ETHICAL PROBLEMS OF LIFE AND DEATH:

OUTLINE

1. The value of human life: sanctity vs. the quality of life; life as absolute value, the principle of totality
   Methodologies in medical ethics.

2. Genetic control of human life.

3. Control of fertility (reproductive technology).

4. Abortion (birth control).

5. Ethical problems in health care:
   - ordinary vs. extraordinary means,
   - sickness and sin,
   - patient-physician relationship,
   - manipulation vs. experimentation - on adults and on children,
   - criteria for informed consent,
   - organ transplantation,
   - ethical problems in psychotherapy
   - the possibility of religiously motivated ethical codes for denominational hospitals in a socialized health care system


7. Good death in a Christian sense vs. the different meanings of “euthanasia”,
   - service to the dying, the problem of artificial life support,

7. Optional areas of research:
   - the drug scene, homosexuality, ecology and health.
I. THE VALUE OF HUMAN LIFE.

1. LEVELS OF MORAL REASONING:
   - expressive evocative level
   - moral level
   - ethical level
   - metaethical level.


   on the post ethical level one finds to basically complementary views in theology;


2. NOTION OF HUMAN LIFE:

   see: a/biblical encyclopedias
   d/"Bioethics", and "Life-Quality of Life" in Enc.of Bioethics.

3. THE VALUE OF HUMAN LIFE

   A. Reagan as above,
   J.M. Gustafson as above

4. TECHNOLOGICAL ALIENATION AND HUMAN LIFE:

   Ivan Illich, "The medicalization of human life", Journal of Medical Ethics, 1975, p.73-77.
   --------, "Clinical damage, medical monopoly, the expropriation of health: Three dimensions of iatrogenic tort", ibid, p.78-80.
   M.Marinker, "Why make people patients?", ibid, p.81-84.
   K.Whitehorn, "Not quite what the patient ordered", ibid, p.92-95.

   outline 2
II. GENETIC CONTROL OF HUMAN LIFE


general information:

1. Possibilities and ethical issues:
   M. Hamilton, The new genetics..., Ch-s I. and V.,
   P. Ramsey, Fabricated Man, Ch. I. and II.
   A. Smith, The Human Pedigree,
   R. Francoeur, Utopian Motherhood

   ethically significant aspects of developments in Biogenetics, genetic twilight or the new beginnings of perfect control over human evolution.

2. Genetic Disease, Genetic counseling and screening:
   see: D.Callahan, “The meaning and sgnificance of Genetic Disease: Philosophical Perspectives”, in Beauchamp and LeRoy Walters, Contemporary Issues in Bioethics, p.580-585;
   also in Hilton, Callahan, Ethical Issues in Human Genetics,p.83-89.

   types of screening: contagious diseases -corresponding public health measures; fluoridation; screening of the unborn or of the newly born (in view of possible abortion), the case of the false positive (like amputating the wrong leg).

   the problem of identifying the possible patient,
   how to imply their consent to a “therapy” causing

   outline 3
irreparable damage to them;  
the possible extent of the therapy -degree of  
predictable danger; counselling in view of mar-
riage; difference between omission and commission  
in case of non-treatment, the effect of screening  
in utero on the acceptable degree of deformities  
an impairments among the handicapped.

3. Genetic intervention:  
see: M. Hamilton, The New Genetics, Ch-s V., VI., VII., VIII.
Bernard Davis, "Prospects for Gene-Therapy for Humans",  
Ethical and Scientific Issues by Human  
Uses of Molecular Genetics, pg.13-21.
R.Roblin, Rogers, A. Capron, "Reflections on issues  
posed by Recombinant DNA Molecule Technology  
I-II-III", ibid, pgs.59-80.
Daniel J. Sullivan, "Gene Splicing: The eight day of  
J. Gustafson, “Genetic Engineering and the normative  
view of the human”, in Ethical Issues in  
Biology and Medicine, Proceedings of a Sym-
posium on the Identity and Dignity of Man,  
p. 46-58. Schenkman, Cambridge, 1973, also in  
Gustafson, Theology and Christian Ethics,  
p.273-86.

