

UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE

DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY MEDICINE

Medicine in the Community 1985

Stream B -History of Medicine

This course uses Paul Starr: The Social Transformation of American Medicine (Basic Books NY 1983) and other readings to trace what Starr calls “the rise of a sovereign profession and the making of a vast industry”. The content of lectures in Medicine in the Community, and some material mentioned below, should cause you to ask whether the Australian health care system is following a history like the American history.

The University bookshop has copies of Starr and YOU ARE ADVISED TO OBTAIN YOUR OWN COPY. Material from Starr will NOT be available from the Department of Community Medicine.

Week

Beginning:

- 11 June NO TUTORIAL
BUT there will be an introductory lecture in the Verco Theatre at 3.00 p.m. on Wednesday 13th June AND you should read two of the following:
N. Hicks: “Medical History and the History of Medicine” in G.W. Osborne & W.F. Mandle (eds): New History (Allen & Unwin Sydney 1982) pp. 69-81;
Paul Starr: Social Transformation... pp. 1-9, 17-29;
M.J. Vogel: “Introduction” in Vogel & C.E. Rosenberg: The Therapeutic Revolution (Univ. Pennsylvania Pr. 1979) pp. vii-xb.
- 17 June COMPETITION
Why was competition so fierce in the supply of health care in America in the second half of the 19th century? Did lay people suffer as much as practitioners did? What were the practitioners’ responses?

Reading:
G. Rosen: The Structure of American Medical Practice, 1875-1941 (Univ. Pennsylvania Pr. 1983) pp. 13-25;
Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 47-59, 96-102 [for Australia, see E. Willis: Medical Dominance (Allen & Unwin Sydney 1983) pp. 36-61].
- 24 June LODGES, DISPENSARIES etc.
What were lodges and dispensaries designed to achieve? Did they succeed? Why

did they decline?

Reading:

Rosen: Structure ... pp. 32-6;

Rosen: "Contract or lodge practice..." in Am. J. Pub. Health 67:4 (1974) pp. 374-378.

Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 200-209 [for Australia, see T. Pensabene: The Rise of the Medical Practitioner in Victoria (HERU/ANU 1980) pp. 147-158].

1 July

MEDICINE AND SCIENCE

What effect did developments in science towards the end of the 19th century have on the practice of medicine?

Reading: (Two of the following, according to your interests.)

R.E. Kohler: "Medical Reform and Biomedical Science-Biochemistry ..." in Vogel & Rosenberg: Therapeutic Revolution ... pp. 27-66;

G.L. Geison: "Divided We Stand: Physiologists and Clinicians ..." in Vogel & Rosenberg: Therapeutic Revolution ... pp. 67-90;

R.C. Maulitz: "Physician Versus Bacteriologist ..." in Vogel & Rosenberg: Therapeutic Revolution ... pp. 92-109;

E.R. Brown: Rockefeller Medicine Men (Univ. Calif. Pr. 1979) pp. 71-91a;

AND Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 134-140 [for Australia, see T.P.

Anderson-Stuart: "President's Address" in Inter. Med. Congr. Trans. 2 (1889) pp. 568-587.

8 July

PUBLIC HEALTH

What purposes did public health work fulfil? Did those purposes change over time?

Reading:

John Duffy: "The American Medical Profession and Public Health..." in Bull. Hist. Med. 53:1 (1979) pp. 1-22;

E.R. Brown: "Public Health in Imperialism ..." in Am. J. Pub. Health 66:9 (1976) pp. 897-903 (for Starr's view, see Social Transformation ... pp. 180-1970; [for Australia, see Michael Roe: "The Establishment of the Australian Department of Health.. ." in Historical Studies XVII: 67 (1976) pp. 176-192].

15 July

MEDICAL EDUCATION

Was the "Flexner" movement merely a capitalist plot? If not, what other forces were at hand to change the structure of medical education around the turn of the century?

