their claim, saying that you do not need your parents’ permission to do anything that Allah requires. "Obedience is in what is right" (Saheeh Al-Jaami As-Sagheer No. 3967); "There is no obedience to the creation in disobedience to the creator" (Saheeh Al-Jaami' As-Sagheer No. 2323); and "There is no obedience to one who does not obey Allah" (Saheeh

\(^{43}\) University of Southern California, Center for Muslim-Jewish Engagement. *The Book of Virtue, Good Manners, and Joining the Ties of Relationship: Translation of Sahih Muslim, Book 32.*

\(^{44}\) University of Southern California, Center for Muslim-Jewish Engagement. *The Book of Jihad: A Partial Translation of Sunan Abu-Dawud, Book 14.*
Al-Jaami’ As-Sagheer No. 7397). Because Allah requires *fard kafiya*, the offensive war of jihad burdened upon the Muslim community rather than individuals, a son does not need his parents’ permission to join the jihad.

These two debates within Islam are important in developing potential connections between women’s education and violence. When considering development as a tactic to fight a war, understanding the way that the population will receive development is important. In these areas, interpretation of Islam is going to be very important in the reception of the message. It will not matter how much the United States believes that the education of women is connected to reducing violence if the people of the country believe that Islam forbids education of women. If the population accepts the interpretation that women are allowed to be educated, the second debate then becomes important. Educated women are less likely to give their consent for their sons to join the jihad, which reduces the young men available to these radical organizations.

---

45 University of Essex Islamic Society. “Obedience to Parents Clashing with Obedience to Allah.”
46 Galula.
The Education of Women and Violence in Pakistan: Exploration of a Case Study

Current State of Education in Pakistan

After exploring four separate potential paths through which education can impact security, whether directly or through economics, social factors, or religion, it is necessary to see how these theories operate in Pakistan. Due to its importance to US national security, Pakistan as case study provides an opportunity to empirically assess if the education of women has any impact on the levels of violence. Given the limitations on U.S. policy to counter the growth of violent movements within Pakistan, any linkages between women’s education level and a reduction in violence in Pakistan should be seized upon by policymakers as an opportunity to more comprehensively implement policy changes to support the War on Terror.

Before exploring the connections between the education of women and violence in Pakistan, it is first necessary to understand some of the basics about the current state of education in Pakistan because, as the quality of education can be even more important than the number of years a student attends, as Glewe explains in his 2002 study. The state of education in Pakistan today is a bleak measure of its development. In 2007, Pakistan’s adult literacy rate is at 54.2%, which places the nation in the bottom twenty in the entire world. When it is segregated by gender, female adult literacy is only 39.6% compared to male adult literacy at 67.7%, scores which are dismal, even in comparison to Bangladesh, a country on the same subcontinent with a human development score that is nearly identical.\footnote{Human Development Report Data 2009. “Pakistan Country Report: The Human Development Index—}
the percentage of GDP spent on education from 1988 to 2003.\textsuperscript{48} There are thousands of “ghost schools” throughout Pakistan, which do not exist but the government pays for the building and the teachers. This rampant corruption further diminishes the amount that the government actually spends on educating students. There are often more than forty students in a classroom, and students do not have basic necessities, like paper, pencils or books. In fact, more than 27\% of schools do not have regular electricity, and 6\% do not have a building in which their school can meet.\textsuperscript{49} One of the most common complaints among parents is that teachers do not show up for school, so that even when students are released from their responsibilities at home in order to go to school, they are still not benefitting from the opportunity.

There are four types of schools in Pakistan, and each one targets a different type of student. Wealthy families generally attend private schools where English is the primary language of instruction. These private institutions offer a higher quality education than the other three types of Pakistani schools. Furthermore, students that attend private schools are more likely to attend university and be eligible for government jobs.\textsuperscript{50} NGO schools, the second type available to Pakistani students, also charge students for attendance but generally have more scholarships, which allow a wider variety of students to attend. Government schools are one of the last options for education, are usually the lowest quality, do not have enough teachers, and are considered widely

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
The final option for education is religious madrassas. These religious schools, especially the radical Islamist ones, operate most successfully in places where the government does not have control. While it is important to keep in mind the differences between the types of education, the rates of education we examine will be the net enrollment rates that do not differentiate between the types of schools. Although there have been multiple laws passed over the last decade requiring madrassas to register with the government, there is no enforcement, and official estimates indicate only about one third the religious schools have complied with the law. Therefore, it is unlikely that all the students who attend madrassas are included in the enrollment rates, an important caveat before considering Pakistani school trends in aggregate.