4. Ethical Evaluation: different approaches
a: consequentialist reasoning:
Joseph F. Fletcher, “Ethical aspects of Genetic controls”,  
in Bioethics ed. by Th. Shannon, pgs., 327-  
341. Reprinted from the New England Journal  
--------, “New Beginnings in Life: A theolo-
gian’s response” in M. Hamilton, The New  
Genetics..., pgs. 78-89.
--------, "The Ethics of Genetic Control, Ending  
Reproductive Roulette", Doubleday, Anchor  

b: deontological reasoning:
Paul Ramsey, Fabricated Man, Ch.I., and II., pgs. 1-103.
Leon Kass, The New Genetics..., Ch.I.
--------, "The New Biology: What price relieving man’s es-
tate?", Science, 174(1971) , p.779-88;  
--------, "What price the perfect baby?", Science, 173(1971),  
p.103-04.
Karl Rahner, "Experiment:Man", theology Digest, Sesquicentennial  
Issue, February, 1968, p. 57-69 (not included in the  
regular volume),
--------, "The experiment with man", Theological Investiga-
tions, vol.9, pgs. 205-224. His approach is more  
cautious in this article than in the previous one.
--------, The Problem of genetic manipulation. ibid  
p.225-252.
c: mediating approach:

Reprinted in Notes in Moral Theology, pg.401-422.

identify the characteristics of each approach in the light of a specific issue.
note the difficulties raised against the consequentialist reasoning by P. Ramsey.
McCormick’s observations: do they forward the debate?, in what sense?

NB: the so called mediating position needs further refinement.

5. Sociobiology:


6. Appendix:

Note the difference between fertilization and conception. The term “reproductive technology” refers to all methods of interference with both processes, but under this heading we only deal with issues pertaining to efforts which fully or partially replace the natural process of fertilization (i.e. the union of sperm and ovum), such as the theoretical possibility of cloning, and the efforts to create artificial conditions for mitosis (i.e. in vitro or extracorporeal fertilization or artificial insemination). Together with chemical or mechanical prevention of the union of sperm and ovum, these procedures can be considered methods of fertility control. Conception control on the other hand refers to efforts which intend to prevent the implantation of the zygote, such as the use of the so called "morning after pill", or the intrauterine devices. Birth control in the strict sense of the term only refers to efforts of preventing the birth of a zygote or embryo, and is to be used for abortion only. The ordinary use of the term, however also includes the use of the anovulants.

1. Asexual reproduction (cloning):

sources: P. Ramsey, Fabricated Man, Ch.2, p.60-104.

Hamilton, The NEw Genetics, Ch.1, p.15-109.

"Reproductive technologies"; "Cloning" in Encyclopedia of Bioethics


common phenomenon in primitive life forms: the entire population has the same genetic information,
also possible for plants: grafting, experiments with carrot cells, it offers great possibilities in agriculture.
nuclear transplants for animals, insect, amphibia, mice or even for rabbit
for higher mammals technical difficulties exist, but the theoretical possibility has been demonstrated
accidental clones: identical twins (caution!), a certain percentage of ova collected for in vitro fertilization (IVF) begin spontaneous mitosis, according to recent reports

problems: the entire process is removed from the context of marital love and its spontaneous sexual expression, generating humans or “humanoids” for specific purposes, cf. J. Fletcher's arguments quality control, legal problems.
2. In Vitro Fertilization:

sources: Pope Pius XII, Allocution delivered to the second world congress on fertility sterility, AAS, 1956 p.467-474;470-471.


B. Häring, Ethics of Manipulation, p.198-200.

R. McCormick, How brave a new World, at several places;


early efforts in the 1950-s; response of Pius XII.

procedure: see Edwards and Somfai,

Purposes: experimental,"therapy" of infertility or of low fertility, genetic screening and possible therapy, recombination of fertilized ova, experimentation on zygotes, human hybrids, inter-species fertilization;

implications: zygote banks, sex-selection, recipient wombs (surrogate mothers in a restricted sense),

problems: status of fertilized zygotes -not all of them are being implanted, some are frozen to be stored until a recipient is found, commodity approach to human fertility, increased separation between the bodily expression of creative love and parenthood, allocation of resources -it is not therapy in the usual sense of the word, but service of a special nature offered by medical arts.

Who decides on the procedure, who carries the pregnancy to term? bonding relationships in utero, risks to the fetus, to the baby or to the mother; hybrids, experimentation without immediate therapeutic implications,

the value of the argument: medical science succeeded to create an artificial Fallopian tube to bypass an obstacle in the reproductive process.

the problems connected with freezing, surrogate motherhood.
Discussions on freezing, experimentation and surrogate motherhood:
P.Singer, D.Wells, "In Vitro Fertilization: the major issues", ibid., p.192-195.
G.D. Mitchell, "In Vitro Fertilization: the major issues - a comment", ibid, p. 196-199.
Teresa Iglesias, "In Vitro fertilization: the major issues", ibid, p. 32-37.