Reading: (two of the following)

Brown: Rockefeller Medicine Men ... pp. 135-156a;

G.E. Markowitz & D.K. Rosner: "Doctors in Crisis.. ." in Amer. Quarterly 25 (March 1973) pp. 83-107;

- Rosemary Stevens: American Medicine and the Public Interest pp. 55-73;
 Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 112-127.
- 22 July SPECIALIZATION
 What benefits and what disadvantages has the medical profession derived from specialization during the 20th century?
- Readings: (two of the following).
 Stevens: American Medicine ... pp. 77-97; 198-217; 294-301;
 Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 352-363.
- 29 July HOSPITALS
 What have been the main types of hospitals, who have they served and who have been the most powerful influences in their policy since 1880?
- Reading: (two of Vogel, Stevens or Clarke)
 M.J. Vogel: "Machine Politics and Medical Care ..." in Vogel & Rosenberg: Therapeutic Revolution ... pp. 159-175;
 R. Stevens: "A Poor Sort of Memory..." in MMFQ Health & Society 60:4 (1982) pp. 551-562a, 565b-576;
 Lawrence J. Clark et al "The Impact of Hill-Burton: ..." in Med. Care 18:5 (1980) pp. 532-547;
 Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 154-169, 347b-351 [for Australia, see K.S. Inglis: Hospital & Community (MUP 1958), Ch. 2; and A. Mitchell: The Hospital South of the Yarra (Alfred Hosp. Melbourne 1977), Intro. & Ch. 4.
- 5 August "HEALTH" INSURANCE
 What have been the pressures for national health insurance in America since 1930; what have been the main points of opposition to such a policy; has the compromise been effective?
- Reading:
 Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 266-315
 OR I.S. Falk: "Medical Care in the U.S.A. ..." in MMFQ Health & Society 51:1 (1973) pp. 1-32.
- 2 Sept. MEDICAL SCIENCE
 In 1984 "Baby Fae" got a baboon's heart from a not very well-known surgeon in a not very well known hospital. What features of research funding might have prepared the American Public and its medical profession for this event?
- Reading:
 Stevens: American Medicine ... pp. 358-377;
 Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 338-347a;
 J. Mistichelli: "Baby Fae" (Scope Note No.4, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Washington, January 1985).

- 9 Sept. THE “MEDICAL-INDUSTRIAL COMPLEX”
Remember our old friend, C. Wright Mills? who would he see as the ‘new men of power’, What would he see as the elements of the “medical-industrial complex” and what might he discern as the underlying “drift” of American medicine?
- Reading:
A.S. Relman: “The New Medical-Industrial Complex” in N.E.J.M. 303 (23 Oct. 1980) pp. 963-970;
G.B. Kolata: “NMC Thrives Selling Dialysis” in Science 208 (April 1980) pp. 379-382 and
S.A. Marcus; “Trade Unionism for Doctors” in N.E.J.M. 311:23 (6 Dec. 1984) pp. 1508-1511;
Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 381-393; [for Australia, see Medical Gazette passim, 1984].
- 16 Sept. COST CONTAINMENT
Do people have a right to health – or to health care? (Or, defend a list of rights in health care.) Are those rights positive or moral ones? Where does the responsibility lie to meet those rights claims? Where does the “patients’ rights movement” fit into this discussion?
- Reading:
Encyclopedia pp. 1507-1516, 1201-1205 AND
N. Hicks: “The Right to Health Care” ABC Radio 2,14 Dec. 1984.
- 23 Sept. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
How much say have American consumers of health care? What structures have been promoted to amplify their voice? Have those efforts worked?
- Reading: To be advised.
- 30 Sept. THE STARR THESIS
Starr’s book has had great popular success in the United States, possibly because his last chapter invokes the American fascination for Old Testament prophecy! What is his thesis?
- Reading:
Starr: Social Transformation ... pp. 420-449
(an alternative view may be found in J.B. McKinlay: J.B. McKinlay: “The Business of Good Doctoring or Doctoring as Good Business...” in Inter. J. Health Servs. 7:3 (1977) pp. 459-483.
- 7 October STARR WARS (sorry about that one)
After the popular acclaim (and the gratifying sales!) The Social Transformation ... began to attract considerable criticism. Who should we believe, Starr or his

critics? And what relevance has all of this for Australia?

Reading:

See the collection of reviews in the Department of Community Medicine.