When applying the previously discussed theories to Pakistan, it is important to understand the current state of the education system. There are large areas of the country that the government does not service, and even when the government provides schools, it does not provide quality education. This is important in light of studies like Easterly’s that show enrollment rates are not sufficient for growing the economy. Even if more girls are able to attend these schools, it does not necessarily mean that they will receive all the potential benefits.

**Direct Connections in Pakistan**

To first address the issue of women’s education and violence in Pakistan, it is necessary to examine the potential direct connections. In order to explore these

---

51 Khan, 25.
52 Singer, p2.
connections, I compare the net enrollment rates\textsuperscript{53} for primary school girls from 1990 to 2004\textsuperscript{54} to the crime rates per 1000 people from 1997-2006.\textsuperscript{55} It is necessary to go back to 1990 for the education statistics to account for the time lag that is inherent in the hypothesis. It is possible that an even greater time lag exists before many of the effects become visible, but this time span should allow us to begin to explore the question at hand. While educating girls may have an effect on the levels of violence in an area, such effect will not manifest in the communities for years. The girls must complete their education and begin raising their own families. There has been a general increase in net enrollment rates of females in primary school from 1990-2004, although not a steady incline. Violent crime rates from 1997-2006 declined until 2002, when a steady ascent began. The data indicates that there is not a direct correlation between the net education enrollment rates for girls in primary school and the violent crime rates, which is illustrated in the chart in Appendix 1.\textsuperscript{56}

An examination of the factors that impact both the education and the crime rate indicates a few reasons why no strong correlation exists. One possible reason is that my

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{53} A net enrollment rate is the number of girls in primary school between the ages of 5-9 divided by the total population of girls aged 5-9. It is considered a more accurate measure of successful enrollment than gross enrollment rates, which are the total number of girls in primary school, divided by the female population ages 5-9. Khan p3.
\item \textsuperscript{54} Education rates came from Khan, the World Bank Education Statistics, UNESCO, and the Government of Pakistan Report on Baluchistan. Further details are in the Appendix. The statistics for education are difficult to find because the government does not necessarily want to publish the enrollment rates. It is possible to find information on the number of girls in primary school but not disaggregated population information in order to determine the rates. Therefore, there is only data for the following years: 1990, 1991, 1996, 2001, and 2004.
\item \textsuperscript{55} Crime statistics for the entire country came from Pakistan’s Federal Bureau of Statistics and included murders, attempted murders, and kidnapings. The rates did not include data from the Federally Administered Tribal Areas because the government of Pakistan is not in control of those areas and cannot gather statistics. The total number of violent crimes were divided by the population and multiplied by 1000. The population statistics came from the US Census Bureau.
\item \textsuperscript{56} See Appendix 1 for chart and table comparisons.
\end{itemize}
study has not been conducted over a suitably long enough time for the correlation to reveal itself: the change may be so gradual that my current results do not yet show a stark contrast in violent crime rates across the entire country between the time before education was introduced and the end of the study. Another possibility is that education does not have that great of an effect on violent crime rates in a country like Pakistan because there are too many other factors that affect and change the crime rate. Pakistan is currently fighting an insurgency that has come from Afghanistan. These are not all young Pakistani men, which means that educating Pakistani women will not have the same effect in countering their decisions to join violent organizations. A third potential reason that the lines do not correlate is that increasing the education of women does not affect crime rates on a macro level. This type of aggregated data does not necessarily reflect the impact that these reforms have on individual families or communities, which could be consistent with Psacharopoulos.

At no point in time is the net enrollment rate for primary girls above 50%, which means more than half of girls ages 5-9 are not even getting to start school. There are a variety of reasons that these numbers are so low. Families are less likely to educate their daughters because they do not perceive that the previously described benefits will extend to them. Because women live with their husband’s families after their weddings, any economic benefit extends to the husband’s family rather than the wife’s. One NGO leader also said that educating women can lead to increased levels of domestic violence in rural Pakistan but that these women are generally also better able to take advantage of the
available resources.\textsuperscript{57} Therefore, there has to be some other incentive for families to send their daughters to school. There have been several suggestions as to what the Pakistani government could do to encourage the increased education of girls, including offering the families stipends. This would allow the families to make up some of the lost wages since their daughters are no longer working in the fields at home.\textsuperscript{58} The lost wages are even greater when there is no government school available and the family must pay the tuition for a private one. In these cases, the daughter is far less likely to be allowed to attend school. In fact, despite the variety of types of schools in Pakistan, unavailability of schools in rural regions is one of the top reasons that girls have cited for not attending school.