3. Artificial insemination: by husband or by donor

history of the problem: animal husbandry, with humans since the end of the last century, contemporary procedures lead to the birth of at least 15.000 individuals in the U.S. alone

theaching of the R.C. Church: end of 19th Century: Palmieri, Bernardi, Holy Office in 1897,
Pius XII, Sept. 27, 1947: methods of obtaining the sperm, absence of intercourse, intimacy of husband/wife relationships, the possibility of medically assisted intercourse.

Jewish-Protestant views: the dividing lines: biological integrity vs. continuity of family lineage; marriage covenant, intimacy of husband wife relationships, disparity of relationship to child, consent.

The question of anticipated adoption: legal problems with AID.

Cryobanking of human sperm (or of zygotes),
Purpose: remedy of sterility, avoidance of transmittable genetic disorders,
Questions: the lack of fertility as pathological condition, how evil is it in an overpopulated world, creative alternatives
cryobanking of human sperm or of zygotes, fertilization distance, the case of Kim Casali, is it possible to draw a line?

sources:

outline 8

Harmon L. Smith, "The meaning of human parenthood", in his Ethics and the New Medicine, p.55-88. Very good source.


Melville Kerr and K.Rogers, "Donor Insemination", Journal of Medical Ethics, 1(1975), p.30-33. (special issue dedicated to problems connected with the procedure: donor selection, cryobanking, law and ethics)


David Roy, "AID" An overview of ethical issues" in D. and W.F. Price(ed-s:) Human artificial insemination and semen


Appendix: surrogate motherhood.

4. Selection of the sex of the baby:

Purpose: to control sex linked deformities, promotion of happiness and satisfaction within the family, reduce birth rate?

Methods: prior to fertilization

After fertilization

IV). BIRTH CONTROL: ARTIFICIAL PREVENTION OF FERTILIZATION AND/OR CONCEPTION

1. Clarification of notions:

- consistency with the demands of biological integrity;
- return to nature phenomenon in other areas of our life: environment, energy, iatrogenic diseases, pollution;
- theological significance of sexual abstinence vs. the role of sexual love in marriage; the sources in theological tradition: suspicion towards sexuality;
- the meaning of responsible parenthood vs. the so called "contraceptive mentality";
- modes of humanizing the world; overpopulation creates a need for a new emphasis;
- stages of development in our knowledge of reproductive biology allow a more accurate distinction between contraception, and abortion;
- the difference between the so called "natural" and "artificial" methods of birth control vs. the insistence in Humanae Vitae on the integrity of the natural process.

2. Stages in development in R.C. teaching and theology:

- sources prior to Casti Connubii
- Casti Connubii
- the issue of surgical sterilization
- the so called "rhythm method" and responsible parenthood: Pius XII.;
- the question of the "pill",
- the case of rape,
- periodic abstinence under scrutiny: L. Janssens,
- organ transplantation vs. temporary or permanent sterility,
- Vatican II.,
- "minority" and "majority" reports of Pope Paul VIth's Commission, Humanae Vitae,
- reactions: Canadian, Mexican, U.S., Scandinavian French, German, Australian (first and second statement) Episcopal Conferences,
- elements of a theological synthesis, elements of consensus, and continuing disagreement
- "natural methods": equal partnership in responsibility, religious and psychologicla significance of absitnence in marriage?
- the issue of "infallibility" in ordinary teaching

sources:

3. Humanae Vitae Revisited


John C. Ford and Germain Grisez, "Contraception and the Infallibility of the Ordinary Magisterium", ibid, p. 258-319. note: there is a good reference to current bibliography in both articles.

Enrico Chiavacci, "Valori di fondo e sistematica normativa", Rivista di Teologia Morale, 10( 1978), Pgs. 519-527;

Giovanni Pezzuto "Analisi critica della Humanae Vitae, Proposta di una nouva ipotesi di valuazione morale della contracezione", ibid, p. 545-585;


4. Side effects of natural and artificial methods of birth control:
the issue of early induced abortions with the use of IUD-s, low dose estrogen pills, and periodic abstinence, the question of increase in minor birth defects in connection with the use of periodic abstinence, the relationship between the IQ and the size of the family.


The time given to children by adults influences their intellectual development, smaller size families tend to have more intelligent children, but again in large families the divided parental attention is compensated by the support of older siblings to younger ones. One can find a corresponding variation in I.Q. Caution: not all qualities in education lend themselves to easy comparison and measurement.

Note: side effects of periodic abstinence:
B. Häring, "Note: New dimensions of responsible parenthood", *Theological Studies*, 37(1976), pgs. 120-132.
C.J. Roberts, C.R. Lowe, "Hypothesis: Where have all the conceptions gone?" The *Lancet*, March 1, 1975, p. 498-499. The hypothesis has been verified through I.V.F. research.

5. Surgical Sterilization as a method of family planning:

Sources:

Sterilization of the mentally retarded?