This lack of correlation is important for policymakers to understand. As the debate demonstrates, these links are not direct. Increasing education is not a panacea to the War on Terror in Pakistan, but it also does not discount all the literature that does draw tenuous connections between women’s education and violence. Aggregating the numbers does not necessarily show local impacts of education on violence. In order to explore some of these local impacts, I will discuss some individual cases of people and organizations working to increase women’s education. I will then examine the effects these efforts have had to see if they could impact levels of violence locally and be a tool for combating terrorism, if only a small one.

\textsuperscript{57} Mufti, Irfan. Interview with author through email. (11 April 2010).
\textsuperscript{58} Latif, p420.
**Education of Women, Socioeconomic Factors, and Violence in Pakistan**

In a patriarchal society like Pakistan, the education of women is uniquely important to their increased status in society. Without an education, they keep a “subordinate status in family, community, and society.”\(^5\) Their education is tied to their economic status because it gives them independence through opportunities to earn their own wages and through the knowledge of their rights within the community and within Islam. Education also provides access to resources that the women otherwise would not have. South Asia Partnership Pakistan SAP-Pk chooses to work in areas that have very high security risks, including FATA, Swat, Dir, and North Waziristan because they understand this is where women need their help the most.\(^6\)

SAP-Pk does research projects throughout these regions in order to determine what women need to strengthen their positions in their families and communities. They conducted a large scale study that included public forums, focus group discussions, and case studies to determine the ways in which the rural poor are affected by globalization and some potential ways help with these changes. Several suggestions included increasing participation for women in social and governance processes, improving agricultural credit systems, and providing basic knowledge about common plant and animal diseases and treatments. But one of their repeated suggestions was to implement a basic literacy and skills program through girls’ schools in rural regions. These schools would teach basic subjects but would also include classes on agriculture, how to

---

\(^5\) Mufti.  
\(^6\) Mufti.
determine a market price for goods, and how to understand the impact of globalization on a micro level.\textsuperscript{61}

Rather than starting the schools themselves, SAP-Pk has a training program that teaches local women how to work with one another to contribute to social development in their own communities. These women then work with one another to build small schools and hire teachers on through the village. This creates a self-sustaining movement that can continue to build the communities for decades rather then depend upon the NGO to provide all the necessities and resources.\textsuperscript{62} According to Schultz, education increases income through acquiring basic skills. By providing training for these women, SAP-Pk is creating these skills in a generation of women who then affect their families and communities. This is different than concentrating on increasing the primary education enrollment rate, but could have an even more immediate effect because the women can then train their children they already have.

The All Pakistan’s Women’s Association (APWA) started a school in Gujarnalla fifty years ago, and this is a perfect example of the ways that education can affect a community.\textsuperscript{63} This school has done more for its community than just educated the young girls, which has the potential to have many positive impacts on its own. APWA has specifically concentrated on making health education part of the daily curriculum and then included the community in education about HIV/AIDS prevention. These classes and this focus on health are likely to increase the normal benefits that girls’ education

\textsuperscript{61} South Asia Partnership Pakistan, “Ascertaining Impacts of Globalisation on Rural Women in Pakistan.”
\textsuperscript{63} All Pakistan Women’s Association. “APWA Ayesha Siddiqa School—Gujarnalla.” (12 Dec 2008).
generally has on health indicators. This could decrease the size of families even more quickly, as HIV/AIDS education focuses on sex education and family planning, and could reduce the youth bulge issue in this particular community.

The APWA also has a girls’ school in Yousuf Goth that has implemented several incentives in order to overcome the barriers that girls usually face in coming to school. Because Yousuf Goth is a poverty stricken region, these barriers are even higher. As mentioned before, the opportunity cost for sending girls to school can be particularly high if the family depends on the girls for agricultural labor or to care for younger children so that mothers can work. In order to offset some of these opportunity costs APWA has made the direct cost for attending the school particularly low. They provide all students with uniforms and books. The effort has been so successful in the town, that the villagers have asked APWA to begin a boys session for school in the afternoon when the girls have gone home for the day.64

The Shuhuda Organization is one that is especially poised to educate women who would then have an effect on the violent situation in Pakistan. Shahuda specializes in educating and training Afghan women both inside and outside Afghanistan, which includes large swaths of Pakistan where refugees have fled the decades of civil war in Afghanistan. These refugee camps can become recruiting grounds for terrorist organizations, multiplying the potential positive effects of educating women, if they do in fact impact the levels of violence.65 Shahuda started a night school near Quetta for

64 All Pakistan Women’s Association. “APWA Yousuf Goth Primary School.” (12 Dec 2008.)
Afghan girls whose families would not allow them to attend school during the day due to family responsibilities. These schools, like those of the SAP-Pk women concentrate on teaching important skills that can be translated into family income but also educate women on their rights, roles, and resources in the community. They use education as a tool to address inequality, which Caprioli says can be one of the indicators of a less stable society.

Safiya Aftab builds on the work of Krueger and finds further evidence that poverty is not directly linked with increases in extremism, militancy or violence. Looking specifically at Pakistan, he found that during the years and the areas in Pakistan that poverty decreased, there was no correlating decrease in violence. He does say that when there are other conditions, like the lack of suitable employment or insufficient public schooling, poverty can be a driving factor that turns people to militancy. This reflects the theories about the youth bulge, both educated and uneducated. Concentration on educating women in Pakistan could have either a positive effect on these problems in Pakistan, by potentially growing the economy and reducing the size of families so that each child has access or more resources, or it could have a negative effect, creating an educated population with unmet expectations who are even more willing to join a violent organization.

These examples provide a glimpse into the ways that the social and economic theories work in Pakistan on a micro level. These are organizations and people who

---


promote the education of young women in order to better their stance in life or to strengthen the status of women around Pakistan. By applying some theoretical connections, it could be possible to understand the way that their efforts may affect the long term security situation in these areas. As mentioned before, the lens of Islam will ultimate color the way that any Pakistani interprets these effects, and it is, therefore, necessary to turn next to the ways that Islam impacts these factors in Pakistan.

**Educating Women, Islam, and Violence in Pakistan**

As a country founded specifically as a land for Muslims who did not want to be under Indian Hindu rule, Islam is a significant factor in decisions about educating women and about violence in Pakistan. Any discussion of these aspects of Pakistani life would be incomplete without reference to the effects Islam could have. Because much of the current violence in Pakistan originates in jihadist organizations rather than criminal violence, it is important to understand what people believe that Islam says about joining these organizations and the ways in which educating women may influence these decisions.

The debate about sending girls to school became very real for Pakistanis living in the Swat valley when the Pakistani Taliban began to militarily move into the valley in 2007, led by a prominent radical Muslim cleric in the Northwest Frontier Province named Maulana Fazlullah. As he militarily moved through the valley, he brought his radical beliefs that families should not send girls to school. He also began burning down girls’
schools in the region in order to stop them from attending school at all.\textsuperscript{68} He and his followers destroyed more than 125 girls’ schools in the Swat Valley, and they Pakistani Taliban threatened to continue bombing the schools until they closed themselves.\textsuperscript{69} The Pakistani government declared victory over the Taliban in the Swat Valley in 2007, although fighting resumed in the summer of 2009.\textsuperscript{70} In this situation, educating girls in Pakistan made them targets of violence, which they may not have been had they not been in school, one of the potential negative effects of further education of women. Fazlullah used Islam as his reasoning for targeting girls’ schools, but Islam has other potential connections to women’s education and violence inside Pakistan.

When examining the debate within Islam about the permission to join the jihad, Victor Asal and Christine Fair did a study of militant families in Pakistan that showed education actually had no impact on the likelihood of the parents consenting or refusing permission for their sons to join jihad. They did, however, find a strong significance to the economic standing of the families. Wealthier families were more likely to refuse consent to their sons.\textsuperscript{71} According to other connections, educating women may help attain this higher economic status, but refused permission will not necessarily be a direct result.