Catholic hospital policy in Canada
V. ABORTION: HISTORY AND SCIENTIFIC FACTS

1. Contemporary scene: social and legal developments.

2. The development of Judeo-Christian positions:
   a/ Judaism
   b/ ancient Christian and medieval doctrine
   c/ developments during Reformation
   d/ post reformation era
   e/ departure of Protestant positions from traditions of orthodoxy
   identify the factors of this change

   sources:

   J.T. Noonan, “An almost absolute value in history” in his The morality of Abortion, Legal and Historical Perpectives, Ch. I. pg. 1-60.

3. The Canadian scene, identify factors and stages of legal developments:

   Paul Ramsey, Ethics at the Edges of Life -for the U.S. situation.

4. Interpretation of the situation:

   sources:

   Andre Hellegers, "Fetal Development", Theological Studies, 1970, p.3-9;
   Robert A. Paoletti, "Developmental Genetics and Psycho-Social Posi-

outline 13.
References


LeRoy Walters (ed.) Bibliography for Bioethics, Centre for Bioethics, Kennedy Institute, Gale Research Co., Continuous publication since 1975 providing an extensive coverage of the literature. The best tool for any research.

Hastings Centre Report, "Bibliography" in each issue, compiled into separate volumes at irregular intervals.


Journals

American Journal of Law and Medicine
Ethics in Science and Medicine
Hastings Centre Reports
Journal of Medical Ethics
Journal of Medicine and Philosophy
Linacre Quarterly
Hospital Progress
C.H.A.C. Bulletin
Perspectives in Biology and Medicine
Science
Nature
Metamedicine
New England Journal of Medicine
Index Medicus,
Computerized Data base, Bioethics line.

General Works

Thomas A. Shannon (ed.), Bioethics; Basic Writings on the key ethical questions that surround the major, modern biological possibilities and problems. Revised. Paulist Press, 1981, p.x-632. The collection represents a variety of religious traditions. The position of the selected authors however seems represent a continuity with Roman Catholic teachings.

T.L. Beauchamp, A.L. Jameton (ed.), Moral Problems in Medicine, Prentice Hall, N.J. 1976, p.552. The Collection reflects the clinical interest of the editors, but also provides texts from classical and contemporary philosophers; it has almost nothing to represent religious ethics.


B. Ashley, K.O’Rourke, Health Care Ethics, A Theological Analysis, The Catholic Hospital Association, St. Louis, 1982, (2nd ed.).


J. Fletcher, Morals and Medicine, Beacon Pr., 1960,  


-----------------, Contemporary Medical Ethics, Sheed and Ward, 1975, p.x-236.


Genetics


Bibliography 3

--------,


D. Sullivan, "Gene Splicing, the eight day of creation", America, 137(1977),p.440-43.


Reproductive Technology

Warren T. Reich (ed), *Encyclopedia of Bioethics*, "Reproductive Technologies".


Ch. Curran, Contraception, Authority, and Dissent, Herder 1969, p. 239.


Journal of Medical Ethics, n.1, 1975, special issue on AID.


Abortion (control of birth):

Congregation of Faith and Doctrine, Declaration on Abortion”, 


J.T. Noonan, "An almost absolute value in history", in his 
The morality of Abortion, Legal and Historical perspectives,Ch. 1, p. 10-60.

G.H. Williams, "Religious residues and presuppositions in te 

Lisa Sawl Cahill, "Abortion and argument by analogy", Horizons, 

John Connery, "Notes , Abortion and the duty to preserve 

-------, Abortion: The Development of the Roman Catholic 

Andre E. Hellegers, "Fetal Development", Theological Studies, 

James J. Diamond, "Abortion, Animation, and biological hominiza-

Joseph F. Doneeel, "Immediate Animation and delayed hominiza-

Stanley Hauervas, "Abortion: Why the arguments fail",Hospital 

Sebastian MacDonald, "The meaning of abortion, part I and II", The 

R. McCormick, "The abortion dossier"", Theological Studies, 

--------, 
"Abortion, Morality and Public Policy" in his 

Paul Ramsey, 
Ethics at the Edges of Life, Yale U. Pr. 

National Commission Report, "Toward a policy on fetal research", 

Robert T. Morrison, "The Human Fetus as useful research material", 


--------,


**Fetal Research**


**Service to the dying**

A. Godin (ed), *Death and Presence; the psychology of death and afterlife*, Lumen Vitae, Brussels, 1972, p. 314.

bibliography 11


Robert M. Veatch, Death, Dying and the Biological Revolution, Our last quest for responsibility, Yale University Pr., 1977, p.ix-323.