Islam is important in considering the impact of girls’ education on violence because Islam is such an integral part of the education system of Pakistan. As discussed before, madrassas are a significant source of education, especially for rural areas where


\textsuperscript{69} Hussain.


the government has not even tried to build schools. There is a chain of Islamic schools
name Al Huda that a woman name Farhat Hashmi began that train women in the Koran,
and its first objective is to “promote purely Islamic values and thinking on sound
knowledge and research.”\(^{72}\) This is one of the few places that women are welcome to
study the Koran even if they are not wearing a hijab, and the women are trained in
Shari’a and can even get help in finding a suitable husband.\(^ {73}\) While these schools remain
unacceptable to those who believe Islam forbids women’s education, it does provide an
example of the ways in which it is possible for women’s education not only to exist
within Islam but thrive and strengthen the religion.

The connections that academicians have found can be explored practically in
Pakistan. Women’s education has had a direct impact on some girls who have chosen to
attend school: they have become targets of terrorists. Yet this has not been the experience
of every girl who has had the opportunity to go to school. Some have been able to join
training programs that have taught them skills to continue building their local economy
and community for years to come. Others have had the opportunity to learn how to have
healthier families and healthier villages. These all have the potential to decrease long
term violence, if these academic connections are found in the real world. Their
contributions to local economies may give young men a job and a reason not to join a
violent organization. Because they have fewer children, each child may be able to get a
better education and therefore a better job. However, being too optimistic about the

\(^{73}\) Khalid, Asma. “Religious Schools Court Wealthy Women in Pakistan.” National Public Radio. (5 April
2010).
possibilities is problematic. These girls and their communities now have greater expectations, which could lead to large disaffected populations if the expectations are not met. These theoretical connections could have very practical consequences in rural Pakistan and in the War on Terror, but those consequences are not necessarily clear.
**Policy Implications**

The current US policy in Pakistan is inconsistent and not viable as a long term solution. Drone attacks are eliminating individual terrorists but also potentially alienating civilians due to collateral damage. Because there are diplomatic and military reasons that an invasion of sovereign Pakistani territory is not a viable option, American leaders must depend upon their Pakistani counterparts to handle the issue militarily. However, Pakistani intelligence is notoriously outside the control of the Pakistani government, and the Pakistani military has been unable to permanently rout the insurgency in rural areas. The US must consider more creative and unconventional methods to counter the threat that is emanating from the country. The connections this paper explores can contribute to these more creative solutions. The connections are not strong ones, and there is a possibility that they will not produce the expected results. However, the tenuous relationship warrants further exploration as a policy option.

Further research into this topic that disaggregates the information into district level would be useful in determining whether or not these have impacts on a more micro level, which according to the exploration is the place that it can have the greatest effects. Looking at the correlations in the individual districts could also help determine where to target experimental programs. The US could look to districts that have already had success in increasing women’s education and decreasing the crime rates to see if there are any other factors that could have contributed to both variables. They can also target areas in which the crime rates are the worst with the plan of reducing these crime rates for the long term, not a quick fix that will immediately revert. This can be a difficult method of
choosing target areas because it then becomes necessary to provide more security and the likelihood of an overeducated population that the local economy cannot support could become a greater threat. These reasons necessitate further research into the potential problems with building these schools, especially in areas that are known for violence against girls’ schools.

This could actually constitute the expansion of a program that already exists called the Frontier Corps, which operates in the Northwest Frontier Province. This Department of Defense Program widely assists with training Pakistani military personnel, but it also has a civilian aid branch that is not well publicized. This is the type of programs that could employ these potential connections on a grander scale.74

The risks associated with the youth bulge are the clearest, and therefore, would be some of the most important to target. Having a large proportion of unemployed young men is a serious risk factor, as several studies showed, including Collier and Fearon. Targeting this demographic could be an important connection to develop further. Another would be to target the economy itself. Because there is a threat that having an overeducated youth bulge also causes instability and internal conflict, targeting the economy itself through several different measures could easily be a tool in the toolbox to fight the War on Terror in Pakistan. Using the education of women with the specific purpose of growing the economy could be a segment of this solution. Providing targeted aid that would promote jobs could be different segment, and promoting foreign investment in the country could be a third segment. Targeted aid could be in the form of

technology to make agriculture more productive or building roads to markets to increase trade, which builds the economies of all the villages that are able to trade with one another. When considering policy implications, it is imperative to understand that each of these solutions, including the increased education of women, only has the potential to help with a small part of the much larger problem. However, in an environment in which US options are as limited as they are in Pakistan, it is important to take victories where they come, no matter how small.

Because Pakistan is a Muslim country, any policies must take into account the ways that Islam and Islamic leaders affect the ways that people think, behave, and respond. Working with individual clerics, especially ones that have influence among either large numbers of people or who are particularly influential in a specific region can be another part of the solution. If policy makers want to use the education of women as a segment of a new policy in Pakistan, they need the support of Muslim clerics so that the majority of Pakistanis understand it is not against Islam to send their daughters to school. Support of local clerics for the experimental schools themselves will also contribute to the success of increasing enrollment rates because Islam is such an integral part of life in Pakistan.

The final policy implication is that policymakers need to examine closely the results of such further research. While these potential connections could provide a small tool that could help alleviate a part of the problem, it is necessary for them to determine whether it is worth the money for the potentially small return. If there is greater evidence on a district level that this is a correlation that exists, they should then choose to
rechannel resources to broaden the program. But the caveats on these connections are important to remember. These connections are academic explorations, not tested hypotheses. Therefore, further evidence is necessary before making any large or long term policy prescriptions based upon them.
Conclusion

Women, education, violence, economics, society, and religion—these are all different and important aspects of cultures and countries, and this paper explored some of the ways that they interact, both in academia and in Pakistan. The connections are not necessarily straightforward, but they do exist. Because the Taliban has moved into Pakistan, it has become necessary to explore the ways in which these issues interact in order to determine if there are unconventional ways that the US may be able to fight the War on Terror there. Even if the connections are weak, it is worth further exploration for the potential result of greater, longer term stability.

The debate about the direct connections between women’s education and violence is one that enlightens the complexity of this issue. While there is evidence on both sides of the debate as to whether they are directly connected at all, there are potentially positive and negative direct connections. Government education could provide a “club good” to compete with that of violent religious organizations, but increased education of women could possibly make them greater targets, both of domestic violence and terrorist attacks against their schools. Both these negative factors have occurred in Pakistan, making the negative consequences an important factor in consideration. An examination of the direct connections provides only a very weak correlation, which supports the idea that educating women does not have an impact on levels of violence on a large scale.

When examined individually, the connections between each of these factors is tenuous because academics debate them and there is not strong empirical evidence that they strongly affect one another, especially on a large scale. There are debates about
whether educating women actually improves the economics of the woman or the community, and to complicate the matter further, there is also a debate as to whether improved economics has any effect on rates of violence. However, the theoretical connection is traceable, and therefore, calls for further research as a policy option, mostly because our options in this region are so severely limited. There is evidence that these connections do exist on a micro scale in Pakistan through programs and individuals who are working to build stronger local economies through the education of women.

The connection between education and violence through social factors not only reveals potential to improve the violence rates but shows connections that could potentially make the violence worse. Therefore, further research is necessary in this area, not only to support the potential connection but also to determine the likelihood of the positive outcome over the negative one. The potential to educate the youth bulge, or the population in general, so that the developing economy cannot meet new expectations should create a cautionary approach so that US policy does not actually make the situation worse. These social factors are also targets of programs in Pakistan, but the US needs to decide if supporting such programs is going to advance its goals in the War on Terror.

Finally, Islam plays a central role in this debate due to the fact that Pakistan is a Muslim country, and Islam affects the daily lives and decisions of its citizens. It is important to understand the debates within Islam about both education and joining violent organizations in order to be able to effectively create policy to implement in these areas.
The relationships between all these factors are not straightforward or easy to
define, but there are potential connections that can provide creative policy solutions in a
place where conventional policy options are simply not viable. Therefore, while this
study is simply exploratory, it does contribute to a possible path for future research that
could lead to policy choices that increase stability over the long term.
Appendix 1

Pakistan Education and Crime Rates
1990-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Net Enrollment Rate</th>
<th>Crime Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>0.216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0.221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0.201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>0.185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0.181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>49.2</td>
<td>0.176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.206</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1The Net Enrollment Rate is the number of girls in primary school between the ages of 5-9 divided by the total population of girls aged 5-9. The data for the net enrollment rates came from the following sources:
   - 1991 and 1996: Khan

2The Crime Rates came from the Federal Bureau of Statistics for Pakistan
http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/publications/yearbook2007/social/19.4.pdf. These raw numbers were divided by the population data from the US Census Bureau at US
Bibliography


Mufti, Irfan. Interview with author through email. (11 April 2010).


